



City of Oakland- Human Services

Final Total Compensation Study Report

August 30, 2024

SUBMITTED BY:
Tameka Usher

Table of Contents

Introduction 3

Background..... 3

Project Scope and Work Plan..... 3

 Compensation Study Parameters 4

Survey Results 8

 Compensation Results 8

Observations 10

Next Steps 11

- Appendix A:** Benefit Component Description
- Appendix B:** Final Total Compensation Datasheets
- Appendix C:** The City and OUSD Comparison Table
- Appendix D:** Benefit Tables

Introduction

The City of Oakland (City) retained Usher Forward HR Consulting (Usher Forward) to conduct a total compensation study for eight (8) benchmark classifications. The study's objective was to determine the competitiveness of the City's total compensation within the labor market. To achieve this, a labor market of seven (7) agencies was established to collect and analyze data. Given the limited data, the City added an additional agency, as noted in the Project Scope and Workplan section.

This total compensation report contains the project scope and work plan, describes the data collection and analysis methodologies, and provides the base compensation results for all survey classifications. All salary data presented utilizes the effective date of March 2024. However, some of the data was updated effective July 1, 2024, to capture agencies salary adjustments.

Background

The U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) outlined changes to compensation standards for Head Start staff. Here are the key points:

1. **Increased Minimum Wages:** The NPRM proposes raising the minimum wage requirements for Head Start staff to ensure wages are competitive with those in similar positions in the community. This adjustment aims to improve staff retention and recruitment.
2. **Wage Alignment with Inflation:** The proposed rule includes adjustments to align wages with inflation and the rising cost of living, helping to maintain the purchasing power of Head Start employees and meet the basic cost of living in the local areas.
3. **Qualification-Based Pay Scales:** Changes are proposed to pay scales based on staff qualifications and experience, ensuring that compensation reflects educational and professional credentials with K-3rd grade teaching staff.

The ruling, which has now become final, addresses how wage increases will impact Head Start program budgets. By August 1, 2031, agencies should progress toward parity of preschool teachers in public-school settings regarding salary, duties, responsibilities, and qualifications.

Project Scope and Work Plan

To complete the total compensation study, Usher Forward completed the following tasks:

- Reviewed the City's background materials, including classification specifications, salary schedules, and organizational charts.
- Conducted a project initiation meeting.
- Developed a data collection method and survey instrument.

- Researched and analyzed salary data from the respective labor market agencies, including salary schedules, classification specifications, memoranda of understanding, benefits, and position control documents (where available) to ensure accurate data was collected and compared.
- Submitted the draft total compensation datasheets for the City's review.
 - Followed up with the labor market agencies to collect information unavailable online.
- Prepared the Draft Total Compensation Report for the City's review and comment.
- Preparation of the Final Total Compensation Report.

Compensation Study Parameters

Labor Market Position

Usher Forward provides a labor market data analysis based on the market mean (average). The labor market mean calculation excludes the City's data since the City's salary is being compared relative to the salaries of other agencies. The labor market mean is the average data point for the complete range of data and can be impacted by high- and low-payers since it is an average of all data points.

Labor Market Agencies

The City identified the following labor market agencies for this study:

1. ABCD Head Start - Boston, MA
2. Contra Costa County – Employment and Human Services Department
3. Garvey School District¹
4. Kidango (Oakland, CA)
5. Oakland Unified School District
6. Unity Council (Oakland, CA)
7. YMCA (Oakland, CA)
8. Wu Yee (San Francisco, CA)

¹ The Human Services Department's Consultant provided this agency and data.

The following briefly explains areas the City should be aware of regarding labor market agencies:

1. ABCD Head Start - Boston, MA
 - a. The agency was unresponsive to all attempts to collect data; however, Usher Forward completed the survey on behalf of the agency using information available online. As such, there are significant gaps in the benefits data collection.
2. Garvey School District
 - a. The City provided matches and salary information, and Usher Forward collected benefit information that is available via their website.
3. Kidango (Oakland, CA)
 - a. The agency declined to participate; however, Usher Forward completed the survey on behalf of the agency using information available online. As such, significant gaps exist in the benefits data collection because the agency's contribution to medical, dental, and vision is unavailable online. Despite several attempts via email and telephone, Usher Forward was not able to collect the dollar amount of such contributions.
4. Oakland Unified School District (OUSD)
 - a. They declined to participate; however, Usher Forward completed the survey on behalf of the agency using supporting documents provided by the agency and information available online. As such, there are significant gaps in the benefits data collection. Usher Forward identified that the OUSD provides full contributions to medical, dental, and vision for full-time staff, but despite several attempts, Usher Forward could not collect the dollar amount of such contributions.
5. Unity Council
 - a. The agency returned a completed survey but did not attach job descriptions. Therefore, Usher Forward had to validate the comparable matches using job postings.
6. YMCA
 - a. The agency returned a completed survey but did not attach job descriptions. Therefore, Usher Forward had to validate the comparable matches using job postings.
7. Wu Yee (San Francisco, CA)
 - a. The agency declined to participate; however, Usher Forward completed the survey on behalf of the agency using information available online.

Survey Classifications

The City identified the benchmark classifications for the study, as presented below, and summary descriptions for each were based on the current job descriptions. Specific comments concerning the job-matching strategy and/or results for some classifications are also included:

- **Head Start Instructor-** This entry-level classification is responsible for the full range of instructional duties associated with teaching the instruction to children enrolled in the Head Start Program/State Preschool Program, instructing parents on early childhood development concepts, organizing and setting up developmentally appropriate education and play materials for the classroom, and assisting in developmental assessments.
- **Early Head Start Instructor-** This entry-level classification is responsible for the full range of instructional duties associated with teaching parents of infants/toddlers in the Early Head Start Program, instructing children enrolled in Early Head Start Programs, instructing parents on early childhood development concepts, assisting in developmental assessments, and organizing and setting up education and play materials for classroom and/or makes home visits.
- **Early Childhood Center Director-** This first-level supervisory classification oversees the day-to-day operation of a child development center for the Head Start/State Preschool/Early Head Start Program(s). Incumbents perform developmental assessments and plan, organize, and schedule daily center/classroom activities based on early childhood education principles; monitor and supervise all activities in the center; and ensure that enrolled children and families receive comprehensive Head Start services.
- **Family Advocate-** This journey-level classification ensures continuous recruitment and full enrollment of assigned site(s); provides and monitors direct case management services to families enrolled in the Head Start/State Preschool and Early Head Start Programs; promotes services including social services, family and community engagement, father engagement, literacy education, health tracking and nutrition, mental health, and disabilities; serves as a liaison between Head Start/State Preschool or Early Head Start center and the home; and partners with families to assist in developing and implementing goals to address their needs and to support school readiness in their child/children.
- **Head Start Coach-** Implements the Head Start/Early Head Start program's research-based, coordinated coaching strategy and priorities for education staff; provides support to education staff to increase the quality of teaching and child outcomes related to the program's school readiness goals; presents supportive and targeted feedback using consistent, systematic, and guided approaches; and trains and mentors/coaches staff.
- **Head Start Program Coordinator-** This journey-level classification supervises the enrollment and maintenance of children and their families in the Head Start and Early

Head Start programs; plans recruitment methods and procedures; assigns and performs recruitment activities and enrolls students in Head Start and Even Start; records and reports average daily attendance; provides information and referrals to educational, health, and nutritional resource agencies as needed by children and their families; and presents and facilitate workshops for parents and other care-providers of children in the Head Start and Early Head Start programs.

- **Head Start/Early Head Start Associate Instructor-** This entry-level classification assists assigned teacher(s) in planning, organizing, and conducting developmentally appropriate activities for children (infant/toddler/preschool) in the Head Start/State Preschool/Early Head Start Programs; assists in instructing children and educating parents on early childhood development concepts; assists in developmental assessments; assists in organizing and setting up education and play materials for classroom and/or supports home visits; and assists in conducting developmental screenings, on-going child observations, developmental assessments; and devises Individual Development Plans on all children enrolled in program.
- **Head Start/Early Head Start Assistant Instructor-** This entry-level classification is responsible for assisting assigned teacher(s) with conducting developmentally appropriate activities for children in the Head Start/State Preschool/Early Head Start Program, assists with introducing parents to early childhood development concepts, observes during developmental assessments and may document observations, assists with instructing children in basic infant/toddler/preschool education concepts, and assists with organizing and setting up developmentally appropriate educational and play materials for the classroom.

While it is our practice to review classification specifications for all job matches, this was not possible in several cases because those materials were unavailable online and/or the agency did not furnish some or all of the documents despite repeated requests. In such cases, Usher Forward identified matches by reviewing the current job announcements available on each agency's website to determine if matches were sufficiently comparable.

Benefit Elements

In addition to the maximum annual base salary, the total compensation study included employer contributions to the following benefits:

- Retirement
- Health-Related Benefits
 - Cafeteria
 - Medical
 - Dental

- Vision
- Incentives/Special Pay
 - Education Incentives
 - Licenses/Certification Pay
 - Professional Development/Membership Pay
- Recruitment (signing) and Referral Pay

Survey Results

Compensation Results

- When conducting a salary survey, classification titles are not a factor in determining a comparable match. Therefore, the intent is to provide general market trends by comparing the span of control, duties and responsibilities, and knowledge, skills, and abilities required to determine whether these are comparable enough to utilize as a match. With a balanced labor market and the use of whole-job analysis, it is reasonable to assume that while some matches will have slightly higher responsibilities and some matches will have slightly lower responsibilities, the overall scope of duties and responsibilities of the combined matches will be balanced.
- All data is presented in annual salaries.
- Insufficient benefits data was collected to analyze the city's total compensation market position. Therefore, the percentage above or below the total compensation mean is noted as insufficient data.
- The designation of "No Comparable Class" was utilized if one of the following two things occurred: 1) there was no comparable classification in the agency, or 2) the review of duties and responsibilities assigned to the reported classification was not comparable.
- In some datasheets, the designation is "Data Not Available." This designation is used when (i) the agency did not provide Usher Forward with the needed information to confirm a match, or (ii) the comparable classification has been determined, but the salary was not provided nor available online.

In order to provide the City with a summary of study results, Table 1 (Summary of Base Salary Results) and Table 2 (Benefits) display the following information:

- The City's classification title.
- The City's maximum annual base salary.
- The labor market mean (average) annual maximum base salary.

- The percentage of the City's maximum annual base salary is above or below the mean of the labor market; this number indicates what percentage of the City's salary is required to move it up or down to the market mean.
- Number of comparable classifications or job matches in the labor market.

Table 1- Summary of Base Salary Results

| Comparable Classification Title | City of Oakland - Head Start Annual Max Salary | Annual Max Salary Mean | % above or below the Market Mean | Number of Matches |
|--|--|------------------------|----------------------------------|-------------------|
| Head Start Instructor | \$60,684.00 | \$75,538.07 | -19.66% | 8 |
| Early Head Start Instructor | \$60,684.00 | \$76,519.46 | -20.69% | 7 |
| Early Childhood Center Director | \$81,412.50 | \$87,746.65 | -7.22% | 7 |
| Family Advocate | \$68,601.00 | \$72,713.00 | -5.66% | 7 |
| Head Start Coach | \$66,319.50 | \$77,997.14 | -14.97% | 5 |
| Head Start Program Coordinator | \$90,830.76 | \$50,337.53 | Insufficient Data | 2 |
| Head Start/Early Head Start Assistant Instructor | \$40,989.00 | \$46,603.13 | -12.05% | 4 |
| Head Start/Early Head Start Associate Instructor | \$48,574.50 | \$56,829.99 | -14.53% | 6 |

Analysis of the base salary data indicates that, on average, the City is **13.54% below the labor market mean** for all survey classifications included within the study's scope. As previously discussed, any classification with fewer than three matches is not considered for analysis since a minimum of three classifications is required to conduct such an analysis.

Table 2 - Benefits

As previously stated, Usher Forward collected numerous benefits, in addition to base salary, to complete the total compensation evaluation of the City compared to the identified labor market. When measuring the market, the goal was to determine the City's competitive position to attract and retain talent. This is done by measuring the benefits new employees would receive upon their hire date. Reported benefits are those for which all employees in an employee group would qualify.

| Comparable Classification Title | Total Comp Annual Maximum Salary | City of Oakland - Head Start Total Comp Annual Salary Mean | % above or below the Market Mean | Number of Matches |
|--|----------------------------------|--|----------------------------------|-------------------|
| Head Start Instructor | \$101,640.00 | \$100,171.56 | Insufficient Data | 8 |
| Early Head Start Instructor | \$101,640.00 | \$97,173.78 | Insufficient Data | 7 |
| Early Childhood Center Director | \$124,913.96 | \$117,378.65 | Insufficient Data | 7 |
| Family Advocate | \$110,529.20 | \$93,525.96 | Insufficient Data | 7 |
| Head Start Coach | \$107,967.53 | \$97,008.26 | Insufficient Data | 5 |
| Head Start Program Coordinator | \$135,488.78 | \$72,040.35 | Insufficient Data | 2 |
| Head Start/Early Head Start Assistant Instructor | \$79,526.45 | \$83,314.30 | Insufficient Data | 4 |
| Head Start/Early Head Start Associate Instructor | \$88,043.45 | \$81,664.70 | Insufficient Data | 6 |

Observations

The previous sections in this report provide detailed information concerning the scope of the project, the methodology used to complete the total compensation study, as well as the results of the study, which show where the City stands in comparison to the labor market for the selected Head Start classifications. A compensation study is a starting point, but limitations in the data make it challenging to implement its results based on the study alone. As such, the study's

implementation will depend on many factors, including the City's compensation strategy, recruitment and retention considerations, labor negotiations, budget considerations, and most certainly, the recent final rule regarding parity between the City Head Start salaries and OUSD. Appendix C compares OUSD salaries and minimum qualifications to the City's Head Start benchmark classifications, which will serve as a tool when determining strategies for parity with preschool teachers in the public-school setting,

Since not all classifications were surveyed, as noted earlier in the report, a select group of Head Start benchmark classifications were selected. Salaries for other Head Start classifications that were not surveyed will need to be evaluated using internal relationships.

Next Steps

The above sections of this report provide detailed information concerning the scope of the project, the methodology used to complete the total compensation study, as well as the results of the study, which show where the City's Head Start classifications stand in comparison to the labor market. Should you require any further information on the contents of this Final Total Compensation Report, please do not hesitate to contact Tameka Usher via email at tusher@hrforwardconsulting.com

Appendix A

Benefit Component Description

- Maximum Annual Base Salary
 - This dollar amount reflects the maximum annual salary paid to the comparable classification.
- Retirement
 - Employer normal cost retirement contribution or contribution to 401 plans
 - The employer's normal cost rate represents the annual cost of service accrual for the fiscal year for active employees as reported in the plan's actuarial valuation. The employers' normal cost rate can be a blended rate for all benefit groups in the plan or reported based on a specific plan tier. Due to differences in retirement structures between public, private, and nonprofit agencies, Usher Forward HR will collect the relevant data but will not include it in the calculated datasheets for comparison purposes. Instead, a separate benefit sheet will be provided.
 - Note since the majority of the labor market agencies are not public agencies, the retirement systems and employer contributions are significantly different.
- Health-Related Benefits (Cafeteria, Medical, Dental, and Vision)
 - The value of the employer's annual contribution for health benefits, which include medical, dental, and vision benefits, based on family coverage (employee + 2 or more dependents).
 - Several employers contribute or fully fund medical, dental, and vision benefits. However, despite repeated attempts, Usher Forward could not collect the dollar amount contribution to make a quantitative comparison of the value of benefits.
- Incentive/Special Pay
 - Refers to the dollar amount that agencies pay toward education incentives, licenses/certification pay, and/or professional development.
- Recruitment (signing) and Referral Pay

Appendix B

Final Total Compensation Datasheets

| Comparable Classification Title | City of Oakland - Head Start Annual Max Salary | Annual Max Salary Mean | % above or below the Market Mean | Number of Matches | Total Comp Annual Maximum Salary | City of Oakland - Head Start Total Comp Annual Salary Mean | % above or below the Market Mean |
|--|---|---------------------------|-------------------------------------|----------------------|---|---|-------------------------------------|
| Head Start Instructor | \$60,684.00 | \$75,538.07 | -19.66% | 8 | \$101,640.00 | \$100,171.56 | Insufficient Data |
| Early Head Start Instructor | \$60,684.00 | \$76,519.46 | -20.69% | 7 | \$101,640.00 | \$97,173.78 | Insufficient Data |
| Early Childhood Center Director | \$81,412.50 | \$87,746.65 | -7.22% | 7 | \$124,913.96 | \$117,378.65 | Insufficient Data |
| Family Advocate | \$68,601.00 | \$72,713.00 | -5.66% | 7 | \$110,529.20 | \$93,525.96 | Insufficient Data |
| Head Start Coach | \$66,319.50 | \$77,997.14 | -14.97% | 5 | \$107,967.53 | \$97,008.26 | Insufficient Data |
| Head Start Program Coordinator | \$90,830.76 | \$50,337.53 | Insufficient Data | 2 | \$135,488.78 | \$72,040.35 | Insufficient Data |
| Head Start/Early Head Start Assistant Instructor | \$40,989.00 | \$46,603.13 | -12.05% | 4 | \$79,526.45 | \$83,314.30 | Insufficient Data |
| Head Start/Early Head Start Associate Instructor | \$48,574.50 | \$56,829.99 | -14.53% | 6 | \$88,043.45 | \$81,664.70 | Insufficient Data |

-13.54%

| City of Oakland Classification Title | Annual Max Salary | Minimum Qualifications | OUSD's Classification Title | Annual Max Salary Mean | Minimum Qualifications | % difference between OUSD and the City's Max Annual Salary |
|--------------------------------------|-------------------|---|-----------------------------|------------------------|---|--|
| Head Start Instructor | \$60,684.00 | Education: Bachelor's or advanced degree in Early Childhood Education, including 12 post-secondary semester units in early education or child development, plus 3 units of supervised field experience in ECE/CD setting completed; AND hold, or qualify for, a Master Teacher Child Development Permit (or higher level permit). Experience: Six months of full-time work experience or one year of part-time experience in a licensed childcare center or comparable group child care program. | Pre-School Teacher ECE | \$103,876.91 | Education: Bachelor's degree in child development/early childhood education, including courses needed to meet credential requirements and student teaching classroom experience. Experience: 2 or more years of successful classroom teaching experience. Has recent and relevant training and experience in assessment, data analysis, and working with second language learners. Experience implementing open court reading program and administration of desired results development profile. | 71.18% |
| Early Head Start Instructor | \$60,684.00 | Education: Associate, Bachelor's, or advanced degree in Early Childhood Education/Child Development, including 3 units of supervised field experience in early childhood education/child development, 3 units of which must be in infant/toddler coursework. OR 24 units in ECE/CD, including core courses plus 16 General Education units, 3 units of which must be in infant/toddler coursework. AND hold, or qualify for, a Teacher Permit (or higher level permit). Experience: 6 months of full-time work experience or one year of part-time experience in a licensed childcare center or comparable group childcare program. | Pre-School Teacher ECE | \$103,876.91 | Education: Bachelor's degree in child development/early childhood education, including courses needed to meet credential requirements and student teaching classroom experience. Experience: 2 or more years of successful classroom teaching experience. Has recent and relevant training and experience in assessment, data analysis, and working with second language learners. Experience implementing open court reading program and administration of desired results development profile. | 71.18% |
| Early Childhood Center Director | \$81,412.50 | Education: Bachelor's or advanced degree in Early Childhood Education, including 12 post-secondary semester units in early childhood education or child development, plus three (3) units of supervised field experience in ECE/setting, AND a Children's Center Supervisory Permit (or higher level permit). Experience: Two years of teaching in a licensed child care center or comparable group child care program. Previous experience in a Head Start Program is highly desirable. | CDC Site Administrator | \$122,272.12 | Education: 12 units in early childhood education. A Master's degree in education or child development is desirable. Possession of California elementary teaching and administrative/Supervision credentials authorizing service in preschool through adult education. Experience: 2 years experience in early childhood education or a childcare and development program. | 50.19% |

| | | | | | | |
|--|-------------|---|-------------------------|-------------|--|---------|
| Family Advocate | \$68,601.00 | Education: Associate's Degree in elementary education, social work, counseling, nursing, or a related field with a minimum of 12 Early Childhood Education units. Experience: 2 years of experience in coordinating or implementing health, social, or education services to low-income families. | ECE Family Navigator | \$81,275.40 | Education: Bachelor Degree or its equivalent required with coursework in social services or related field. A combination of experience and education maybe used to meet the Bachelor Degree requirement; however, the work experience years used to qualify for the Bachelor Degree requirement cannot be used to meet the work requirement. Experience: 2 years of work experience in the areas of social services or education. 2-4 years of experience working in parent education, parent advocacy programs involvement programs. | 18.48% |
| Head Start Coach | \$66,319.50 | Pending | DNA | \$0.00 | DNA | |
| Head Start Program Coordinator | \$90,830.76 | Education: Bachelor's degree in early childhood development, public health, education, and public administration. A Master's degree is highly desirable. Experience: 2 years of progressively responsible work experience in social service, public health, or educational/literacy programs. | Special, Enrollment ECE | \$62,131.05 | Education: Associate of Arts Degree required. Experience: 4 years experience working with families and students in a customer service environment. | -31.60% |
| Head Start/Early Head Start Assistant Instructor | \$40,989.00 | Education: 6 units of Early Childhood Education or Child Development. Additional requirement for early head start program assistant instructors: Education must include three (3) units of Infant/Toddler coursework. Experience: None required. Experience in a licensed child care center or comparable group child care program is highly desirable. | NCC | \$0.00 | NCC | |
| Head Start/Early Head Start Associate Instructor | \$48,574.50 | Education: 12 post-secondary semester units or equivalent quarter units in early childhood education or child development. Candidates must have units that cover the general areas of child growth and development, child family and community, child and family, or program/curriculum; AND hold, or qualify for, an Associate Teacher Child Development Permit (or higher level permit). Additional requirement for early head start program substitutes: Education must include six (6) units of Infant/Toddler coursework. Experience: 4 months of full-time work experience or equivalent part-time experience in a licensed child care center or comparable group child care program. | DNA | \$0.00 | DNA | |



Benchmark Classification: Head Start Instructor
Total Matches: 8

| Labor Market Agency | Comparable Classification Title | Annual Maximum Salary | Deferred Comp | Cafeteria | Health | Dental | Vision | Retirement Contribution | Total Compensation |
|--|---------------------------------|-----------------------|---------------|-----------|-------------|------------|----------|-------------------------|--------------------|
| City of Oakland | Head Start Instructor | \$60,684.00 | | | \$31,868.04 | \$1,392.00 | \$243.96 | \$7,452.00 | \$101,640.00 |
| Action for Boston Community Development Head Start | <i>HeadStart Teacher</i> | \$72,090.20 | | | | | | | \$72,090.20 |
| Contra Costa County – Employment and Human Services Department | Teacher-Project | \$60,032.28 | \$1,800.00 | | \$34,114.20 | \$921.24 | | \$6,003.23 | \$102,870.95 |
| Garvey School District | <i>Head Start Teacher</i> | \$72,974.00 | | | \$32,400.96 | \$545.52 | \$232.20 | \$19,739.47 | \$125,892.15 |
| Kidango | <i>Head Start Lead Teacher</i> | \$74,526.40 | | | | | | \$2,981.06 | \$77,507.46 |
| Oakland Unified School District | <i>Pre-School Teacher ECE</i> | \$103,876.91 | | | | | | \$28,098.70 | \$131,975.61 |
| Unity Council | Teacher | \$62,254.40 | | | \$23,772.00 | \$900.00 | | \$3,112.72 | \$90,039.12 |
| Wu Yee | <i>Lead Preschool Teacher</i> | \$85,758.40 | | | | | | \$8,575.84 | \$94,334.24 |
| YMCA ¹ | Head Start Preschool Teacher | \$72,792.00 | | | \$25,792.92 | \$798.60 | | \$7,279.20 | \$106,662.72 |

| | |
|---------------------------|-------------|
| Base Salary Mean | \$75,538.07 |
| % above or below the Mean | -19.66% |

| | |
|---------------------------|-------------------|
| Total Compensation Mean | \$100,171.56 |
| % above or below the Mean | Insufficient Data |

Notes:
Italicized Comparable classifications= The match was not verified by reviewing a job description or class specification.
1- After two year the YMCA contributes 10% of annual salary towards retirement



Benchmark Classification: Early Head Start Instructor
Total Matches: 7

| Labor Market Agency | Comparable Classification Title | Annual Maximum Salary | Deferred Comp | Cafeteria | Health | Dental | Vision | Retirement Contribution | Total Compensation |
|--|--------------------------------------|-----------------------|---------------|-----------|-------------|------------|----------|-------------------------|--------------------|
| City of Oakland | Early Head Start Instructor | \$60,684.00 | | | \$31,868.04 | \$1,392.00 | \$243.96 | \$7,452.00 | \$101,640.00 |
| Action for Boston Community Development Head Start | <i>Teacher-Infant/Toddler</i> | \$72,090.20 | | | | | | | \$72,090.20 |
| Contra Costa County – Employment and Human Services Department | Infant and Toddler Teacher-Project | \$60,032.28 | \$1,800.00 | | \$34,114.20 | \$921.24 | | \$6,003.23 | \$102,870.95 |
| Garvey School District | NCC | | | | | | | | |
| Kidango | <i>Early Head Start Lead Teacher</i> | \$74,526.40 | | | | | | \$2,981.06 | \$77,507.46 |
| Oakland Unified School District | <i>Pre-School Teacher ECE</i> | \$103,876.91 | | | | | | \$28,098.70 | \$131,975.61 |
| Unity Council | Teacher | \$62,254.40 | | | \$23,772.00 | \$900.00 | | \$3,112.72 | \$90,039.12 |
| Wu Yee | <i>Lead Infant Toddler/Teacher</i> | \$90,064.00 | | | | | | \$9,006.40 | \$99,070.40 |
| YMCA ¹ | Head Start Infant/Toddler Teacher | \$72,792.00 | | | \$25,792.92 | \$798.60 | | \$7,279.20 | \$106,662.72 |

| | | | |
|---------------------------|-------------|---------------------------|-------------------|
| Base Salary Mean | \$76,519.46 | Total Compensation Mean | \$97,173.78 |
| % above or below the Mean | -20.69% | % above or below the Mean | Insufficient Data |

Notes:
NCC= No Comparable Class
Italicized Comparable classifications= The match was not verified by reviewing a job description or class specification.
1- After two years, the YMCA contributes 10% of annual salary towards retirement.



Benchmark Classification: Early Childhood Center Director
Total Matches: 7

| Labor Market Agency | Comparable Classification Title | Annual Maximum Salary | Deferred Comp | Cafeteria | Health | Dental | Vision | Retirement Contribution | Total Compensation |
|--|---|-----------------------|---------------|-----------|-------------|------------|----------|-------------------------|--------------------|
| City of Oakland | Early Childhood Center Director | \$81,412.50 | | | \$31,868.04 | \$1,392.00 | \$243.96 | \$9,997.46 | \$124,913.96 |
| Action for Boston Community Development Head Start | DNA | | | | | | | | |
| Contra Costa County – Employment and Human Services Department | Site Supervisor I-Project | \$68,076.36 | \$1,800.00 | | \$34,114.20 | \$921.24 | | \$6,807.64 | \$111,719.44 |
| Garvey School District | <i>Program Manager (Center Director)</i> | \$76,779.00 | | | \$32,400.96 | \$545.52 | \$232.20 | \$20,768.72 | \$130,726.40 |
| Kidango | <i>Center Director II</i> | \$89,250.24 | | | | | | \$3,570.01 | \$92,820.25 |
| Oakland Unified School District | <i>CDC Site Administrator</i> | \$122,272.12 | | | | | | \$33,074.61 | \$155,346.73 |
| Unity Council | Center Director | \$77,188.80 | | | \$23,772.00 | \$900.00 | | \$3,859.44 | \$105,720.24 |
| Wu Yee | <i>HeadStart Child Development Center Manager</i> | \$98,700.00 | | | | | | \$9,870.00 | \$108,570.00 |
| YMCA ¹ | Center Director- Early Childhood Impact | \$81,960.00 | | | \$25,792.92 | \$798.60 | | \$8,196.00 | \$116,747.52 |

| | |
|---------------------------|-------------|
| Base Salary Mean | \$87,746.65 |
| % above or below the Mean | -7.22% |

| | |
|---------------------------|-------------------|
| Total Compensation Mean | \$117,378.65 |
| % above or below the Mean | Insufficient Data |

Notes:
DNA= Data Not Available
Italicized Comparable classifications= The match was not verified by reviewing a job description or class specification.
1- After two years, the YMCA contributes 10% of annual salary towards retirement.



Benchmark Classification: Family Advocate
Total Matches: 7

| Labor Market Agency | Comparable Classification Title | Annual Maximum Salary | Deferred Comp | Cafeteria | Health | Dental | Vision | Retirement Contribution | Total Compensation |
|---|---------------------------------|-----------------------------|------------------|-----------|-------------|------------|---------------------------|----------------------------|--------------------|
| City of Oakland | Family Advocate | \$68,601.00 | | | \$31,868.04 | \$1,392.00 | \$243.96 | \$8,424.20 | \$110,529.20 |
| Action for Boston Community Development Head Start | Family Advocate | \$72,090.20 | | | | | | | \$72,090.20 |
| Contra Costa County – Employment and Human Services Department | NCC | | | | | | | | |
| Garvey School District | Family Health Services Worker | \$66,187.00 | | | \$32,400.96 | \$545.52 | \$232.20 | \$17,903.58 | \$117,269.26 |
| Kidango | Head Start Family Advocate | \$71,400.00 | | | | | | \$2,856.00 | \$74,256.00 |
| Oakland Unified School District | ECE Family Navigator | \$81,275.40 | | | | | | \$21,985.00 | \$103,260.40 |
| Unity Council | Family Advocate | \$65,998.40 | | | \$23,772.00 | \$900.00 | | \$3,299.92 | \$93,970.32 |
| Wu Yee | Family Advocate | \$79,248.00 | | | | | | \$7,924.80 | \$87,172.80 |
| YMCA ¹ | Family Advocate | \$72,792.00 | | | \$25,792.92 | \$798.60 | | \$7,279.20 | \$106,662.72 |
| Base Salary Mean | | \$72,713.00 | | | | | Total Compensation Mean | | \$93,525.96 |
| % above or below the Mean | | -5.66% | | | | | % above or below the Mean | | Insufficient Data |

Notes:
NCC= No Comparable Class
Italicized Comparable classifications= The match was not verified by reviewing a job description or class specification.
1- After two years, the YMCA contributes 10% of annual salary towards retirement.



Benchmark Classification: Head Start Coach
Total Matches: 5

| Labor Market Agency | Comparable Classification Title | Annual Maximum Salary | Deferred Comp | Cafeteria | Health | Dental | Vision | Retirement Contribution | Total Compensation |
|--|---|-----------------------|---------------|-----------|-------------|------------|----------|-------------------------|--------------------|
| City of Oakland | Head Start Coach | \$66,319.50 | | | \$31,868.04 | \$1,392.00 | \$243.96 | \$8,144.03 | \$107,967.53 |
| Action for Boston Community Development Head Start | <i>Childhood Education Mentor/Coach</i> | \$62,189.40 | | | | | | | \$62,189.40 |
| Contra Costa County – Employment and Human Services Department | NCC | | | | | | | | |
| Garvey School District | <i>Coach</i> | \$76,779.00 | | | \$32,400.96 | \$545.52 | \$232.20 | \$20,768.72 | \$130,726.40 |
| Kidango | <i>Head Start Coach</i> | \$78,714.48 | | | | | | \$3,148.58 | \$81,863.06 |
| Oakland Unified School District | <i>DNA</i> | | | | | | | | |
| Unity Council | Coach Coordinator | \$78,852.80 | | | \$23,772.00 | \$900.00 | | \$3,942.64 | \$107,467.44 |
| Wu Yee | <i>Education Coach</i> | \$93,450.00 | | | | | | \$9,345.00 | \$102,795.00 |
| YMCA ¹ | NCC | | | | | | | | |

| | |
|---------------------------|-------------|
| Base Salary Mean | \$77,997.14 |
| % above or below the Mean | -14.97% |

| | |
|---------------------------|-------------------|
| Total Compensation Mean | \$97,008.26 |
| % above or below the Mean | Insufficient Data |

Notes:
DNA= Data Not Available
NCC= No Comparable Class
Italicized Comparable classifications= The match was not verified by reviewing a job description or class specification.
1- After two years, the YMCA contributes 10% of annual salary towards retirement.



Benchmark Classification: Head Start Program Coordinator
Total Matches: 2

| Labor Market Agency | Comparable Classification Title | Annual Maximum Salary | Deferred Comp | Cafeteria | Health | Dental | Vision | Retirement Contribution | Total Compensation |
|--|---|-----------------------|---------------|-----------|-------------|------------|----------|-------------------------|--------------------|
| City of Oakland | Head Start Program Coordinator | \$90,830.76 | | | \$31,868.04 | \$1,392.00 | \$243.96 | \$11,154.02 | \$135,488.78 |
| Action for Boston Community Development Head Start | DNA | | | | | | | | |
| Contra Costa County – Employment and Human Services Department | NCC | | | | | | | | |
| Garvey School District | NCC | | | | | | | | |
| Kidango | DNA | | | | | | | | |
| Oakland Unified School District | <i>Special, Enrollment ECE</i> | \$62,131.05 | | | | | | \$16,806.45 | \$78,937.50 |
| Unity Council | Early Head Start Enrollment Coordinator | \$38,544.00 | | | \$23,772.00 | \$900.00 | | \$1,927.20 | \$65,143.20 |
| Wu Yee | DNA | | | | | | | | |
| YMCA ¹ | NCC | | | | | | | | |

| | |
|---------------------------|-------------------|
| Base Salary Mean | \$50,337.53 |
| % above or below the Mean | Insufficient Data |

| | |
|---------------------------|-------------------|
| Total Compensation Mean | \$72,040.35 |
| % above or below the Mean | Insufficient Data |

Notes:
DNA= Data Not Available
NCC= No Comparable Class
Italicized Comparable classifications= The match was not verified by reviewing a job description or class specification.
1- After two year the YMCA contributes 10% of annual salary towards retirement



Benchmark Classification: Head Start/Early Head Start Assistant Instructor
Total Matches: 4

| Labor Market Agency | Comparable Classification Title | Annual Maximum Salary | Deferred Comp | Cafeteria | Health | Dental | Vision | Retirement Contribution | Total Compensation |
|--|--|-----------------------|---------------|-----------|-------------|------------|----------|-------------------------|--------------------|
| City of Oakland | Head Start/Early Head Start Assistant Instructor | \$40,989.00 | | | \$31,868.04 | \$1,392.00 | \$243.96 | \$5,033.45 | \$79,526.45 |
| Action for Boston Community Development Head Start | DNA | | | | | | | | |
| Contra Costa County – Employment and Human Services Department | Assistant Teacher- Project | \$43,901.52 | \$1,800.00 | | \$34,114.20 | \$921.24 | | \$4,390.15 | \$85,127.11 |
| Garvey School District | Teacher Assistant | \$44,759.00 | \$1,790.36 | | \$32,400.96 | \$545.52 | \$232.20 | \$12,107.31 | \$91,835.35 |
| Kidango | DNA | | | | | | | | |
| Oakland Unified School District | NCC | | | | | | | | |
| Unity Council | Floater Teacher | \$49,920.00 | | | \$23,772.00 | \$900.00 | | \$2,496.00 | \$77,088.00 |
| Wu Yee | DNA | | | | | | | | |
| YMCA ¹ | Teacher Assistant | \$47,832.00 | | | \$25,792.92 | \$798.60 | | \$4,783.20 | \$79,206.72 |

| | |
|---------------------------|-------------|
| Base Salary Mean | \$46,603.13 |
| % above or below the Mean | -12.05% |

| | |
|---------------------------|-------------------|
| Total Compensation Mean | \$83,314.30 |
| % above or below the Mean | Insufficient Data |

Notes:
DNA= Data Not Available
Italicized Comparable classifications= The match was not verified by reviewing a job description or class specification.
1- After two years, the YMCA contributes 10% of annual salary towards retirement.



Benchmark Classification: Head Start/Early Head Start Associate Instructor
Total Matches: 6

| Labor Market Agency | Comparable Classification Title | Annual Maximum Salary | Deferred Comp | Cafeteria | Health | Dental | Vision | Retirement Contribution | Total Compensation |
|--|--|-----------------------------|------------------|-----------|-------------|------------|----------|----------------------------|--------------------|
| City of Oakland | Head Start/Early Head Start Associate Instructor | \$48,574.50 | | | \$31,868.04 | \$1,392.00 | \$243.96 | \$5,964.95 | \$88,043.45 |
| Action for Boston Community Development Head Start | Teacher Assistant - HeadStart | \$43,625.40 | | | | | | | |
| Contra Costa County – Employment and Human Services Department | Associate Teacher- Project | \$46,015.32 | \$1,800.00 | | \$34,114.20 | \$921.24 | | \$4,601.53 | \$87,452.29 |
| Garvey School District | NCC | | | | | | | | |
| Kidango | Headstart Associate Teacher -Early HeadStart | \$70,345.60 | | | | | | \$2,813.82 | \$73,159.42 |
| Oakland Unified School District | DNA | | | | | | | | |
| Unity Council | Associate Teacher | \$52,894.40 | | | \$23,772.00 | \$900.00 | | \$2,644.72 | \$80,211.12 |
| Wu Yee | Associate Teacher | \$80,267.20 | | | | | | \$8,026.72 | \$88,293.92 |
| YMCA ¹ | Teacher Assistant | \$47,832.00 | | | \$25,792.92 | \$798.60 | | \$4,783.20 | \$79,206.72 |
| | Base Salary Mean | \$56,829.99 | | | | | | Total Compensation Mean | \$81,664.70 |
| | % above or below the Mean | -14.53% | | | | | | % above or below the Mean | Insufficient Data |

Notes:
DNA= Data Not Available
NCC= No Comparable Class
Italicized Comparable classifications= The match was not verified by reviewing a job description or class specification.
1- After two years, the YMCA contributes 10% of annual salary towards retirement.

Appendix C

The City of Oakland and OUSD Comparison Table

| City of Oakland Classification Title | Annual Max Salary | Minimum Qualifications | OUSD's Classification Title | Annual Max Salary Mean | Minimum Qualifications | % difference between OUSD and the City's Max Annual Salary |
|--|-------------------|---|-----------------------------|------------------------|--|--|
| Head Start Instructor | \$60,684.00 | Education: Bachelor's or advanced degree in Early Childhood Education, including 12 post-secondary semester units in early education or child development, plus 3 units of supervised field experience in ECE/CD setting completed; AND hold, or qualify for, a Master Teacher Child Development Permit (or higher level permit). Experience: Six months of full-time work experience or one year of part-time experience in a licensed childcare center or comparable group child care program. | Pre-School Teacher ECE | \$103,876.91 | Education: Bachelor's degree in child development/early childhood education, including courses needed to meet credential requirements and student teaching classroom experience. Experience: 2 or more years of successful classroom teaching experience. Has recent and relevant training and experience in assessment, data analysis, and working with second language learners. Experience implementing open court reading program and administration of desired results development profile. | 71.18% |
| Early Head Start Instructor | \$60,684.00 | Education: Associate, Bachelor's, or advanced degree in Early Childhood Education/Child Development, including 3 units of supervised field experience in early childhood education/child development, 3 units of which must be in infant/toddler coursework. OR 24 units in ECE/CD, including core courses plus 16 General Education units, 3 units of which must be in infant/toddler coursework. AND hold, or qualify for, a Teacher Permit (or higher level permit). Experience: 6 months of full-time work experience or one year of part-time experience in a licensed childcare center or comparable group child care program. | Pre-School Teacher ECE | \$103,876.91 | Education: Bachelor's degree in child development/early childhood education, including courses needed to meet credential requirements and student teaching classroom experience. Experience: 2 or more years of successful classroom teaching experience. Has recent and relevant training and experience in assessment, data analysis, and working with second language learners. Experience implementing open court reading program and administration of desired results development profile. | 71.18% |
| Early Childhood Center Director | \$81,412.50 | Education: Bachelor's or advanced degree in Early Childhood Education, including 12 post-secondary semester units in early childhood education or child development, plus three (3) units of supervised field experience in ECE/setting, AND a Children's Center Supervisory Permit (or higher level permit). Experience: Two years of teaching in a licensed child care center or comparable group child care program. Previous experience in a Head Start Program is highly desirable. | CDC Site Administrator | \$122,272.12 | Education: 12 units in early childhood education. A Master's degree in education or child development is desirable. Possession of California elementary teaching and administrative/Supervision credentials authorizing service in preschool through adult education. Experience: 2 years experience in early childhood education or a childcare and development program. | 50.19% |
| Family Advocate | \$68,601.00 | Education: Associate's Degree in elementary education, social work, counseling, nursing, or a related field with a minimum of 12 Early Childhood Education units. Experience: 2 years of experience in coordinating or implementing health, social, or education services to low-income families. | ECE Family Navigator | \$81,275.40 | Education: Bachelor Degree or its equivalent required with coursework in social services or related field. A combination of experience and education maybe used to meet the Bachelor Degree requirement; however, the work experience years used to qualify for the Bachelor Degree requirement cannot be used to meet the work requirement. Experience: 2 years of work experience in the areas of social services or education. 2-4 years of experience working in parent education, parent advocacy programs involvement programs. | 18.48% |
| Head Start Coach | \$66,319.50 | Pending | DNA | \$0.00 | DNA | |
| Head Start Program Coordinator | \$90,830.76 | Education: Bachelor's degree in early childhood development, public health, education, and public administration. A Master's degree is highly desirable. Experience: 2 years of progressively responsible work experience in social service, public health, or educational/literacy programs. | Special, Enrollment ECE | \$62,131.05 | Education: Associate of Arts Degree required. Experience: 4 years experience working with families and students in a customer service environment. | -31.60% |
| Head Start/Early Head Start Assistant Instructor | \$40,989.00 | Education: 6 units of Early Childhood Education or Child Development. Additional requirement for early head start program assistant instructors: Education must include three (3) units of Infant/Toddler coursework. Experience: None required. Experience in a licensed child care center or comparable group child care program is highly desirable. | NCC | \$0.00 | NCC | |
| Head Start/Early Head Start Associate Instructor | \$48,574.50 | Education: 12 post-secondary semester units or equivalent quarter units in early childhood education or child development. Candidates must have units that cover the general areas of child growth and development, child family and community, child and family, or program/curriculum; AND hold, or qualify for, an Associate Teacher Child Development Permit (or higher level permit). Additional requirement for early head start program substitutes: Education must include six (6) units of Infant/Toddler coursework. Experience: 4 months of full-time work experience or equivalent part-time experience in a licensed child care center or comparable group child care program. | DNA | \$0.00 | DNA | |

Appendix D

Benefit Tables

Retirement Contribution, Deferred Compensation, and FICA Participation

This table reports data on retirement plans, including employer contributions.

| Agency | Retirement Plan | Employer Retirement Contribution |
|---|-----------------|----------------------------------|
| City of Oakland | PERS | 12.28% |
| ABCD Head Start | DNA | DNA |
| Contra Costa County- Employment and Human Services Department | PERS | 10.10% |
| Garvey School District | PERS | 27.05% |
| Kidango | 401 | 4% Match |
| Oakland Unified School District | PERS | 27.05% |
| Unity Council | 401 | 5% |
| YMCA | 401 | 10% |
| WuYee | 403B | 10% matching after one year. |

Health Plan Contributions

This table reports the employer contribution to cafeteria plans and health benefits, which include medical, dental, and vision plans offered to employees and their eligible dependents.

| Agency | Cafeteria | Medical | Dental | Vision |
|---|------------|--|--|--|
| City of Oakland | N/A | \$2,655.67 | \$116.00 | \$20.33 |
| ABCD Head Start | DNA | DNA | DNA | DNA |
| Contra Costa County- Employment and Human Services Department | N/A | \$2,842.85 | \$76.77 | N/A |
| Garvey School District | N/A | \$2,700.08 | \$45.46 | \$19.35 |
| Kidango | DNA | DNA | DNA | DNA |
| Oakland Unified School District | DNA | Pays the full contribution for full-time employees | Pays the full contribution for full-time employees | Pays the full contribution for full-time employees |
| Unity Council | N/A | \$1,981.00 | \$75.00 | N/A |
| YMCA | N/A | \$2,149.41 | \$66.55 | N/A |
| WuYee | N/A | Pays the full contribution for full-time employees | Pays the full contribution for full-time employees | Pays the full contribution for full-time employees |

Other Compensation Allowances/Incentives

This table reports on pay practices for recruitment, referral, or retention pay, education incentive pay, license/certification pay, and professional development pay.

| Agency | Allowance/Incentive Types | | | |
|---|---|---|---------------------------|-------------------------------|
| | Recruitment Signing & Referral Pay | Education Incentives | License/Certification Pay | Professional Development/ Pay |
| City of Oakland | N/A | 2.5%- Master Teach | 2.5% or 5% | \$250- SD1 \$450- TW1 |
| ABCD Head Start | DNA | DNA | DNA | DNA |
| Contra Costa County- Employment and Human Services Department | Up to \$6,000- recruitment pay \$12,000 retention pay | N/A | N/A | \$525 for two years. |
| Garvey School District | \$1,000- recruitment pay | Provides a variable pay incentive, which starts at a 2% increase in the base salary. The variable pay amount is determined based on creditable years of exp. (1 to 24 years) and obtaining a BA, BA+15 units, BA+30 units, BA+45 units, or BA+60 units. | DNA | DNA |

| Agency | Allowance/Incentive Types | | | |
|---------------------------------|--------------------------------------|---|---|--|
| | Recruitment Signing & Referral Pay | Education Incentives | License/Certification Pay | Professional Development/ Pay |
| Kidango | \$2,500- recruitment pay | DNA | Up to \$5,250 for a degree program or teaching permit | |
| Oakland Unified School District | DNA | Provides a variable pay incentive, which starts with a 1% increase in the base salary. The variable pay amount is determined based on creditable years of exp. (1 to 24 years) and obtaining a Master Teacher Permit, Site Supervisor Permit, Director Permit, Master Teach, Site Supervisor, Director permit with a BA +30 units above the permit; Master Teach, Site Supervisor, Director permit with a BA +60 units above the permit, Master Teach, Site Supervisor; Director permit with a BA +75 units above the permit; and Master Teach, Site Supervisor; Director permit with a BA +90 units above the permit | | DNA |
| Unity Council | \$1,000 | \$4,622.80- AA \$5,187.87- BA | The benefit is provided but varies for each employee | The benefit is provided but varies for each employee |
| YMCA | N/A | The amounts are unknown, but pay is adjusted based on the units, permits, degrees, and years of experience. | | \$500 per year. |
| WuYee | \$2,000 (Teachers only) hiring bonus | N/A | N/A | N/A |