



Privacy Advisory Commission
September 6, 2018 5:00 PM
Oakland City Hall
Hearing Room 1
1 Frank H. Ogawa Plaza, 1st Floor
Meeting Agenda

Commission Members: *District 1 Representative: Reem Suleiman, District 2 Representative: Chloe Brown, District 3 Representative: Brian M. Hofer, District 4 Representative: Lou Katz, District 5 Representative: Raymundo Jacquez III, District 6 Representative: Clint M. Johnson, District 7 Representative: Robert Oliver, Council At-Large Representative: Saied R. Karamooz, Mayoral Representative: Heather Patterson*

Each person wishing to speak on items must fill out a speaker's card. Persons addressing the Privacy Advisory Commission shall state their names and the organization they are representing, if any.

1. 5:00pm: Call to Order, determination of quorum
2. 5:05pm: Review and approval of June and July meeting minutes
3. 5:10pm: Open Forum
4. 5:15pm: Surveillance Equipment Ordinance – staff status update regarding department outreach for survey of existing equipment
5. 5:20pm: Sanctuary Contracting Ordinance – staff status update regarding review and introduction to Council
6. 5:25pm: Sanctuary “non-cooperation” Ordinance – staff status update on introduction of ordinance to Council.
7. 5: 40pm: Surveillance Equipment Ordinance – Department of Transportation – UAV/Drones. Review Anticipated Impact Report and take possible action on proposed Use Policy.
8. 7:00pm: Adjournment



Privacy Advisory Commission
July 9, 2018 5:00 PM
Oakland City Hall
Hearing Room 2
1 Frank H. Ogawa Plaza, 1st Floor
Special Meeting Minutes

Commission Members: *District 1 Representative: Reem Suleiman, District 2 Representative: Chloe Brown, District 3 Representative: Brian M. Hofer, District 4 Representative: Lou Katz, District 5 Representative: Raymundo Jacquez III, District 6 Representative: Clint M. Johnson, District 7 Representative: Robert Oliver, Council At-Large Representative: Saied R. Karamooz, Mayoral Representative: Heather Patterson*

Each person wishing to speak on items must fill out a speaker's card. Persons addressing the Privacy Advisory Commission shall state their names and the organization they are representing, if any.

1. 5:00pm: Call to Order, determination of quorum

A quorum was established with only member Johnson unable to attend.

2. 5:05pm: Review and approval of June meeting minutes

The minutes were approved.

3. 5:10pm: Open Forum

There were no Open Forum Speakers.

4. 5:15pm: Surveillance Equipment Ordinance – status update regarding department outreach for survey of existing equipment.

Joe DeVries reported that he had presented at the department Head Meeting last month and was preparing a memo that would provide guidance as to what existing technologies are currently in use and will bring a list back to the PAC at the September Meeting.

5. 5:20pm: Discuss and create working group for review of Federal law enforcement task force agreements.

Tim Birch with OPD proposed that a working group (ad hoc committee) be created of select PAC members who will meet directly with OPD staff to review MOUs with federal agencies and bring recommendations

to the PAC. He anticipates approximately 6 MOUs per year that would require review. The ad hoc committee was created and includes: Chairperson Hofer, Member Karamooz, Member Katz, and Member Oliver.

6. 5:30pm: Surveillance Equipment Ordinance - "Large Scale Event- Warriors Parade". Receive and take possible action on staff informational report.

The PAC received the report from Captain Holmgren and approved it for submission to the Public Safety Committee.

Captain Holmgren reported that the drone detection device was able to identify 20 drones with only 3 in an area considered potentially risky and 1 incident where a drone flew close to a dignitary. There were zero confiscations and zero complaints filed. There were some Wi-Fi connectivity issues and it was a good training for future events.

Captain Holmgren also reported that the cameras installed by NCRIC did not capture footage of any crimes (there were no incidents and no arrests at the parade). The cameras were running from 8am the morning of the parade until the crowds disbursed and were taken down and returned two days later.

There was one public speaker: JP Masser asked what the cost of the drone detection system was and the Captain offered to follow-up with that information.

7. 5:40pm: Surveillance Equipment Ordinance – Police Department – "Ride Along" software application. Review and take possible action on Anticipated Impact Report.

Rose Sutton with OPD introduced the team from Ride Along who provided a thorough overview (via PowerPoint) of the product and its purpose in assisting OPD when they respond to calls for service involving someone with a history of mental illness. They took questions from the PAC and also received input on the Anticipated Impact Statement.

A summary of concerns raised by the PAC included:

- *Protecting privacy of the people in the database*
- *Outreach to the homeless and those with mental health problems to see that they have input into the product design*
- *Creating quantitative measures of success (such as a reduction in calls for service and avoiding cost savings estimates that cannot be verified or are purely anecdotal*
- *Indicating alternatives in the Impact Statement including competing software that may be available and/or "status quo" if no other alternative exists.*

There was one public speaker on the item: JP Masser raised several concerns about the homeless and this being used to further alienate or criminalize them. He also wanted to see more in the Impact Statement about protecting people's privacy.

Staff will bring back a revised Anticipated Impact Statement in the fall.

8. 6:10pm: Police Department proposal to amend City retention schedule pertaining to Body Worn Camera footage. Review and take possible action on proposal.

The PAC reviewed OPD's resolution to Council that authorizes the deletion of Body Work Camera records that are over two years old. This will prevent OPD from spending significant resources storing data that is unnecessary and does not affect any footage retained for investigative purposes.

9. 7:00pm: Adjournment

Public Works/ City Facilities - Inventory of Surveillance Technology

Technology	Address	Description	Department	Quantity
CCTV	Lionel J. Wilson Building 150 Frank H. Ogawa Plaza, Oakland, CA 94612	Cameras are used to monitor public spaces by security guards and recordings are kept for at least 30 days after which recording is overwritten. In case of incident event (criminal activity, accident/misc. incident) recordings are kept for longer period of time. In some instances copy of the recording is given to police as part of their investigation.	Oakland Public Works	14
CCTV	Dalziel Building 250 Frank H. Ogawa Plaza, Oakland, CA 94612	Cameras are used to monitor public spaces by security guards and recordings are kept for at least 30 days after which recording is overwritten. In case of incident event (criminal activity, accident/misc. incident) recordings are kept for longer period of time. In some instances copy of the recording is given to police as part of their investigation.	Oakland Public Works	43
CCTV	City Hall 1 Frank H. Ogawa Plaza, Oakland, CA 94612	Cameras are used to monitor public spaces by security guards and recordings are kept for at least 30 days after which recording is overwritten. In case of incident event (criminal activity, accident/misc. incident) recordings are kept for longer period of time. In some instances copy of the recording is given to police as part of their investigation.	Oakland Public Works	5
Card Access System	Lionel J. Wilson Building 150 Frank H. Ogawa Plaza, Oakland, CA 94612	Card access system is used to provide security and access to various doors using an access card. Access card is presented near access card reader (proximity reader) for system to release door. City staff have specific access rights according to their place of work and access levels that have been approved by their department heads. The system stores card access activity for several years.	Oakland Public Works	Most office suites and restroom doors
Card Access System	Dalziel Building 250 Frank H. Ogawa Plaza, Oakland, CA 94612	Card access system is used to provide security and access to various doors using an access card. Access card is presented near access card reader (proximity reader) for system to release door. City staff have specific access rights according to their place of work and access levels that have been approved by their department heads. The system stores card access activity for several years.	Oakland Public Works	Most office suites and restroom doors
Card Access System	City Hall 1 Frank H. Ogawa Plaza, Oakland, CA 94612	Card access system is used to provide security and access to various doors using an access card. Access card is presented near access card reader (proximity reader) for system to release door. City staff have specific access rights according to their place of work and access levels that have been approved by their department heads. The system stores card access activity for several years.	Oakland Public Works	Most office suites and restroom doors
CCTV	7101 Edgewater Dr. Oakland CA. 94621	Cameras are used to monitor corp yard property, fuel island and employee parking lots. they are monitored by security guards and recordings are kept for at least 30 days after which recording is overwritten. In case of incident event (criminal activity, accident/misc. incident) recordings are kept for longer period of	Oakland Public Works	11

Card Access System	7101 Edgewater Dr. Oakland CA. 94621	Card access system is used to provide security access to various buildings located at the MSC and the employee parking lots. Access card is presented near access card reader (proximity reader) for system to release door. City staff have specific access rights according to their place of work and access levels that have been approved by their department heads. The system stores card access activity for several years.	Oakland Public Works	43
CCTV	5050 Coliseum Way, Oakland CA. 94621	Cameras are used to monitor equipment shop perimeter, storage yard and employee parking lot. Recordings are kept for at least 30 days after which recording is overwritten. In case of incident event (criminal activity, accident/misc. incident) recordings are kept for longer period of	Oakland Public Works	4
CCTV	750 50th Avenue, Oakland CA. 94621	Cameras are used to monitor KOCB building and employee parking lot. Recordings are kept for at least 30 days after which recording is overwritten.	Oakland Public Works	3
CCTV	Carmen Flores Recreation Center 1637 Fruitvale Ave. Oakland CA 94601	Cameras are used to provide security and crime deterrence, they are not monitored	Oakland Parks, Recreation and Youth Development	?
CCTV	Cesar Chavez Park 3705 Foothill Blvd. Oakland CA 94601	Cameras are used to provide security and crime deterrence, they are not monitored	Oakland Parks, Recreation and Youth Development	?
CCTV	East Oakland Sports Center 9161 Edes Ave. Oakland CA 94603	Cameras are used to provide security and crime deterrence, they are not monitored	Oakland Parks, Recreation and Youth Development	6
CCTV	FM Smith Recreation Center 1969 Park Blvd. Oakland CA	Cameras are used to provide security and crime deterrence, they are not monitored	Oakland Parks, Recreation and Youth Development	?
CCTV	Lincoln Square Recreation Center 250 10th St. Oakland CA 94601	Cameras are used to provide security and crime deterrence, they are not monitored	Oakland Parks, Recreation and Youth Development	?
CCTV	Malonga Casquelourd 1428 Alice St. Oakland CA 94601	Cameras are used to provide security and crime deterrence, they are not monitored	Oakland Parks, Recreation and Youth Development	6
CCTV	Studio One Recreation Center 365 - 45th St. Oakland CA	Cameras are used to provide security and crime deterrence, they are not monitored	Oakland Parks, Recreation and Youth Development	20
CCTV	West Oakland Youth Center 3233 Market St. Oakland CA 94608	Cameras are used to provide security and crime deterrence, they are not monitored	Oakland Parks, Recreation and Youth Development	5
CCTV	Digital Arts and Culinary Center 5818 International Blvd Oakland CA. 94621	Cameras are used to provide security and crime deterrence, they are not monitored	Oakland Parks, Recreation and Youth Development	?
CCTV	81st Branch Library 1021 81st Ave. Oakland CA	Cameras are used to provide security and crime deterrence, they are not monitored	Oakland Public Library	24
CCTV	AAMLO 659 - 14th St. Oakland CA 94612	Cameras are used to provide security and crime deterrence, they are monitored by the security guard	Oakland Public Library	1
CCTV	Cesar Chavez Library 3301 East 12th St. Oakland CA 94601	Cameras are used to provide security and crime deterrence, they are not monitored	Oakland Public Library	8
CCTV	Dimond Branch 3565 Fruitvale Ave. Oakland CA 94602	Cameras are used to provide security and crime deterrence, they are not monitored	Oakland Public Library	2

CCTV	Eastmont Branch 7200 Bancroft Ave. Suite 211 Oakland CA 94605	Cameras are used to provide security and crime deterrence, they are not monitored	Oakland Public Library	?
CCTV	Elmhurst Branch 1427 - 88th Ave. Oakland CA 94621	Cameras are used to provide security and crime deterrence, they are not monitored	Oakland Public Library	?
CCTV	Golden Gate Branch 5606 San Pablo Ave. Oakland CA 94608	Cameras are used to provide security and crime deterrence, they are not monitored	Oakland Public Library	1
CCTV	MLK Branch 6833 International Blvd. Oakland CA 94621	Cameras are used to provide security and crime deterrence, they are not monitored	Oakland Public Library	5
CCTV	Melrose Branch 4805 Foothill Blvd. Oakland CA 94601	Cameras are used to provide security and crime deterrence, they are not monitored	Oakland Public Library	3
CCTV	Temescal Branch 5205 Telegraph Ave. Oakland CA	Cameras are used to provide security and crime deterrence, they are not monitored	Oakland Public Library	?
CCTV	Veterans Building 200 Grand Ave. Oakland CA 94610	Cameras are used to provide security and crime deterrence, they are not monitored	Department of Human Services	1

OPD Surveillance Technologies as of August 29, 2018

Item	Description
Automated License Plate Recognition (ALPR)	Cameras photograph all seen license plates and use optical recognition software to structure text of license, and populate into license database for tracking.
FLIR Camera / Helicopter	Thermal and video camera in helicopter.
Thermal Imaging /VIDEO ATTIC Camera	Thermal and Infrared camera on mobile pole
FLIR Camera / Boat	Thermal and video camera in boat
FLIR Camera / Portable Observation Tower	Thermal and video camera in portable manned observation tower.
Pole mounted Video Camera	Video camera on a pole that can be moved to different locations and powered by utility. Reviewed remotely.
Body Worn Camera (BWC)	Officer BWC manually used to record videos. Officers use docking system to upload to city-maintained server system, w/ plans to upgrade to cloud-storage system.
IP Addresses of live-streamed privately-owned video cameras voluntarily provided by business owners	Business owners voluntarily provide IP addresses of private video cameras to OPD personnel.
Remote Audio Telecommunications Monitoring	Technology is used to monitor private phone calls.
Cellphone Data Extraction Equipment	Technology is used to manually download data from seized cell phones.
Cell Site Simulator	Machine to mimic cell phone tower signals and determine location of cell phones with predetermined identifiers for specific cell phones or in rescue mode to locate cell phones with unknown identifiers.
GPS Tracker	Technology is used to track non-OPD vehicles in the course of an investigation.
Hostage Negotiation Throw Phone	The phone that OPD uses to throw into structures with hostage takers include communication capabilities.
Robot (Land)	The OPD (land) robot for critical incident use includes remote access video capability, to the operator.
Robot (Water)	The OPD aquatic robot includes remote access video capability to the operator via cabled connection.
Gunshot Locater Technology	OPD uses gunshot locater technology (ShotSpotter) to determine time and place as well as other data concerning gunshots.

OakDOT - Inventory of Surveillance Technology

Technology	Address	Description	Department	Quantity
Traffic Signal Cameras	Various: see "Traffic Camera" tab	Cameras located at intersections that are used to detect vehicles and trigger traffic signals. These cameras do not record; they have no hard drives or memory to store data.	Department of Transportation	27
CCTV	City Center West Garage 1250 Martin Luther King Jr. Way, Oakland, CA 94612	Cameras are used to monitor public spaces by security guards and recordings are kept for at least 30 days after which recording is overwritten. In case of incident event (criminal activity, accident/misc. incident) recordings are kept for longer period of time. In some instances copy of the recording is given to police as part of their investigation.	Department of Transportation	11
CCTV	Dalziel Garage 250 Frank H. Ogawa Plaza, Oakland, CA 94612	Cameras are used to monitor public spaces by security guards and recordings are kept for at least 30 days after which recording is overwritten. In case of incident event (criminal activity, accident/misc. incident) recordings are kept for longer period of time. In some instances copy of the recording is given to police as part of their investigation.	Department of Transportation	19
CCTV	Montclair Garage 6235 La Salle , Oakland, CA 94611	Cameras are used to monitor public spaces by security guards and recordings are kept for at least 30 days after which recording is overwritten. In case of incident event (criminal activity, accident/misc. incident) recordings are kept for longer period of time. In some instances copy of the recording is given to police as part of their investigation.	Department of Transportation	8
Card Access System	City Center West Garage 1250 Martin Luther King Jr. Way, Oakland, CA 94612	Card access system is used to provide controlled access to the facility for vehicles and, in the case of pedestrian entrances, drivers. Access card is presented near access card reader (proximity reader) for system to raise gate or access or release a door. Monthly parkers and city employees using pool vehicles have specific access rights according to their garage. The system stores card access activity for several years.	Department of Transportation	1
Card Access System	Dalziel Garage 250 Frank H. Ogawa Plaza, Oakland, CA 94612	Card access system is used to provide controlled access to the facility for vehicles and, in the case of pedestrian entrances, drivers. Access card is presented near access card reader (proximity reader) for system to raise gate or access or release a door. Monthly parkers and city employees using pool vehicles have specific access rights according to their garage. The system stores card access activity for several years.	Department of Transportation	1

Card Access System	Pacific Renaissance Plaza Garage 388 9th St, Oakland, CA 94607	Card access system is used to provide controlled access to the facility for vehicles and, in the case of pedestrian entrances, drivers. Access card is presented near access card reader (proximity reader) for system to raise gate or access or release a door. Monthly parkers have specific access rights according to their garage. The system stores card access activity for several years.	Department of Transportation	1
Card Access System	Telegraph Plaza Garage 2102 Telegraph Ave, Oakland, CA 94612	Card access system is used to provide controlled access to the facility for vehicles and, in the case of pedestrian entrances, drivers. Access card is presented near access card reader (proximity reader) for system to raise gate or access or release a door. Monthly parkers have specific access rights according to their garage. The system stores card access activity for several years.	Department of Transportation	1
Card Access System	Harrison St Garage 1200 Harrison St, Oakland, CA 94612	Card access system is used to provide controlled access to the facility for vehicles and, in the case of pedestrian entrances, drivers. Access card is presented near access card reader (proximity reader) for system to raise gate or access or release a door. Monthly parkers have specific access rights according to their garage. The system stores card access activity for several years.	Department of Transportation	1
Card Access System	Franklin Plaza Garage 415 19th St, Oakland, CA 94612	Card access system is used to provide controlled access to the facility for vehicles and, in the case of pedestrian entrances, drivers. Access card is presented near access card reader (proximity reader) for system to raise gate or access or release a door. Monthly parkers have specific access rights according to their garage. The system stores card access activity for several years.	Department of Transportation	1
Smart Parking Network	City-wide, concentrating on commercial district ROW	Sensor-based smart parking system designed to deliver mobile phone app parking availability to consumers and parking management reports to DOT. In February 2017, DOT worked with and secured support of PAC before going to Council and passing Resolution 86581 CMS in support of this project	Department of Transportation	1
Vehicle-Mounted License Plate Recognition (ALPR)	City-wide, roving	ALPR will be used by Parking Enforcement for (1) enforcing time-and meter or permit violations and (2) parking management. The former use is subject to existing evidence requirements for citations; the latter aims to produce occupancy and turn-over data that does not require identifiable information. Staff have drafted Use Policy and Impact Analysis and is working with the PAC to secure its support.	Department of Transportation	5

Human Services Department Inventory of Current Surveillance technology in use

Item	Description
Downtown Oakland Senior Center: Security Cameras in City Buildings	Cameras are used to monitor public spaces by security guards and recordings are kept 1 year for review if a criminal event takes place.
Item	Description
North Oakland Senior Center: Security Cameras outside City Buildings	Cameras are owned and operated by Children's Hospital
Item	Description
Head Start-85 th Ave. Center: Security Cameras in City Buildings	Cameras are owned and operated by the Allen Temple Church at 85 th Ave Center.