



SELECTION PANEL REPORT

TO: Selection Panel for the
Oakland Police Commission

FROM: Felicia Verdin
Assistant to the City Administrator

SUBJECT: 2022 Nomination Process

DATE: July 15, 2022

Action Requested:

For the Selection Panel to:

1. Review, discuss and/or modify the 2022 nomination schedule.
2. Review, discuss and/or modify the evaluation and interview schedule.
3. Determine its next meeting or series of meetings.

Executive Summary:

The Selection Panel received 12¹ Police Commissioner applications for the 2022 nomination process. All candidates that submitted an application by June 30, 2022 Selection Panel meeting. After conclusion of the candidate statements, the Selection Panel will vote on which applicants will be invited to interview with the Selection Panel on August 2.

At this meeting, the Selection Panel may also amend its process for evaluating candidates. The tentative interview schedule and applications are included in Attachment A. At this meeting, the Selection Panel will interview candidates and may decide to nominate a candidate as a Police Commissioner, delay making that nomination, or select candidates that will participate in a second round interview tentatively scheduled for August 2, 2022.

The term for the nominee will initiate on October 17, 2022. Staff proposes the Selection Panel make its decision no later than mid-August 2022, which will allow staff time to complete the required background check and submit the scheduling request and staff report to be heard at a City Council meeting in September.

During its April 26, 2022 meeting, the Selection Panel nominated Angela Jackson-Castain to serve as an Alternate on the Police Commission. On June 7, Ms. Jackson-Castain's appointment was confirmed by the Oakland City City Council meeting. She attended her first meeting on June 23, 2022.

Staff did provide the attached rating sheet to members of the Panel to review applications. Not all members of the Panel submitted a rating sheet to staff. This is an item of discussion for the Panel to determine how the rating sheets could be utilized during the selection process.

Background:

In 2022, the Selection Panel will be nominating a slate of one (1) appointee to the Police Commission and (1) Alternated Police Commissioner for City Council approval. The term for

¹ One applicant, Eric Cavallari did not respond to a request for an interview. Another potential applicant, Clarice Newton only submitted a resume and did not respond to request to complete an application.

Commissioner Jesse Hsieh, currently serving on the Police Commission will expire October 2022. Alternate Commissioner Angela Jackson-Castain's term will also expire in October 2022.

Police Commissioner Terms

Table 1: Terms for Current Police Commissioner

Commissioner	Appointing Authority	Term End Date
Tyfahra Milele, <i>Chair</i>	Mayor	Oct. 2023
Marsha Peterson, <i>Vice-Chair</i>	Selection Panel	Oct. 2023
Jess Hsieh	Selection Panel	Oct. 2022
Brenda Harbin-Forte	Mayor	Oct. 2022
Rudolph Howell	Selection Panel	Oct 2024
Regina Jackson	Mayor	Oct. 2021
David Jordan	Mayor	Oct. 2023
<i>Angela Jackson-Castain, Alternate</i>	Selection Panel	Oct. 2022
Karely Ordaz, Alternate	Mayor	Oct. 2023

Nomination Schedule

The Selection Panel determined the 2022 nomination schedule as reference below in **Table 2**:

Table 2: 2022 Nomination Schedule

Activity	Date
Application released	May 2022
Joint press release with Mayor announcing 2022 nomination period	May 20, 2022
Incumbents notified	May 27, 2022
Application deadline	June 30, 2022
Candidate interviews (first round)	July 19, 2022
Finalist interviews (second round)	August 2, 2022
Determination of slate	August 10, 2022
Background check process complete	early-September 2022
Council confirmation	September 20, 2022

As previously mentioned, if the goal is to get a nominee scheduled for confirmation at the City Council meeting of September 20, 2022, the Selection Panel will need to determine the nominee no later than mid-August 2022. All other dates can be adjusted accordingly based on input from the Selection Panel.

2022 Police Commission Application

The current Police Commission application available on the City's website at <https://cao-94612.s3.amazonaws.com/documents/Police-Commission-2022-Application.pdf>

The Police Commissioner Application is available online in English, Spanish, Chinese and Vietnamese on the Police Commission webpage (www.oaklandca.gov/boards-commissions/police-commission).

Additionally, staff was able to provide the following outreach:

- Press release to all media contacts
- Email communication to announce and request distribution of information to:
 - Mayor's Office
 - City Council Offices
 - City service provider networks
 - Selection Panel Members
 - Oakland Police Commissioners
 - Community Police Review Agency
 - Oakland Neighbors Inspiring Trust
 - Latino Task Force
 - Oakland Community Organizations

In 2020, Vice Chairperson Brendalynn Goodall worked with KLBX radio to run a 15-second Public Service Announcement (PSA) leading up to the application deadline. The PSA was advertised free of charge and aired 30 times between May 29 to June 12, 2020.

Also in 2020, Member Lorelei Bosserman organized outreach efforts by the Selection Panel and maintained a database of organizations that were contacted directly by Selection Panel Members.

Applicant Statistics

Table 3 shows application statistics by nomination year. There were no nominations required in 2018.

Table 3: Applications Statistics by Year

Nomination Year	Applications Received	Applicants Invited to Interview	Nominations made by Selection Panel
2017	146	28	4 Commissioners; 1 Alternate
2019	16	10	1 Commissioner; 1 Alternate
2020	68	17	2 Commissioners
2021	16	5	1 Commissioner
2022	12	To be determined	To be determined

For questions regarding this report, contact Felicia Verdin at (510) 238-3128 or fverdin@oaklandca.gov.

Attachment:

- A) 2022 Applicant Evaluation Tool
- B) 2021 Finalist Interview questions
- C) Selection Panel Rating Sheet

ATTACHMENT A
Applicant Evaluation Tool



APPLICANT EVALUATION TOOL
Position: Police Commissioner (Volunteer)

Position Description

Serve on Police Commission public body of seven (7) members plus two (2) alternates. The Police Commission's role is to oversee the Oakland Police Department's policies, practices and customs to meet national standards of constitutional policing and oversee the Community Police Review Agency that investigates police misconduct and recommends discipline.

Core Competencies, Interview Questions & Evaluation

Core competencies are the identified knowledge, skills, and/or abilities that are necessary to the successful performance of an Oakland Police Commissioner. The objective of the interview is to assess the competency and qualifications for serving as a Police Commissioner. The Selection Panel will ask each applicant a series of questions that are designed to understand the applicant's qualifications in the following areas:

A. Interpersonal / Collaborative

- a. Works cooperatively and productively with others to achieve results.
- b. Respects and welcomes diverse perspectives. Able to process multiple points of view and achieve constructive results.
- c. Respects the confidentiality of information or concerns shared by others.
- d. Strong communications skills – both written and oral.

B. Judgement / Decision-Making

- a. Has a strong sense of urgency about solving problems and getting work done.
- b. Effectively analyzes and interprets rules and regulations.
- c. Understands inter-relational systems and influences.
- d. Applies factual information, due diligence and sound judgment in making decisions and dealing with confidential and/or sensitive information.

C. Analytic / Investigative Practices

- a. Has knowledge and/or experience in sound investigative practices.
- b. Has knowledge and/or experience in applying a racial equity framework and systems thinking approach to identifying and addressing issues.

D. Values / Commitment / Perspective

- a. Seeks and synthesizes community perspective into decision-making.
- b. Able to commit time and energy to serving on Police Commission.
- c. Brings perspective of community most impacted by law enforcement (e.g., race, gender, disability, residency, etc.)

E. Level of Interest

- a. Understands role and authority of Police Commission.

Applicant Name: _____

Evaluator Initials: _____

A. Based on the responses to the following interview questions, rate the applicant’s strength of the **Core Competency – Interpersonal / Collaborative**:

1. Tell us about your experience working effectively with others, including your experience working on other boards, commissions and groups. How did you handle conflict in these situations?

2. Scenario: The Commission's members strongly disagree on an issue. What would you do to forge a consensus or reach a compromise?

Core Competency	Exceptional (5)	Strong (4)	Fair (3)	Weak (2)	Not Acceptable (1)
Interpersonal / Collaborative					
Comments	<i>Note. The Comments section allows for a qualitative assessment, to complement the quantitative scores.</i>				

Applicant Name: _____

Evaluator Initials: _____

B. Based on the responses to the following interview questions, rate the applicant’s strength of the **Core Competency – Judgement / Decision-Making**:

3. While serving on the Police Commission there will be a great deal of pressure from the public, fellow commission members and City staff. What skills will you draw on to manage this and come to a fact-based decision?
4. Tell us about your experience and/or opinion of the Oakland Police Department.
5. Describe an experience where you had to make a difficult decision that affected someone’s life.
6. Being a Commissioner may involve being insulted by the public and criticized by the police. Have you ever been publicly insulted? What advice would you give to someone about how to handle it?
7. Has someone you disagreed with ever changed your mind about something? Please provide an example.

Core Competency	Exceptional (5)	Strong (4)	Fair (3)	Weak (2)	Not Acceptable (1)
Judgement / Decision-Making					
Comments	<i>Note. The Comments section allows for a qualitative assessment, to complement the quantitative scores.</i>				

Applicant Name: _____

Evaluator Initials: _____

C. Based on the responses to the following interview questions, rate the applicant’s strength of the **Core Competency – Analytic / Investigative Practices**:

8. Throughout the Federal Court's oversight of O.P.D., the Court has consistently criticized OPD's Internal Affairs Division for the thoroughness, objectivity and professionalism of its investigations of alleged officer misconduct and there is a public perception that both line police officers and their supervisors are rarely held accountable. What structural or policy changes should the Commission explore to address this issue?

9. How does institutional racism and systemic oppression impact the department’s ability to achieve compliance with the Negotiated Settlement Agreement?

10. How do you define police brutality and what are the key elements that produce it?

11. With the assistance of a Court-appointed expert, it has been fully established that OPD officers have for some time and continue to make racially-biased stops of motorists and pedestrians. What actions should the Commission take to change this OPD practice?

Core Competency	Exceptional (5)	Strong (4)	Fair (3)	Weak (2)	Not Acceptable (1)
Analytic / Investigative Practices					
Comments	<i>Note. The Comments section allows for a qualitative assessment, to complement the quantitative scores.</i>				

Applicant Name: _____

Evaluator Initials: _____

D. Based on the responses to the following interview questions, rate the applicant's strength of the **Core Competency – Values / Commitment / Perspective**:

12. Tell us about your current schedule outside your career or volunteer community work. How would you manage the additional hours (up to 20 hours per week) required to participate on the Police Commission?
13. Tell us about your community involvement and what groups you are affiliated with.
14. While serving on the Commission you will learn information that may not be familiar to your life experience, share a brief experience where you had to see through many lenses.
15. Why do you want to be part of the Oakland Police Commission and what impacts would you like to see the Oakland Police Commission have and accomplish?
16. What skills would you bring to the Oakland Police Commission?
17. What is the Police Commission doing right?
18. If you became a Police Commissioner, what would you do differently?
19. For you personally, which of your work, community service and/or organizational leadership experiences would help you in serving on the Oakland Police Commission?

POLICE COMMISSIONER APPLICANT EVALUATION TOOL

Applicant Name: _____

Evaluator Initials: _____

Core Competency	Exceptional (5)	Strong (4)	Fair (3)	Weak (2)	Not Acceptable (1)
Values / Commitment / Perspective					
Comments	<p><i>Note. The Comments section allows for a qualitative assessment, to complement the quantitative scores.</i></p>				

Applicant Name: _____

Evaluator Initials: _____

E. Based on the responses to the following interview questions, rate the applicant’s strength of the Core **Competency – Level of Interest:**

20. When did you first become interested in the Police Commission? What have you done to learn more about it? And what are your impressions?

21. Have you attended any Police Commission meetings either in person or virtually?

Core Competency	Exceptional (5)	Strong (4)	Fair (3)	Weak (2)	Not Acceptable (1)
Level of Interest					
Comments	<i>Note. The Comments section allows for a qualitative assessment, to complement the quantitative scores.</i>				

POLICE COMMISSIONER APPLICANT EVALUATION TOOL

Applicant Name: _____

Evaluator Initials: _____

	Exceptional (5)	Strong (4)	Fair (3)	Weak (2)	Not Acceptable (1)
Overall Score					
Comments					

ATTACHMENT B
Finalist Interview Questions

Standard Questions

1. Would you tell the Panel about your involvement in Public Safety matters in Oakland, and how that involvement has influenced your desire to serve on the Oakland Police Commission?

Follow-up, time permitting

What do you hope to achieve on the Commission?

2. How can the commission make the best use of the data in VISION?

If they don't know, explain it to them and then get an answer.

3. What change in OPD policy is needed to break up the 'thin blue line' or code of silence?
4. What concrete steps should the Commission take to expand community engagement and input? And, what would you do to educate and engage the community in the work of the Commission? Please be specific.
5. While serving on the Commission you will learn information that may not be familiar to your life experience. Please share a brief experience where you had to see through someone else's life experience and give an example.
6. How would you work to gain consensus in a chaotic situation where the Commission is deeply divided on an issue? Are there any similar examples where you have done this?
7. What is your approach to creating highly effective teamwork with colleagues on the Commission, even when belief systems about the work may vary widely? Please give examples where you have done that.
8. How would you handle specific concerns and complaints about the OPD, which are brought to the Commission? These can include instances of excessive force, failure to act in a situation that requires police intervention, etc.
9. What would you advocate as the best process to use to identify the recommendations for the next Police Chief? Would you give preference to promoting from within OPD or to an outsider?
10. How does institutional racism and historic bias influence the effectiveness of efforts by the Courts, the Commission and OPD leadership to revise and implement policy and operational reforms.
11. Since social media plays an enormous role in our culture, what are your thoughts on how Police Commissioners should or should not utilize social media to comment on issues which may come before the Commission, or which may affect the perception of the Commission as a whole?

Optional & Follow Up Questions

12. How do you define police brutality, and what are the key factors responsible for it?
13. How would you grade the Oakland Police Commission's accomplishments to date, and what are its major challenges going forward?
14. What is the most important asset that a candidate for Inspector General should possess? -OR- In the coming year, the Commission will likely recruit and hire its first Inspector General. What do you believe are the most important skills, experience and other qualifications that candidates for this position should have?
15. Describe an experience where you had to make a difficult decision that affected someone's life.
16. Has anyone you disagreed with ever changed your mind about something? Please provide an example.
17. If you are appointed, what would you want your legacy to be after completing your term? What significant contribution would you want the Commission to remember you for?
18. It's often been said that police culture has police policy for lunch. What strategies can the Commission use to align the pace of policy change and cultural change at OPD?
19. In Oakland, in the area of crowd/demonstration control the OPD's "cycle" is to violate both the law and its existing policy, the City to be sued, the City to settle the new lawsuits, sometimes with revisions to its prior policy, and OPD commanders and line personnel to again violate the same laws and policy during future demonstrations. What steps can the Commission take to help break this cycle?
20. With guidance from the Commission, the CPRA Executive Director is in the process of developing a uniform process for charge intake, categorization, investigation and timely decision or resolution of complaints of officer misconduct. What do you believe are the most important components of such a case-handling system?
21. How long have you lived in Oakland?
22. Have you read Measure LL, the 21-page document that defines the Police Commission? (Available on the Police Commission website, <https://www.oaklandca.gov/boards-commissions/police-commission>. Scroll down to "About," near the bottom of the page.)
23. Have you read any of the minutes or agenda packets for any of the Police Commission meetings? (Available on the Police Commission

Finalist Interview Questions

website, <https://www.oaklandca.gov/boards-commissions/police-commission>. Under "Meetings," click "View All Meetings, Minutes & Agendas.")

ATTACHMENT C
Selection Panel
Rating Sheet

Applications submitted for the Oakland Police Commission as of 7/13/22
Selection Panel ratings

Applicants	Rate Application 1-5 5 = highest, 1 = lowest
1. Eric Cavallari	
2. Samantha Columbus	
3. Monica Hollins	
4. Jesse Hsieh	
5. Angela Jackson-Castain	
6. Clarice Newton – no application submitted. Only resume & email	
7. Rakita O’Neal	
8. Thelonious Polk	
9. Barry Robinson	
10. Stacy Thompson	
11. Heather Washington	
12. Margaret Grimsley	
13. Eules Winbush	

Return to rating sheet to Felicia Verdin by July 12, 2022

fverdin@oaklandca.gov

Submitted by _____