



**CITY OF OAKLAND  
REDISTRICTING COMMISSION  
(REGULAR MEETING)**

**Meeting Minutes**

**Wednesday, November 10, 2021**  
Via Teleconference

Redistricting Commissioners: Benjie Achtenberg, Amber Blackwell, Daniel Chesmore (Alternate), Gloria Crowell, Lilibeth Gangas, Shirley Gee, Stephanie Goode, Masoud Hamidi, Paul Marshall, Tracy Richmond McKnight, Diana Miller, Tejal Shah, Bharat Singh (Alternate) Jan Stevens, and Mary Velasco.

Commission website: [www.oaklandca.gov/redistricting](http://www.oaklandca.gov/redistricting)

---

**1. Roll Call and Determination of Quorum**

Quorum was determined and the meeting started at 5:06 pm.

Commissioners present: Gloria Crowell, Lilibeth Gangas, Shirley Gee, Stephanie Goode, Masoud Hamidi, Paul Marshall, Tracy Richmond McKnight, Diana Miller, Tejal Shah, Jan Stevens, and Mary Velasco (arrived at 5:29 pm).

Commissioners excused: Benjie Achtenberg, Amber Blackwell

Alternate Commissioners present: Daniel Chesmore, Bharat Singh.

City staff present: Richard J. Luna, Corey Alvin.

City Attorney staff present: Mitesh Bhakta.

**2. Open Forum**

Public comments were provided by the following speakers:

Mike Zelinski

Mary Vail

Dana Mims

To Niya M. Scott-Smith

**3. Disclosure Requirements by Commissioners**

There were no disclosures made by Commissioners.

There were no public comments on this item.

**CITY OF OAKLAND  
REDISTRICTING COMMISSION  
(REGULAR MEETING)**

**Meeting Minutes (Continued)**

**Wednesday, November 10, 2021**  
Via Teleconference

---

**4. Approval of Meeting Minutes**

The Commission reviewed the draft meeting minutes. A motion was made by Stephanie Goode, seconded by Gloria Crowell, to approve the minutes for the meeting of October 27, 2021. The motion passed with 10 ayes (Crowell, Gangas, Gee, Goode, Hamidi, Marshall, McKnight, Miller, Shah, Stevens), one not present (Velasco) and two excused (Achtenberg, Blackwell).

There were no public comments on this item.

**5. Resolution to Continue Teleconference Meetings**

The Commission reviewed the proposed resolution. A motion was made by Shirley Gee, seconded by Gloria Crowell, to adopt the proposed resolution. The motion passed with 10 ayes (Crowell, Gangas, Gee, Goode, Hamidi, Marshall, McKnight, Miller, Shah, Stevens), one not present (Velasco) and two excused (Achtenberg, Blackwell).

The adopted resolution is included as *Exhibit A*.

There were not public comments on this item.

**6. Outreach Efforts Updates**

Elena Serrano and Charisma Acey provided outreach updates to the Commission, including organizations that were contacted, previous and upcoming in-person events where the public can learn about redistricting. Commissioners discussed various outreach strategies.

Paul Mitchell of Redistricting Partners spoke about the redistricting process while citing other examples from California jurisdictions. Commissioners discussed the impacts of redistricting.

Alternate Commissioner Daniel Chesmore exited the meeting at 6:00 pm.

Public comments were provided by the following speakers:

Mike Zelinski  
Liz Suk  
To Niya M. Scott-Smith  
Iris Merriouns  
Stan Weisner  
Joan Inha

**CITY OF OAKLAND  
REDISTRICTING COMMISSION  
(REGULAR MEETING)**

**Meeting Minutes (Continued)**

**Wednesday, November 10, 2021**  
Via Teleconference

---

**7. Baseline Criteria**

Commissioner Stephanie Goode, on behalf of the Communications Ad Hoc Committee, presented a report on establishing baseline criteria for each draft district map proposal that is produced. Commissioners discussed the proposal, the need to expand definitions on certain criteria, and if the criteria could be mapped.

City staff stated any decisions could be made at the meeting on November 15, 2021, as the item was also noticed for that meeting.

Chair Lilibeth Gangas was excused from the meeting at 6:53 pm.

Public comments were provided by the following speakers:

To Niya M. Scott-Smith  
Brooke Levin  
Brittany Rae Buckmire  
Mary Forte  
Paulina Gonzalez  
Nelson T

No action was taken on this item.

**8. Public Testimony Regarding Redistricting & Draft Map Discussion**

City staff member Richard J. Luna stated that due to the delay in receiving draft district maps E, F, G and H, that staff recommended no action be taken on the new draft maps to allow ample time for the Commissioners and public to review the proposals.

Sophia Garcia of Redistricting Partners presented an overview of the draft maps and answered questions from the Commissioners.

The following public speakers provided public testimony:

Jananai Ramachandran  
Otto  
Stuart Flashman  
To Niya M. Scott-Smith  
Brooke Levin  
Nathan Moon

Written comments were submitted by the following individuals or groups:

Hannah Wolf  
Mary Sullivan  
Ezra Kong

**CITY OF OAKLAND  
REDISTRICTING COMMISSION  
(REGULAR MEETING)**

**Meeting Minutes (Continued)**

**Wednesday, November 10, 2021**  
Via Teleconference

---

Aileen Frankel  
Kathleen Hirooka  
Gary Sirbu  
North Hills Community Association  
Craig Downing  
Helen Smiler  
Doug Berman  
Tom Cuff  
Mike Bradley  
Mary Vail  
Patrick Zak  
Martin Thomas  
Elizabeth Byrne  
Karen Ivy  
Richard Cowan  
Janice Yager  
Carol Bieri  
Christine Acker  
Carolyn Mahoney  
Myrna Walton  
Lara Coffin  
Tim Little  
Richard Hawkins  
Jody London  
Christian Peeples  
Janice Hearn  
Stephanie Bianco  
Thomas Bacon  
Sandra Davidson  
Christian Peeples  
Marilyn Citron  
Karen Brown  
Hilary Fox  
Thomas McGuire  
Diana Sonne  
Jean Follette  
Emily Hou  
Ann Postag

**CITY OF OAKLAND  
REDISTRICTING COMMISSION  
(REGULAR MEETING)**

**Meeting Minutes (Continued)**

**Wednesday, November 10, 2021**  
Via Teleconference

---

Ina Meyrowtiz  
Maryly Snow  
Stella Ma  
Sally Park Rubin  
Margaret Garms  
Giovanni Hernandez, Jessica Ramos, Roxana Perez Lima, Yarency Lizbeth Avelar, and  
Losaline Kakala Moa  
Sally Park Rubin  
Nelson Tam  
Ronald Wacker  
Brooke Levin  
Brigitte Nicoletti

Following testimony, Commissioners stated discussion on the draft maps should hold until the next meeting on November 15, 2021.

**9. Adjournment**

The meeting adjourned at 7:53 pm.

# ***Exhibit A***

## **Adopted Resolution**



CITY ATTORNEY'S OFFICE

**OAKLAND REDISTRICTING COMMISSION**

**RESOLUTION NO. 21-004**

---

**RESOLUTION DETERMINING THAT CONDUCTING IN-PERSON MEETINGS OF THE OAKLAND REDISTRICTING COMMISSION AND ITS COMMITTEES WOULD PRESENT IMMINENT RISKS TO ATTENDEES' HEALTH, AND ELECTING TO CONTINUE CONDUCTING MEETINGS USING TELECONFERENCING IN ACCORDANCE WITH CALIFORNIA GOVERNMENT CODE SECTION 54953(e) AS AMENDED BY CALIFORNIA ASSEMBLY BILL NO. AB-361 (SEPTEMBER 16, 2021).**

**WHEREAS**, on March 4, 2020, Governor Gavin Newsom declared a state of emergency related to COVID-19, pursuant to Government Code Section 8625, and such declaration has not been lifted or rescinded, See <https://www.gov.ca.gov/wp-content/uploads/2020/03/3.4.20-Coronavirus-SOE-Proclamation.pdf> ; and

**WHEREAS**, on March 9, 2020, the City Administrator in their capacity as the Director of the Emergency Operations Center (EOC), issued a proclamation of local emergency due to the spread of COVID-19 in Oakland, and on March 12, 2020, the City Council passed Resolution No. 88075 C.M.S. ratifying the proclamation of local emergency pursuant to Oakland Municipal Code (O.M.C.) section 8.50.050(C); and

**WHEREAS**, City Council Resolution No. 88075 remains in full force and effect to date; and

**WHEREAS**, the Centers for Disease Control (CDC) recommends physical distancing of at least six (6) feet whenever possible, avoiding crowds, and avoiding spaces that do not offer fresh air from the outdoors, particularly for people who are not fully vaccinated or who are at higher risk of getting very sick from COVID-19. See <https://www.cdc.gov/coronavirus/2019-ncov/prevent-getting-sick/prevention.html>; and

**WHEREAS**, the CDC recommends that people who live with unvaccinated people avoid activities that make physical distancing difficult, See <https://www.cdc.gov/coronavirus/2019-ncov/your-health/about-covid-19/caring-for-children/families.html>; and

**WHEREAS**, the CDC recommends that older adults limit in-person interactions as much as possible, particularly when indoors. See <https://www.cdc.gov/aging/covid19/covid19-older-adults.html>; and

**WHEREAS**, the CDC, the California Department of Public Health, and the Alameda County Public Health Department all recommend that people experiencing COVID-19 symptoms stay home, See <https://www.cdc.gov/coronavirus/2019-ncov/if-you-are-sick/steps-when-sick.html>; and

**WHEREAS**, persons without symptoms may be able to spread the COVID-19 virus, See <https://www.cdc.gov/coronavirus/2019-ncov/prevent-getting-sick/prevention.html>; and

**WHEREAS**, fully vaccinated persons who become infected with the COVID-19 Delta variant can spread the virus to others, See <https://www.cdc.gov/coronavirus/2019-ncov/vaccines/fully-vaccinated.html>; and

**WHEREAS**, the City's public-meeting facilities are indoor facilities that are not designed to ensure circulation of fresh / outdoor air, particularly during periods of cold and/or rainy weather; and

**WHEREAS**, the City's public-meeting facilities are not designed to ensure that attendees can remain six (6) feet apart; and

**WHEREAS**, holding in-person meetings would encourage community members from different households to come to City facilities to participate in local government, and some of them would be at high risk of getting very sick from COVID-19 and/or would live with someone who is at high risk; and

**WHEREAS**, in-person meetings will bring community members who are experiencing COVID-19 symptoms to leave their homes in order to come to City facilities and participate in local government; and

**WHEREAS**, some attendees would use ride-share services or public transit to travel to in-person meetings, thereby putting them in close and prolonged contact with additional people outside of their households; and

**WHEREAS**, on September 29, 2021, Commissioners adopted a resolution determining that conducting in-person meetings of the Oakland Redistricting Commission and its committees would present imminent risks to attendees' health, and electing to continue conducting meetings using teleconferencing in accordance with California Government Code Section 54953(e) as amended by California Assembly Bill No. AB-361 (September 16, 2021); now therefore be it:



**RESOLVED:** that the Oakland Redistricting Commission finds and determines that the foregoing recitals are true and correct and hereby adopts and incorporates them into this Resolution; and be it

**FURTHER RESOLVED:** that, based on these determinations and consistent with federal, state and local health guidance, the Oakland Redistricting Commission renews its determination that conducting in-person meetings would pose imminent risks to the health of attendees; and be it

**FURTHER RESOLVED:** that the Oakland Redistricting Commission firmly believes that the community's health and safety seriously and the community's right to participate in local government, are both critically important, and is committed to balancing the two by continuing to use teleconferencing to conduct public meetings, in accordance with California Government Code Section 54953(e), a provision of AB-361; and be it

**FURTHER RESOLVED:** that the Oakland Redistricting Commission will renew these (or similar) findings at least every thirty (30) days in accordance with California Government Code section 54953(e) until the state of emergency related to COVID-19 has been lifted, or the Oakland Redistricting Commission finds that in-person meetings no longer pose imminent risks to the health of attendees, whichever is occurs first.

ADOPTED ON THIS 10<sup>th</sup> DAY OF November, 2021.