



**CITY OF OAKLAND
REDISTRICTING COMMISSION
(REGULAR MEETING)**

Meeting Minutes

Wednesday, October 13, 2021
Via Teleconference

Redistricting Commissioners: Benjie Achtenberg, Amber Blackwell, Daniel Chesmore (Alternate), Gloria Crowell, Lilibeth Gangas, Shirley Gee, Stephanie Goode, Masoud Hamidi, Paul Marshall, Tracy Richmond McKnight, Diana Miller, Tejal Shah, Bharat Singh (Alternate) Jan Stevens, and Mary Velasco.

Commission website: www.oaklandca.gov/redistricting

1. Roll Call and Determination of Quorum

Quorum was determined and the meeting started at 5:02 pm.

Commissioners present: Benjie Achtenberg, Amber Blackwell, Gloria Crowell, Lilibeth Gangas, Shirley Gee, Stephanie Goode, Masoud Hamidi, Paul Marshall, Tracy Richmond McKnight, Diana Miller, Tejal Shah, Jan Stevens, and Mary Velasco.

Commissioners excused: none.

Commissioners absent: none.

Alternate Commissioners present: Daniel Chesmore.

Alternate Commissioners excused: Bharat Singh

City staff present: Richard J. Luna, Corey Alvin.

City Attorney staff present: Mitesh Bhakta.

2. Chair and Co-Vice Chair Rotation Announcement

The Commission welcomed the new leadership team of Chair Lilibeth Gangas and Co-Vice Chairs Diana Miller and Tejal Shah. Commissioners thanked former Chair Tracy Richmond McKnight for her service in leading the Commission.

3. Open Forum

Public comments were provided by the following speakers:

David Peters
Stuart Flashman
Ralph Cook
Leonora Sea
Iris Merriouns

**CITY OF OAKLAND
REDISTRICTING COMMISSION
(REGULAR MEETING)**

Meeting Minutes (Continued)

Wednesday, October 13, 2021
Via Teleconference

4. Disclosure Requirements by Commissioners

Commissioner Shirley Gee reported attending a meeting with City Council President Nikki Fortunato Bas to discuss redistricting. Additionally, Commissioner Gee spoke with Councilmember Treva Reid on conducting additional outreach on redistricting.

Co-Vice Chair Tejal Shah attended a roundtable discussion with Mayor Libby Schaaf and Councilmember Loren Taylor at the Akoma Market where redistricting was discussed.

Commissioner Stephanie Goode attended the Mayor's State of the City event and at the event, thanked Council President Nikki Fortunato Bas for providing additional funding for redistricting work.

Chair Lilibeth Gangas engaged with Councilmember Carroll Fife on social media to help bring awareness to redistricting in District 3.

Commissioner Tracy Richmond McKnight reported speaking about redistricting during open forum at a previous City Council meeting.

There were no public comments on this item.

5. Approval of Meeting Minutes

Commissioners reviewed the draft meeting minutes. A motion was made by Gloria Crowell, seconded by Amber Blackwell, to approve the minutes for the meetings of September 8, 2021 and September 29, 2021. The motion passed with 13 ayes (Achtenberg, Blackwell, Crowell, Gangas, Gee, Goode, Hamidi, Marshall, McKnight, Miller, Shah, Stevens, Velasco).

There were no public comments on this item.

6. Resolution to Continue Teleconference Meetings

Deputy City Attorney Mitesh Bhakta presented a proposed resolution to continue the Commission's determination and findings to hold teleconference meetings.

A motion was made by Tejal Shah, seconded by Tracy Richmond McKnight, to adopt the proposed resolution. The motion passed with 13 ayes (Achtenberg, Blackwell, Crowell, Gangas, Gee, Goode, Hamidi, Marshall, McKnight, Miller, Shah, Stevens, Velasco).

The adopted resolution is included as *Exhibit A*.

**CITY OF OAKLAND
REDISTRICTING COMMISSION
(REGULAR MEETING)**

Meeting Minutes (Continued)

Wednesday, October 13, 2021
Via Teleconference

Public comments were provided by the following speakers:
Iris Merriouns

7. Outreach Consultant Update & Outreach Strategy

Charisma Acey of Outreach by Design presented an update on the outreach strategy, shared proposed posters and flyers that the consultant team created to assist in public awareness, and described the activities taken by the outreach consultants to date.

Commissioners engaged in a discussion on best types of outreach strategies, materials needed to conduct outreach, and the importance of having Commissioners present at in-person events.

Public comments were provided by the following speakers:

David Peters
Liz Suk
Stuart Flashman
Iris Merriouns
Ralph Cook
Susan Piper

No action was taken on this item.

A motion was made by Gloria Crowell, seconded by Tejal Shah to take agenda item 9 (Redistricting Testimony) out of order and to open the public hearing. The motion passed with 13 ayes (Achtenberg, Blackwell, Crowell, Gangas, Gee, Goode, Hamidi, Marshall, McKnight, Miller, Shah, Stevens, Velasco).

9. Redistricting Testimony

Paul Mitchell of Redistricting Partners presented the four draft maps developed by the consultant team on behalf of the Commission, including the methodology used in creating the draft maps.

Commissioners engaged in a discussion on how to narrow down the draft map options for the Commission and public to consider, how communities of interest input should factor into deciding which maps to prioritize, and the need to include additional demographic data in the summary tables for the draft maps.

Commissioner Paul Marshall was excused from the meeting at 7:37 pm.

**CITY OF OAKLAND
REDISTRICTING COMMISSION
(REGULAR MEETING)**

Meeting Minutes (Continued)

Wednesday, October 13, 2021
Via Teleconference

A motion was made by Jan Stevens, seconded by Shirley Gee, to drop draft maps A and C and to close the public hearing. The motion passed with 12 ayes (Achtenberg, Blackwell, Crowell, Gangas, Gee, Goode, Hamidi, McKnight, Miller, Shah, Stevens, Velasco), and one excused (Marshall).

The following public speakers provided public testimony:

Stuart Flashman
Leonora Sea
Liz Suk
David Peters
Stan Weisner
Ronnie Spitzer
Reisa Jaffee
Elizabeth Stage
Ralph Cook
Iris Merriouns
Kevin Dalley

Written comments were submitted by the following individuals or groups:

Leonora Sea on behalf of the Rockridge Community Planning Council Board of Directors
Patrick Messac
Brooke Levin
Theresa Nelson
Jonathan Gabel
Leonora Sea on behalf of the Rockridge Community Planning Council Board of Directors

A motion was made by Tracy Richmond McKnight, seconded by Stephanie Goode, to extend the meeting to 8:30 pm. A friendly amendment made by Benjie Achtenberg was accepted to extend the meeting until 9:00 pm. The motion as amended passed with 12 ayes (Achtenberg, Blackwell, Crowell, Gangas, Gee, Goode, Hamidi, McKnight, Miller, Shah, Stevens, Velasco), and one excused (Marshall).

8. Additional Commission Meetings

Commissioners discussed the need to add additional meetings so the public can provide input on the draft maps before final adoption takes place in December.

Commissioner Shirley Gee was excused from the meeting at 8:12 pm.

Commissioner Benjie Achtenberg provided dates for the Commission to consider as it contemplated adding additional meeting dates and encouraged the Commission to reserve one date for a youth focused engagement event.

**CITY OF OAKLAND
REDISTRICTING COMMISSION
(REGULAR MEETING)**

Meeting Minutes (Continued)

Wednesday, October 13, 2021
Via Teleconference

A motion was made by Benjie Achtenberg, seconded by Tracy Richmond McKnight, to schedule seven additional special meetings or workshops between now and December 8, 2021. The motion passed with 11 ayes (Achtenberg, Blackwell, Crowell, Gangas, Goode, Hamidi, McKnight, Miller, Shah, Stevens, Velasco), and two excused (Gee, Marshall).

Public comments were provided by the following speakers:

Liz Suk
Oliver
Ronnie Spitzer
David Peters
Iris Merriouns

Written comments were submitted by the following individuals or groups:
Sietse Goffard on behalf of the Asian Law Caucus, Oakland Rising, the ACLU
Foundation of Northern California, and the League of Women Voters of Oakland.

9. Ad Hoc Committee Reports

Commissioner Benjie Achtenberg stated he scheduled a presentation with students at McClymonds High School on October 21, 2021 and requested volunteers to assist with the event.

Public comments were provided by the following speakers:

Carroll Fife
David Peters

No action was taken on this item.

10. Agenda Requests for Future Meetings

Commissioner Stephanie Goode requested receiving metrics on the survey responses, outreach activities, and mailings.

Chair Lilibeth Gangas requested the total number of comments and interactions tracked by outreach efforts.

There was no public comment on this item.

11. Adjournment

The meeting adjourned at 9:00 pm.

Exhibit A

Adopted Resolution



CITY ATTORNEY'S OFFICE

OAKLAND REDISTRICTING COMMISSION

RESOLUTION NO. 21-003

RESOLUTION DETERMINING THAT CONDUCTING IN-PERSON MEETINGS OF THE OAKLAND REDISTRICTING COMMISSION AND ITS COMMITTEES WOULD PRESENT IMMINENT RISKS TO ATTENDEES' HEALTH, AND ELECTING TO CONTINUE CONDUCTING MEETINGS USING TELECONFERENCING IN ACCORDANCE WITH CALIFORNIA GOVERNMENT CODE SECTION 54953(e) AS AMENDED BY CALIFORNIA ASSEMBLY BILL NO. AB-361 (SEPTEMBER 16, 2021).

WHEREAS, on March 4, 2020, Governor Gavin Newsom declared a state of emergency related to COVID-19, pursuant to Government Code Section 8625, and such declaration has not been lifted or rescinded, See <https://www.gov.ca.gov/wp-content/uploads/2020/03/3.4.20-Coronavirus-SOE-Proclamation.pdf> ; and

WHEREAS, on March 9, 2020, the City Administrator in their capacity as the Director of the Emergency Operations Center (EOC), issued a proclamation of local emergency due to the spread of COVID-19 in Oakland, and on March 12, 2020, the City Council passed Resolution No. 88075 C.M.S. ratifying the proclamation of local emergency pursuant to Oakland Municipal Code (O.M.C.) section 8.50.050(C); and

WHEREAS, City Council Resolution No. 88075 remains in full force and effect to date; and

WHEREAS, the Centers for Disease Control (CDC) recommends physical distancing of at least six (6) feet whenever possible, avoiding crowds, and avoiding spaces that do not offer fresh air from the outdoors, particularly for people who are not fully vaccinated or who are at higher risk of getting very sick from COVID-19. See <https://www.cdc.gov/coronavirus/2019-ncov/prevent-getting-sick/prevention.html>; and

WHEREAS, the CDC recommends that people who live with unvaccinated people avoid activities that make physical distancing difficult, See <https://www.cdc.gov/coronavirus/2019-ncov/your-health/about-covid-19/caring-for-children/families.html>; and

WHEREAS, the CDC recommends that older adults limit in-person interactions as much as possible, particularly when indoors. See <https://www.cdc.gov/aging/covid19/covid19-older-adults.html>; and

WHEREAS, the CDC, the California Department of Public Health, and the Alameda County Public Health Department all recommend that people experiencing COVID-19 symptoms stay home, See <https://www.cdc.gov/coronavirus/2019-ncov/if-you-are-sick/steps-when-sick.html>; and

WHEREAS, persons without symptoms may be able to spread the COVID-19 virus, See <https://www.cdc.gov/coronavirus/2019-ncov/prevent-getting-sick/prevention.html>; and

WHEREAS, fully vaccinated persons who become infected with the COVID-19 Delta variant can spread the virus to others, See <https://www.cdc.gov/coronavirus/2019-ncov/vaccines/fully-vaccinated.html>; and

WHEREAS, the City's public-meeting facilities are indoor facilities that are not designed to ensure circulation of fresh / outdoor air, particularly during periods of cold and/or rainy weather; and

WHEREAS, the City's public-meeting facilities are not designed to ensure that attendees can remain six (6) feet apart; and

WHEREAS, holding in-person meetings would encourage community members from different households to come to City facilities to participate in local government, and some of them would be at high risk of getting very sick from COVID-19 and/or would live with someone who is at high risk; and

WHEREAS, in-person meetings will bring community members who are experiencing COVID-19 symptoms to leave their homes in order to come to City facilities and participate in local government; and

WHEREAS, some attendees would use ride-share services or public transit to travel to in-person meetings, thereby putting them in close and prolonged contact with additional people outside of their households; and

WHEREAS, on September 29, 2021, Commissioners adopted a resolution determining that conducting in-person meetings of the Oakland Redistricting Commission and its committees would present imminent risks to attendees' health, and electing to continue conducting meetings using teleconferencing in accordance with California Government Code Section 54953(e) as amended by California Assembly Bill No. AB-361 (September 16, 2021); now therefore be it:

RESOLVED: that the Oakland Redistricting Commission finds and determines that the foregoing recitals are true and correct and hereby adopts and incorporates them into this Resolution; and be it

FURTHER RESOLVED: that, based on these determinations and consistent with federal, state and local health guidance, the Oakland Redistricting Commission renews its determination that conducting in-person meetings would pose imminent risks to the health of attendees; and be it

FURTHER RESOLVED: that the Oakland Redistricting Commission firmly believes that the community's health and safety seriously and the community's right to participate in local government, are both critically important, and is committed to balancing the two by continuing to use teleconferencing to conduct public meetings, in accordance with California Government Code Section 54953(e), a provision of AB-361; and be it

FURTHER RESOLVED: that the Oakland Redistricting Commission will renew these (or similar) findings at least every thirty (30) days in accordance with California Government Code section 54953(e) until the state of emergency related to COVID-19 has been lifted, or the Oakland Redistricting Commission finds that in-person meetings no longer pose imminent risks to the health of attendees, whichever is occurs first.

ADOPTED ON THIS 13th DAY OF October, 2021.