

Oakland's ZEV Action Plan 2022

Public Outreach Summary

Table of Contents

Workshops led by Community Partners	2
Workshop 1: Identifying Barriers & Demystifying ZEVs	3
Spanish Speaking Citizens' Foundation Workshop #1	3
West Oakland Environmental Indicators Project's Workshop #1	7

Workshops led by Community Partners

In partnership with OakDOT, TransForm enlisted the expertise of local community based organizations to lead community workshops in neighborhoods identified by CalEnviroScreen as areas in greatest need of investment in ZEV if Oakland is to lead an equitable transition away from carbon intensive transportation options.

TransForm subcontracted with the Spanish Speaking Citizens' Foundation (SSCF) and the West Oakland Environmental Indicators Project (WOEIP) to encourage grassroots participation and reach the targeted underserved communities. Each group lead two workshops in the Summer and Fall of 2021.



Spanish Speaking Citizens' Foundation

The East Bay Spanish Speaking Citizens' Foundation (SSCF) is located in the heart of Oakland's Fruitvale district and has been providing services for 55 over years. SSCF offers programs and services in the following three areas: 1) immigration and citizenship assistance, 2) educational and workforce development for youth and adults, and 3) information and referral services. SSCF helps improve the lives of Latino residents in Oakland and embrace their cultural heritage so they can become civic leaders committed to the betterment of their communities. Their vision is to create and maintain a vibrant community where all people live in harmony, can enjoy educational and recreational opportunities, and access high-quality jobs.



West Oakland Environmental Indicators Project

The West Oakland Environmental Indicators Project is a resident-led, community-based environmental justice organization dedicated to achieving healthy homes, healthy jobs and healthy neighborhoods for all who live, work, learn and play in West Oakland, California.

Their mission is to build grassroots capacity to provide local leadership for positive change. Our work aids residents in understanding the political, social, and natural forces that impact their lives. We give impacted residents the tools to participate in these processes and to drive change from the bottom.

Workshop 1: Identifying Barriers & Demystifying ZEVs

Workshop 1 introduced the ZEV Action Plan to the public and informed the community of existing conditions identified to date through maps, images, stories and statistics. Through discussion facilitated by local community leaders, and human-centered design activities, community members identified pain-points and barriers to ZEV adoption in their respective neighborhoods, the Fruitvale and West Oakland.

In conjunction with the survey (Task 2.3) and online engagement (Task 2.1), findings from this workshop act as the initial needs assessment for the ZEV Action Plan. Workshop attendees shared their insight on Oaklanders' needs, perceptions, and acceptance rates of ZEVs, their experience driving or riding ZEVs, and perceptions of new, used, and shared vehicle markets for ZEVs in Oakland. In planning for the workshop, Spanish Speaking Citizens Foundation (SSCF) identified a couple of high priority items to consider. The impact of the pandemic and the economic fallout are particularly prevalent in low-income communities. SSCF indicated workshop content should highlight clean mobility job opportunities to help community members who are interested in the field. Workshop content was adapted to include this topic.

Spanish Speaking Citizens' Foundation Workshop #1

Spanish Speaking Citizens Foundation (SSCF) held its first workshop on Wednesday, July 28, 2021, from 5:00 PM to 8:30 PM in the parking lot of their community center located at 1470 Fruitvale Avenue. In an effort to adhere to COVID-19 public health guidelines, the workshop was conducted outdoors and participants were required to wear masks and have their temperatures taken upon entry. In total, (28) community members, (2) TransForm staff, (3) City of Oakland staff and (1) external partner from DoorDash attended the workshop.



During the first hour of the event, participants ate dinner provided by a local taqueria, Birria Niko's and interacted with each other before the workshop commenced at 6:00 PM. Participants also received a raffle ticket for the opportunity to win prizes at the end of the workshop. The event was facilitated entirely in Spanish by the Executive Director and youth leaders on staff at SSCF. English speakers were provided with translation equipment with translation provided by the City of Oakland. This particular approach aimed to ensure the full participation of Spanish-speaking participants and remove hindrances to the free flow of conversation that often happens when facilitation is in English.

Poster Presentation and Discussion

Attendees were divided into 4 groups that cycled through four different poster stations listed below. Each station had a SSCF facilitator and at least (1) City of Oakland staff or TransForm staff as a notetaker and to help answer questions.

- **Station #1:** What is a Zero Emission Vehicle?/ What are Clean Mobility Jobs?
- **Station #2:** Why do we care about Zero Emission Vehicle adoption? - Public Health
- **Station #3:** Where should we put Electric Vehicle Infrastructure in Fruitvale?
- **Station #4:** Financial - How much does it cost to own an Electric Vehicles

Station #1: What is a Zero Emission Vehicle?/ What are Clean Mobility Jobs?

Common Themes

- **Diversity in choice:** After learning about the various types of EV chargers and vehicles, participants stressed the need to have access to additional options better suited to their needs.
 - They expressed challenges to installing EV chargers, particularly the difficulty in installing chargers at apartment complexes. Since attendees were overwhelmingly renters versus owners, they do not have decision-making power over whether they can install a charger at their place of residence. Charging infrastructure must be deployed to overcome disparate access to public and private chargers since lower-income renters will not have the same access to chargers that wealthier homeowners have access to.
 - Participants mentioned the lack of chargers in their immediate vicinity as the main deterrent to purchasing a ZEV.
 - Participants also mentioned the need for ZEVs to accommodate different family structures. They mentioned having “larger” and multi-generational families -- more people than a 5-passenger vehicle can accommodate. Participants interested in learning more about the availability of larger EVs. (There is likely a smaller market of used 6+ passenger ZEVs.)

Station #2: Why do we care about Zero Emission Vehicle adoption? - Public Health Impact

Common Themes

- **The community deeply understands the negative health impacts of air pollution:** Participants shared they understand the negative health outcomes (i.e., asthma, allergies and serious illnesses) caused by air pollution from gasoline vehicles, especially among older adults. And while the community understood the importance of swapping gas vehicles for ZEVs, workshop participants also highlighted that not everyone in the community drives. In fact, one participant shared that she “walks everywhere” and that “people walk” in the Fruitvale community.
- Parents at the workshop mentioned a desire to see ZEV and climate change education added to their children’s curriculum.
- **Barriers to ZEV adoption to consider for future outreach efforts:** Workshop participants highlighted that many Fruitvale residents are immigrants who don’t currently have access to a driver’s license or credit card. These barriers prevent community members from using e-bike or e-scooters services and further prevent residents from purchasing new electric vehicles.
 - The high cost of shared electric services (e.g., e-bikes and e-scooters) and up-front cost of electric cars were also referenced barriers to ZEV adoption. One participant shared that “poor people will buy used cars and these cars have higher emissions than new hybrid or zero-emission vehicles. People purchase used cars because it’s what they can afford and what’s available when they have limited or no access to credit.”
 - Several residents were pleasantly surprised to learn about available EV incentive programs. For many this was the first they’ve ever heard of the potential lower cost of EVs through government subsidies. They mentioned the need for more education and outreach in their community.
 - Range anxiety is a real concern. People need more information around how far EVs can travel. One resident said they would feel more secure with an EV if they had access to “back-up batteries.”
- **The lack of infrastructure prevents some residents from using alternative modes to driving cars.** Community members referenced having limited to no availability of bike parking in their neighborhood. They also highlighted the removal of shared e-bikes from the Fruitvale area. One workshop group described the excessive number of personal vehicles in their neighborhood. They wanted more public parks or gardens for people to walk and recreate outdoors.



- **Public transportation as a solution? Challenges and Benefits:** Workshop participants described safety as a concern for not taking public transportation. They would like to have more lighting and “official staff” present on public transportation. One family expressed the desire to shuttle around their children via personal automobile because they worried about their teenage children getting harassed or assaulted on transit. Participants also stressed that public transportation is not always convenient. One participant shared that “they like the new Tempo [bus rapid transit] buses because they come often, but the other lines take forever.” Another group pointed out that currently buses have bike racks that only accommodate two bikes, so traveling with bikes on transit is challenging.

Station #3: Where should we put Electric Vehicle Infrastructure in Fruitvale?

Common Themes

- **Locate chargers at or near culturally relevant locations.** Participants identified the following locations: laundromats, beauty salons, pharmacies, parking lots near taco trucks, parking lots at community-based organizations like SSCF, grocery stores (e.g., FoodMaxx, Latinx markets), parks, schools, and apartment complexes.
 - Additional considerations: Many community members live in apartment complexes with limited parking. Consider locating chargers near-by apartment complexes that don’t take away too much parking for residents
- **The community wants chargers installed,** but installation must be coupled with culturally relevant training resources on how to use chargers. Resource materials should be offered in both English and Spanish to meet the language needs of the community. Information should be provided in print format as well as smartphone-based applications.
- **Residents want chargers that can charge multiple devices,** including EVs, e-bikes and e-scooters.

Station #4: Financial - How much does it cost to own an Electric Vehicle?

Common Themes

- **Residents were still concerned about the net price of EVs even after incentives** and want access to resources that help with credit services. As referenced in previous poster sessions, some residents mentioned limited access to credit as a barrier to purchasing vehicles.
 - For most, the discount on EVs was something they need upfront, and need to experience month over month, versus having the income bandwidth to obtain a rebate after fronting high monthly payments. A related, well-documented practice is similarly observed on transit when cash-strapped households cannot afford the upfront costs of a “cheaper” monthly bus pass. The household then opts to pay

per ride for the more immediate convenience of paying per ride, where one has more control over how much they spend on travel costs.

- **More information needed for EV charging resources.** Participants want more information on the total costs to install chargers at their home. One participant asked if the purchase of a new or used EV comes with “EV charger credit” for stations like ChargePoint.



Closing Remarks

Workshop participants reconvened and Alicia Contreras, SSCF Executive Director, expressed gratitude to community members for their time to attend the workshop. Right before closing SSCF conducted a raffle for (3) gift cards for all remaining participants. This was an engaging and fun way to wrap up the evening and to encourage participants to attend Workshop #2.

West Oakland Environmental Indicators Project’s Workshop #1

West Oakland Environmental Indicators Project (WOEIP) facilitated its first virtual workshop on Tuesday, August 10th from 6-7:30pm. WOEIP created an [eventbrite registration](#) two weeks before the event and promoted the workshop through their organization’s listserv. In total approximately 35 community members, (2) City of Oakland staff, (1) TransForm staff and (4) representatives from partner organizations (i.e., CalTrans, BAAQMD, Acterra, East Bay Community Energy) attended the virtual workshop. The workshop was recorded and later uploaded to [Youtube](#).

The workshop opened with staff introductions from WOEIP, City of Oakland and TransForm. Following introductions WOEIP’s Co-Directors, Ms. Margaret Gordan and Brian Beveridge shared WOEIP’s mission, approach to environmental justice and overview of existing and past projects, including the [“Owning Our Air: The West Oakland Community Action Plan.”](#)

ZEV Action Plan Presentation and Discussion

West Oakland: Did you know the City of Oakland has a plan to install electric vehicle chargers in your neighborhood?



• Do you want electric chargers in the neighborhood?
• Do you want to know about electric vehicle ownership?
• Join us via Zoom on Tuesday, August 10th at 6pm.

Michael Randolph, City of Oakland, provided an overview of the City's Zero-Emission Vehicle (ZEV) Action Plan and discussed the intended outcomes of the final plan. Following the ZEV Action Plan introduction, Michael presented on the following topics for discussion:

1. **Public health impact and how communities of color, including West Oakland face higher rates of health impacts from air pollution.**
2. **What is a Zero Emission Vehicle?**
3. **Electric Vehicle (EV) chargers and future planned EV stations in West Oakland**
4. **Financial incentives to purchase EVs**

Common Themes

- **ZEV workforce development and training opportunities:** Workshop participants expressed the desire for workforce development and training opportunities that prepare current and future auto industry employees with the skills needed to adapt and succeed with new zero-emission technologies.
 - One resident acknowledged the informal economy around auto repairs and asked, "What happens to the sidewalk economy of car repairs [as we transition to ZEV in the future]?"
 - Another participant stated, "We have to teach young people these qualities" and they should be embedded in high school curriculum.
- In addition to exploring pathways for EV workforce development training and high school curriculum, participants mentioned the need for training opportunities for current combustion vehicle mechanics and those who "love old cars" to evolve and expand their skillset to also work on electric vehicles.
- **How to make chargers more accessible to West Oakland Residents:** Currently, West Oakland has zero publicly accessible EV charging stations. Workshop participants suggested locating stations on major boulevards (e.g., 18th Street and Adeline Street.),
 - Residents pointed out the barriers to accessing public charging stations which is particularly important for residents who live in homes or apartment complexes that cannot support EV charging infrastructure.
 - One participant discussed " [some] people live in older houses that haven't been retrofitted and it's dangerous to charge [electric] cars when the electricity hasn't been grounded properly and the landlord won't make the [proper] investment."

- Another suggestion was to locate charging stations at churches and local businesses. Participants understood that hosting an EV charging station offers a range of potential benefits, including direct revenue from charging station use.
 - Residents also shared sentiments related to the cost of EV charging. One participant shared “in the beginning, a lot of charging stations were set up in parking lots and other lots were free, however now, all of the free charging stations are paid.” To help make charging stations more accessible to low-income residents, one participant recommended that anyone who qualifies for social safety net programs (i.e., PG&E Care, EBT/CalFresh, Social Security) should have access to subsidized or free charging.
 - One resident expressed the idea of having solar-powered charging stations, pointing out a brand new “giant climbing gym in the neighborhood with a flat roof” as an opportunity. They also expressed the need to have energy providers at the table.
- **Recycling process for EV batteries:** Several residents discussed concerns around the recycling process for EV batteries and the need for a long-term recycling plan to ensure the West Oakland community doesn’t suffer from additional environmental harm.
 - Related to EV battery recycling, one resident highlighted that “in the next 20-30 years gas stations will become less viable” and the ZEV Action Plan should have strategies to address the possibility of West Oakland gas stations turning into brownfields if properties are left abandoned.
- **Understanding the full and long-term impact of electrification.** West Oaklanders agreed on the need to comprehensively understand the full impact of the EV industry and the desire for a long-term plan for a successful transition. One resident mentioned that EVs and solar are a “great idea” but they worry that it is “just a changing of hands of power -- shifting from gas to the mining of other rare Earth metals...We don’t just want to transition from one toxic supply to another.”
- **Safety concerns around increased ZEV access:** Workshop participants wanted more information on the safety and regulations around electric trucks and for owning an EV. They shared that the ZEV Action Plan should include safety plans that incorporate the Oakland Fire Department to ensure they are equipped to handle any damaging fires caused by EV battery malfunctions.
- **Considerations for future ZEV outreach efforts:** Overall, workshop participants were enthusiastic about electric vehicles and charging infrastructure in West Oakland, however, there’s a need to conduct ongoing educational outreach with the general community. Specifically, “giving out information is one of the most important things we can do to tell people about electric vehicles,” especially if the “first [EV] that people think about is a Tesla.”

- Workshop participants stressed the importance of receiving education on the full spectrum of EV options, as well as more information on the financial incentives available to California residents.
- Participants also suggested partnering with local car dealers in surrounding cities (i.e., Berkeley, Fremont, Colma and San Leandro) to expand resident's knowledge about the variety of EVs that are available to purchase.
- Participants also encouraged the Project Team to host a walking tour in Emeryville, CA for the next workshop to introduce residents to the different types of charging stations that are currently available.

Closing Remarks

At the end of the workshop, Michael Randolph invited representatives from the ZEV industry to share a brief introduction of their organization and the resources/services they provide residents of disadvantaged communities. These groups included the Bay Area Air Quality Management District which provides grants of up to \$2,000 for at-home installation of EV chargers; East Bay Community Energy who is working with the City on public fast charging infrastructure including work to develop a fast charging hub in West Oakland; and Acterra, a partner in Drive Clean Bay Area, that conducts regular EV workshops including clinics on the financial incentives for EVs.

Brian Beveridge from WOEIP provided concluding remarks and expressed that he will be reaching out to participants with the recording of the event, links shared during the meeting, and to follow-up with details on Workshop #2.