



## Privacy Advisory Commission

December 1, 2022

5:00 PM

Via Teleconference

### ***DRAFT Meeting Minutes***

---

**Commission Members:** *District 1 Representative: Reem Suleiman, District 2 Representative: Chloe Brown, District 3 Representative: Brian Hofer, Chair, District 4 Representative: Lou Katz, Vice Chair District 5 Representative: Omar De La Cruz, District 6 Representative: Gina Tomlinson, District 7 Representative: Robert Oliver, Council At-Large Representative: Henry Gage III Mayoral Representative: Jessica Leavitt*

1. Call to Order, determination of quorum

A quorum of members was present.

2. Review and approval of the draft October 6 meeting minutes

Chair Hofer moved to approve the minutes. Commissioner Oliver seconded.

No one opposed and one abstention by Reem Suleiman. Motion was approved.

3. Open Forum/Public Comment

No one spoke during open forum/public comment.

4. Federal Task Force Transparency Ordinance – OPD – US Marshals Services (USMS), Alcohol Tobacco Firearms (ATF)

- a. Review and take possible action on the draft memoranda of understanding with federal partners (MOU)

Only the ATF MOU was included in the packet and available for comment by the PAC.

Chair Hofer requested comment from Commissioners on the MOU. There were no additional comments.

OPD update on the MOU's provided by Lt. Scott Bezner. He indicated that the DEA MOU received a favorable recommendation by the PAC during the November meeting. A PAC ad hoc meeting was

held for the ATF and USMS MOU, language changes were proposed to the federal partner. ATF agreed to changes. USMS MOU will come back to the PAC in January.

Chair Hofer moved that the PAC forward the revised ATF MOU to the city council with a favorable recommendation upon the condition that OPD wear body worn cameras when participating, per the addendum agreement. Second by Commissioner Oliver.

D1 – yes

D2 – abstain

D3 – yes

D4 –yes

D5 –absent

D6 -yes

D7 – yes

At-large – absent

Mayor appointee – yes

The item passed.

5. Surveillance Technology Ordinance – DOT – Mobile Parking Payment Proposal

a. Informational Report by CSU Law Clinic – no action will be taken at this meeting

The Department of Transportation (DOT) brought forward the Mobile Parking Payment proposal. Chair Hofer provided some history on the item and indicated that the PAC previously approved the front end piece of the program, the Automated License Plate Use Policy which is used for various parking enforcement purposes. DOT is proposing to work with a number of vendors and mobile apps to collect revenue in the program

Michael Ford, manager in the DOT presented and thanked Chair Hofer for introducing him to the project with the students and expressed appreciation for the work that the students have completed. He provided an update to the Commission on deadlines and indicated that an extension to the existing agreement was granted in August for one year. The DOT is planning to come back in January or February to discuss the mobile parking payment proposal, if there are new things to explore and develop, staff will work with the City Attorney's Office. There is time and opportunity to integrate lessons learned from this experience.

Students from the Cleveland State College of Law and the School of Social Work made a presentation to the Commission regarding their research on privacy issues relating to the Park Mobile Program. The scope of work consisted of working with the PAC and DOT on a proposed implementation of a multi-provider parking payment system.

The goal of the project as stated by the chair, was to automate many of the tools and policy writing on how to do impact statements and analyze the technology related to data sharing and data flow. The work could benefit future commissions, staff and others.

A draft report from the students was distributed in the agenda packet.

#### Public Comment

Unfortunately, due to technology constraints no public comment was taken.