



**Privacy Advisory Commission**  
**May 2, 2019 5:00 PM**  
**Oakland City Hall**  
**Hearing Room 1**  
**1 Frank H. Ogawa Plaza, 3rd Floor**  
***Meeting Minutes***

---

**Commission Members:** *District 1 Representative: Reem Suleiman, District 2 Representative: Chloe Brown, District 3 Representative: Brian M. Hofer, District 4 Representative: Lou Katz, District 5 Representative: Raymundo Jacquez III, District 6 Representative: Vacant, District 7 Representative: Robert Oliver, Council At-Large Representative: Vacant, Mayoral Representative: Heather Patterson*

---

*Each person wishing to speak on items must fill out a speaker's card. Persons addressing the Privacy Advisory Commission shall state their names and the organization they are representing, if any.*

1. 5:00pm: Call to Order, determination of quorum

*Members Present: Suleiman, Hofer, Katz, Jaquez, Oliver, Patterson.*

2. 5:05pm: Open Forum/Public Comment

*There were no Open Forum speakers.*

3. 5:10pm: Review and approval of the draft April 4 meeting minutes

*The April Minutes were approved unanimously.*

4. 5:15pm: UC Berkeley's Samuelson Law, Technology & Public Policy Clinic – presentation of draft Privacy Principles; review and take possible action.

*The Privacy Principals and Implementation Guidance Document were presented and discussed. There were two public speakers: Michael Ford and Tracey Rosenberg who both spoke in strong favor of the principals. The PAC voted unanimously to recommend the City adopt the principals.*

5. 5:30pm: Federal Task Force Transparency Ordinance – OPD – presentation of inaugural annual report for FBI/JTTF; review and take possible action.

*Bruce Stoffmacher presented the modified report from OPD. There were several public speakers that indicated a strong concern that the report still does not provide information that would help the PAC (and public) properly monitor the work of the JTTF. The speakers included: Jeffrey Wang, Sandy Valenceano, Javier Jamil, Cynthia Choi, Samena Usman, Jehan Hakim, and Elica Vafaie.*

*The PAC members also expressed several concerns about the amount of information made available. Specifically, the number of assessments performed by the JTTF, the number of requests from other agencies (such as ICE), and a better understanding of how much time the OPD representative is actually spending on task force work is critical. Chairperson Hofer noted that the original template that PAC Members had developed with OPD had 31 data points and the current report only answers 17 of them.*

*The PAC unanimously adopted a motion to recommend against acceptance of the report by the City Council and to send a letter enumerating the missing information.*

6. 5:40pm: Surveillance Equipment Ordinance – Hofer/Patterson – proposed amendment to prohibit use of facial recognition technology; review and take possible action.

*Chairperson Hofer introduced the amendment that categorically prohibits the use of Facial Recognition technology. There were four public speakers all of whom supported the measure: Henry Gage, Samera Usman, Michael Katz-Lacabe, and Matt Cagle.*

*The proposal passed unanimously.*

7. 6:00pm: Surveillance Equipment Ordinance – OPD – Remote Camera Impact Report and draft use Policy – review and take possible action.

*Bruce Stoffmacher reviewed the draft policy and concerns were raised about the use of the cameras at public gatherings, especially in determining what size of gathering and what purpose they would be used for. There was one public speaker: Henry gage who expressed similar concerns. The Chair recommended an ad hoc group work with OPD on the policy and the item was continued to June.*

8. 7:00pm: Adjournment

*The meeting adjourned at 7pm.*