



Privacy Advisory Commission
February 7, 2019 5:00 PM
Oakland City Hall
Hearing Room 1
1 Frank H. Ogawa Plaza, 3rd Floor
Meeting Minutes

Commission Members: *District 1 Representative: Reem Suleiman, District 2 Representative: Chloe Brown, District 3 Representative: Brian M. Hofer, District 4 Representative: Lou Katz, District 5 Representative: Raymundo Jacquez III, District 6 Representative: Vacant, District 7 Representative: Robert Oliver, Council At-Large Representative: Saied R. Karamooz, Mayoral Representative: Heather Patterson*

Each person wishing to speak on items must fill out a speaker's card. Persons addressing the Privacy Advisory Commission shall state their names and the organization they are representing, if any.

1. 5:00pm: Call to Order, determination of quorum

Members present: Hofer, Katz, Patterson, Jaquez, Karamooz.

2. 5:05pm: Review and approval of January 3 meeting minutes

The minutes were approved unanimously.

3. 5:10pm: Open Forum

There were no Open Forum Speakers.

4. 5:15pm: UC Berkeley's Samuelson Law, Technology & Public Policy Clinic – introduction and discussion of scope of work, including drafting of Privacy Principles.

Member Patterson introduced the group who will be launching an effort to develop a set of privacy principals for the City of Oakland to include in its creation of an overarching privacy policy. The principals will touch on data collection, use, storage, and third party access. The goal is to develop principals that are modeled after other jurisdictions but unique to Oakland. They will be interviewing key stakeholders over the month and bringing a draft back to the PAC in April.

5. 5:20pm: Surveillance Equipment Ordinance – OPD – Exigent Use of Surveillance Technology report, and take possible action.

Bruce Stoffmacher presented the report and it was approved unanimously. He also noted that due to the sudden consistent use of the Sherriff's Department's UAV (drone), staff will be bringing a formal policy to the PAC in the spring.

6. 5:30pm: Surveillance Equipment Ordinance – OPD – Automated License Plate Reader Anticipated Impact Report – review and take possible action.

The PAC reviewed the updated Impact Report and asked several questions regarding camera angles, data retention, and specifics on purpose and mitigations. The suggestion was made to bring the Impact Statement back along with the proposed Use Policy so they could be reviewed together. They will come back in March.

7. 6:00pm: Federal Task Force Transparency Ordinance – OPD – presentation of inaugural annual reports (FBI/JTTF, ATF, DEA task forces), and take possible action.

Six public speakers gave input on this item expressing both optimism that the PAC will be receiving these annual reports but also disappointment about the lack of information the first drafts contain. The fact that some information was not shared without the City submitting a Freedom of Information Act (FOIA) Request was of concern. Also, citing 832.7 as a reason to not share information was also questioned.

The PAC unanimously sent the draft reports back asking staff to get more information (from the federal agencies and internally) > The PAC also asked for a legal opinion about 832.7 and whether that was a valid reason to not disclose information.

8. 6:30pm: Surveillance Equipment Ordinance – OPD – Body Worn Camera Anticipated Impact Report – review and take possible action.

Similar to Item 6, the Impact Statement and Use Policy will be brought back together in March.

9. 7:00pm: Adjournment

The meeting adjourned at 7:05.