



Privacy Advisory Commission
April 15, 2023; 9:00 AM
Oakland City Hall
Hearing Room 3
1 Frank H. Ogawa Plaza, 1st Floor
Special Meeting Minutes

Commission Members: *District 1 Representative: Reem Suleiman, District 2 Representative: Chloe Brown, District 3 Representative: Brian Hofer, Chair, District 4 Representative: Lou Katz, Vice Chair District 5 Representative: Omar De La Cruz, District 6 Representative: Gina Tomlinson, District 7 Representative: Robert Oliver, Council At-Large Representative: Henry Gage III Mayoral Representative: Jessica Leavitt*

Each person wishing to speak on items must fill out a speaker's card. Persons addressing the Privacy Advisory Commission shall state their names and the organization they are representing, if any.

1. Call to Order, determination of quorum
2. IAPP Conference Report Back –by Felicia Verdin

Felicia Verdin, Assistant to the City Administrator provided an update on the IAPP Global Privacy Summit that was held April 1-4 in Washington, DC.

3. Role of Chief Privacy Officer – by Joe DeVries
 - a. Incorporating into existing PAC framework
 - b. Succession/resource needs

Deputy City Administrator Joe DeVries provided an update on the role of the Chief Privacy Officer to track Privacy policies and train city staff on impact statements and use polices.

Mr. DeVries discussed the need to create internal administration instructions on Privacy requirements to memorialize city policies and procedures, as an example there is an internal working group that created an inclusive community engagement policy. A memo can also be written to brief city departments on the template for use policies and impact statements. All policies must have all the components before it is



Privacy Advisory Commission
April 15, 2023; 9:00 AM
Oakland City Hall
Hearing Room 3
1 Frank H. Ogawa Plaza, 1st Floor
Special Meeting Minutes

presented to the PAC. Training on the surveillance ordinance and other privacy policies can also be conducted through citywide training.

It was determined that an ad-hoc needs to be created to further clarify the role of the Chief Privacy Officer and its connection to the Chief Security Officer in the Department of Information and Technology, in addition to discussing other internal City of Oakland policies and practices.

4. Community Engagement Strategy
 - a. Remote Presentation by Hector Dominguez – City of Portland
 - b. Discuss elements needed for successful engagement

Hector Dominquez presented a PowerPoint and discussed the City of Portland’s success with engaging the community in their privacy work.

Questions were raised regarding their budget, participation, outreach. There were additional questions asked about how public comment was gathered. All funding was provided by the City of Portland. Business associations were engaged through their chamber and other community partners participate in their privacy work. There are also a group of privacy champions that are in engaged in Portland’s privacy efforts.

5. Impact Assessment/Threat Matrix - by Kelsey Finch – see her PowerPoint
 - a. Presentation and training

Kelsey Finch, senior associate, privacy and data protection with Aleada Consulting presented information about a range of topics pertaining to privacy. She discussed the involvement of privacy forums to create



Privacy Advisory Commission
April 15, 2023; 9:00 AM
Oakland City Hall
Hearing Room 3
1 Frank H. Ogawa Plaza, 1st Floor
Special Meeting Minutes

peer connections and information sharing, including the need for an enterprise data management approach.

Ms. Finch also discussed the need for community engagement and bringing in diverse voices. Get people from the community on the team. She provided an example of how Long Beach created digital equity surveys to involve the community.

She explained that on the government side we can do a better job of articulating potential harms by creating better scenarios of the need for privacy policies and programs. Ms. Finch indicated that this can be done by providing real actual examples of emotional distress, for example. It would be helpful to review Privacy Impact Assessment (PIA) in the federal government and look at what problems are trying to be resolved specifically.

She discussed the steps of a Privacy Risk Assessment to create processes, templates and instructions and create contingency plan. Furthermore, Ms. Finch discussed the need for transparency and accountability to build public trust. She also discussed smart data management and the need for sustainable.

6. Surveillance Ordinance Training – by Chair Hofer

Chair Hofer engaged the Commission and staff in an exercise on impact statements and proposed use policies.

7. PAC Needs – by Chair Hofer

Chair Hofer led a discussion of potential funding request to further support the work of the PAC to engage the community.



Privacy Advisory Commission
April 15, 2023; 9:00 AM
Oakland City Hall
Hearing Room 3
1 Frank H. Ogawa Plaza, 1st Floor
Special Meeting Minutes

He also discussed the need for succession planning in the PAC and the impact of upcoming term limits and the need for an annual election. Appointments take place at the end of March. Chair Hofer indicated that his term ends 2025 and he wants to be chair one more year. He expressed his interest to set up the next generation of PAC members in a good way. He also suggested that a few different vice chairs could serve in the role over a year long period.

There was a discussion about Infrastructure needs and systems to track due dates, policies, and policy writing. Logigate was mentioned as a possible system.

There is a desire by the PAC to better engage with City Departments outside the scope of existing ordinances (Privacy Principles, general data collection and security practices, public facing materials).

Additionally, an ad-hoc could be formed to improve the information that the PAC provides publicly in the following areas:

- Website improvements
- Social media presence
- Process to receive complaints or inquiries from the public
- Notice to stakeholders for community engagement (staff was requested to email the PAC with Neighborhood Council information, including the beat locator).