



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

February 11, 2021

Regina Jackson: Good evening, and welcome to the Oakland Police Commission meeting of Thursday, February 11th, 2021. I'd first like to call this meeting to order. It's 5:33 and we're going to do roll call. Commissioner Dorado, are you here?

Jose Dorado: Presente.

Regina Jackson: Excellent. Thank you. Commissioner Gage?

Henry Gage, III: Present.

Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Garcia?

Sergio Garcia: Here.

Regina Jackson: Excellent. Thank you. Commissioner Harbin-Forte?

Brenda Harbin-Forte: Present.

Regina Jackson: Excellent. Thank you. Commissioner Singleton?

Tyfahra Singleton: Present.

Regina Jackson: Thank you, and I am here as well. We have a quorum. At this time, I would like to take any public comment for our closed session. Mr. Rus, I turn it over to you.

Juanito Rus: Thank you, Madam Chair. At this time, if any member of the public wishes to make comment on the closed session item on tonight's agenda, please raise your hand in the Zoom queue and you will be called in the order in which your hands are raised. At this time, I see five hands in the queue. Excuse me, while I turn on my clock. The first speaker on this item is Rachel Beck. Good evening Ms. Beck, can you hear us?

Rachel Beck: Hi. Yes. Can you hear me?

Juanito Rus: We can hear you. Whenever you're ready.

Rachel Beck: Great. Thanks. My name is Rachel Beck. I'm a district one resident, and I am just asking if you can commit to waiting until 6:30, the regularly scheduled meeting time, to start open session commenting. That's all. Thank you.

Juanito Rus: Thank you, Ms. Beck. The next speaker in the queue is Jennifer Tu. Good evening Ms. Tu, can you hear us?

Jennifer Tu: Yes. Thank you. Hi, this is Jennifer Tu from district three. I had a similar question to the previous speaker. I was wondering if we know what time we should expect closed session to end, and for



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION MEETING TRANSCRIPT

February 11, 2021

the open forum to begin since the meeting that switched from the regularly scheduled meeting of 6:30 to the special meeting. I think it would be a really nice courtesy, and if we could know what time to be prepared with our one minute comment. Thanks very much. That's all.

Regina Jackson: Mr. Rus. I'll go ahead and answer that question since it's been posed by two people. Thank you very much for your query. We try as best we can to handle our closed session items so that we finish in a timely manner and start our regular meeting at 6:30 there, over the last three years, have been certainly several times where we've gone over due to increasingly complicated matters, but that will be our goal tonight. We intend to start the regular session of our meeting at 6:30 and that's when we will do our open forum. Thank you.

Juanito Rus: Thank you, Madam Chair. The next speaker in the queue is Charlotte Ashlock. Good evening, Ms. Ashlock. Can you hear us?

Charlotte Ashlock: Yeah, can you hear me?

Juanito Rus: We can hear you. You have the floor.

Charlotte Ashlock: I'm just calling in today to speak against the militarization of police. I know that there's going to be more discussion of that later, but this was a good time for me to call it. I am really upset that we're even considering keeping the BearCat or using any military items at all against the people of Oakland. That makes me feel like I'm the enemy and I really need to be helped not to be scared. We shouldn't spend money on military equipment. That's my comment. Thank you.

Juanito Rus: Thank you, Ms. Ashlock. The next speaker in the queue is Megan Steffen. Good evening, Ms. Steffen, can you hear us?

Megan Steffen: Yes, I can. Thank you so much, Mr. Rus. I wanted to say on the closed session lawsuit, that I hope that you don't have to spend too much time on what seems to me to be a really spurious attempt to discredit the police commission and that you all get to take a little break before beginning at 6:30. I also wanted to say that one of the reasons why I have so much faith in this commission and why I continue to fight for the city to give you all more resources. It's because you have built trust with the public by being transparent and being consistent. I hope in the future that when special meetings like this happen, which is pretty often, you all are unlucky enough to have to deal with a lot of lawsuits that the agenda can continue to come out, as soon as possible. This week was a little rough with it only coming out 48 hours beforehand. Thank you so much and good luck with this case.

Juanito Rus: Thank you, Ms. Steffen. The next speaker in the queue is Ms. Assata Olugbala. Good evening Ms. Olugbala, can you hear us okay.

Assata Olugbala: Yeah. Nobody's talked about the lawsuit. I know you guys are very upset that we don't stick to the agenda, but I read the lawsuit and it's interesting related to measure why it was the determination of the court to the peers that measure why money could not be used for



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION MEETING TRANSCRIPT

February 11, 2021

recruiting, training, and hiring of officers who would not be identified with the community resource program. It also said that the requirement for 800 in I think three offices, did not have to be met in the base staff of 739. I think that the key thing is understanding that officers who are hired in Oakland or minimal staffing officers. We are working with a minimal staff. This lawsuit further determined, some other things that I don't understand how you have jurisdiction over any of these things but [crosstalk 00:10:52]...

Juanito Rus: Thank you Ms. Olugbala, your time has expired. The next speaker in the queue is a telephone attendee. The last four digits 9997. Good evening, 9997. Can you hear us?

9997: Hi. Can you hear me?

Juanito Rus: We can hear you. The floor is yours.

9997: Thank you. I'm just going to skip the line here and just direct my comments to the commissioners. You are going to have the duty of electing a new chair and vice chair. Well, the last chair has been elected twice. The last few chairs have been mayoral candidates, and I think this has really undermined faith in the commission in general. I think if you elect another mayoral candidate, especially with the kinds of lies and really bad behavior that the mayor has done, and the dishonesty in which he's not taking responsibility for managing the police department, it will be very damaging to the police commission standing among the community. I implore you, please, elect the chair to the commission who is a community appointee, not a mayoral appointee. It's about time, anyway. Thank you.

Juanito Rus: Thank you, 9997. The next speaker in the queue is Jasmine Fallstich. Good evening Ms. Fallstich, can you hear us?

Jasmine Fallstich: Yes. Thank you. Thanks for taking the time to care. My comments and thanks chair Jackson for answering the question about the ending of closed session. I just want to confirm as we're trying to galvanize people to come to public comment tonight, that public comment for the regular meeting or the remainder of the agenda, won't begin until 6:30. If that sounded like what you were saying, but just want to make sure that, that I heard that correctly. That's all. Thanks.

Regina Jackson: Thank you. Yes, I will confirm that we will not start the regular meeting of the police commission until 6:30. Public comment, I imagine, will probably come within the first five to 10 minutes as we will have to take roll call again.

Juanito Rus: At this time, Madam Chair, I see no other hands in the queue.

Regina Jackson: Thank you very much, Mr. Rus. At this time we have taken public comment. I would like to invite the commissioners to join me in closed session. After that, we will try to be as prompt as possible to get back to start our meeting on time at 6:30. Thank you everyone. (Silence)

Regina Jackson: I think we are all back. We can start the next portion of our meeting. Are we ready to go, Mr. Rus?



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

February 11, 2021

Juanito Rus: Yes, madam Chair. You're live.

Regina Jackson: Great. Thank you very much. Good evening. It is now 6:31. Welcome to the regular meeting of the Oakland Police Commission for February 11th, 2021. I would like to call the meeting to order and go over roll call one more time. Let's see. Commissioner Dorado?

Jose Dorado: Present.

Regina Jackson: Thank you, commissioner Gage.

Henry Gage, III: Here.

Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Garcia?

Sergio Garcia: Here.

Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Harbin-Forte?

Brenda Harbin-Forte: Present.

Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Singleton?

Tyfahra Singleton: Present.

Regina Jackson: Thank you. And let's see... Alternate Commissioner David Jordan?

David Jordan: Present.

Regina Jackson: Thank you. And Mr. Rus, I am looking for the Alternate Commissioner that we will welcome tonight. Can you take a look and see if Marsha Peterson is locked in the other side, please? And I am present. This is Regina Jackson. We do have a quorum.

Juanito Rus: I am looking. Ms. Peterson, if you are present in the attendee list, please raise your hand in the queue. Nice. I have promoted her to the panel, Chair.

Regina Jackson: Okay. We'll move forward while you try to work that out.

Juanito Rus: Oh, my apologies. I must have [crosstalk 01:04:59]. I moved her to the panel. She should appear.

Regina Jackson: Excellent. Okay. Thank you. And Alternate Commissioner Peterson, are you here?

Marsha Peterson: I am. Can you hear me?



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

February 11, 2021

- Regina Jackson: Excellent. Thank you very much. Okay. I wanted to report out that we had no reportable action from the Closed Session.
- Regina Jackson: And before we go to open comment, I wanted to read a very brief statement. Tonight I'm delighted to welcome our new Police Chief LeRonne Armstrong. Before we formally welcome him, though, I want to call attention to the Commission's work to get us here. The commission's search process will stand as one of its leading accomplishments. The commission conducted this search process on our own. We didn't rely on a consultant to find us a chief, we went out and did the work ourselves. When this process began in the middle of a raging pandemic, we knew the city's budget would be tight. We also knew that consultants cost the city \$850,000 last time. We looked at that price tag to taxpayers, and we decided instead, to do this all for free. We drafted the job description, we conducted a national inclusive search, we hosted a candidates' forum, and we did all the due diligence. We did this ourselves based on what Oakland needs right now. After all that, on Monday, we held a swearing in ceremony for our new chief at his alma mater, McClymonds High School, right here in Oakland. Already we are getting public reports about new bold changes that Chief Armstrong has put into motion, and we expect there will be more and more to come.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you to Chief Armstrong for using this process to explain your unique qualifications to the commission, the city and the public. You sure have earned this new position and that's why I'm so glad that we're going to be able to introduce you tonight as our new chief. Now I'd like to go to open forum for public comment. Mr. Rus.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you madam chair. Prior to tonight's meeting, the commission received written public comment from Jennifer Tu, Megan Steffen, Mary Vale, and another letter signed by a number of organizations within the city. It's a very long list, so I will not read all of them. At this time we will go to open forum for tonight's commission meeting. If you any member of the public, wishes to make public comments during the open forum session of tonight's meeting, please raise your hand in the Zoom queue, and you will be called in the order in which your hands are raised. The first hand in the queue belongs to Kristine Wyndham. Good evening Miss Wyndham. Can you hear us?
- Kristine Wyndham: I can. Thank you so much. Can you hear me?
- Juanito Rus: Sorry. I muted myself. Yes. The floor is yours.
- Kristine Wyndham: Oh, thank you. And thank you for your work in hiring a new police chief. My name is Kristine Wyndham. I live in the Glenview district, a neighborhood of District 5. I'm a mom of three, I've lived in Oakland over 30 years. I'm a former public school teacher. I'm here to comment on the armored vehicle policy because I think that the new armored vehicle policy in agenda item 11, doesn't put enough restrictions on the BearCat. I urge the police commission to ban continued use of the BearCat in our city. A militarized tank does not belong in any neighborhood in Oakland. I was a small part of when our residents successfully lobbied to end the Alameda County Sheriff sponsored urban shield expo for exactly this reason, that we do not want military equipment used by those sworn to serve and protect.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

February 11, 2021

Juanito Rus: Thank you [crosstalk 01:09:46] Miss Wyndham.

Kristine Wyndham: Thank you.

Juanito Rus: Your time is expired. The next speaker in the queue is Jasmine Fallstich. Good evening Miss Fallstich. Can you hear us?

Jasmine Fallstich: Yes. Thank you. Sorry. Multiple people here.

Juanito Rus: That's okay.

Jasmine Fallstich: I worked with a number of other community members on a petition. I will read the petition now and a following speaker will tell you who has signed it and how many... Which organizations have signed it and the number of individuals. So, "To the Oakland Police Commission on February 11th, 2011, as you consider the Oakland Police Department's revised policy for use of armored vehicles this Thursday, we strongly urge you to take action to retire OPD's paramilitary BearCat. in addition, because OPD borrows BearCat vehicles from other police agencies and also has an armored suburban SUV vehicle, we also urge you to act now to make the proposed armored vehicle training bulletin much more restrictive for BearCat deployments. The streets of Oakland are not a combat field. Use of a military style truck is not a proportional response to residential emergencies. The BearCat's presence strikes [crosstalk 01:11:15] Fear in the part of adults-"

Juanito Rus: Thank you Miss Fallstich. Your time has expired.

Jasmine Fallstich: Thank you.

Juanito Rus: The next speaker in the queue is Steven Jeram. Good evening Mr. Jeram. Can you hear us?... Mr. Jeram? Your microphone is muted.

Steven Jeram: Hello everybody.

Juanito Rus: [inaudible 01:11:52].

Regina Jackson: Hello. I'm sorry. I missed your commentary. My apologies.

Juanito Rus: Mr. Jeram you can start whenever you're ready.

Regina Jackson: Okay. Thank you. Thank you very much. Mm-hmm (affirmative).

Steven Jeram: Continuing Jasmine's comment, "... and children who experience it in operation. It triggers trauma for black and brown folks who live in the neighborhoods where it is most frequently used. In 2018, Oakland police officers used the BearCat as a shooting platform to kill Joshua Pawlik, a homeless man sleeping on the ground, with a firearm at his side. Five officers were fired and the city paid \$1.4 million to Mr. Pawlik's family. Oakland is now required by a federal court to create a



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION MEETING TRANSCRIPT

February 11, 2021

new policy for armored vehicles, yet, if the same situation occurred again, the policy before the commission now would still authorize deploying a BearCat or for a BearCat from another police agency. The armored vehicles training bulletin from the commission [crosstalk 01:13:03] Would authorize the BearCat even if there is only reasonable suspicion for firearm use."

Juanito Rus: Thank you Mr. Jeram. The next speaker in the queue is Kevin Cantu. Good evening Mr. Cantu. Can you hear us?

Kevin Cantu: Yes. Excuse me. [crosstalk 01:13:26] Picking up where he left off, "... That is a very low standard. The proposals would not make the BearCat a backup option to an armored SUV even though that suburban has sufficient ballistic protection. OPD officers have observed that the BearCat acquired in 2008 is often in the repair shop, will not function much longer, and that other options can be considered. Oakland is currently re-imagining how to achieve public safety for all residents. Although there is much we don't agree on, we are unified that militarizing police has not made us safer and that removing the tank like BearCat from Oakland, is a necessary step." Sincerely signed, 67 Suenos, Advancing Justice - Asian Law Caucus, ACLU of Northern California, American Friends Service Committee, Anti Police-Terror Project, BEY-Peace: Better Alternatives for Youth, Coalition for Police Accountability, Code Pink: Women for Peace East Bay [crosstalk 01:14:31] Chapter.

Juanito Rus: Thank you Mr. Cantu. The next speaker in the queue is Joseph Mente. Good evening Mr. Mente. Can you hear us?

Joseph Mente: Yes. Can you hear me?

Juanito Rus: We can hear you. The floor is yours.

Joseph Mente: Joseph Mente, budget and data advisory board of the Reimagining Public Safety Task Force. I find it really disappointing that the police commission is acquiescing the OPD's propaganda about their need for military equipment. The BearCat does not deescalate encounters, it invokes terror in our citizens. It's expensive to maintain at a time when every city department is being demanded to make deep budget cuts. This is not the best use of precious taxpayer dollars. It would be far more effective to just spend those funds on improving the IT systems which OPD uses to make better decisions on resource allocation. IT systems which OPD is years behind in implementing because while there's budget for the software, it does not allocate personnel to actually implement those systems. It would build far more trust in the community to spend those funds on improving the way OPD does, and often doesn't, provide data to the public. I know this because for the last several months of my life, I've been neck deep in both the budget and calls for service data as part of that Reimagining Public Safety Task Force. Please do not authorize the use of this BearCat. Thank you.

Juanito Rus: Thank you Mr. Mente. The next speaker in the queue is Jennifer Tu. Good evening Miss Tu. Can you hear us?



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

February 11, 2021

- Jennifer Tu: Yes. Thank you. This is Jennifer Tu from District 3. I want to speak on two agenda items. Item 12, to give priority to officers for the vaccination. The vaccination only makes symptoms non-life threatening, it doesn't make the person immune. This means that someone who has received the vaccine could still become infected and spread or even super spread COVID. We've all seen that officers struggle with consistently masking and I'm wondering if there's an opportunity to revise item 12, given the risk of inconsistent masking in OPD and potential harm to the public. Item 11, training bulletin. Thank you [inaudible 01:16:41] Committee for all of your work on this, and I would ask for you to please consider restricting the language to only govern the armored SUV. We heard on January 11th, that the SUV can fully replace the BearCat, and I hope the commission will take this opportunity to stop allowing use of a vehicle that traumatizes our neighbors with its menacing visual presentation. Thanks very much.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you Miss Tu. The next speaker in the queue is Maria Navarro. Good evening Miss Navarro. Can you hear us?
- Maria Navarro: Good evening. Can you hear me?
- Juanito Rus: We can hear you. The floor is yours.
- Maria Navarro: Good evening. My name is Maria Navarro. I've joined today's meeting to comment on the armored vehicle use policy. The policy as it is written today, does not put forth enough restrictions on the BearCat. The police commission should not support a vague policy that governs military equipment that is unsuitable for normal policing. The Oakland Police have a history of being granted immunity from legal accountability even in the face of misconduct and abuse, therefore, do not approve and implement a policy that leaves room for interpretation. Thank you.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you. The next speaker in the queue is listed as Youth Alive. Good evening Youth Alive. Can you hear us?
- Gabriel Garcia: Yes, I can. Thank you. This is Gabriel Garcia. I am the Policy and Advocacy Manager for Youth ALIVE. I want to first say congratulations to the Chief Armstrong, but I'm really here to speak about the proposal around the armored vehicle. We are deeply sympathetic for OPD needing protection when they are entering situations that they know will be dangerous, but it's also impossible to ignore the impact that having military like equipment brandished in our neighborhoods, especially when those neighborhoods are predominantly black and brown, can really have on not only our community members, but specifically our youth, seeing those vehicles in their neighborhoods. That's why we were requesting a common sense policy to really prioritize the use of the armored SUV that's been mentioned multiple times tonight, over the BearCat, and really limiting the use, any use, of the BearCat to situations with actual or threatened to firearm violence where it's absolutely necessary. Thank you.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you. The next speaker in the queue is listed as Laura Wesley. Good evening Miss Wesley. Can you hear us?



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

February 11, 2021

- Laura Wesley: Hello. Yes. Thank you. Hi, I'm Laura Wesley. I'm a clinical social worker living in District 4, working with youth and families in Brooklyn for the past 10 years. I'm also calling to comment on the new armored vehicle policy, agenda item 11. The kids that I work with, some as young as kindergarteners, are universally scared of the police. They don't feel safe, they don't feel protected by them, and how could they when police resemble military and have used the BearCat as a shooting platform to murder Joshua Pawlik? The BearCat makes Oakland look like a war zone and that needs to be retired. There's no reason that OPD needs a BearCat, especially considering the armored Suburbans already available to them. And rather than spending money on maintaining and servicing this armored vehicle, I want our dollars to go towards increasing access to mental health and community resources that actually prevent violence rather than cause more. Thank you for your time and your service.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you Miss Wesley. The next speaker in the queue is Rachel Beck. Good evening Miss Beck. Can you hear us?
- Rachel Beck: Hi. Yes. Thanks. My name is Rachel Beck, I live in District 1. According to OPD's own use of force policy, aiming a gun without firing it constitutes the use of force that an officer must report. We know from an IG audit that officers historically have under-reported this, but policy says they're supposed to. While OPD maintains that the BearCat makes them less likely to shoot Oaklanders, there's no use of the BearCat that is purely defensive. Just driving it into a neighborhood is equivalent to unholstering a gun and pointing it. The use of force policy recognizes that a threat to commit violence is violence. Our militarized equipment policy should recognize that too, and the department's history with the BearCat means its visible presence is a threat to people around it. Oaklanders deserve a policy that retires the BearCat. I understand that you're volunteers and worked hard on this policy, and yet, I wonder what the point of the January 11th listening session was, if not to listen to and incorporate concerns of impacted people. Thank you.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you Miss Beck. The next speaker in the queue is Ann Whidden. Good evening Miss Whidden. Can you hear us?
- Ann Whidden: Hi. Yes. I don't like being called Miss Whidden. I'm calling to comment on item 11, the armored vehicle policy. I am a resident of Oakland's District 4 in the Fairfax neighborhood, I'm also the parent of a teenager. Even without the BearCat, our youth are afraid of the police. A few years ago when my son was 13 and we had an altercation outside of our house, I went outside, I told him to stay inside. About halfway through the altercation, the police came. When I came back inside to check on my son, I found him hiding under my bed. When I asked him when he had went to hide, he said it was when the police showed up. He was not afraid of our neighbors, he was afraid of the cops. I'm also in a New York Times' cooking community, and last month, someone I'd never met before posted that when she was out buying tacos in her Fruitvale neighborhood, she saw an armored vehicle. It terrified her.
- Ann Whidden: Everybody knows that the only reason to have an armored vehicle is to terrorize residents and to try and influence them, and to intimidate folks. Please retire the BearCat and make sure that the armored vehicle training bulletin is more restrictive for BearCat deployment.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

February 11, 2021

- Juanito Rus: Thank you. Your time has expired. The next speaker in the queue is a telephone attendee of the last four digits 0185. Good evening 0185. Can you hear us?
- Michele Lazaneo: This is Michelle Lazaneo, spokesman for the Bandabaila family. Tatiana Dugger was 18 years old when she disappeared from a hotel in Oakland on January 9th. Her family reported to OPD that she may be a victim of human trafficking and it was out of character for her to go silent on social media. Her typical behavior was to call, text, messenger or Snapchat with family members every single day. The reporting officer did not follow the investigative steps listed in their current protocol. In fact, the reporting officer didn't contact Tatty's family until the next day. Officer Mora took the initial report, but her family wasn't provided with any updates for days. There was no follow up on leads, no extensive search during the critical first 72 hours. As a result, her family drove to Oakland and canvassed the area alone looking for her. Tatty's birthday was yesterday, she turned 19. She has been missing for 33 days without contact with any family or friends.
- Michele Lazaneo: Her family is desperate to find her and one of her older sisters has been familiarizing herself with the popularity of pimps recruiting girls on social media. She found one who was offering a \$1,000 reward to anyone who locate to return to his "hoe" [crosstalk 01:24:26] Who was "acting up."
- Juanito Rus: Thank you Miss Lazaneo. Your time has expired. The next speaker in the queue is listed as Tasha. Good evening Tasha. Can you hear us?
- Tasha Mente: Yes. Can you hear me?
- Juanito Rus: We can hear you. The floor is yours.
- Tasha Mente: Great. Thank you. This is Tasha Mente, D 1 resident. I stand with the community that condemns the use of paramilitary vehicles in our streets, and I demand that OPD retire the BearCat. We need the armed vehicle ad hoc to write more stringent guidelines around the use of paramilitary vehicles as OPD borrows BearCats from other departments as well. So to this training bulletin, we say thanks, but no tanks. As we welcome our new chief, I'm also asking him to clarify during his report, what his plan is to maximize efficiency of the current force. Several Oaklanders and I, have noticed OPD presence guarding private stores, including multiple Walgreens across the city. If we're supposedly slammed with calls, why are we allowing officers to spend extra hours protecting a Walgreens instead of patrolling districts with murders? Please explain how much these private businesses are paying the city for this service, and if it's enough to cover the cost of sworn officers working overtime to prevent and resolve murder cases. Thank you.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you. The next speaker in the queue is Miss Assata Olugbala. Good evening Miss Olugbala. Can you hear us?
- Assata Olugbala: Yes. [inaudible 01:26:01] My time Mr. Rus, but question is, is open for, well public comment, or a combination of the two? Can you answer me Mr. Rus?
- Juanito Rus: It is open forum...



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

February 11, 2021

- Assata Olugbala: [crosstalk 01:26:16] Okay. Thank you.
- Juanito Rus: I believe, but the parliamentarian can correct me if I'm wrong.
- Assata Olugbala: That's okay. I thought it was open forum. Let me just address, the jurisdiction of this body, has oversight of the agency or Cipro. I'm not seeing sufficient oversight of Cipro to the point where you can make an evaluation of their effectiveness and appropriately looking at misbehavior of officers. Okay? Lastly, I think it would be dignified for anybody speaking about the BearCat to wait for the new police chief to give us a chance to hear from him or from the department, before you blast them on the BearCat. Give them a chance.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you Miss Olugbala. The next speaker in the queue is Sameena Usman. Good evening Miss Usman. Can you hear us?
- Sameena Usman: Yes. Hello. My name is Sameena Usman, I'm the Government Relations Coordinator for the Council on American Islamic Relations. I'm concerned with the language on the proposed armored vehicle language, and I feel like it does not provide enough protections for the community. I do... I hear all of the comments from the community members, and it's truly heartbreaking to hear about how children are afraid of law enforcement and hide under their beds in order to... Whenever they know that law enforcement is nearby. That's very concerning and this has an immense psychological impact on community members that it's damaging, and truly, I do not believe that the city should be having such a piece of equipment. This is a militarized equipment that should not be in cities, this is not a war, we should not be having such equipment and we should be retiring it, especially since it's very costly to maintain. Thank you.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you Miss Usman. The next speaker in the queue is a telephone attendee of the last four digits 3787. Good evening 3787. Can you hear us?... 3787, you can unmute and you have the floor... Last call for 3787 telephone attendee... Very well. At this time I will lower your hand. If you wish to speak on this item, if you re-raise your hand, I will call you at the end of the queue. The next speaker in the queue is listed as Maria. Good evening Maria. Can you hear us?
- Maria: Yes. Can you hear me?
- Juanito Rus: We can hear you. The floor is yours.
- Maria: All right. Thanks. My name is Maria, I live in the Fruitvale area on 25th Avenue, and I'm here to comment on the policy on militarized equipment, specifically to ask the commission to work to retire the BearCat and to stop allowing its use. My neighbor across the street has been targeted by this military equipment several times and I can tell you that even as a bystander, not as the direct target, that it is a terrorizing thing to experience. A tank in the street makes the neighborhood feel like a war zone. What it doesn't feel like, is genuine public safety. I thank you the commission, for your work and for keeping us all safe by banning BearCat. Thank you.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

February 11, 2021

- Juanito Rus: Thank you Maria. The next speaker in the queue is a telephone attendee with the last four digits 5802. Good evening 5802. Can you hear us?
- Saleem Bey: Yes. Good evening. Can you hear me?
- Juanito Rus: We can hear you. The floor is yours.
- Saleem Bey: Yes. This is Saleem Bey and I'd like to chime in, first of all, about the militarization of the community. The police talked behind closed doors about these things being toys, toys that they use inside the community. So that's therefore... Their justification is fear, but in the back, they just use these things as toys just like the baton and just like the other things [inaudible 01:30:56]. I'd also like to speak to the divide and conquer that the mayor has been putting out there against Asian and black, to pit each other against each other, in order to justify more OPD budget. OPD hasn't been keeping Chinatown North Oakland, East or West Oakland, safe to this point. So why would we think that all of a sudden, this added attention to Chinatown means that OPD needs more budget money? OPD needs to be pared down and needs to be actually defunded and decommissioned, instead of giving any more money. And nobody should listen to Libby Schaaf who had [crosstalk 01:31:36] Six police chiefs or more, under her-
- Juanito Rus: Thank you Mr. Bey. The next speaker in the queue is William Palmer. Good evening Mr. Palmer. Can you hear us?
- William Palmer: Yes I can. Thank you commission. My name is William Palmer. I believe that before you roll in a military equipment into our community, you need to pause and think that you've already failed the community by having to come in in this form and fashion. Instead of spending money for your police to bring in military equipment, how about bringing in jobs for those who don't have jobs? How about giving purpose to those youngsters who are just running the streets with nothing to do, with time on their hands? How about giving entrepreneurial classes to those that may be selling illegal substances and so on and so forth? How about using love instead of war, to solve the problems in our community? If more policing had ever solved a problem since slavery ended and police was created, we wouldn't even have problems. You've had hundreds of years to use police force to make our community safest. It is only to make wealthier communities feel safer. So please, demilitarize our communities [crosstalk 01:32:58] And retire BearCat.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you. Thank you Mr. Palmer. The next speaker in the queue is John Lindsay Poland. Good evening Mr. Lindsay Poland. Can you hear us?
- John Lindsay-Poland: Yes. Can you hear me?
- Juanito Rus: Yeah. We can hear you. The floor is yours.
- John Lindsay-Poland: Good evening. I work for the American Friends Service Committee, I was on the ad hoc committee for the policy on armored vehicles, and I join the voices to urge you to act to retire the BearCat. One of the things that we learned is that... And this was very late in the process. Is that the same



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

February 11, 2021

circumstances in which Joshua Pawlik was killed, under the policy that is before you tonight, my reading of it is that that would have approved the deployment of the BearCat. It would have allowed officers to fire from the top of the BearCat because there was no prohibition on using the BearCat as a shooting platform. You can pass a simple resolution that goes to the city council, that urges the city council and or the city manager, to retire the BearCat. There have been other circumstances also in which the BearCat was deployed where it should not have been, and under this proposed policy, it would again because of the low standard. So I urge you to retire it and adopt a stricter standard.

Juanito Rus: Thank you Mr. Lindsay Poland. The next speaker in the queue is Megan Steffen. Good evening Miss Steffen. Can you hear us?

Megan Steffen: Good evening. I can. Thank you so much. Happy lunar new year eve. I just wanted to, for the record and for the rest of the council, read off the other organizations that have signed on to the petition that Jasmine Fallstich and Steven were reading earlier. The Council on American Islamic Relations San Francisco Bay area, the Ella Baker Center for Human Rights, First Congressional Church of Oakland, Lighthouse Mosque, National Lawyers Guild SF Bay area, Oakland Neighbors Inspiring Trust, Oakland Privacy, Oakland Yard Wine Shop, Restore Oakland, Sarah Webster Fabio Center for Social Justice, Secure Justice, Seminary of the Street, Showing up for Racial Justice Bay area, Support Life Foundation, the Wellstone Club, United Native Americans, Urban Peace Movement and Youth ALIVE. In addition, since I sent the petition to you at 3:30 PM, 29 more people have signed the petition to retire the BearCat bringing the total to 310 people. Thanks so much.

Juanito Rus: Thank you Miss Steffen. The next speaker in the queue is Cathy Leonard. Good evening Miss Leonard. Can you hear us?

Cathy Leonard: Yes, I can. Good evening. Cathy Leonard from District 1. I'm on the steering committee of the Coalition for Police Accountability. District 1 is the district where Joshua Pawlik was killed. That was 18 blocks from my home. I want to thank the commission for looking for new ways to engage the community in the development of policy. Although the process for this policy was restricted due to an order by the federal judge, we hope that future policy development will expand the ability of community members to be at the table and ensure transparency throughout the process. The Coalition for Police Accountability supports removing militarized equipment from the policing of Oakland. We support retiring the BearCat as soon as possible and not replacing it with any visibly identified militarized vehicles. Thank you.

Juanito Rus: Thank you Miss Leonard. The next speaker in the queue is listed as Margaret. Good evening Margaret. Can you hear us?

Margaret Mayer-Hoffer: Hello. My name is Margaret Mayer-Hoffer. I'd like to join the other commenters in saying that the new armored vehicle does not go far enough by placing restrictions on the BearCat, OPD needs to retire the BearCat entirely. Militarized vehicles have no place in policing. They're a source of community fear and not community trust. Thank you.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

February 11, 2021

- Juanito Rus: Thank you Margaret. The next speaker in the queue... Oh, my apologies. The next speaker in the queue was Mr. Ericson Amaya, and I accidentally lowered his hand, so I've lost him. Mr. Amaya, if you can re-raise your hand, I'll call on you. Mr. Amaya, you have the floor.
- Ericson Amaya: Hello everybody. Ericson Amaya, I'm repping 67 Suenos, 67 dreams. We work directly with students in Oakland and it is clear from our youth, that this equipment is meant for war. Oakland is not at war. It causes more potholes and trauma that OPD and the city of Oakland are not prepared to address because getting a simple oversight report on this vehicle takes months. Please keep the next generation safe, end the criminalization of youth, and support communities first. We do not need no more law and order leaders at the local state national level. Please retire this war vehicle from our streets. Thank you.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you Mr. Amaya. The next speaker in the queue is listed as Humberto. Good evening Humberto. Can you hear us?
- Humberto: Yeah. And can you hear me?
- Juanito Rus: We can hear you. The floor is yours.
- Humberto: Awesome. What's going on everybody? My name is Humberto, I also work with the organization 67 Suenos that my partner E just mentioned, and I actually want to drop a quote from one of the youngsters that we worked with. We did an open forum on police issues and a youngster from District 6, a 17-year old young man said this, "If police only see their job as a war, they will never be able to protect and serve their community, but instead, will escalate and terrorize because that's what they know; bloated budgets, deficient priorities, complicit local governments."
- Humberto: Just wanted to share that quote from the youngsters that we work with, this is their perspective and what they feel, right? I also just want to address the new chief, super glad that you're in the mix and we're hearing good things from you. Mr. Fab posted you saying you represent West Oakland, and the youngsters that we work with from McClymonds are pushing for what we just called for, right? And the BearCat and militarized police. Thank you.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you, Humberto. The next speaker in the queue is Amelah El Amin of MU'EED. Good evening Ms. El Amin, can you hear us?
- Amelah El Amin: I can hear you. Can you hear me?
- Juanito Rus: We can hear you. You're a bit faint, but the floor is yours.
- Amelah El Amin: Thank you very much. As you said, my name is Amelah El Amin, I'm with MU'EED Incorporated, a non-profit organization in Oakland, in the Lighthouse Mosque. I live in District 7 and the Lighthouse Mosque is in District 1. And we urge you as a community to retire the BearCats. Oakland is not a combat zone; and it causes psychological harm to children and adults in our community, as well as it being costly. The day that I saw the BearCat driving down my street, all I



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

February 11, 2021

could think was, are we at war? Did something happen that I don't know about and I woke up, and we have a tent in the middle of our street. That's not how I want to live, and that's not how you should want us to live. Thank you for your time.

Juanito Rus: Thank you, Ms. El Amin. The next speaker in the queue is Kiana Rodriguez. Good evening, Ms. Rodriguez. Can you hear us?

Kiana Rodriguez: Yes. Can you hear me?

Juanito Rus: We can hear you. The floor is yours.

Kiana Rodriguez: My name is Kiana Rodriguez and I am an intern in the Government Relations Department at the Council on American Islamic Relations, San Francisco Bay area. We urge the Police Commission to ban the continued use of the BearCat armored vehicle in Oakland. Oakland PD uses forces disproportionately against black residents, and several studies conclude that police departments that acquire military grade equipment are more likely to use violence and are no more successful in reducing crime. In 2018-2019, OPD deployed the BearCat about twice a week on average, mostly in East Oakland and West Oakland, never in the Hills. Young people have testified how traumatizing their experience of these SWAT raids were, yet the decision to deploy the BearCat is linked in OPD policy and practiced in these SWAT raids, with unclear and wide criteria for when to deploy. OPD already has assault rifles, armored vehicles, battering rams, firearm rounds used to break locks, pepper spray, launchers, and projectiles for less lethal weapons and long batons, using crowd control to begin with. It is for these reasons harm outweighs any potential benefits. We are due to restrict the uses for armed vehicles. Thank you.

Juanito Rus: Thank you, Ms. Rodriguez. The next speaker in the queue is listed as Courtney. Good evening. Courtney, can you hear us?

Courtney: Good evening. I can hear you. Can you hear me?

Juanito Rus: We can hear you. You have one minute, whenever you're ready.

Courtney: All right. I am also here to call for the retirement of the BearCat. I'd like to remind everyone here today that the world is watching us. The world is watching the extreme militarization of the US police force and they are watching in shock as we continue to watch in shock and in trauma of constant state terror. We implore you to prevent future death and loss of life and to heal communities rather than harm them and continue the state terror by putting down a tank that has no place in community. Thank you.

Juanito Rus: Thank you. At this time I believe that is... There's one last hand in the queue. The last speaker in the queue on this item is Omar Farmer. Good evening, Mr. Farmer, can you hear us?

Omar Farmer: Good evening. Yes. This is Omar Farmer. I'm also a member of Ad Hoc Committee and I echo everyone's comments here. There's no empirical evidence that military equipment enhances



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

February 11, 2021

officer public safety. It actually triggers feelings of trauma for many, particularly children and other people in the community. Therefore, we really need to set more restrictive guidelines in the policy or retire it altogether. Thank you.

Juanito Rus: Thank you, Mr. Farmer. At this time, Madam Chair, I see no other speakers in the queue, I return the meeting to you. And as I said that, one other hand went up. Madam Chair, would you like me to take one more speaker or...

Regina Jackson: Please do. Thank you.

Juanito Rus: And now there are two. The next speaker is Christopher Valentine. Good evening, Mr. Valentine, can you hear us? Or Valentine? Mr. Valentine?

Christopher Valentine: Am I unmuted now?

Juanito Rus: You are unmuted. You have one minute, whenever you're ready.

Christopher Valentine: I'm ready. I see the value of the Oakland Police Department in controlling crime, where it is possible. In July, we saw multiple examples of organized crime committing major robberies and major burglaries of buildings. In a case like that, where there are large numbers of vehicles with criminals taking away the property from businesses and looting them, I could see the BearCat as being a useful tool in that kind of a rare case. It does come up and organized crime is not going away. There are lots of organized criminals who make Oakland their prey. In general, people are scared of the military vehicles. It looks like a war machine that's meant to kill people and the use of it should be as limited as possible. That's my opinion. Thank you.

Juanito Rus: Thank you, Mr. Valentine. And the next speaker in the queue is listed as Anne J. I believe that is Ms. Janks. I'm going to have to promote her to the panel. One second. Good evening, Ms. Janks. Can you hear us?

Anne Janks: Yes, I can. Good evening. I am with the Coalition for Police Accountability and I volunteered when the commission offered to have community members serve on the Ad Hoc as people who were able to make comments. I just want to clarify an earlier comment, that under this policy as written, which I would like to be stronger, that the police could still use the BearCat as a shooting platform in a situation like Pollock. First of all, I'd like to remind everybody that one reason that was most shocking about the murder of Joshua Pollock is that the police had learned nothing from a murder several years earlier from [Marius Hall 01:47:06]. Second of all, there is language restricting how an armored vehicle can be used. Even in this language, I just think it's important to recognize what the commission has done. There's also language in the Armed Unresponsive bulletin that was just passed that does the same thing. I repeat, I would like to get rid of the BearCat. Thank you.

Juanito Rus: Thank you, Ms. Janks. The next speaker in the queue is Marc Pilisuk. Good evening Mr. Pilisuk, can you hear us? Mr. Pilisuk? Excuse me, if I'm butchering your name, Marc Pilisuk.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

February 11, 2021

Marc Pilisuk: Can you hear me?

Juanito Rus: We can hear you. You have one minute, whenever you're ready.

Marc Pilisuk: Okay, I'm ready. I just wanted to say as someone who studies conflict resolution on a larger basis, that the most important thing that the police can do in helping to maintain public safety is to have the confidence of the people that they're working with. The use of large-scale military equipment really reduces that confidence and has no place in a community.

Juanito Rus: Thank you, Mr. Pilisuk. And now Madam Chair, I believe that is all the hands that were in the queue. I return the meeting to you.

Regina Jackson: Thank you very much. The next item on our agenda is to welcome our new Alternate Commissioner, Marsha Peterson. I am delighted to welcome Marsha Peterson, a learned and outstanding attorney specializing in personnel and labor relations. I'm not going to give her resume, I will let her share a little bit about herself. I do want to say that it is nice to see someone that I've known for 20 years, who I have great respect for, joining our work. It's a lot, and I'm delighted to have you with us. So Marsha, if I can unmute your mic, maybe you could share a little bit about yourself and then the rest of the commissioners can chime in with comments and or questions.

Marsha Peterson: Can you hear me?

Regina Jackson: Yes, ma'am.

Marsha Peterson: Well, good evening everyone. Thank you, Madam Chair and to the members of the commission. I am Marsha Carpenter Peterson, born and raised in Oakland, California. Oakland Tech graduate, low junior high school graduate, and a UC Berkeley graduate. After graduating from Berkeley, I went on to receive my law degree at Georgetown University, Georgetown Law Center in Washington DC. After which I spent almost six years with the Department of Justice in the Civil Division, Commercial Litigation Branch, winning over 40 cases on behalf of the Government. I returned to Oakland in 1983. Married with two children. Married a Skyline graduate of Oakland, and I was the Deputy Civilian Attorney in the Oakland Army Base office. The Deputy Staff Judge Advocate was my title. And then when I left there, I went on to be the General Counsel of the Naval Supply Center for approximately 15 years before it closed.

Marsha Peterson: Then I went on to the Port of Oakland to be the Deputy Port Attorney for labor and employment. And then I was promoted to be the Advisor to the Executive Director and the Board of Port Commissioners for labor. I was at the Port for about 15 years, a little over 15 years, and I officially retired. And then I did a little contract work on the plaintiff's side, again in labor and employment. I've been a member of the Oakland Parks and Rec Commission for five years. I was on the Civil Grand Jury for two years. I've been a National Committee Chair for The Links, Incorporated for protocol for four years, and I have served as a Vice President for Friends of Faith, which was a



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

February 11, 2021

non-profit that helped women with breast cancer. So I've done a lot of non-profit work after I "retired."

Marsha Peterson: And so I have now, humbly and with honor, I am accepting this position with the Oakland Police Commission. I'm honored and I look forward to advancing the work of the commission. So thank you for welcoming me and I do look forward to taking my place on the commission. Thank you for an opportunity to speak.

Regina Jackson: Thank you very much, Commissioner Peterson. I'm not sure if any of the other commissioners have individual welcomes and or questions, but please raise your hand so that I can acknowledge you. Okay. Commissioner Dorado.

Jose Dorado: Yes. I just wanted to welcome you to our commission. We had a chance to chat. It was very nice, the conversation that we had. I really can't think of a better set of qualifications that you have outlined. Oakland born and raised, UC Berkeley grad. You did your years of work outside and you came back home. So I just wanted to say thank you for taking on this load and it's a load, but a load that you will enjoy. And I just want to welcome you on behalf of everyone. Thank you for stepping up and doing this.

Marsha Peterson: Thank you very much.

Regina Jackson: I see another hand from Commissioner Harbin-Forte.

Brenda Harbin-Forte: Thank you, Chair. I want to welcome our new commissioner as well. Marsha, you and I have known each other for many, many years, and I'm just very, very pleased to be able to work with you in this capacity. You bring a broad range of experience. You bring a commitment to Oakland, you bring some fresh ideas, but service to the city of Oakland. It's already been demonstrated and I'm just very, very pleased to have you on the commission, and I know that you'll do an outstanding job and that you'll make courageous suggestions and always act in the best interest of the people of Oakland. So welcome.

Marsha Peterson: Thank you so very much. I'm very honored to serve with you Commissioner Harbin-Forte.

Regina Jackson: Vice Chair Gage.

Henry Gage, III: Thank you, Chair. Commissioner Peterson, as my colleagues have already said, welcome. This work is tiresome, it's thankless, but it is necessary. It is a labor of love, as well as the labor of survival for many of us, and I'm grateful that the City of Oakland has individuals who are willing to step up when the opportunity presents itself. Thank you for being here, we're looking forward to working with you.

Marsha Peterson: Thank you very much.

Regina Jackson: I think those are all the hands that are raised. We can go to public comment.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

February 11, 2021

- Juanito Rus: Thank you, Madam Chair. Does any member of the public wishes to comment on item seven on tonight's agenda, please raise your hand in the Zoom queue, and you will be called in the order in which your hands are raised. At this time, the first speaker on this item is Ms. Assata Olugbala. Good evening, Ms. Olugbala.
- Assata Olugbala: Yes. All right. You may not have the jurisdiction to correct the wrong doings of Ginale Harris. It does not allow you to ignore it. And anybody who comes to this body, in the future, and today, comes on the backs of Ginale Harris. The wrong doing that happened to her can happen to anyone, if it's not allowed to be dealt with. You say you have no jurisdiction, but you do have a conscious. If you have a conscious, you have to look at what the Coalition for Police Accountability, the selection panel did to sabotage Ginale Harris' capability of being on this commission. And I'm so disappointed with the public who spoke up for Ginale Harris, but they have now walked away from her. All the work she's done, all the commitment she's had. No one can go forward without taking responsibility, because if you ignore Ginale Harris, what else will you ignore as you proceed to do your work?
- Juanito Rus: Thank you, Ms. [inaudible 01:57:54]. The next speaker in the queue is Kevin Cantu. Good evening, Mr. Cantu.
- Kevin Cantu: Welcome aboard. And I hope you are as active and assertive a participant in this commission, as the best of your predecessors. Good luck.
- Marsha Peterson: Thank you.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you Mr. Cantu. The next speaker in the queue is a telephone attendee with the last four digits 5802. I believe that is Mr. Saleem Bey. Good evening, Mr. Bey. Can you hear us?
- Saleem Bey: Yes. Good evening. This is Saleem Bey. I would like to reiterate with Ms. Assata said, which was that, Ginale Harris, nobody has forgotten, no real person has forgotten that Ginale Harris was railroaded off of this commission, and that goes directly to the credibility of this commission and all the commissioners that are sitting up there. That they watched this happen, that Ginale Harris was railroaded. She was said to be the hardest working commissioner on the Oakland Police Commission, and yet the Oakland, I mean, Coalition for Police Accountability had two members that voted against her and sabotaged her. So the community will never forget the people who were standing up for the community that were attacked by the powers that be. And just because you have a law degree, does not make you qualified for the positions on here. I'm not saying this personally to the new commissioner or the new alternate commissioner, but just the fact that all of the people up there with law degrees that think that they're better than everybody else, doesn't mean anything.
- Juanito Rus: Your time has expired. The next speaker in the queue is Cathy Leonard. Good evening, Ms. Leonard, can you hear us?



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

February 11, 2021

- Cathy Leonard: Yes. Good evening. I'd like to welcome our newest police commissioner to the Police Commission. A lot of hard work, a lot of time. I hope you're up to the challenge and that you'll represent the community. And also I'm going to say this for the last time, the Coalition for Police Accountability had absolutely nothing to do with Ginale Harris not being maintained as a Police Commissioner. There were four people that voted against her, not two people. I'm sorry she's gone. She was a great member of the Police Commission, and that's all I'm going to say on that issue from here on out. Welcome again, Ms. Peterson. Thank you.
- Marsha Peterson: Thank you.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you, Ms. Leonard. The next speaker in the queue is Jennifer Tu. Good evening, Ms. Tu. Can you hear us?
- Jennifer Tu: Yes. Thank you. I just wanted to echo the earlier speaker, I think that was Kevin, who said welcome to new Alternate Commissioner, Marsha Peterson. Thank you for signing up for some really incredible volunteer work and I just wanted to let you know that I really appreciate all of the work that I know you'll be doing and how much you'll be building on the work of all of the people who have come through the commission since it was started in 2016. So thank you so much for being here and welcome.
- Marsha Peterson: Thank you.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you, Ms. Tu. At this time, I see no other hands in the queue. Madam Chair. I return the meeting to you. Chair Jackson?
- Regina Jackson: Thank you very much. The next item is the election of the Police Commission Chairperson. Commissioner Harbin-Forte. Your hand is up.
- Brenda Harbin-Forte: I apologize. I'll take it down, but then I'll put it right back up on this next agenda item. So I'll wait.
- Regina Jackson: I'm sorry. I think my cable's a little unstable. I called on you. Have you already spoken?
- Brenda Harbin-Forte: No, my hand was up, but I am ready to speak on this agenda item. I'm sorry. My hand was still up from the prior time.
- Regina Jackson: Oh, I'm sorry, Okay, got it.
- Brenda Harbin-Forte: But I would like to raise it now to speak on this agenda item when you formally call it.
- Regina Jackson: Oh, okay. Yes. So I have called it and I see that your hand is up. Thank you.
- Brenda Harbin-Forte: All right. Thank you. With respect to the election of the Commission Chairperson, I would like to nominate the current chair, Chair Jackson, to serve another term as chair. I make the nomination for a number of reasons. One, she has been a fantastic and outstanding chair. She's led us through



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

February 11, 2021

some challenging times and she has been an exemplary leader. We have had issues of first impression in terms of how we go about selecting our new Police Chief. She led us through that, through a very creative way of selecting our Police Chief to ensure transparency, to ensure that the public was kept apprised of what was going on and to introduce the candidates to the public, to let them see the candidates that we were considering. She is the hardest working person I know, and she juggles a number of things. I think it's also good to have the continuity of this chair.

Brenda Harbin-Forte: We have a number of new commissioners on the commission and she is one of our elder commissioners. She was one of the original commissioners on the commission and she has the history, she has the institutional knowledge, and really, she is now the longest serving commissioner. I think that with her continued leadership, others who are newer to the commission will be later in a position to assume the leadership of the commission. But I would like to nominate her. I won't go through her entire resume, but as you know, what she's been involved in, in terms of East Oakland Youth Development Center. Meaning that she's highly educated, she has all kinds of degrees and everything else, but she's just a wonderful person. She's politically savvy and she has represented us well. She's advocated for the commission and always fought for the commission and the commission's best interests. So I would nominate her to be chair of the commission for another term.

Regina Jackson: Thank you, Brenda. I see two more hands, Commissioner Dorado followed by Commissioner Garcia.

Jose Dorado: Thank you, Chair Jackson. I cannot agree more to what Commissioner Harbin-Forte said, other than you and I, as the commissioner said, the elders on the commission. But one of the things I do want to mention is the fact that when you first got elected, it was a real test for you. And as I told you, a couple of times, you just got better and better at the job. It's not easy being the chair. Not just in terms of controlling the discussion and the meeting itself, but certainly the kind of work and kind of time and kind of savvy that is absolutely needed to do the job effectively. And that's what you've done in no uncertain terms. So I wholeheartedly second commissioner Harbin-Forte's motion for you being our nominee for the chair again, and I'm glad that you're willing to step up and do that. Thank you for your dedication, because it is considerable. Thanks again.

Regina Jackson: Thank you, Commissioner Dorado. I see Commissioner Garcia's hand raised.

Sergio Garcia: Thank you, Commissioner. Thank you, Madam Chair. Well, Commissioner Dorado beat me to the punch. If I could third the nomination, I would gladly do it. I think, Chair Jackson, while I've been on the commission only a few months, I have found Chair Jackson to be not only an exemplary leader, hard-working commissioner, but also someone who has a great love for the City of Oakland and I'm losing my voice.

Regina Jackson: Okay. Thank you, Commissioner Garcia.

Sergio Garcia: I'm not done. Let me just drink some water, here we are. Okay. Great love for the City of Oakland, and truly a mentor for those of us who are new to the commission, because there is lot to cover



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION MEETING TRANSCRIPT

February 11, 2021

with the strong vote of our voters here in this city, that has put us in the spotlight. A lot of folks have mentioned that. And through all of that, Chair Jackson has been tested again and again. And I really enjoy working with you, Chair Jackson. So I'm super thrilled that you are willing to step up and do it again. So I third the nomination for Chair Jackson.

Regina Jackson: I thank you very much. I would be remiss if I didn't ask if there were any other nominations for the position of Chairperson. Commissioner Singleton.

Tyfahra Singleton: Thank you, Chair. I would also like to nominate you for Chair. I know you've already been nominated, but it has been quite a transition to join this commission and your compassionate leadership, I have never seen in my career. And I can't imagine moving forward at this beginning time as we knew commissioners come without you. So I also would like to nominate you.

Regina Jackson: Thank you so very much. I'm speechless. If there are no other nominations, then I will move forward. It has been moved and properly seconded. [crosstalk 02:10:28] No, I'm getting ready to go there.

Brenda Harbin-Forte: Oh. I'm sorry.

Regina Jackson: I'm not forced to vote. No, no, no. That's okay. Yeah. So Mr. Rouse, if we can take public comment, please.

Juanito Rus: Thank you. Madam Chair. If any member of the public wishes to speak on item eight, please raise your hand in the Zoom queue and you will be called in the order in which your hands are raised. The first speaker on this item, excuse me while I share the timer, is listed as Bruce S. Good evening, Bruce S. Can you hear us?

Bruce Schmiechen: Yes, I can. Can you hear me?

Juanito Rus: We can hear you.

Bruce Schmiechen: Yeah. Bruce speaking, Coalition for Police Accountability and Faith in Action. And in the line of something that was said very early tonight. I just want to stipulate, I'm not a particular fan of Mayor Schaaf, and I've been since attending almost every Police Commission meeting since it started, have often been critical of her attempts to influence the commission, etcetera. That said, I judge all the commissioners, not on how they got on the commission, but how they performed on the commission. Chair Jackson is an extraordinary person. I feel privileged to have gotten to know her a bit and I can't think of anybody better to be Chair of this commission. She is great. She's a great person all around. Thank you.

Juanito Rus: Thank you, Mr. Schmiechen. The next speaker in the queue is Cathy Leonard. Good evening, Ms. Leonard. Can you hear us?



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

February 11, 2021

- Cathy Leonard: Good evening. Yes, I can. Everyone has said what needs to be said about Commissioner Regina Jackson, whom I've known for many years and I am in full support of her maintaining the chairship of the police commission. Thank you.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you, Ms. Leonard. The next speaker in the queue is Michael Tigges. Good evening, Mr. Tigges. Can you hear us?
- Michael Tigges: Thank you. One minute. Yes, I guess I'm just going to pile on with all of the rest of us here who have been very impressed by Chair Jackson's leadership through really tumultuous times. And the nice thing is she stands up to the mayor politely but firmly, which is just refreshing. Thank you.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you, Mr. Tigges. The next speaker in the queue is Assata Olugbala. Good evening, Ms. Olugbala. Can you hear us?
- Assata Olugbala: Yes. I cannot support anybody because of the reasons I continue to present around how lack of leadership when it's necessary to stand up for Ginale Harris, the lack of leadership. It would have taken a lot of courage to stand up for Ginale Harris. And Ms. Jackson and all of you should know, particularly the ones Garcia and Singleton, you were there. You heard what went on and you remained silent. So it doesn't matter whether you're the mayor, or you came from the selection panel because the selection panel is corrupt related to that. And Nicole, I'm so glad you said you're not going to talk no more about what I'm saying about the coalition for police accountability. Is so much going on wrong with this? It doesn't matter who is the president and the vice president, because you all take the same position, you won't stand up for justice.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you, Ms. Olugbala. The next speaker in the queue is a telephone attendee with the last four digits, 5802. I believe that is Mr. Saleem Bey. Good evening, Mr. Bey. Can you hear us?
- Saleem Bey: Yes, it's Saleem Bey. And I would like to follow up with what Ms. Assata said that we did not forget that number one, this commission was created based on the fact that the City of Oakland had failed in racial profiling of the black community. Part of that failure came from the mayor, the current mayor. This commission has never had a community leadership.
- Saleem Bey: Everybody who's been on this commission in the leadership position and the chair position has been representing the mayor. So how are you going to say that this is something that's independent if the mayor keeps choosing it, when the mayor is the person who was the issue in the first place? The mayor has never been able to pick a competent police chief. So how are you going to say that now the mayor is to be the person who gets to choose the person who is going to be the chair of the police commission? That means nothing has changed in terms of the police commission or community leadership of the police. And if that doesn't change and you [crosstalk 02:16:16] keep putting the mayor's people in here, then the community will never be in charge of the...
- Juanito Rus: The next speaker in the queue is a telephone attendee with the last four digits, 9997. Good evening, 9997. Can you hear us?



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

February 11, 2021

- 9997: Hi, can you hear me?
- Juanito Rus: We can hear you. You have the floor.
- 9997: I just want to express my disappointment. I've been disappointed with the newer members of the commission for a long time. You all don't do anything, you don't say anything, you don't comment, you don't make the conversation bigger. I wonder what you're doing most of the time during the meeting. But I think this is bigger. I mean, there is a reason why this is the first meeting since Libby Schaaf attacked a council person, an Asian-American council person in Chinatown lied about the police budget, which is under your purview. That even made Newsweek. And for the chair to talk about how wonderful it was to hire a new police chief instead of that was shocking. It's shocking, and you should all be embarrassed. And if anyone knew anything about the commission, it would be embarrassing. But no one pays attention to this commission anyway because of this kind of stuff. I'm very disappointed.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you, 9997. The next speaker in the queue is Mariano Contreras. Good evening, Mr. Contreras. Can you hear us?
- Mariano Contreras: Yes. Good evening. I just want to personally appreciate the leadership provided by Chair Jackson. And I highly suspect that it was Chair Jackson who really promoted the local search of the new chief, which saved us tons of money as taxpayers. I really suspect that she was the driving force behind that. I can't tell you the number of times that we've been overlooked because we've been told that we don't have locally qualified applicants. And not only did they save us money, but also you have lifted one of our own. So once again, for everyone who participated in this, and particularly Chair Jackson, thank you for this and everything you do and you do well. Thank you.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you, Mr. Contreras. At this time seeing no other hands in the queue, Madam chair, I return the meeting to you.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you very much. I think it's time to vote. Commissioner Dorado.
- Jose Dorado: Aye.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Gage.
- Henry Gage, III: Yes.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Garcia.
- Sergio Garcia: Aye.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Harbin-Forte.
- Brenda Harbin-Forte: Aye.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

February 11, 2021

Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Singleton.

Tyfahra Singleton: Yes.

Regina Jackson: Thank you. And I will vote for myself. I am proud to be your chairperson. I'm really moved by all the wonderful and supportive comments, and I hear the challenges. I will say this, that while I am a mayoral appointee, I am now and have always been a community leader first. Mayor Schaaf has never tried to force me to do anything. And those of you that know me would know that she couldn't if she tried. I am appreciative that she appointed me. But from the moment that I have been on this commission, I have sought to not have a line. Some people would call it color line, others power line, whatever you want to call it. I really sought to ensure that members of the commission were for the City of Oakland, not for any other side. So, thank you for indulging me in that moment of privilege. I will continue to work very hard for the commission as well as for the citizens because we wouldn't be here without you. Thank you.

Regina Jackson: It was a unanimous vote. I forgot to identify the votes. Moving on to item nine, the election of the Oakland Police Commission's vice chair. I would like to nominate Commissioner Dorado. Forgive me. I jumped right ahead. I didn't see the two hands in front of me. Commissioner Garcia and Harbin-Forte, and I will speak after they speak. Commissioner Garcia?

Sergio Garcia: Thank you, Madam Chair. I fully want to express my support for Commissioner Dorado. He, like Chair Jackson, has been on this commission for several years through many tough and challenging times. I've only been on the commission for a few months, but Jose has already reached out and given me tremendous support and background on the key and the critical issues facing the commission, hardworking, very committed to Oakland, super committed to racial equity and the elimination of white supremacy wherever we find it, and especially within the Oakland Police Department. I'm fully supportive of the nomination. I would like to second that nomination.

Regina Jackson: Excellent. Thank you very much. I didn't quite get to say a few things that I wanted to. Commissioner Dorado has been the other four-year term person. Commissioner Dorado reached out before we were even on the dais. He is Mr. conciliator and he's just very strong voice. I was proud to see his work on the ad hoc for the police chief nominations. He worked very diligently. I'm even more proud to have him call out white supremacy law before people recognized that it was in fact a thing, people in the police, I would say. Community is very well aware. Commissioner Dorado has been stalwart. He has been thorough. He has been committed. And as we get ready to do this community policing thing, we can just call him Jose community policing Dorado.

Regina Jackson: I'm very proud to nominate or second or third, as the case may be. I can't say enough about him. He's thoughtful, he's kind, he's thorough, and he's committed to Oakland, and that's what we need. Commissioner Harbin-Forte.

Brenda Harbin-Forte: Yes. Thank you, chair. I want to echo what's already been said about Commissioner Dorado. He is hardworking, he is dedicated, he is committed to Oakland. I did not know him as I did not know many of the commissioners before I came onto the commission in July. But what I've been



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

February 11, 2021

impressed with is his commitment to the commission's work, his activities in the community, how active he is, how he cares about what the community thinks, and how hard working he was. It was a pleasure to work with him on the ad hoc to select a new police chief. He has creative ideas and he's just a hard worker. And I think the commission has been lucky to have him on as I had with you for these four years since the commission was started. And I think he will be a wonderful vice chairperson and I echo everything that has been said about him.

Regina Jackson: Excellent. Thank you very much. It has been moved and seconded. I want to know if there are any other nominations for the position of vice chair. I see no other hands up. So with that, we can go to public comment. Mr. Rus?

Juanito Rus: Thank you, Madam Chair. If any member of the public wishes to speak on item nine on tonight's agenda, please raise your hand in the Zoom queue and you will be called in the order in which your hands are raised. The first speaker on this item is a telephone attendee with the last four digits, 5802. Good evening, 5802. Can you hear us?

Saleem Bey: Yes. Good evening. This is Saleem Bey. And I would also like to say that Mr. Dorado took over the lead as the eighth ad hoc chair for the state independent investigation. And so far to this point, Mr. Dorado has been top notch. We have no complaints against him. One of the issue is, is that all of the people who are lauding Mr. Dorado to make sure that they follow up when Mr. Dorado comes with the independent investigation of the Bey case, that they also follow up with Mr. Dorado's ad hoc committee, and that people follow up with the recommendations that come out of that. And beyond that, I would just like to say Mr. Dorado has been pretty much straight up with us and we appreciate him as an ally. Thank you.

Juanito Rus: Thank you, Mr. Bey. The next speaker in the queue is Michael Tigges. Good evening, Mr. Tigges. Can you hear us?

Michael Tigges: Yes, I can. Thank you, Juanito. I'm going to add to the adulation. Commissioner Dorado is an old friend. We met back in 2010 working on Jean Quan's mayoral campaign. And we've been good friends and colleagues ever since. No better choice than having Chair Jackson and Jose as the two people in the leadership of the commission. It gives me confidence that this commission will continue its groundbreaking work. And let's all remember, this commission is known nationwide for the incredible work that they've done in reforming policing in this country. Thank you.

Juanito Rus: Thank you, Mr. Tigges. The next speaker in the queue is listed as Bruce S. I believe that's Mr. Schmiechen. Good evening, Mr. Schmiechen. Can you hear us?

Bruce Schmiechen: Yeah, I'm assuming you can hear me.

Juanito Rus: We can hear you.

Bruce Schmiechen: I just want to say, yeah, I think this is a great team this being put forward. And particularly, I didn't know everything about the background on the police chief hiring, and I'm so glad to hear that



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

February 11, 2021

Commissioner Dorado was a key voice in that. And the thing that I think is really excellent about this is knowing the community policing lens that is so important to commissioner Dorado and it's important to the community and to Oakland. And moving forward, I think bringing that with this opportunity of a reboot with the new chief, I really look forward to his leadership in that regard. And so I'm really appreciative of his long service. And I think having the two senior members is wonderful. Thank you.

Juanito Rus: Thank you, Mr. Schmiechen. The next speaker in the queue is Cathy Leonard. Good evening, Ms. Leonard. Can you hear us?

Cathy Leonard: Yes, I can. Good evening. I'd also like to express my happiness that Commissioner Dorado has been nominated as vice chair. I've also have known him and his work in the community for many years. He's a diligent person. He loves Oakland as I do, and I'm looking forward to him continuing his great work on the police commission. Thank you, Commissioner Dorado, for all the work you've done so far and will do in the future.

Juanito Rus: Thank you, Ms. Leonard. The next speaker in the queue is Assata Olugbala. Good evening, Ms. Olugbala. Can you hear us?

Assata Olugbala: Yeah. I think it's really amazing how the two people that could have helped Ginale Harris the most of the president and the vice president, Dorado was the one that supposedly wrote... No, he didn't write. He supposedly stated to Ms. Cobb in an interview, telephone interview that Ms. Cobb reported. He said Ginale was abrasive. He said he didn't say it. He came to the meeting and said he didn't say it. But he didn't fight for her. He never did fight for her. Still, not saying nothing about it. Ginale is somebody that really believes in you. She believes in you, and you've never even fought for her. But you did work hard to get [inaudible 02:31:27] to dance with Brooks. You worked hard on that, but you couldn't work with Ginale.

Juanito Rus: Thank you, Ms. Olugbala.

Assata Olugbala: Hey, babies. I can see you. How are you doing? I got it...

Juanito Rus: At this time, I see no other hands in the queue. Madam Chair?

Regina Jackson: Thank you very much. It has been properly moved and seconded. We've taken public comment and it's now time to vote for Jose Dorado for the commission vice chairperson. First vote is Commissioner Dorado.

Jose Dorado: I humbly vote for myself.

Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Gage?

Henry Gage, III: Yes.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

February 11, 2021

Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Garcia.

Sergio Garcia: Aye.

Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Harbin-Forte.

Brenda Harbin-Forte: Aye.

Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Singleton.

Tyfahra Singleton: Yes.

Regina Jackson: Thank you. And hi for myself. Again, a unanimous vote, very happy to have you serve as the vice chair, Commissioner Dorado. You know what this is about to be, some hard work, man.

Jose Dorado: Absolutely. And thank you so much to everybody and their vote and the accolades as well as from the public. I really appreciate it. And I couldn't ask for a better partner in this moving forward than Regina Jackson, but I will say that I will, and I do count on those commissioners who are no longer here on the dais but are still with us, starting with Ginale Harris and going to Mike Nisperos and Edwin Prather and Tara Anderson, Thomas Smith, those who still they're not here on our Zoom call, but their hearts are here. And I know that Regina and I can call on them at any time and we will for guidance in moving forward.

Jose Dorado: And lastly, the team, if you can call it that, rounded up by our new chief I think is an unbeatable combination. And I'm excited. I'm excited for the future, I'm excited for this commission, and I'm excited for our city and our future. A lot of hard work, there's no getting around that, but nothing good comes or anything without any hard work. So thanks again to everyone. I really appreciate it.

Regina Jackson: Absolutely. Thank you. So, now we are going to do a more formal welcome for our new police chief, LeRonne Armstrong. LeRonne, I think most people got to know you through the interview process. But if you have any words about your first few days as chief, certainly, your priorities and what it is that you are looking for in terms of support from us, please let us know, let it rip.

Chief Armstrong: Good evening, chair. Thank you to the police commissioners and all of the commissioners that were part of the selection panel. I really appreciate being selected to be one of the finalists for the chief of police position. And I'm thankful that the mayor selected me to be the police chief for the City of Oakland. So, I'm honored to take on this position. For me, it is a huge accomplishment not only for myself but for my community. Obviously, some know my background. I'm born and raised in Oakland, raised in West Oakland, a graduate of McClymonds High School. I joined the police department over 22 years ago, and I came here with a mission. And my mission was really to change the culture of the Oakland Police Department to be a bridge between the community and the police department, and to be able to be a part of the decision-making that I think can help to build a relationship with our community.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

February 11, 2021

- Chief Armstrong: So, I'm really grateful to be in this position. I hit the ground running. One of the things that I did from the outset was really make it clear that it was a new day starting Monday morning with my appointment to chief of police. I was very clear through the entire testing process that for 22 years, I was a police officer in Oakland all the way up to a deputy chief of police in Oakland, but I was not the police chief. And the final book did not stop with me. I am now in the position as the final decision-making for the Oakland Police Department, and I plan to make these immediate changes.
- Chief Armstrong: So, if commission is aware, I started Monday by making sweeping changes up to the executive level. My goal is to put a team in place that is going to focus this department on NSA compliance to ensure that this department every day is putting forth our best effort to reach compliance. I immediately promoted Captain Christopher Bolton to deputy chief of police over Bureau of Field Operations One. I also promoted Captain Nishant Joshi to deputy chief of police for Bureau of Field Operations Two. Both of these two outstanding executives understand my mission, understand where I want to take the organization, and understand my vision for safety in the City of Oakland.
- Chief Armstrong: We have some serious challenges at the Oakland Police Department, and I recognize those challenges. One of the things that I've already begin drafting is a new waiver that will go to all future and background hirees that will make it a mandatory sign-off that they have no connection to any white supremacists, any extremist groups, or any racist, sexist, or homophobic groups. They can't have any comments on social media or have any connection in any way to these type of ideas. I'm also producing a waiver within the Oakland Police Department that all members of the department will sign that also acknowledges to say, "We are going to continue our current investigation with our independent investigator. And at the conclusion of that investigation, those found in violation of the department's policy will face significant discipline up to termination." The culture of this organization is going to be sanitized to get rid of those that should not wear a badge anymore.
- Chief Armstrong: We have an issue around violent crime in our city. And as someone that has been a victim of violence in a family that has felt a traumatic impact of losing family members, I understand how important it is that people in our community live in a safe city, particularly our African-American community where violence has plagued them the most. I want my community to know that every day that I come to work and put on this uniform, I have you in my mind and in my heart that I have to do whatever I can to make this city safe for everyone. But I realize the people in this city that have been impacted the most. The culture of this organization needs to be one that values its relationship with our community.
- Chief Armstrong: You have already seen me out on foot in Chinatown, making sure I support our community. You see me in East Oakland getting out and meeting our community. I'll continue to be in the community making relationships, trying to improve the Oakland Police Department. My relationship with the police commission will continue. I have been fortunate to be the liaison for the police commission for the past two years. My role will be filled now by deputy chief Nishant Joshi. He will become the new liaison and will continue to work with the police commission to



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

February 11, 2021

make sure we are making policies that improve the Oakland Police Department, progressive policies that are examples to the country about how progressive policing can change a city, how progressive policing can change a country. So chair, I just really thank you. I'm ready for this challenge. I think the mayor, the city administrator, they promoted Deputy Chief Drennon Lindsey, from interim deputy chief to permanent deputy chief. I have been in conversations with the federal monitor about moving the department forward.

Chief Armstrong: One of the new initiatives that you will see is that the department will create a bureau of risk management and accountability. That bureau will focus on NSA compliance full-time and we will be transparent about our progress with the commission and with the public. You will soon see monthly stop data reports uploaded to our website. You will also see our quarterly compliance reports. It is our effort to demonstrate to the public that we are moving forward with our NSA compliance effort. So chair, I'll stop there. I'll take any questions and comments. Within 100 days, you will have before you my strategic plan that will not be just written by me. It will be a focus group of community members, members of the police commission, as well as members of the police department's executive team. So I submit to you my opening remarks, Mick.

Speaker 2: [inaudible 02:43:15].

Chief Armstrong: I forgot what?

Speaker 2: [inaudible 02:43:18].

Regina Jackson: Chief.

Chief Armstrong: Chair, did you hear me?

Regina Jackson: I'm sorry. My cable is going in and out. I cut off after the 100-day plan.

Chief Armstrong: Yes. Within 100 days, we will produce our strategic plan for our next two years. That will include community members, police commissioners, and the OPD executive team along with other members within the department. So I just wanted to submit to the community that there is a 100-day plan that will be coming that will have the department's mission, vision, and values, but also our strategic plan for how we're going to accomplish our goals.

Regina Jackson: Sounds like a great start. Thank you very much. I know we want to talk a little bit about your policy priorities, but I do see a hand up from Commissioner Dorado.

Jose Dorado: Chief, it really just rolls right off the tongue. Chief LeRonne Armstrong, I'm so pleased at your selection, the mayor selected you. And I'll just reiterate again what I had told you when I called to congratulate you. [foreign language 02:44:46]. Do not fail us, and I know you will not. So I'm looking forward to working with you as we all are. And I know that we will together accomplish great things. So, thank you and welcome.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

February 11, 2021

- Regina Jackson: Thank you very much, Commissioner Dorado. Commissioner Harbin-Forte, is your hand up, newly? Or did you not take it down? I'm sorry, I can't discern.
- Brenda Harbin-Forte: Yes, it is back up.
- Regina Jackson: Okay. Very good.
- Brenda Harbin-Forte: Thank you.
- Regina Jackson: No problem. So, [crosstalk 02:45:24] hands. Commissioner Harbin-Forte and then, Commissioner Peterson. Go ahead.
- Brenda Harbin-Forte: Chief Armstrong does have a very nice ring to it, and I want to congratulate you on having been selected. Your commitment to Oakland and the great work that you've done, it's just been extraordinary. I was very pleased to learn all about you during the selection process. Also, very pleased that you are a graduate at McClymonds as I am. So, the people from McClymonds, sometimes, do all right by themselves in life. So, I really want to just congratulate you. It's very impressive that you did just, swearing-in, you took your oath of office at McClymonds High. It means a lot to the West Oakland community. It means a lot to the entire Oakland community. I just want you to know that we are here for you, not just as members of the commission. I'm here for you as a resident of the city of Oakland. There's a lot of work to be done and things... we need to take a creative look at getting that work done. So, just know that the community supports you. The commission supports you. And I, personally, support you. Thank you.
- Regina Jackson: Commissioner Peterson, and then followed by Commissioner Garcia.
- Marsha Peterson: Thank you, Madam Chair. Congratulations Chief Armstrong on your appointment. I wanted to just ask and receive a point of clarification. Did you say you are going to submit within 100 days, your mission, vision, and values, and strategic plan for the next two years, within the next 100 days, you're going to submit that?
- Chief Armstrong: Yes, that's our goal.
- Marsha Peterson: Thank you.
- Regina Jackson: Okay. Commissioner Garcia.
- Sergio Garcia: Congratulations, Chief Armstrong. It's evident, that you care deeply about Oakland. You're grounded and open. You're centered in Oakland. And you know what the job will require having served over 20 years in OPD. Your statements about the culture within the Oakland Police Department, resonate with me. And I'm sure with every one of the commissioners here. You value the community and your commitment to completely sanitize Oakland of all vestiges of white supremacy, that's just the one thing that I was hoping you would say. And you said it at your first meeting as Chief of Police. So, thank you for that. Thank you so much for that.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

February 11, 2021

- Sergio Garcia: I, personally, look, very eager, to work with you. I like how you express the progressive policing responsibilities and challenges that could really make Oakland a better place. And you also know that the nation is watching. So, I'm really happy that you mentioned the entire country where policing is an area of focus, that the Biden-Harris campaign had referenced and now their administration is referencing. So, you are the right person at the right time, not just for Oakland, but for the entire country. So, I'm really looking forward to working with you and partnering with you, and all the great people at the Oakland Police Department. Thank you.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you, Commissioner Garcia. Those are all the hands that I see, thus far. I did want to engage you in one conversation around your priorities for policies so that I can be appropriate in setting up our ad hoc and our way forward and timelines to meet the expectations. Can you talk about the priorities that you're putting forth, your attachment?
- Chief Armstrong: Yes. So, Chair, we have put forward and I emailed you and the Vice-chair, this week with our new updated internal affairs policy. That is a really critical policy for us. It governs our taken-in complaints, how we investigate complaints. We've had it reviewed by the federal monitor as well as the plaintiff's attorneys and the city attorney. And so, we are now seeking to bring it forth to the commission. I'm not sure if we need an ad hoc, but if the commission feels like we need to do more work and there are more additions that they believe, substantive additions to the policy, we can definitely move forward in an ad hoc. But if it's something that we think we can just modify policy, that's one that I'd like to move for pretty urgently, because that covers our internal affairs investigative process.
- Chief Armstrong: The other policy that we will be bringing forth to you, shortly, is our forcing investigations policy. Essentially, how we investigate officer-involved shootings and serious uses of force. That policy is being finished. It's in its last review stage from our criminal investigations division. So, Deputy Chief Lindsey and her team, they're finishing up that policy that will be coming to you within the next month, I assume. And then, you will get our vehicle pursuit policy after that. All three of which are heavy-lift policies. And so, I want to start with those three that have a significant impact on the community. It would be nice to hear the community's input on those three policies. And then, I think, those three will be something that we will be working on, hopefully, for the next several months.
- Regina Jackson: Okay. Thank you very much. At this point, if there are no other hands or questions for Chief Armstrong, we can go to public comment. Okay. Mr. Rus?
- Juanito Rus: Thank you, Madam Chair. If any member of the public wishes to speak on item 10 on tonight's agenda, please raise your hand in the zoom queue, and you'll be called in the order in which your hands are raised. The first speaker on this item is Jennifer Tu. Good evening, Ms. Tu. Can you hear us?
- Jennifer Tu: Yes. Thank you. I just wanted to, I guess, through the chair, offer my welcome to the new Chief Armstrong. Like the commissioner said, it is very fun to say that instead of deputy chief. So, congrats on the job. I wanted to call and encourage you to consider replacing, when you come to



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

February 11, 2021

this commission, the traditional crime stats report with a report on how you are changing the culture of racism in OPD. A couple of suggestions, maybe, you might want to consider sharing the racial distribution of traffic stops and how that has been changing month over month. Or, also, what progress you've made in removing white supremacists from OPD ranks. I think it's great that you are asking officers to make their white supremacist comments private. That seems fine, but I would also like to see white supremacists, actively, removed from OPD and stripped of their pensions, which runs the city hundreds of thousands per retired officer. Thanks and welcome.

Juanito Rus: Thank you, Ms. Tu. The next speaker in the queue is Cathy Leonard. Good evening, Ms. Leonard. Can you hear us?

Cathy Leonard: Yes, I can. Good evening and congratulations, Chief Armstrong. I first met you when I was on the community policing advisory board and you'd come in and make reports. And I've always said that I respected the way you presented your reports. I'm a graduate of Castlemont, so there's a little competition there with MC, but I know a lot of great people came out of MC. And I'm glad that you, immediately, talked about doing something about getting out from under the negotiated settlement agreement. It's high time after 18 years and millions of dollars wasted that could have been spent on our community. So, congratulations. I'm looking forward to you, doing a great job and ridding the department of every racist that is there and setting forth policy a that they never get a job in the Oakland Police Department again. Thank you.

Juanito Rus: Thank you, Ms. Leonard. The next speaker in the queue is Bruce Schmiechen. Good evening, Mr. Schmiechen. Can you hear us?

Bruce Schmiechen: Yeah. And I'm assuming you can hear me and... Yeah, I want to welcome Chief Armstrong. This is actually my second opportunity today I've had to hear from him, and I've liked everything I've heard, so far. It's refreshing to hear... He came to the Interfaith Coalition [inaudible 02:55:13] County, earlier this afternoon, and it's great to hear him speaking with full authority in his own voice. I look forward to more of that now that he is in this position as the chief. And I'll just say that my first encounter with him was, I don't know, eight or 10 years ago. Oakland Community Organizations, that was faith in action, its old name, our meeting out at Eastmont Mall, offices out there. A friendly guy came in, we're in a regular suit, and said, "Somebody knew who he was?" I said, "Oh, that's Brian Armstrong. He's a cop." And I was thinking, "Well, it's great to see him here. And it's great to see him now up where he is again tonight." I appreciate him very much. Thank you.

Juanito Rus: Thank you, Mr. Schmiechen. The next speaker in the queue is Lorelei Bosserman. Good evening, Ms. Passer, man, can you hear us?

Lorelei Bosserman: Yes, I can. Thank you. I would like to say congratulations, Chief Armstrong, and welcome. I don't know if welcome is appropriate. I guess, I'm not in OPD so I can say welcome, but congratulations. It is really nice to see you as chief. And it is so refreshing to hear a chief of OPD say, "Yes, we do have problems." For two years, Chief Kirkpatrick kept telling us how great everything was. And so to hear you say, "Yeah, we've got problems and we're going to work to change them" is so



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

February 11, 2021

refreshing. So, thank you for that. It's wonderful to see someone who lives in Oakland and who is from Oakland as the chief. And I was telling someone just a few days ago, "Man, I hope that he is one of the police officers who has been wishing for years, that they could do something to change the culture." And it sounds like you are, you've talked about that in your comments. And so-

Juanito Rus: Thank you, Ms. Bosserman. The next speaker in the queue is Rashidah Grinage. Good evening, Ms. Grinage. Can you hear us?

Rashidah Grinage: I can. Thank you. Well, Chief Armstrong, congratulations. I've known you it seems forever. I do remember, you came to the Pueblo office and we talked about juvenile diversion. And as you can see, we are now, finally, implementing that policy that we've talked about so many years ago, and I wanted to appreciate your support for that. I wish you all the best, as we all do in Oakland, and we're here to support you in whatever way we can. So, once again, congratulations. It's been a long time coming, as the song says. Thank you.

Juanito Rus: Thank you, Ms. Grinage. The next speaker in the queue is Joseph Mente. Good evening, Mr. Mente. Can you hear us?

Joseph Mente: Can you hear me?

Juanito Rus: We can hear you. You have a minute one.

Joseph Mente: Cool. Joseph Mente, District 1. Welcome Chief Armstrong. I truly do wish for your success from the bottom of my heart. I appreciate your words to take white supremacy seriously, unlike the last chief. And I'm really hopeful that that words turned into action. I want to make sure that you include in your strategic plan, allocating OPD staff to implement the promised, much delayed, and very expensive IT reforms that are essential to appropriately allocating resources. You can't steer a ship without properly functioning instruments. For far too long, OPD has neglected these, embarrassingly, obsolete systems. I would love to see OPD standardize, streamline, and expand its public data. Importantly, please do not announce random crime statistics at the beginning of a meeting and waste everyone's time because people will just go into a website. Lastly, OPD constantly says that OPD officers are moving from call to call. Why do I consistently see uniformed OPD officers, at times, multiple units, stationed on-guard at Walgreens at Temescal? Can't Walgreens pay for their own security guards? I don't want guards with guns in my local Walgreens. Thank you.

Juanito Rus: Thank you Mr. Mente. The next speaker in the queue is a telephone attendee with the last four digits, 0185. Good evening, 0185. Can you hear us?

Michele Lazaneo: This is Michelle Lazaneo, spokesman for the Bandabaila family. Congratulations, Chief Armstrong. There is no doubt that you're committed to open your heart and soul, are products of Oakland, they were cultivated here. During your first 100 days, please prioritize evaluating your missing persons' division, DG00-6. The current process, including how your call-takers prioritize a missing persons' report, need to be evaluated. Jonathan Bandabaila, Priscilla Castro, and [inaudible]



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

February 11, 2021

03:00:28]s family, all reported, waiting over 10 hours or more, before the reporting officer ever arrived at their residence or called them back to begin to report. That is not acceptable. Please prioritize this. We've been waiting for 21 months now. Thank you. And good luck.

Juanito Rus: Thank you, Ms. Lazaneo. The next speaker in the queue is Megan Steffen. Good evening, Ms. Steffen. You have the-

Megan Steffen: Good evening. Thanks so much. I have to admit to a bit more ambivalence than the other speakers. I'm here in part because I went to the town hall meeting on June 8th, 2020. And I made my first public comment because then, deputy chief Armstrong, implied that Black Lives Matter protesters had been the ones who shot and killed federal security officer David Underwood. I really do hope now, Chief Armstrong, that we can expect more honesty and integrity from you. And I hope that what you're implying is true, that those weren't your words and that wasn't your mendacity. I appreciate the commitment to transparency, to getting out from under the NSA, from publishing data in a timely fashion. And I think it remains to be seen whether it will happen, but here I am. Thank you.

Juanito Rus: Thank you, Ms. Steffen. The next speaker in the queue is Michael Tigges. Good evening, Mr. Tigges.

Michael Tigges: Thank you, Juanito. I also want to offer my congratulations to Chief Armstrong. I'm sure my old friends on the civilian side of the ceasefire are especially pleased. I'm especially pleased that you've promoted Captain Bolton. An officer or a captain that I've worked with as chair of an NCPC for the last several years, who was one of the parts of the culture of the department that you are striving for. And I appreciate as being a member of the coalition police accountability, your commitment to... and the culture that keeps used under the NSA. Finally, I hope that you will take many of the suggestions, we as part of the advisory boards, for the re-imagining public safety task force. I was the author of a social media amendment to the MOR that I hope you will read and add to your changes. Thank you.

Juanito Rus: Thank you, Mr. Tigges. The next speaker in the queue is Reisa Jaffe. Good evening, Ms. Jaffe. Can you hear us?

Reisa Jaffe: Yes. Thank you so much. I like what I'm hearing. I've, unfortunately, as a senior citizen, spent many years hearing people say things that sound good, and then there's no follow-through, but I'm going to leave it open. And with the hope that what you're saying is what you mean. And I understand that people who don't, ultimately, have authority don't actually get always do. So, we're going to see. I would like to add that I would ask you to please look at your hiring policies. It's harder to get people off. So, it's really important. What kinds of questions will you be asking? Specifically, about how people have shown their ability to be anti-racist. Thank you.

Juanito Rus: Thank you, Mr. Jaffe. The next speaker in the queue is Assata Olugbala. Good evening, Ms. Olugbala. You have the floor.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

February 11, 2021

- Assata Olugbala: Yes. I just want to say that the best thing I can do is to not ask you what you need to do, but give you the chance to do what you need to do. And listen before I say anything to what you are proposing, what your recommendations are, and don't jump ahead to prejudice before I give you an opportunity to say what you think is best around the issue we are currently dealing with at that time. At the same time, I have my two little grandsons on the phone and I just announced that this new police chief is a black man and they went, "Yay." And you represent an opportunity for a lot of black boys to have a view of seeing someone being successful. Lastly, Ginale Harris has a lot of faith in you. She has spoken about you to me, numerous times, about how she believes in you. So, you have someone that truly believes in you, Ginale Harris. Thank you.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you, Ms. Olugbala. The next speaker in the queue is John Lindsay-Poland. Good evening, Mr. Lindsay-Poland. You have the floor.
- John Lindsay-Poland: Good evening. And I add my congratulations to Chief Armstrong. I was also very glad to hear your prioritization of addressing with concrete actions, the NSA, and the culture, and actual actions of white supremacy within the department. I support that and will do anything I can to advance that. I was often uncomfortable when you were deputy chief, seeing you put out front to defend policies of acting chief Manheimer. And now that the buck stops with you, I hope you will address some of the issues around information production, including the after-action report on what happened in protests downtown last year, on the attacks on protesters that have been delayed. It may have to do with the IT system that Mr. Mente discussed. I hope you'll do that. Thanks.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you, Mr. Lindsay-Poland. The next speaker in the queue is Jasmine Fallstich. Good evening, Ms. Fallstich. You have the floor.
- Jasmine Fallstich: Good evening. Thank you so much, Mr. Rus. Just this evening at the NCPC meeting, officer Johnson revealed to the attendees that OPD approached the boards of Walgreens and Targets with an offer to staff OPD officers at the stores. And two previous callers have brought this up, that they've recently seen more officers at their local Walgreens and Targets. So, my question is why? Why would OPD approach corporations who can pay for their own private security to offer to staff there? Officer Johnson also said that Target and Walgreens are offering to pay the overtime. So, I'm curious to hear what exactly the details of that contract are and how they might be impacting all of the other businesses and individuals who don't have the funds that Target and Walgreens have?
- Juanito Rus: Thank you, Ms. Fallstich. The next speaker is [inaudible 03:08:36]. Good evening, Ms. [inaudible 03:08:39]. Can you hear us?
- Amelah El Amin: I can hear you. Can you hear me?
- Juanito Rus: We can hear you. The floor is yours.
- Amelah El Amin: Okay. [inaudible 03:08:50] you keep on [inaudible 03:08:50]. My name is [inaudible 03:08:51]. I'm with [inaudible 03:08:52] in Oakland. Really quick and 30 seconds. If you are sincere, then they're



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION MEETING TRANSCRIPT

February 11, 2021

going to come for you. And I pray that you have people around you that are going to protect you. If you're not sincere, the creator is going to come for you. We really do need what you're offering and what you're saying. May your actions follow your word and they may be an example to our city and to this country. Thank you.

Juanito Rus: Thank you, Ms. [inaudible 03:09:26]. The next speaker is Omar Farmer. Good evening, Mr. Farmer. The floor is yours.

Omar Farmer: Good evening. Question for Chief Armstrong. I was happy to hear the priority or about the NSA. And you mentioned a risk management program, and I just was curious, is that the same risk management incentive project that was in place years ago? I believe where it required OPD to set funds aside for potential lawsuits. And if that amount was exceeded that they had to pay some sort of penalty or extra payment. I'm just curious if that's the same program. If you could just tell us a little bit more. And also, Oh, I heard that there's a tonal composition study that the department's working on with Dr. Everhart, and I believe, that's supposed to help out with resolving NSA items, as well. If you could tell us more about that, that will be great because I know she's done great work with you all. Thank you.

Juanito Rus: Thank you, Mr. Farmer. The next speaker in the queue is Kevin Cantu. Good evening, Mr. Cantu. The floor is yours.

Kevin Cantu: Good evening. Welcome aboard, Chief Armstrong. I'd like to echo Jennifer Tu's comment earlier, calling for a habit of bringing relevant, actionable progress updates to these meetings. I look forward to any improvements you can make. I'd like to echo an earlier commenter's call for efforts to focus... The way I would phrase it is to focus the department on a systemic improvement, instead of merely letting... I don't know... the patrol equivalent of the United States Air Forces, fighter mafia to control the department. It's not all about guns. So, sometimes it's about policies. It's about bringing, landing system systemic changes in IT, for example. Maybe that means-

Juanito Rus: Thank you, Mr. Cantu. Your time has expired. The last speaker in the queue on this item is listed as Humberto. Good evening, Humberto. Can you hear us?

Humberto: Yeah. Can you all hear me?

Juanito Rus: We can hear you. One minute. Whenever you're ready.

Humberto: Yeah. So, what's going on, you all? Humberto representing 67 [inaudible 03:12:29]. It's a community organization supporting undocumented youth and youth from mixed-status families in Oakland. And yeah, just wanted to comment to the new chief. I have seen your name and your story posted by Mr. Fab and was just kind of like, "Okay, he's real West Oakland." That's the claim, right? And so, I just want to follow-through and I hope we see your support. And I heard you say taking a vow against white supremacy and hoping that you can do everything that you can in your position. Not just do that with individual officers, but institutionally, as well, right? I could say, for



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION MEETING TRANSCRIPT

February 11, 2021

example, as someone representing within the documented community, we seen a [inaudible 03:13:16]. For example, push for collaborations with [inaudible 03:13:20] and immigration. And we hope to have you as an advocate on that side and push back to help us be an advocate on that side against white supremacy. Thank you.

Juanito Rus: Thank you. Humberto. Two additional people have joined the queue. The next speaker is a telephone attendee with last four digits 5802. I believe, that's Mr. [inaudible 03:13:45] Bey. Good evening, Mr. Bey.

Saleem Bey: Yes. Good evening. [inaudible 03:13:51] Bey. My family moved to Oakland in 1968. And as a black man, who's lived under OPD between 1968 and the present which the chief claims to have done, understands that OPD has come a long way just to be on the understanding that we could speak this openly without being attacked inside our community. So, as a black man to a black man, the only grace that you have with us as a community, is the fact that Ginale Harris says that we should give you a chance. The only chance that we're going to give you if they were going to send you plenty of evidence of racial profiling and Islamophobic racism with OPD. If you don't act on that, then we will treat you like the last 10 chiefs that have gone before you, and the only reason why you're a chief right now is because the last 10 chiefs have failed. So, if you're not going to do what the community asks will be on you.

Juanito Rus: Thank you, Mr. Bey. And, now the last speaker in the queue is Mariano Contreras. Oh, and another joined. Mr. Contreras, the floor is yours.

Mariano Contreras: Thank you. Welcome, Chief Armstrong. I am really encouraged, as well as many people are encouraged to hear your priorities, especially, the one with the NSA compliance. But I also would like to remind you of the sanctuary city ordinance that exists in the city of Oakland, which states that there should be no cooperation with ICE. But that does not mean looking the other way from your department weekly, either ICE or sheriffs coming to the city of Oakland and arrest and remove supposed undocumented persons. You must demand that they declare themselves to your department before they carry out any of those orders. Thank you.

Juanito Rus: Excuse me. I was muted. Thank you, Mr. Contreras. And the next speaker in the queue is Salah Elbakri. Good evening, Mr. Elbakri. Can you hear us?

Salah Elbakri: Indeed, I can. I want to congratulate the chief on his position. May God bless him. We're looking forward to working with him. My name is Salah Elbakri the executive director of Support Life Foundation, a community organization out of the Fruitvale district. I just have a couple of comments for our new chief of police. Just to remember that Oakland still suffers from the social injustices that have been perpetrated against its own people. Social justice that we're rooted in economic justice and lack of economic justice. And so, when we get to the inner city, and he is from the inner city, that you understand the depth of where these kids are and why are these kids getting trouble? The solution is not jail time. This solution is not more people send to places [crosstalk 03:17:28] education. Thanks.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

February 11, 2021

- Juanito Rus: Thank you, Mr. [inaudible 03:17:31]. The next speaker in the queue is Christopher Valentine. Good evening, Mr. Valentine. Can you hear us?
- Christopher Valentine: Thanks. I'm on mute, now.
- Juanito Rus: You're unmuted, whenever you're ready.
- Christopher Valentine: Okay. There's a basic underlying problem, especially, in the black community, although, I'm not in the black community. There, in which people who have witnessed a crime are afraid to divulge their information that they have because they're afraid that the community will view them as a snitch. I don't know if the new police chief has any insights into how to resolve that, but it resulted in... When my son was murdered, the witnesses were intimidated by the police and did not come forward, and the result was the murderers got away and proceeded to kill more teenage boys after he was killed. It's a serious problem, and I hope the new police chief can engender more trust on the part of the community. Thank you.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you, Mr. Valentine. At this time, seeing no other hands in the queue, Madam Chair, let me return the meeting back to you.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you very much. Excuse me, Chief Armstrong, I would like to make sure that in your next update you include responses to some of the queries that were posed this evening, specifically the one about Target and Walgreens and then I don't remember the specifics of Omar farmers' questions about the risk management program, if it's a call back to an old one or something. So I'm hoping between those two things and the last citizens question that we can include all of those in your next update, is that possible?
- Chief Armstrong: Yes, Chair, we will produce a report for in particular the overtime at both Target and Walgreens and other locations that we have overtime details at. The other question, I think we can handle just right now; Mr. Farmer's question, which was about the risk management. No, that risk management is about our early intervention system, which is officers that have some indication of at risk behavior that we will intervene and so that is our use of our data per to NSA to examine potential at-risk behaviors. So that's what that risk management is about.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you very much. Excuse me, commissioner Garcia, is your hand up new or did I miss pulling it down?
- Sergio Garcia: No. I got to lower it.
- Regina Jackson: Alright, thank you very much. Okay, now on to item 11. So there has been much contention, certainly we've heard a lot of public comment and what I'd like to do is one, provide context for how we got here and then have the two other ad hoc members get into some contextual conversation about our process and where we came to; to see if we can actually get some broader understanding about where it is that we are, and then we can make a decision whether or not we want to move forward.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

February 11, 2021

- Regina Jackson: So, in terms of some background, as a part of the last management conference that the judge in leading the NSA, he asked that we have... Or actually that the police complete three policies that were all coming out of the Pawlik case.
- Regina Jackson: One was on armed and unresponsive. I think Anne Janks spoke to that a little bit. The other was DAT teams and the final third was the militarized equipment training bulletin.
- Regina Jackson: What he asked that we do was with the armed and non-responsive, there was no policy, so we created one. The DAT teams and militarized equipment were training bulletins that he directed that we update both the armed and unresponsive and DAT teams were approved in January.
- Regina Jackson: The goal was to try and get this militarized training bulletin completed in advance of the next management conference, which is coming up on the 22nd or 23rd.
- Regina Jackson: Clearly, there has been a lot of work between the police department, the commission and the citizens that were a part of the ad hoc. I do know that commissioner Gage also worked diligently last year in the preparation of an ordinance that we passed to the city council and then alternate commissioner David Jordan also had extraordinary contributions to the update of his training bulletin. So with that contextualized background, for the benefit of the other commissioners, I would like to let commissioners Gage and Jordan provide more discussion and more insights for the benefit of community as well as the commission. So whomever would like to go first knock yourself out.
- David Jordan: Go ahead, vice chair.
- Henry Gage, III: Thank you commissioner Jordan. I am no longer vice chair though.
- David Jordan: Former vice chair. I apologize to both of you and commissioner Dorado, vice chair Dorado.
- Henry Gage, III: Thank you, commissioner Jordan. Commissioners and members of the public, I'd like to speak to both of you for a moment. Now, I'm also curious to hear more from the public given the comment you've received today, as the chairs noted, our task was to draft and adopt the three policies mentioned, and our deadline as currently constituted is February 22nd. It's a bit of framing I'd like to state that I am deeply concerned about the militarization of civilian police departments. As the chair referenced, last year I coauthored a draft ordinance that this commission approved that would provide for comprehensive oversight over a plethora of militaristic police equipment. And key to this regulatory structure is the mandate for annual reports from the police department. These reports are designed to continually challenge the department stated justifications for acquiring potentially abusive equipment, and they provide crucial support for oversight actions. Now, the analysis of the training bulletin before us has raised a number of issues.
- Henry Gage, III: One that's come up in public comments so far is the question of whether an alternate vehicle can be substituted. The short answer is yes, but that process will take time. A great deal has been said about the feelings of fear and trauma that the bear cats appearance can create. I understand



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

February 11, 2021

those feelings. I'd like to see OPD use an alternative vehicle in the future. I note that other jurisdictions have purchased and currently use armored vehicles with the equivalent ballistic protection, but without the military appearance of vehicles like fear cats and hem raps were pretty much must consider appearance, not just armor ratings when the time comes to replace its current compliment of vehicles. So how do we transition to reference one of the proposed guiding principles of the re-imagining taskforce? The police reduction should only be made when a suitable alternative is in place. That's proven to offer an equivalent or better impact on public safety.

Henry Gage, III: Now I sincerely desire to see the department demilitarize, and I want to ensure that as we move in that direction, you replaced the tools that we decommission, which leads us to the question before us. How do you balance the police officer's need for protection against the potential for trauma and the creation of fear that the appearance of the bear cat can create? Our ad hoc committee determined that this balance was best set by restricting the use of all armored vehicles to situations involving firearms or explosives.

Henry Gage, III: We additionally determined that before an armored vehicle could be used, police commanders must determine a variety of things. Things like what they were in alternate operation location would diminish the need to use an armored vehicle, whether the targeted person or persons have a history within a relevant timeframe involving criminal use of firearms or other weapons, because if they didn't use wouldn't be authorized, they also need to consider the potential presence of minors, the elderly, medically compromised people with disabilities and other vulnerable people. That was the balance we struck. Now, I was appointed to this commission by the selection panel. I have a special responsibility to listen to the public and that responsibility is never more difficult in times like the present, where I disagree not with the aims that speakers have stated, but with the timing of the action that's being requested, I asked that this commission approve the training bulletin before us with the amendment to page two, I think it's section two suggested by the plaintiff's attorneys and explained on page 13 of our agenda this evening. With that, I'd like to hear from commissioner Jordan, fellow commissioners and members of the public.

Regina Jackson: Mr Jordan?

David Jordan: Yeah, sorry it took me a second to get off mute. Thank you. So thank you to commissioner Gage, and thanks for sort of laying out the basis for our concern around maybe just taking this back to the drawing board and feeling like we've done a significant amount of strong work around improving the concerns, improving this policy that is really hugely informed by the concerns we heard from the community and things that we already knew on a real gut level and things that came out of Pawlik and things that are sort of larger than Pawlik.

David Jordan: I think that from my perspective and not getting into the minutia of it, my goal, and I'm just going to say it from jump, is I'd like to see an Oakland without a bear cat or anything that looks like a bear cat, anything that has external armor that causes the sense of othering or furthers that sense of othering between the community and the police department that makes the community feel, especially in the community that I live in, district six. That makes us feel like we are in occupied



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

February 11, 2021

territory. I know that there's a great deal of police officers who don't want to be giving that impression. I know that the chief Armstrong is one of them and I know that that Lieutenant Turner who put in a lot of work on this with us is another one.

David Jordan: We all showed up to this ad hoc and honestly, going to previous ad Hawks of two previous training bulletins before this, with the intent to engage in good faith discourse, to develop a consensus that was effective for the community that also, as difficult as this maybe to hear for some people is that we also have to be concerned with the act of policing and what that looks like for the officers who are engaging in it and what their safety looks like and what that means for them to be able to engage in that process in a way that is removed from the...

David Jordan: Sorry, I'm a little frustrated by it by this process, because part of what I'm hearing in the stuff that I'm seeing online and things that I heard in public comment definitely felt somewhat accusatory as if we were in some ways capitulating to unreasonable police department demands. And honestly, if there was a side that gave more grounds, it was definitely the department. We were relentless, John Lindsay Poland, Omar Farmer and Janks, and the three commissioners involved in pushing that needle towards the direction community to hear. What I am interested in seeing is, it may feel really great to just say, let's put forward a resolution that said, let's get rid of the bear cat immediately. You know what, there's enough chances the city council passes that we have a lot of new progressive city council people.

David Jordan: But beyond that, I think that what I'd really like to see is them past that ordinance, that commissioner Gage and I, and former commissioner Brown also worked on and John Lindsay Poland, who was a major force in that ordinance as well, which allows us the opportunity to develop an evidence based approach, to doing away with things like the bear cat. Further it leaves the groundwork for refuting the ideas of its necessity in general, removing the bear cat is just the first step. I want to create lasting senses of change, the shift in the acceptance of this kind of equipment in general, not this one particular piece of equipment.

David Jordan: Our current bear cat has one foot in the grave. Let's be honest, we've heard it already from people, public comments, and it's going to need to be replaced soon. In the meantime, I'd like to use the powers that the ordinance gives us to engage in the kind of oversight that will provide us and that evidence that we can use in this jurisdiction and those jurisdictions that might follow suit with us to move away from this idea of having these kinds of vehicles in our communities. That is my goal and it's been said that well, maybe the ordinance won't pass, if you think the ordinance won't pass, what makes you think the city council is going to pass a resolution moving the bear cat out of hand in true good faith I think that I want to move forward with the option that affords us the most amount of leverage to get to the goal that we really have in our hearts.

David Jordan: I also want to just say, I hate having sort of the state of my bonafide of why I believe this and any of that. But I'm not up here in some functionary. I have no intention to run for political office after this. I'm here because I grew up in a very impacted neighborhood as a person of color who faced a significant amount of police violence and violence in general in my community during the heaviest part of the crack epidemic in the late eighties and early nineties. I witnessed the police TAC teams



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

February 11, 2021

doing raids on my neighbors apartments and homes. That's I think that I don't want for my community. I'm working to do this in a way that I feel like is most effective. Now you can choose not to believe me, but I'm putting my part of my sleeve in and trying to lay that out there for you. If any of you out there who comments tonight, want to have a conversation about it one-on-one. My email is out there, let me know. I'm happy to take the time. Thank you.

Regina Jackson: Thank you, commissioner Jordan. I know that before we even had the work being done on the ordinance, we had significant conversations about the police department's desire to get a second bear cat and I was like, "Absolutely not." The difference is that to go from zero to 60, not having a lot of restrictions to just not having it. Also, does it provide any insulation for the officers that are out there? I mean, yes, they signed up to put their lives on the line, but does that mean that they shouldn't have some protections? There are a bunch of wholesale restrictions that were put in this training bulletin to require more intelligence led work and many more boxes that have to be checked before the bear cat could even go out. Historically, that was not in place and in this training bullets in it is. Now when we had...

Henry Gage, III: Regina Jackson, if you're speaking, we cannot hear you.

Speaker 3: Her mic is not showing that she's picking anything up, commissioner Gage, and she just dropped off the call. I believe her internet is acting up.

Jose Dorado: It must be the storm.

David Jordan: This is commissioner Jordan. Until we get the chair back, would the new vice chair like to open the floor up to anyone, other commissioners who'd like to weigh in on this maybe?

Jose Dorado: Yes. Thank you commissioner Jordan. So I'm thrown into the mix. So let's just open it right up to any comments from commissioners on the item 11, the military equipment training bulletin. Let me open it up then.

Brenda Harbin-Forte: Commissioner Dorado. My hand is up, I don't know if others are as is commissioner Singleton, so I'm not sure who came up first, whose hand was up first. But I will go if that's alright.

Jose Dorado: Yes, please do.

Brenda Harbin-Forte: Alright, I'd like better framing the issues here. I suppose that one issue is whether the commission recommend that the police department get rid of the bear cats altogether. Although that I don't think is really on our agenda. The other is about whether or not we go with the languages proposed by the ad hoc, which talks about commanders making every effort to avoid the deployment of armored vehicles in the presence of minors, et cetera and whether we go with that, or we substitute the language that's been recommended by another ad hoc comment, ad hoc member Turner, and Chanin the plaintiff's attorney Chanin. Is that where we are, whether we should have the language about make every effort or commander shall make a good faith effort to avoid the deployment? Is that what the issue is that is basically up for decision tonight?



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

February 11, 2021

- Jose Dorado: I think it's a, it's a number of things. Commissioner Harbin-Forte. Certainly it's that question, it's the question of whether or not the language in the training bulletin should delineate an elimination of the bear cat entirely. If in fact there should be some sort of a phase out, basically the training bulletin is a guide for how we want to proceed. So at this point, I'd like to hear some more comments from any other of the commissioners. Let's go with commissioner Singleton.
- Brenda Harbin-Forte: I'm sorry, commissioner Dorado. I will say that I would like to conclude my comments by saying that in an ideal world, I would get rid of the bear cats, I would not have it. I'm very troubled by the militarization of police vehicles in our communities, but I think that there is a need for it now and hopefully at some point we may get to the point where we can abolish them. But I'm interested in what we can do to make sure that it is that any deployment of it causes less trauma and that the deployment is a very rare occasion. So with that, I'm done with my comments.
- Regina Jackson: Forgive me, commissioner Dorado. Vice-chair thank you for jumping in. I totally lost all my sound and I don't know if you want to continue managing the meeting. It looks like there are quite a few hands in the queue, and I would also after the commissioners raise their questions, I would invite chief Armstrong to add any additional context for the benefit of the commissioners.
- Jose Dorado: Go ahead, chair Jackson.
- Regina Jackson: Okay. Thank you. So I think commissioner Singleton and then Gage, but it could be Gage and then Singleton, so my apologies.
- Tyfahra Singleton: I think I was next. Thank you, chair. My question is that I read this pretty carefully and I couldn't see any restrictions that would prevent a replication of the Pawlik case and I was wondering if you could point me to the language that prevents another incident like that, be it via commissioner Gage or commissioner Jordan.
- Henry Gage, III: I can take a stab at that commissioner Singleton. I think the short answer is that this policy doesn't because what happened to Mr Pawlik wasn't so much a consequence of having an armored vehicle on the scene as a consequence of how the officers approached a person who was armed and unresponsive. There's an argument to be made that the presence of a militaristic vehicle can encourage a certain mindset, that can encourage an officer to be more aggressive, but the policy language that would more directly prohibit or prevent what happened to Mr. Pawlik from happening again, isn't necessarily found in this policy because this policy would permit the deployment of an armored vehicle to a scene where there's a person who's unconscious and carrying firearm, but what the officers do when they're on that scene would then be covered under the armed and unresponsive policy and the designated arrest teams policy. So it's not this policy answer, but also kind of this policy.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you commissioner Gage. Commissioner Jordan, did you want to add any more context to commissioner Singleton's query?



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION MEETING TRANSCRIPT

February 11, 2021

- David Jordan: Yeah, I think this really does track with a lot of what we've read in public comment tonight, is that the problematic elements of the bear cat was not specifically that it was used as a shooting platform. That quote from the monitors it's taken somewhat out of context. The real challenge is that in years past it's the idea of the bear cat has been put forward as one of de-escalation. One of the things we really did seek to address and debunk in this policy, in the conversations that we had was that we don't perceive the bear cat as a tool for de-escalation.
- David Jordan: In some ways it might have the sort of same outcome, that the idea of that its application might provide a safe outcome if used properly. But essentially the idea was that rather than officers using it as physical coverage, provide them further safety so that they did not have to enact force options. They simply used it as a way to get a better line of sight to the firearm on Joshua Pawlik. So the real issue here is not disqualifying it as a shooting platform, but really intensely reinforcing the idea that the bear cat is to be used as a means to apply the principles of distance and time and safety for officers so that they do not feel like they have to engage in force, and that is much more clearly laid out in the two previous policies, which language-wise and philosophy wise do really sort of tracking a linear narrative. So they really do have to be digested as a slate in some way. I'm done.
- Speaker 3: It appears that Chair Jackson has lost her audio again.
- Regina Jackson: I'm sorry, I'm back. I'm on two different sources now. So thank you. So commissioner Singleton, I just wondered if that answered your question or if you had a follow-up?
- Tyfahra Singleton: It answered my question, but I will comment that I'm basically looking for something in this policy that if it's misused, that it's a clear violation of the policy, like very clear, and it leans heavily toward an argument could be made that reasonable suspicion and all of these things were present. It seems a lot harder to say a clear policy violation was made from the way it's written right now. So, like everyone else, I would like to see an elimination of a bear cat. But if that is not something that could be done by our February deadline, I would like to at least see increased restrictions that make it easy to determine that a policy has been violated when this equipment is misused. And that is the end of my comment.
- David Jordan: Sorry, it doesn't sound like the chair is on right now. This is commissioner Jordan. I don't want to, re-litigate all three policies. I think that there's a very clear reason why monitors asked the commission and the police department to address these three policies as a package. The things that you were specifically asking for, those specifically asked are largely covered in DAP policy, the dedicated arresting policy and the unarmed or the armed and unresponsive policies, sorry training bulletin, and I think that further, we need to look at some of the things around our like tactical team training bulletins and policies to further cement the philosophies that we've put in place in these three pieces. I do hear your concern. And I and I do think that if you looked at those as a whole, as opposed to three constituent parts, it would make a lot more sense. That may be our fault for not presenting them that way, I think that we just wanted to show that we are making progress by bringing them out in the order that they did.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

February 11, 2021

- Jose Dorado: Thank you commissioner Jordan, chief Armstrong.
- Chief Armstrong: Yes, vice-chair. I think commissioner Jordan did an excellent job just explaining and commissioner Singleton, I think the intent when we had the executive force review board that led to a deliverable out of the Pawlik matter, that required us to complete these training bulletins. The intent was really to commissioner George point to isolate each use each particular issue that we found within that board. One of which was a lack of a clear direction and training on the bear cat and that's what this particular training bulletin was intended to accomplish. I think we came to the table with the commission and it was very open and worked to craft out what I believe gives us guidance. We currently don't have a training bulletin on the BearCat at this time, and so it'd be good to get a policy that at least governs the use of this piece of equipment.
- Chief Armstrong: So, I'll say all these three policies really should be taken into context. The BearCat, the authorization for the BearCat to actually be deployed, is really covered in this policy. How we approach an armed and unresponsive person actually is in the armed unresponsive training bulletin. That really says now that the BearCat is there, how do you manage this situation? And that's where I think we've seen failures in the past. The vehicle is there, it has an intent of why it was brought there, but then how do you handle someone that's armed and unresponsive?
- Chief Armstrong: And then the third policy that really derives into this conversation is the designated arrest team training bulletin that really gives guidance on how these officers are supposed to work together to minimize the need to use force. And so I think that's ... I know [inaudible 03:52:12] that language, but collectively that was our goal. And when you said "accountability," that's how we can begin to singly measure what the officers' actions were. Were they authorized to even bring in the vehicle? Second thing, how did they approach the individual? And then, third, did we have a coordinated approach to managing the situation?
- Chief Armstrong: And so, I think for us as a department that, for me, gives stronger accountability tools because there's a process that officers need to go through before we take action. So I just wanted to offer that.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you, [inaudible 03:52:49]. Are there any other questions from the Commissioners?
- Speaker 4: Commissioner Jackson, you are very faint. I can hear you, but barely. I don't know if you [crosstalk 03:53:07].
- Regina Jackson: Okay. Is this better?
- Speaker 4: Much better.
- Regina Jackson: Okay, great. So I was trying to discern if there were any additional questions from the Commission. If there aren't, we could go to public. Okay. Commissioner Gage.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

February 11, 2021

- Henry Gage, III: Thank you, Chair. Wanted to briefly address a question raised by Commissioner Harbin-Forte about the issue before us this evening. The training bulletin language that's in our agenda packet is subject to subsequent amendment and review by the monitoring team. And as part of that process, a slight edit has been suggested, and it is on page 13 of our agenda, and that has to do with changing language from ... I believe if I can pull up the language briefly ... Here we are. The changes to section was a section on page two, second paragraph to say, "Commanders shall make a good faith effort instead of making every effort," and a memo from the police department explains the justification for that change. The request and the motion I would make is that we move to approve the training bulletin before us as amended by this memorandum.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you, Commissioner Gage. Commissioner Harbin-Forte, does that answer your question? I see your hand up. Commissioner Harbin-Forte, I see your hand up.
- Brenda Harbin-Forte: Yes. I'm sorry. I'm sorry. I'm muted. Yes, that's the issue. I'm asking whether the issue is whether we approve the training bulletin as is or we approve it with the proposed language by Mr. Channon and Joseph Turner. Is that, basically, what's on the agenda tonight? And I suppose then that there would need to be some motion to adopt the proposed language first or however we do it. I'm not sure how we do it. Maybe we should talk about whether maybe there should be comment on whether or not we adopt this proposed language.
- Regina Jackson: Well, we have to take public comment first.
- Brenda Harbin-Forte: No, I mean our discussion. I'm sorry. Our discussion should be geared toward whether we adopt this proposed language or not, the proposed language change or not. And I'm not sure which Commissioners are in favor of adopting, of making the language change, or whether we go with the version of the training bulletin as proposed by the ad hoc committee. I guess, I would say that since we have to stay with the BearCat, since we have to live with it, that I would go with the version of the language that is proposed by the ad hoc committee.
- Regina Jackson: So, thank you, Commissioner Harbor-Forte. We still need to take public comment even though the majority of people gave public comment in the open forum on the site.
- Brenda Harbin-Forte: Okay.
- Regina Jackson: But I want to make sure that no one else has any other questions before we do that so that we can make a decision on whether or not to support it. I see Chief Armstrong's hand up.
- Chief Armstrong: And, Chair, before we go, the public comment, I just want to make sure that the public knows that I have heard their voices. I understand how traumatic it can be when this vehicle is deployed into the community. I think this policy will help us have better control over when it's deployed. It as accountability tools. And I would seek to, like you mentioned earlier, once this vehicle is retired, to get a vehicle that is less militarized. I have spoken with my staff and we'll begin to do research on a vehicle that looks much different, but still provides us the same level of safety.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

February 11, 2021

- Regina Jackson: Thank you very much. Commissioners, I want to make sure that we have exhausted conversation, and I now see Commissioner Garcia's hand up.
- Sergio Garcia: Thank you, Chair Jackson. This question is directed to our new Police Chief Armstrong. You mentioned that you're in the process of getting another vehicle, another type of vehicle. My understanding is that there's already a vehicle that is within OPD, the Suburban SUV vehicle, the armored one that is ... I guess, it's not mentioned in what we're being asked to review and vote on today. And I'm just wondering if maybe that we're just living in a snapshot of where we are today, but I want to better understand where we are today versus where we're heading. I think Commissioner Harbin-Forte stated it well, which is where my mind is, and that is in an ideal world we would not have a BearCat. This tank-like vehicle has no place in Oakland or anywhere in this country. And I'm just wondering what is it today that can be used as an alternative to the BearCat so we don't even get to the steps that are necessary for the OPD to deploy the BearCat unless and until a similar vehicle has been considered?
- Sergio Garcia: And the reason why I'm asking that, Chief Armstrong, is because you mentioned that you guys are ... It sounds like OPD would rather not use the BearCat. It sounds like it's just a vehicle that's there and that can be deployed for certain police safety or under certain very limited circumstances. And we're struggling with what those limited working circumstances might be. And maybe we could just avoid the whole thing if we were to simply go to a vehicle that does everything the BearCat does, that is currently online at the OPD. And maybe it's an imperfect solution and maybe that's suggested by your reference to the search for another vehicle option.
- Sergio Garcia: Can you provide a little more color of where OPD is with respect to what kinds of vehicles are available today that do substantially what the BearCat does but doesn't have the militarized component to it? That's one question.
- Sergio Garcia: Second question is, where are we heading? Where is OPD heading? What is OPD searching for in the way of an alternate vehicle to the BearCat? Thank you.
- Chief Armstrong: [inaudible 04:00:50], Chair.
- Regina Jackson: Chief Armstrong.
- Chief Armstrong: Yes. [inaudible 04:00:54], Chair. One of the things we examined in the ad hoc is the very question that you ask, and currently the department only has two vehicles in its fleet that are armored. That is the BearCat and then our armed Suburban. The BearCat has capabilities that the Suburban does not. And so I probably would like to go into deep detail, but we went into a lot of detail with the ad hoc about the differences between the two vehicles. One vehicle is much taller, it gives you a higher elevation there, it has stronger ballistic capabilities, it also has the ability to hold a stretcher inside. So if we were to have to rescue someone during a situation, we could fit that stretcher into the rear of the vehicle. But we understand that the Suburban looks much different. And we do deploy the Suburban when the situation or the circumstances is appropriate for the use of that vehicle.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

February 11, 2021

Chief Armstrong: What I'll say is that, what I'd like to see for us as we move forward is to examine what's out there that provides the same capabilities as our current BearCat but also is less militaristic. It looks more ... We were looking just online and we've seen some Sprinter vans that look much less militarized and would be an option, but I think just after we get out of this fiscal situation that we are in the City of Oakland, I think then we can start having conversations about potentially replacing the vehicle, upgrading the vehicle and figuring out what's next for the department.

Chief Armstrong: But I think to Judge Harbin-Forte's, I submit to the idea that I wish we lived in a society or a community where there was no need for a vehicle like this. But unfortunately with the things that we've seen in our community, just with the use of high power weapons, with the consistent recovery of firearms and those using firearms, I think to not have a piece of equipment like this that actually could provide some safety for community, as well as for the officers, I think we would not be in line with best practices if we didn't have that. And we would pose a significant risk to the officers and, in some ways, even potentially increase the likelihood that they might not have the resource to actually protect them from weapons or ballistics.

Regina Jackson: Thank you, Chief Armstrong. Commissioner Jordan's hand is up and then followed by Commissioner Peterson.

David Jordan: Thank you, Chair. Thank you, Chief Armstrong. Two things: So I wanted to address Commissioner Garcia's question, and it's largely similarly to what Chief Armstrong said, but from the perspective of a person who's not a police officer. The thing that was very compelling to me, especially when we went and had firsthand walk around with the BearCat in person was the significant size difference inside. There are times where, as the Chief said, the BearCat needed to transport significantly more officers and personnel, not just officers, but also potentially emergency medical staff, a full sized stretcher, which absolutely will not fit inside the Suburban. There are some situations, few as they might be, that the BearCat is actually better suited towards.

David Jordan: There were some other arguments that were, in my opinion, a little more tenuous, but the one that was the most compelling was being able to access a site, especially with emergency medical staff involved, where they could be kept safe but still activated when needed, that really was compelling as far as the question of whether it is a backup or it has a more specialized usage. And I know that that's parsing a little bit finely, but it really is different.

David Jordan: And we also did [inaudible 04:05:26] clearly have conversations in that moment during the walk around that, at least it was my intention when it came time, I mean, if I'm still around, who knows how long it may be before we can afford to buy another vehicle, but that something like the not overtly armored, but armored van that [inaudible 04:05:51] uses, which has the space of the BearCat, but appears more like a standard vehicle, like the Suburban and is, therefore, in those really important, tangible ways, less problematic.

David Jordan: The other issue I really wanted to address, but I forgot to mention earlier, is I think one of our big failings in this whole process, and I think that I know a bunch of us are hoping to ameliorate going forward, is the way we access community voice in these ad hocs. I don't think we were effective. I



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

February 11, 2021

don't think we've been effective thus far. And I think in this ad hoc we had the most forward version of accessing community voice, having a community forum, but it was an hour. And it was around a dozen people who we didn't have an opportunity to have a conversation with. It should have been a facilitated conversation in which they could ask questions of us, we could ask questions of them. What we really needed was something closer to a focus group as opposed to giving everybody two minutes to just give general responses that often sounded very similar.

David Jordan: I wanted to hear individual experiences and responses that were really informed by the details that we had given them around the conversations that we had been having there. I think that's the direction we need to move forward so that we can avoid some of what's going on tonight.

David Jordan: It's painful. This policymaking process is challenging and we're in it to move towards a common goal. But we are not perfect and we have not been perfect thus far and we're hoping to evolve it and get better. Thanks.

Regina Jackson: Thank you very much, commissioner Jordan. Excuse me. Commissioner Peterson.

Marsha Peterson: Thank you, Madam Chair. And I acknowledge that I'm catching up on some of these matters, but I suspect there's been some review of studies that show that the point of these type of vehicles substantially enhance the safe and effective police performance or of their duties, especially the use of non-force options. I'm just wondering if we are going backwards because, at some point, I know the Obama administration was very concerned about cities obtaining militarized police vehicles. How far along are we in endorsing the use of this type of vehicle? I'm just questioning.

Regina Jackson: I'm not sure who wants to answer that question. I know, for the Commission, that we definitely want to see the BearCat go away soon, but I don't think through this process that we were convinced that we could go from zero to 60. We thought that there were a few steps in between. And given the fact that there wasn't a policy on this, we needed to have something in place that created many more restrictions and more accountability than what we previously had, which was zilch.

Regina Jackson: Now, the BearCat's going to die a natural death. We don't know when, but what we thought was enhanced restrictions, more supervision, more accountability and oversight was a progressive way forward to having the BearCat go to cemetery.

Marsha Peterson: I understand. Thank you.

Regina Jackson: Thank you. Let's see. Commissioner Gage.

Henry Gage, III: Thank you Chair. Just a quick housekeeping note. Since you're using two devices, you're going to need to mute one of the two, because there's a pretty nasty echo that's coming whenever you speak.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

February 11, 2021

- Regina Jackson: I'm sorry. I'm muting one when I'm talking on the other, but sometimes I think I'm late. So my apologies.
- Henry Gage, III: Yeah. It's something about the speaker feedback is causing a big echo. So it might be you're using speakers instead of headphones. You might want to switch to headphones.
- Regina Jackson: Okay. So I think ... I'm sorry. Commissioner Gage, was your comment just about my feedback? It was helpful, but I just want to make sure that you didn't have something additional to say?
- Henry Gage, III: No, that's all for now. Thank you.
- Regina Jackson: Okay. No problem. Thank you. And Commissioner Garcia, I'm not sure if your hand never got lowered before. If you had another question or comment?
- Sergio Garcia: I had to lower-
- Regina Jackson: Commissioner Garcia?
- Sergio Garcia: I need to lower my hand. I have now lowered my hand.
- Regina Jackson: Oh, okay. Perfect. Thank you. So after that conversation if there are no more questions, I think we can go to public comment and then determine next steps from there. Is that agreeable? I see no hands.
- David Jordan: Sorry. This is Commissioner Jordan. Based on the process, I mean, we can go to public comment now, but if somebody moves and second, we really do need to have a public comment after the [crosstalk 04:12:22].
- Regina Jackson: Oh, I'm sorry. Yes. So why don't we ... I was thinking that we should table the vote, but if somebody wants to make a motion, we can see where we're going. Commissioner Gage.
- Henry Gage, III: Thank you, Chair. I move that we adopt the training bulletin as amended by the plaintiff's attorneys.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you, Commissioner Gage. Is there a second? I don't know. Can everybody hear me? Is there a second or have I lost sound again?
- Sergio Garcia: We can hear you.
- Brenda Harbin-Forte: We can hear you. There does not appear to be a second to the motion.
- Regina Jackson: Okay. Got it. All right. Well, I will second the motion then. Why don't we go ahead and take public comment and then determine how we want to move forward?



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

February 11, 2021

- Brenda Harbin-Forte: Excuse me, Madam Chair. On some point of order. I go back to saying that we have not discussed the pros and cons as a Commission. Our discussion has not included the pros and cons of the amendment that is proposed. And I would like for us to express our views on whether or not ... Again, on the pros and cons of the proposed amendment, because it appears that our choices are just to adopt the training bulletin as proposed by the ad hoc or adopted as proposed. If there were no second to Commissioner Gage's motion, that motion would die. We could then move to the motion of whether or not we adopt the training bulletin as proposed by the ad hoc.
- Regina Jackson: Yes. [crosstalk 04:14:22].
- Brenda Harbin-Forte: But now that you have seconded the motion, unless you withdraw your second or something ... I'm not sure.
- Regina Jackson: Well, Commissioner Garcia, I saw your hand up.
- Sergio Garcia: I tend to agree with Commissioner Harbin-Forte's point of order comment here. I'm struggling with contextualizing our vote today. I understand what the ad hoc was asked to do. I understand that it comes from the federal monitor, and I understand that it's, on its face, very progressive to impose accountability and strict procedures and admonitions and all of that before this militarized vehicle is deployed.
- Sergio Garcia: But I think that Commissioner Harbin-Forte is actually pointing to something that could be an alternative. We don't know what that might be. We may have to table this discussion, but I do think that ... What I'm finding very challenging, and I think a lot of people perhaps on the Commission have found challenging because of the lack of a second to that motion, is to take a vote today on what has been proposed by the ad hoc.
- Sergio Garcia: I'm speaking only for myself, but I detect that the silence after the motion, in my observation, could be a reticence to vote on that motion tonight.
- Regina Jackson: Okay, that's fair. So what if the policy explicitly said that the current BearCat could not be replaced with another BearCat so that when this BearCat goes to the graveyard, it'll be phased out?
- Regina Jackson: But to your point, if Commissioner Gage could lead more discussion on the amended language that Commissioner Harbin-Forte is requesting, then maybe we can at least move forward for public comment and then determine whether we take a vote, whether we table a vote, what have you. Commissioner Gage, can you do that?
- Henry Gage, III: Thank you, Chair. I'd like to clarify the motion I'm making as well. The motion I'm making is that we adopt the training bulletin put forward by the ad hoc and the training bulletin put forward by the ad hoc was subsequently reviewed and request to edit that ad hoc training bulletin was made. That request is explained on page 13 of our agenda packet. It would change the words from "every effort" to "good faith effort."



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

February 11, 2021

- Henry Gage, III: So, my motion is to adopt the training bulletin as put forward by the ad hoc with this edit from "every effort" to "good faith effort" that was suggested by the plaintiff's attorneys. Now, that's the motion that's on the floor and the motion that's been seconded. If there are further amendments the Commissioners would like to make, I believe there's also other language that's been floating around, which is certainly up for debate.
- Brenda Harbin-Forte: Point of order. I would request further discussion on the motion. I think that would be appropriate after a motion.
- Henry Gage, III: Indeed. The motion and second is really just saying that we'd like to have debate on the item before a vote.
- Brenda Harbin-Forte: Right. So it seems to me that with respect to the proposed amendment, Joseph Turner was a member of the ad hoc committee. I'm assuming that this proposal was raised or concerns were raised at the ad hoc. And the ad hoc committee came forth nonetheless with the proposed language that's in the ad hoc, that's in the proposal and it says "make every effort." So I'm not hearing good arguments for why we should do something other than what is recommended by the ad hoc committee, which is the training bulletin as is proposed in our agenda packet.
- Henry Gage, III: Commissioner Harbin-Forte, I believe your timeline understanding is incorrect.
- Brenda Harbin-Forte: Okay.
- Henry Gage, III: The ad hoc committee put forward language and, as you noted, Acting Lieutenant Turner was a member of that ad hoc.
- Brenda Harbin-Forte: Right.
- Henry Gage, III: Subsequent to that language being agreed upon, the draft was forwarded to OCA counsel, Bridget Martin, and plaintiff's attorney, Jim Channon. They reviewed the language that the ad hoc put forward and they noted this concern, to change, "every effort" to "good faith effort." And the explanation for that request is on page 13.
- Brenda Harbin-Forte: And I've seen that explanation. And what is the view then of the ad hoc committee as a whole? Does the ad hoc committee as a whole agree to this proposed change or is the ad hoc committee as a whole still suggesting that we adopt the training bulletin that is in our agenda packet? And that is critical information because, basically, if you have, basically, a minority view of the ad hoc on what the language should be, that's something that we ought to know. What is the view of the ad hoc committee as a whole in terms of the proposed language?
- Henry Gage, III: Speaking for-
- Brenda Harbin-Forte: If the ad hoc committee as a whole says, "We reject this proposed language. A majority of us don't want to change." Then we need to know that.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION MEETING TRANSCRIPT

February 11, 2021

- Henry Gage, III: Speaking for myself, I am in favor of the language proposed by the plaintiff's attorneys. The change made make sense logically, and it's not a particularly substantive edit, in my opinion.
- Brenda Harbin-Forte: There were other members of the ... I'm sorry, Madam Chair. I don't need to be out of order, but there were other members ... Has the ad hoc committee gone back and discussed the proposed change and taken a vote on whether or not the ad hoc majority-
- Regina Jackson: Commissioner Harbin-Forte, I don't know if you can hear me.
- Brenda Harbin-Forte: I'm sorry. I can. Yes ma'am.
- Regina Jackson: Can you hear me?
- Brenda Harbin-Forte: Yes, yes, I can.
- Regina Jackson: Okay. Commissioner Harbin-Forte can you hear me?
- Brenda Harbin-Forte: Yes, I can.
- Regina Jackson: Okay. Very good. Thank you. Whoo. So there are ... I'd like to have Commissioner Jordan weigh in on whether or not he supports this. Commissioner Jordan.
- David Jordan: Yes. Thank you, Chair. So, I mean, maybe it's me not doing my due diligence and not looking further into the proposed edit and where and how it was motivated. I think it's relatively innocuous and I'm very much tempted to just let it slide. But also in the spirit of the ... I mean, speaking in the spirit of good faith and the dialogue that we've had with the other ad hoc members, members of community, Ms. [inaudible 04:22:51], Lindsay [inaudible 04:22:52] and Mr. Farmer, who didn't get a chance to weigh in on this, I know at issue is the decision making process, but I firmly feel we make every effort to include them and hear their voices and never disregard their perspectives.
- David Jordan: And, to that, I'm concerned that a last minute third-party edit might damage that trust. I could be off base here and I recognize it as a very small change in language but, honestly, we had days' worth of fights over smaller changes in these policies, in this ad hoc that's been going on for a big chunk of the past year.
- David Jordan: So I might have to come out in the negative around that and go with the original language. I guess, that's [inaudible 04:23:54].
- Regina Jackson: Okay. Thank you very much. Chief Armstrong.
- Chief Armstrong: Yes. Just to put it in context, Chair, part of our NSA requirements, when we-have policies that fall under NSA, we bring forth to the commission, but also those policies are reviewed by the plaintiff's attorneys, the federal monitor and our city attorney. And so in each review there may



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

February 11, 2021

be some potential edits or feedback from them or suggestions of policy changes, but that doesn't change the idea that the commission has obviously the final approval of those policies. But I think the effort is, is that both the city attorney and in this case, the plaintiff's attorney was making what they thought was recommendations for improvement to the policy. So it's a simple offer of an edit from the plaintiff's attorneys. The commission can determine whether they want to support that edit or not. I think the department rests that it would be helpful, but again, it's not something that was the department's recommendation.

Regina Jackson: Okay. So Commissioner Harbin-Forte, the answer to your question, is that this slight change that was made, we didn't have another Ad Hoc meeting before this had to get into the agenda. So there are several of us that support it and there are probably several who don't. You heard from the three Ad Hoc members, two support it and one doesn't. So at this point, what I'd like to do is go to public comment and then we can determine whether or not we want to vote tonight, if we want to table the vote to the next meeting and possibly resume the Ad Hoc to do some further work. We can make all those different decisions after we go to public comment. Can we go to public comment now? Commissioner Harbin-Forte?

Brenda Harbin-Forte: Are you waiting for... I think everybody understood my entire point.

Regina Jackson: Right. And I was trying to make sure [crosstalk 04:26:10].

Brenda Harbin-Forte: Please go to public comment. Again, I just wanted to know what the... When we have Ad Hoc committees, there's a recommendation from the Ad Hoc committee that we take some action. [crosstalk 04:26:23] and I understand why we don't have that tonight, but I did want to know where is the Ad Hoc or at least where is the majority of the Ad Hoc [crosstalk 04:26:33]?

Regina Jackson: I understand.

Brenda Harbin-Forte: And the majority seems to reject it, but... At least the commissioners who were on the Ad Hoc...

Regina Jackson: No, two of them are accepting and one is rejecting, but-

Brenda Harbin-Forte: Oh, I see, I'm sorry, just the opposite. Okay.

Regina Jackson: Yeah. That's okay. So Chief Armstrong, are you needing to say one more thing before we go to public comment?

Chief Armstrong: No, ma'am, I'm sorry. I [crosstalk 04:27:00].

Regina Jackson: No. Not a problem. Not a problem. And see, I think just in terms of clarification, Commissioner Harbin-Forte, our work together was a struggle. We went through a lot to get to progressive. And quite frankly, I have been a little shocked by this overwhelming public comment tonight about retire the BearCat, because I hadn't heard that in the Ad Hoc. I just have to be honest about that. We all want to get to a place where the BearCat goes somewhere to die, but how we get there is



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

February 11, 2021

the issue. So at this point we will, unless Commissioner Gage your hand is newly up, we'll go to public comment. I'm clarifying?

- Henry Gage, III: Thank you, Chair. I would like to note for fellow Commissioners that I'm perfectly happy moving forward with the Ad Hoc recommendation as is, and not adopting the OC language. We don't need it. It's really minor. If that's a serious sticking point, let's just [crosstalk 04:28:12].
- Regina Jackson: Okay, let's do this then. Because the motion that was on the floor that I seconded, was to adopt the additional language. So I will remove my second if you would like to offer a substitute motion.
- Henry Gage, III: In that case, I'll move that we adopt the training bulletin as put forward by the Ad Hoc.
- Regina Jackson: Okay. And I will second. Now it's been properly moved and second, we will go to public comment. Mr. Rus?
- Juanito Rus: Thank you, Madam Chair. At this time, if any member of the public wishes to make comment on item 11 on tonight's agenda, please raise your hand in the Zoom queue, and you'll be called in the order in which your hands are raised. The first speaker on this item is Tom Baker. Good evening, Mr. Baker, can you hear us?
- Tom Baker: Yes. Thank you. My name is Tom Baker and I live in District Six in Arroyo Viejo Park. Last summer on July 18th, police responded to a reported armed domestic violence situation at Lockwood and 79th. Numerous officers with ARs were there for over eight hours, directing commands over a loud speaker to the house. A sniper was perched through the top of the BearCat in the middle of 79th for hours. It was Saturday morning, kids were running and playing in the street, eight-year-olds. They were saying things like, "They're going to kill him," and, "He should escape up the back." The man wasn't there.
- Tom Baker: Apparently he had left long before they entered. He had no history of gun violence. The gun was not confirmed by anyone in the house. The family was related to my neighbor, two blocks from them at 79th and Arthur. He was with them that night and offered to help the police resolve the situation, but they declined. My neighbor's 11-year-old daughter watched it all. The whole neighborhood was witness to it, and it absolutely was traumatizing. I saw now Chief Armstrong later that morning at a charity event and he explained that was the policy for that type of situation. This needs to change so it will never happen again.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you, Mr. Baker.
- Juanito Rus: The next speaker on this item is Joseph Mente. Good evening, Mr. Mente, you have the floor.
- Joseph Mente: Can you hear me?
- Juanito Rus: We can hear you.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

February 11, 2021

- Joseph Mente: Joseph Mente, District one. Just driving up in such an obviously military vehicle is an act of aggression on the community. Exactly the opposite of re-imagining public safety. There is an existing alternative, we don't "have to live with it." Use the armored SUV instead, it does not invoke terror in the community. If that's not acceptable, require a warrant for all use of the BearCat. Regarding the BearCats capabilities, it's taller, higher elevation, why do you need that? To use as a shooting platform? Stronger ballistic armor, why do you need that?
- Joseph Mente: How often has OPDs use of the BearCat encountered the level of firepower you're describing. Do you have data on that? For holding a stretcher, has that ever happened in the history of the BearCat? More transport capacity, just follow up with additional cars, which you have. There are so many potential uses of the BearCat described. When has OPDs use of the BearCat aligned with those uses? Align with those potentialities, provide actual data, this is a manufactured crisis. Thank you.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you, Mr. Mente.
- Juanito Rus: The next speaker in the queue is John Lindsay-Poland. Good evening, Mr. Lindsay-Poland, you have the floor.
- John Lindsay-Poland: Good evening. I'd like to ask the Chair, whether I could have three minutes. As a member of the Ad Hoc, I can address some of the Commissioner's questions that have come up during this discussion
- Juanito Rus: I will refer that question to the Chair.
- Juanito Rus: It appears at this time, Mr. Lindsay-Poland, that the Chair is continuing to have audio difficulties, if you-
- Regina Jackson: No, I [crosstalk 04:32:17] yes.
- Juanito Rus: Okay. Sorry. We didn't hear you. Yes. Okay, I will set additional time. I unfortunately do not have a three minute timer, so I will give you two and then an additional one, Mr. Lindsay-Poland. Whenever you're ready.
- John Lindsay-Poland: Thank you so much, I really appreciate it. Ultimately, Commissioner [inaudible 04:32:41] asked about studies that show [inaudible 04:32:45] what crime reduction... I'm sorry, I don't have any other speaker on, I don't know what is causing this. There are recent studies that show that the provision of military equipment from the 1033 program do not reduce crime and do not improve officer safety. There are no studies directly of BearCats, but there are studies of militarized equipment that show that throughout the country. Also, I wanted to note that in the community comments session that the Ad Hoc had, my accounting of all the community comment was that almost everyone favored the elimination of the BearCat. So for me that wasn't a surprise. I think there's a piece of information that the commission should be aware of, which is that OPD borrows BearCats from other agencies. So the retiring of the BearCat does not actually eliminate the



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

February 11, 2021

possibility that BearCats would be deployed in Oakland, as it happens already, especially when the BearCat is in the shop.

John Lindsay-Poland: So that's why it's very important that the existing policy or training bulletin account for situations such as those with Joshua Pawlik. There was a proposal to add a sentence that said, "At a prohibited use of the BearCat as a shooting platform." And Lieutenant Turner said that sometimes an officer would need to use the turret in order to balance a sniper rifle, and so that was turned down. The makeup of the Ad Hoc includes three community members, but it was the full commissioners who had voting authority within that Ad Hoc. So we gave input, but we did not have a vote. The training bulletin could also be strengthened in a situation like Mr Pawlik, if there were something stronger than reasonable suspicion of use of a firearm. As we heard from Mr. Alden, that's a very low standard and would likely not prevent at least the deployment of a BearCat in that situation, if not the actual use of it as a shooting platform.

John Lindsay-Poland: I also want to just pick up on Chair Jackson's suggestion about a sentence that says that the BearCat will be retired. We heard during the Ad Hoc that that is a probable outcome in the future. And I think if this commission put forward a sentence in this or a separate resolution that said, "We would like to see a plan for retiring the BearCat," that would honor both the community input, as well as what the commissioners have said, as well as what Chief Armstrong has said. Thanks so much for hearing me.

Juanito Rus: Thank you Mr. Lindsay-Poland.

Juanito Rus: Oh, my apologies. I appear to have lowered the hand of Ms. Jennifer Tu. Ms. Tu, if you would raise your hand again, I will call on you. I see you're there. The next speaker is Jennifer Tu.

Jennifer Tu: Hi. Thank you. I just want to remind the commissioners that we are in a unique opportunity right now with the federal oversight deadline, combined with the outpouring of public sentiment since the summer, and also a brand new city council. Now is the time to make big, bold change. I know all of the members of the Ad Hoc have worked very hard on this in really trying circumstances, and I would ask for you to please consider spending just a little more time on this. You could ask the judge for an extension, you've already done two out of the three. Revise the training bulletin to prioritize the armored SUV, which does not bring trauma to impacted communities with its really violent visual presence. It is in your power to, as Commissioner Singleton said, to prevent another Joshua Pawlik and bring us to the ideal world day. And we, the members of the public are counting on you. Please remove the BearCat from the training bulletin. Thank you so much.

Juanito Rus: Thank you, Ms. Tu.

Juanito Rus: The next speaker in the queue is Maria Navarro. Good evening, Ms. Navarro, can you hear us?

Maria Navarro: Good evening. Can you hear me okay?

Juanito Rus: We can hear you. You have the floor.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

February 11, 2021

- Maria Navarro: Thank you. It is alarming that the police commission would approve a policy that is so vague. You are risking implementing a policy that will be open for interpretation. If the policy moves forward and Oakland PD misuses the BearCat, then the public will lose further trust in the police and in the police commission. I'd like to know where the data is to support the need for such militarized equipment. How many times has the Oakland PD found themselves in a situation where the BearCat needed to be deployed and was the best tool to respond to a situation? Personally, if there's a situation in Oakland that truly requires a BearCat, then the police need to step aside and Oakland needs to call the National Guard. Thank you.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you, Ms. Navarro.
- Juanito Rus: The next speaker in the queue is Reisa Jaffe. Good evening, Ms. Jaffe, can you hear us?
- Reisa Jaffe: Hi. Yes. Thank you. Other speakers have spoken about the issues of where's the data that actually shows, but I'd like to bring up a related point, and that's how we frame things matter. When I was one of those small people who was at the public thing, and I heard police talk about the worst possible case scenarios about protecting the police. And that's a visual that people can hold onto and it's much harder for people to grasp the visual of all the trauma that's happening to the kids that the speaker spoke about earlier and all the other members of the community. We don't have a good visual, but we need to start visualizing that. We need to weigh that as important, as we're weighing the life of the police officers, because data shows the police do not have the most high-risk profession. And we don't talk about other professions and the risk of lives the way that we do this. So we need to weigh community as important as we're weighing the police. Thank you.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you, Ms. Jaffe.
- Juanito Rus: The next speaker in the queue is Mariano Contreras. Good evening, Mr. Contreras, can you hear us?
- Mariano Contreras: Yes. It seems that the crux of this whole issue is why there's a BearCat, is for safety of officers. If that's the case, then why don't the Oakland Police Department and the commission work on procedures, lines of command. This, I believe, can provide the best safety for officers. And a point of order for Commissioner Gage, he referenced a guiding principle from the Reimagining Public Safety Task Force, "Police reduction will only be made when a suitable alternative is proven to offer an equivalent or better impact on public safety." That was a proposed guiding principle, it was not accepted and that is not a part of the guiding principles for the Reimagining Public Safety Task Force. So I don't want him to use this as an argument for his reasoning. Thank you.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you, Mr. Contreras.
- Juanito Rus: The next speaker in the queue is Kevin Cantu. Good evening, Mr. Cantu.
- Kevin Cantu: Good evening, again. I really liked Commissioner Singleton's comment earlier, "We should make this policy actionable, a policy where it's clear when it's been violated." I think that as other



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

February 11, 2021

commenters have pointed out, the framing really matters. And as much as we see movies or TV, where no holds are barred. I think in practice, we don't have to live with it. We don't need it. We don't have to have it and our city can choose to do differently. And I would urge you to consider, for example, the Chair's suggestion that we add wording to restrict further purchases and even mutual aid or borrowing of BearCats or similar devices.

Juanito Rus: Thank you, Mr. Cantu.

Juanito Rus: The next speaker in the queue is Sameena Usman. Good evening, Ms. Usman. Can you hear us?

Sameena Usman: Yes, I can. Thank you. Again, Sameena Usman, Government Relations Coordinator for the Council on American-Islamic Relations. I find it interesting that the Chair, I believe it was the Chair, had mentioned that she didn't know that community members had felt so strongly about this issue, when in reality, I think people have a very visceral reaction to this. Every single person who I've spoken to is really outraged by the use of the BearCat and the use of this being deployed in our cities to make it like a war zone. So honestly, what we really need to be doing is retiring the BearCat. We need to write in language to retire it. And we also need to opt for having some type of armored suburban, I know we already have one. I think it's the decision on the commission and the council on whether or not we need more. I would opt for no, but at the same time, I think that we really need to put the safety of our community and the mental health safety as well, and the effect that it has on our community. Thank you.

Juanito Rus: Thank you, Ms. Usman.

Juanito Rus: The next speaker in the queue is Lorelei Bosserman. Good evening, Ms. Bosserman. You have the floor.

Lorelei Bosserman: I am so sorry. I forgot to lower my hand.

Juanito Rus: Oh, very well. The next speaker in the queue is a telephone attendee. The last four digits, 1362. Good evening, 1362. Can you hear us? Telephone attendee with the last four digits 1362? Appears to have lowered their hand. The next speaker in the queue is Cathy Leonard. Good evening, Ms. Leonard. You have the floor.

Cathy Leonard: Good evening, once again. I'm an Oakland native. I've lived in just about every district in Oakland. When the police come to black neighborhoods, which I have primarily lived in as a black woman, they come in with three and four cars terrorizing the neighborhood. Imagine now you're a child and this huge military tank comes into your neighborhood. It's traumatizing. We need to get rid of this vehicle. Let's stop beating around the bush. Why are we going to wait to retire it? Retire it now. It's a waste of money, it's traumatizing. It does no good for the citizens of Oakland and we don't want to pay for it. Let's get rid of things that... I don't understand why we're even having a discussion about keeping it. Let's get rid of it once and for all. Thank you very much.

Juanito Rus: Thank you, Ms. Leonard.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

February 11, 2021

- Juanito Rus: The next speaker in the queue is Assata Olugbala. Good evening, Ms. Olugbala. You have the floor.
- Assata Olugbala: Yes. I've seen vehicles like this in New Orleans. We have many of them, mostly due to the fact that we have rescue efforts that happened with hurricanes and we lease these large police vehicles. They're armored, and we use them frequently. So I'm not traumatized by seeing a large armored vehicle. I'm concerned about officers. The number one thing is officers being protected. And this vehicle, I saw it with the Boston bombing being used for that. I saw it when that woman officer, I think it was in Vacaville, was lying on the ground and they use that BearCat to come in and protect her. Of course, she didn't make it, she died. But that has to be a major consideration we need in the case of acts of shooters. Did you see what happened on January the 6th in Washington, DC? We are in a state of domestic terrorism on the rise in cities. It can happen again. It will happen again.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you, Ms. Olugbala.
- Juanito Rus: The next speaker in the queue is listed as Tasha. Good evening, Tasha. You have the floor.
- Tasha Mente: Hello, can you hear me?
- Juanito Rus: We can hear you.
- Tasha Mente: Great. Thanks. So it's clear to me that this particular training bulletin isn't ready for prime time just yet. And I encourage the commissioners to not vote on it tonight. I'm agreeing with my fellow residents that you can request an extension, possibly from the judge, or potentially try to get this to be in a form that is transparent to the public prior to the next meeting. But it needs to include language around borrowing other BearCats and including chain of command information so that deploying an armored vehicle is in a free for all with the community, and John Lindsay-Poland had mentioned.
- Tasha Mente: And my understanding from discussing with the community about how it's deployed, is that OPD uses it like a security blanket. They use it because they think it makes them feel safe, but it's actually a form of escalation, not de-escalation. So I recommend selling it for parts and maybe you can use it at Target and Walgreens money to buy a Sprinter van instead. Thanks.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you.
- Juanito Rus: The next speaker in the queue is Anne Janks. Excuse me, while I promote her to the panel. Ms. Janks, can you hear us? You can [crosstalk 04:48:27].
- Anne Janks: Yes, sir.
- Juanito Rus: Right. Whenever you're ready.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

February 11, 2021

- Anne Janks: Good evening. Actually, I wanted to respond a little bit to Chief Armstrong, in terms of his characterizations of the many advantages of the BearCat, but hopefully that can be a conversation for another day when they are in fact getting another vehicle. Because I think that the suburban is as much as it should happen, but two things come up in this discussion that I think are worth the commission learning from. One, is that this speaks to how important it is for these Ad Hoc's to be completely transparent so that the public can really watch what's going on and see the drafts and the language. I think it would really have helped here.
- Anne Janks: And the second is that the commission needs to be communicating directly with these other parties, the monitor and the plaintiff's attorneys, so that we're not receiving an interpretation of a discussion with OPD, who wanted certain things out of the language and then reported back that that's what Shannon said. Thank you.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you, Ms. Janks.
- Juanito Rus: Excuse me while I... The next speaker in the queue is Megan Steffen. Good evening, Ms. Steffen. Can you hear us?
- Megan Steffen: Good evening. Thank you. I just want to speak to the sense of surprise that commissioners seem to have. I was at the town hall where the Ad Hoc conducted their public engagement process. Nothing that the public did was a surprise. And I'm sorry if the petition was a surprise, but the public has been saying the same thing. I hear Commissioner Jordan saying that he wants focus groups. I'm a corporate researcher, I conduct focus groups for a living. And there is nothing a focus group can do if my stakeholders don't want to listen. Consumers can say what they want as many times as they want, but if someone's not going to listen, it's not going to make a difference. I'm really sad today. I feel the discussion hasn't been about anything the public brought up and I hope you continue this discussion, because it doesn't feel over.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you, Ms. Steffen.
- Juanito Rus: The next speaker in the queue is Jasmine Fallstich. Good evening, Ms. Fallstich.
- Jasmine Fallstich: Good evening. Thank you for taking my comment. Similar to what the previous commenter said, it does seem like there is some misunderstanding on behalf of the commissioners about the BearCat. I particularly want to call out how frequently it's used, Commissioner Harbin-Forte, you indicated that you thought it was a very rare recurrence. And I believe that the data shows us that it's deployed about seven times per month, which would be almost twice per week, which does not seem rare at all. So without making it more difficult to access the BearCat, it's going to continue to be used so frequently. So perhaps it could be used only as a backup when the suburban is not available, since the suburban is also covered in this training bulletin. I would also support an amendment removing informational purposes from the clause reading, "Oversight and informational purposes when authorized by a meeting of the police commission."
- Juanito Rus: Thank you, Ms. Fallstich.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

February 11, 2021

- Juanito Rus: The next speaker in the queue is Salah Elbakri. Good evening, Mr. Elbakri, can you hear us?
- Salah Elbakri: Yes, I could. Salah Elbakri, Support Life Foundation, Executive Director out of the Fruitvale District in Oakland, resident for the past 30 years. I am eager to encourage all of us to move on and discontinue the use of this vehicle. And my worry is that we replace it with something similar or of the same capacity. The talk of the fear for the life of the officers, which is very dear to us, we need our security here in the city, but the talk of the fear, of protecting the lives of the officers is also very alarming to me. Again, I don't see an officer coming to any crime scene without multiple vehicles coming. So the thought that we need farther and farther protection is just counter to any common intelligence out there. May God bless you, and thank you for taking our comment. Take care.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you, Mr. Elbakri.
- Juanito Rus: The next speaker in the queue is a telephone attendee with the last four digits 5802. I believe that was Mr. Saleem Bey. Mr. Bey, can you hear us?
- Saleem Bey: Yes. Good evening, Saleem Bey. I would just admonish the police commission, who... The commission was created by two thirds vote, a super majority of the public. A super majority of the public has come before you, and before this whole meeting, and said how much they're against having a militarized vehicle in the community. So there shouldn't be any discussion whatsoever beyond the fact of serving the community, which has overwhelmingly said they don't want a military vehicle. Now, just on a personal note, I've never seen the BearCat, but I've actually seeing a Troop Carrier with militarized officers standing on the deck of an armored vehicle, come into the community and run operations on streets that I've been on. So, for people who were talking about the, "Oh, the BearCat," or what, have you ever seen the BearCat? You've never been living where people are, where the military [crosstalk 04:55:26].
- Juanito Rus: ... Mr. Bey. Thank you, Mr. Bey.
- Juanito Rus: The next speaker in the queue is listed as Elise. Good evening, Elise. Can you hear us? You appear to still be muted. You can unmute yourself. Last call for Elise. Well, I'm going to move to the next speaker. Elise, if you still wish to make comment, please raise your hand again and I will come back.
- Juanito Rus: The next speaker in the queue is, Omar Farmer. Good evening, Mr. Farmer. Can you hear us?
- Omar Farmer: Yes, I can hear you. I'd just like to ask, Chair Jackson, can I get two minutes? It might only take 90 seconds, but... Is that possible, as an Ad Hoc member?
- Jose Dorado: Chair Jackson?
- Regina Jackson: Yes?



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

February 11, 2021

Jose Dorado: Omar Farmer's asking for two minutes.

Regina Jackson: Oh, okay. Two minutes.

Brenda Harbin-Forte: Excuse me, Madam Chair, I hate to interrupt, but it's almost 10:30. Would this be an appropriate time to-make a motion?

Regina Jackson: Tell you what? Why don't we let him do his thing for two minutes? We'll get closer within. I will go straight to you to extend our meeting.

Brenda Harbin-Forte: Sorry.

Regina Jackson: Thank you.

Juanito Rus: Mr. Farmer, you have the floor.

Regina Jackson: Mr. Rus.

Juanito Rus: Yes. Mr. Farmer?

Omar Farmer: Yes, I'm here. Thank you very much. I'm ready. All right, I just want to say that to me, keeping the policy as is just shows that we haven't learned from the mistakes in politic the situation, and that's the reason the ad hoc was put together to my understanding. Throughout the ad hoc, we advocated for stronger restrictions, but they weren't accepted. One of those was to put the Bearcat in a secondary position, which has been mentioned and take the suburban out first. And in the event that the specific capabilities of the Bearcat and the Police Commission can determine how and when OPD can use it in that event. The Bearcat is already frequently in the shop as OPD shared in the June of 2019 Police Commission meeting, where they stated that it's in the shop almost 50% of the time.

Omar Farmer: So, they already have a plan to use the suburban from a primary position since the Bearcat is out of service so often. Also, the type of ballistic protection that the Bearcat provides is for weapons above the 50 caliber. However, no credible intelligence was presented showing that they've ever encountered that type of weapon, so I don't feel like it's required to have. The suburban also can carry a stretcher, just not a flat six foot back board stretcher.

Omar Farmer: There are all types of stretchers out there that can be purchased and used in the suburban as a former EMT, I can tell you that. There's also no clear training on how to govern the incident command of position, which is often activated when the Bearcat goes out and lack of command and control and planning for contingencies from the incident command of position was a root cause of the politic situation, which is very unsettling for me personally, knowing that officers haven't been completely trained on that very critical and important role where they're oftentimes making life and death decisions. So I think it's just best that we retire it. You also have the option of trading it in for another suburban. That's all. Thank you.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

February 11, 2021

Juanito Rus: Thank you, Mr. Farmer.

Regina Jackson: Commissioner Harbin Forte.

Brenda Harbin-Forte: Yes. Thank you chair. Considering the time I would like to make a motion to extend the meeting for another hour.

Regina Jackson: Oh no.

Brenda Harbin-Forte: Can you hear me? Hello, can everybody hear me?

Juanito Rus: I can hear you, commissioner Harbin Forte.

Jose Dorado: I second your motion.

David Jordan: Okay.

Brenda Harbin-Forte: Is chair Jackson gone? Commissioner Dorado, you may have to take over.

Automated recording: Welcome to Zoom, enter your meeting ID followed by... Enter your participant ID followed by-

Jose Dorado: Let me see if she's going to come back.

David Jordan: While we await for the chair to come back online. I mean, since I haven't seconded it yet, can I maybe suggest we extend for half an hour instead of a full hour, if you will agree to?

Jose Dorado: Commissioner Jordan, I already seconded the hour for Commissioner Harbin Forte's motion. So let's just go straight to -

Regina Jackson: I'm back guys, sorry.

Jose Dorado: Okay.

Regina Jackson: If we have moved and seconded for an hour, if we end early, that's fine. So why don't we just go ahead and vote to extend for the hour and then we can move on. Is that okay?

Jose Dorado: Yep. That works.

Regina Jackson: Okay. Terrific. All right. So Commissioner Dorado.

Jose Dorado: Aye.

Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Gage.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

February 11, 2021

Henry Gage, III: Yes.

Regina Jackson: Commissioner Garcia.

Sergio Garcia: Aye.

Regina Jackson: Commissioner Harbin Forte.

Brenda Harbin-Forte: Aye.

Regina Jackson: And Commissioner Singleton.

Tyfahra Singleton: Yes.

Regina Jackson: Okay. Aye, for myself. We're in [inaudible 05:01:43] we've extended for an hour and hope to get out much sooner than that. We have heard all public comments, I believe that we may have a resolution which would, once again, include amending the motion that is currently on the table. I believe the motion was made by commissioner Gage, would you like to restate your motion and make an amendment to that motion?

Henry Gage, III: Thank you, chair. I wouldn't state it as an amendment to the motion so much as it seems there's a need for an accompanying resolution. The discussion has brought up the need to make clear to both the department and the council that we would like to see this piece of equipment retired and the specific language would need to be put forward, likely in a future meeting as drafting on the day, as is generally disfavored. So I would again maintain the motion as stated, but simply state that it's my intention to bring a companion resolution in the future.

Regina Jackson: Okay. Can you be a little more specific? The future is broad.

Henry Gage, III: Well, that could be as soon as our next meeting.

Regina Jackson: I'm sorry?

Henry Gage, III: That could be as soon as our next meeting, however, we would need some discussion on the content of that resolution.

Regina Jackson: Okay. So for resolution that could be brought within the next month? So that gives us two meetings, does that make sense or no?

Henry Gage, III: I think so. I would not ask for... So I don't see a need to amend the motion on the floor, it's been moved and seconded to adopt the language proposed by the ad hoc. However, the conversation has triggered the thinking that it would likely be beneficial to propose a companion resolution. I'm curious to members of the commission about the content of that companion resolution, it seems that language would need to be added to discuss the desire to retire the Bearcat moving forward.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION MEETING TRANSCRIPT

February 11, 2021

And I'd like to open discussion as to what additional language would be appropriate for such a companion resolution.

David Jordan: Commissioner Gage, it's Commissioner Jordan. I'm not sure if the chair is there. I had my hands up, so I'm just going to jump in. I would support that resolution, I think it is one that we all agree with and I feel like I've very clearly voiced support for that agenda.

David Jordan: I think that we can even add that straight in a sort of initial... There is language in the training bulletin that specifically talks about an understanding of how the Bearcat affects community and its usage and why it has to be limited. I don't think that it would be crazy to even just add language in there that just says, as of this date right now, this training bulletin, which is some ways within the document until the next training role then comes along. When the existing, because we do talk about the existing equipment as it is currently on the ground at this moment. And we can talk, in the training bulletin, about it being sort of having a finite timeline on it and that it should be replaced with something that is less problematic.

David Jordan: Additionally, I think what we did not talk about here tonight, but that we did talk about extensively in the ad hoc is that there's an intention by the commission to go back and develop overarching policy for these equipment. That is more about principle philosophy and a lot more sort of the guiding concerns that have been voiced here today. And maybe the training bullets, isn't the place for that, maybe there's the policy. Although I do understand if we want to get this thing passed today, maybe we just throw it in both. I'm good with that.

Regina Jackson: Okay. Thank you very much Commissioner Jordan. I see Commissioner Garcia's hand is up.

Sergio Garcia: Thank you madam chair Jackson. I agree with Commissioner Jordan's providing more color and detail on what that resolution would provide. My question is, I guess, I don't want to get ahead of ourselves, maybe I won't ask that question. Maybe I would just say it loud, I think those overarching principles governing the use of militarized vehicles is the way to go. I think there has to be some kind of contextualization of the use of this Bearcat. The Bearcat vehicle, I think, has created or has raised a lot of issues in my mind around those principles. So if a companion resolution can be brought to bear in the near future, that would include a plan for retiring the Bearcat and a press or even a prohibition on bringing in other Bearcat vehicles, because for all the reasons that were stated tonight, that's an overarching principle.

Sergio Garcia: And it would be important that because this Bearcat is going to be retired, I think we all agree with that. There'll be a plan to retire the Bearcat. Important for that resolution to govern the use of militarized vehicles in general, because I think this may not be the end of the conversation on no authorized vehicles in the future.

Sergio Garcia: The point has also been made about asking for more time and I'm not sure if the resolution needs to state that, but I think the ad hoc committee is in the best position to consider whether we need to ask judge Orrick for more time to address these concerns and to draft a resolution and have that resolution be approved by this commission. Thank you.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

February 11, 2021

Jose Dorado: Chair Jackson.

Sergio Garcia: We may have lost her again.

Jose Dorado: Okay.

Regina Jackson: I can hear you.

Jose Dorado: Okay, go ahead, chair Jackson.

Regina Jackson: Go ahead.

Jose Dorado: Okay. I was just going to say that I have a ton of questions on the use of the Bearcat, in fact, the entire question, the entire issue. So I just wanted to say that because I have so many questions I'm going to vote against the motion and I think we should just go back to the drawing board. And in addition, we should ask judge Orrick for more time. Thank you.

Regina Jackson: I think that we are going to take a vote one way or the other, but include that there's going to be an accompanying resolution. I'm I misguided? Was that your proposal Commissioner Gage?

Henry Gage, III: Thank you, chair. I had asked that we vote on the legislation before us tonight, but keep in mind that it is my intention to come back with the companion resolution, taking notes and I know that there's a desire amongst the commission to include language stating the desire to retire the Bearcat, as well as a prohibition or languages to disfavored use both in a mutual aid context and other contexts of the Bearcat and similar vehicles. So I wouldn't tie them together quite in the way you've framed it, but I would suppose that we have a vote on the underlying legislation and keep in mind that the companion resolution will be covered.

Regina Jackson: Members of the ad hoc, members of the community, I wanted to figure out how to include the two, but if we can't then perhaps what we do is we go ahead and move to vote on this language that's before us right now, and then do another motion on ensuring that a company resolution can be developed and brought back to the commission soon. So why don't we take a vote now? Would you please go ahead and, I think everybody knows what we're voting on? We've heard a couple of concerns and we'll see where we land. So commissioner Dorado.

Jose Dorado: No.

Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Gage.

Henry Gage, III: Yes.

Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Garcia.

Sergio Garcia: No.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

February 11, 2021

- Regina Jackson: Commissioner Harbin Forte.
- Brenda Harbin-Forte: Yes. With the understanding that we are going to move to try to abolish the vehicle, that this is sort of like a stop gap measure now. But so I vote, yes.
- Regina Jackson: Okay. Thank you. And commissioner Singleton.
- Tyfahra Singleton: No.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you. And yes, for myself. If I'm adding correctly that's four, yes, and two, no.
- Brenda Harbin-Forte: Three noes. Oh, I'm sorry.
- Regina Jackson: I'm sorry.
- Brenda Harbin-Forte: I'm sorry. I thought I wasn't muted. I'm not supposed to be.-
- Regina Jackson: Okay. That's fine. Let me go back and add it's late. One, two, three, four, yeses, and Dorado, Garcia, who else said no?
- Tyfahra Singleton: That was me.
- Regina Jackson: Oh, I thought I heard you say, yes. Okay. Got it. Okay. So the motion passes, I would like to invite another motion to address the accompanying resolution that we've been having discussion about.
- Jose Dorado: Chair Jackson.
- Regina Jackson: Yes.
- Jose Dorado: If it's three, three, it fails.
- Henry Gage, III: Chair Jackson, I believe the count is not accurate. I believe we only have six sitting commissioners that are present. We would need to elevate an alternative frequent to continue with the vote.
- Regina Jackson: Oh, okay. So I didn't realize that we... Okay. So, I guess I should promote commissioner Jordan for seven votes, is that correct, Conor? Counsel?
- Conor Kennedy: I apologize chair, I was on mute.
- Regina Jackson: No, it's okay.
- Conor Kennedy: Yes. Alternate commissioners can be elevated in the chair sole discretion and they may temporarily cast a vote.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

February 11, 2021

- Regina Jackson: Okay. Thank you. Commissioner Jordan was a part of this ad hoc and did a lot of work and I would like to elevate him for a vote. Commissioner Jordan.
- David Jordan: I'm going to vote yes. With the stipulation that there is the resolution regarding tiring and requirements around what potentially replaces it.
- Regina Jackson: Okay. So let's do this, the vote is four to three. Why don't you make the motion about the accompanying resolution that we've all kind of been talking at and [inaudible 05:16:03] we can nail that down.
- David Jordan: Sure. I move that the members of the ad hoc meet one final time to develop a resolution regarding the sunseting of the current Bearcat and what his replacement looks like and what the requirements are around therefore.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you. I recognize Commissioner Gage's hand.
- Henry Gage, III: Second.
- Regina Jackson: Okay. So it's been properly moved and seconded. Let's take a vote. Commissioner Dorado.
- Jose Dorado: Do we need to take public comment because it's another.
- Regina Jackson: It's on the same item. So, no, we don't have to take it again.
- Jose Dorado: Okay. Aye.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Gage.
- Sergio Garcia: I'm sorry, madam chair. I have a question about this resolution because I'm-
- Regina Jackson: Did you not hear that?
- Sergio Garcia: No. I just want to ask whether I know what has just been approved is there any possibility, even a remote possibility, that as the ad hoc goes back to craft a resolution with specific requirements, they may find the need to bolster some of the language, perhaps that's in the training bullet. In other words, find something that, that perhaps was missing and bring that if there's any possibility that might happen, might be a good thing. I would be in favor of voting in favor of the resolution.
- Regina Jackson: Okay. So Commissioner Garcia, that training bulletin, which is not a forever document can always be improved, but the current one has been approved. So what we're voting on now is the accompanying resolution and so we want to stick to that and the vote is to use so that we can finish this, so that we can stay on focus.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

February 11, 2021

Sergio Garcia: Thank you for that.

Regina Jackson: Sure. What is your vote?

Sergio Garcia: I vote yes.

Regina Jackson: Okay. Thank you. Commissioner Harbin Forte.

Brenda Harbin-Forte: Aye.

Regina Jackson: Thank you, Commissioner Singleton.

Tyfahra Singleton: I'm sorry, but I didn't quite understand how we're voting on resolution without... Are we voting on creating one or [inaudible 05:19:00] ?

Regina Jackson: Okay. So let me have commissioner Jordan restate his motion so that you can be clear, okay?

Tyfahra Singleton: Okay.

Regina Jackson: Commissioner Jordan.

David Jordan: Yeah. So the intent is that we are voting on passing this... So the stipulation for the previous vote was that we create this resolution. Now this is emotion to create that resolution, which we will then bring back, I presume at the next meeting of the commission for your approval. That resolution will include the timeline, ideally, around the retirement of the Bearcat and specific guidelines around what its replacement will look like.

Tyfahra Singleton: So, this is like a friendly amendment to the previous motion [crosstalk 05:19:56]?

Regina Jackson: It's not technically, but they are connected.

Tyfahra Singleton: Okay, then yes.

Regina Jackson: Okay. Thank you very much. And so you all got to help me with my addition here. So Singleton, yes, Garcia, yes, Dorado, yes, Gage, yes, Harbin Forte, yes, and yes for myself. So the motion for the resolution design is in agreement. Okay, thank you very much. Now we will move forward to item 12, which is the resolution on parity regarding the administering of COVID vaccinations for frontline public safety workers.

Regina Jackson: You all may remember in my remarks at the last meeting that I was not this dismayed, but really disturbed that there was a distinction between vaccinations for public safety workers inside the city of Oakland. The Oakland Fire Department had received there, as a month ago and to date, we still don't know when the police officers will receive theirs. And it's not just about protecting the police officers, but that is a primary protection around the citizens that they engage when they



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

February 11, 2021

are doing their public safety work. At the end of the resolution, we include the importance of mask wearing at all times for the police officers, because we know that that has been an issue of vulnerability for them. Are there any questions about the resolution from the commissioners? I don't see any questions, Chief Armstrong, are you in favor of this resolution?

Chief Armstrong: Yes, ma'am chair. I appreciate the resolution, I appreciate our officers needing to be protected with the vaccines so that not only can they be protected, but also the public can be protected. I did just receive information from the County today that they did receive additional vaccine and would be beginning to vaccinate what they call Tier B1 which would include law enforcement. So it's our belief that next week we'll start vaccinations for our officers starting Tuesday and Thursday. But the resolution is appreciated because things could change.

Regina Jackson: Okay. Thank you very much. I don't see any other hands up. Oh, now I see some. So commissioner Gage followed by Jordan.

Henry Gage, III: Thank you chair. Procedurally, I'm not sure if this is a correct place to put this, but given that it's front of mine, now, I'd like to get this out. An issue has arisen in some other jurisdictions with respect to frontline safety workers, both police fire, as well as EMS refusing administration of the vaccine. I'd be curious to know, as we move through the vaccination process, if you kindly report back at a future date, if you come across data indicating that any significant number of officers are refusing vaccines, if offered.

Regina Jackson: Okay. Thank you. I'm sure Chief Armstrong can provide us with an update to that. My real intention was that they be able to receive them if they wanted to, because that's far they hadn't been able to, but that's a good point. There are certainly some, not a lot of information out there for certain audiences. Commissioner Jordan.

David Jordan: Yeah. Had a long meeting, I don't want to stretch it out too much further. I have a question specifically around, how strict has that guidance been around officer uses of masks. I know that that the concept of mask and the importance of mask has in sort of the general population and among frontline workers has evolved over the last year. So I know that that maybe has been a developing process for you. But I mean, literally, just as recently as last week, I was in proximity to a crime scene, just passing by and saw at least one officer doing the chin strap, mask around the chin situation, which did cause me concern. So that is a question, and the statement around it is not necessarily been proven that a vaccine protects you from transmitting the virus, which further highlights the importance of masks. We shouldn't consider having had the vaccine a safeguard against that, so it's important that people understand that, especially important for frontline workers to understand that problem.

Regina Jackson: Absolutely. And that's why it's included, I think it's one of the last we're at. Are there any other questions? Okay. I'm seeing, Mr. Rus, do you want to go get public comment for us please?

Juanito Rus: Thank you, madam chair. If any member of the public wishes to make comments on item 12 on tonight's agenda, please raise your hand in the Zoom Q and you'll be called in the order in which



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

February 11, 2021

your hands are raised. The first speaker on this item is Assata Olugbala. Good evening, Ms. Olugbala, you have a floor.

- Assata Olugbala: Yes. Thank you. First and foremost, I don't know if this is in your jurisdiction because you can't deal with Janell Harris because it's not your jurisdiction. So I may constantly call you on the fact that there's nothing to measure LL that speaks to you dealing with this kind of issue. It is also important that there are people who are experts in the science and medical field who are coming up with the decisions around how the distribution of the vaccine should take place, respect that process. There are 13 essential workers identified by the state of California, public safeties are one. So just to pick one to say, they need the vaccine is not fair. And it's amazing that you look at the safety of officers in this agenda, the last agenda item that was involved in the safety of officers was not considered. We can have armored vehicles to protect money, but we can't have armored vehicles to protect police officers.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you. Ms. Olugbala. The next speaker in the queue is Jim Chanin. Good evening, Mr. Chanin, can you hear us?
- Jim Chanin: Yes, I can. Can you hear me?
- Juanito Rus: We can hear you. You have the floor.
- Jim Chanin: Okay. Thank you. I'll be short. I just think that from what I've heard, almost every police department in the Bay Area has received the vaccine, except those in Alameda County, San Jose has received theirs, San Francisco has received theirs. The officers deal with people who are highly likely to have the virus or could have the virus, there are, I don't know, Chief Armstrong can tell me, but I know there are literally dozens of officers who have COVID now. And one of them has the kind of COVID that keeps on coming back, so they really need this and I have hope it's really a no brainer that you will approve it. Thank you.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you, Mr. Chanin. The next speaker in the queue is Anne Janks, I will promote her to the panel. Good evening, Ms. Janks, can you hear us?
- Anne Janks: I did. Mr. Teresa really did try to fix that.
- Juanito Rus: It's okay.
- Anne Janks: So, I support vaccinating the police officers. Public health suggests that one of the things to do is to vaccinate the people who are least compliant as the way of stopping the spread. Police officers are, I appreciate your adding a statement here, but I would like to hear a very serious conversation with the chief about how he's going to enforce it more stringently. I guarantee you that you vaccinate these officers and we are going to be hearing from the public that when they say to the officers, "How come you don't have your masks on?" They're going to say "I was vaccinated." And it's just, the disrespect, way that they've refused to wear masks and endangered



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

February 11, 2021

the public and their coworkers and themselves really needs to be emphasized while they get the vaccines. Thank you.

Juanito Rus: Thank you, Miss Janks. The next speaker in the queue is Joseph Mente. Good evening Mr Mente.

Joseph Mente: Can you hear me?

Juanito Rus: We can hear you. You have the floor.

Joseph Mente: Cool, Joseph Mente. District one. I'm going to echo Mrs. Olugbala's comment, leave this up to the scientists. This is not something that's really anything to do with this commission. Vaccination is not going to prevent transmission to any significant degree and we should be using the existing supply for other essential workers.

Joseph Mente: I do however support vaccinating police officers. I'm not against them being further in line than perhaps myself as a healthy young individual. They are in fact in contact with high-risk people but they should be using their existing protection equipment, which they clearly aren't to a large degree. And again, please leave this to the medical field to determine, not a public body who is not actually an expert on this. Just as myself, I am not an expert on this. Thank you.

Juanito Rus: Thank you, Mr Mente. The next speaker is Jennifer Tu. Good evening Ms. Tu, you have the floor.

Jennifer Tu: Great thank you. I just wanted to thank Alternate Commissioner Jordan for bringing up the points about how much OPD has been struggling with its officers consistently masking. And to echo what the previous speaker said, the best way for us to protect our officers and also members of the public are to follow the guidance that has been given, which is to be masking consistently.

Jennifer Tu: And for us to also continue to follow existing guidance around making sure that the right people are getting the vaccines, in the right order. And for all of us to continue to do our parts and mask and support each other in masking. So anything the commission can do to help support OPD in being able to mask, seems like a really great place to take this conversation. Thanks very much.

Juanito Rus: Thank you, Ms. Tu. The next speaker in the queue is a telephone that's ending with last four digits 5802. I believe that is Mr Saleem Bey. Good evening Mr. Bey, you have the floor.

Saleem Bey: Yes, good evening, Saleem Bey. I wasn't going to make a comment on this issue for time, but because Mr Channon opened his mouth, Mr. Channon's overseeing 18 years of failed NSA that has affected the black community primarily. So for him to open his mouth and say, anything should be discounted by this commission.

Saleem Bey: The other issue is, is that Mr. Channon and also oversaw the flaws and criminal selection panel that disregarded Janelle Harris's experience and everything like that. So Mr. Channon please retire. Go someplace and stop overseeing being the gatekeeper between the NSA and the black



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

February 11, 2021

community, when the black community has issues that need to be addressed by the NSA and neither you nor Mr. Burris will open the gate to the NSA.

Juanito Rus: Thank you, Mr. Bey. The next speaker in the queue is Megan Steffen. Good evening, Ms. Steffen.

Megan Steffen: Hi, I wasn't going to comment on this, but I was at my NCPD meeting tonight. I went to two meetings and Officer Gichki and Officer Johnson were sitting close enough to each other in the office that their mikes were picking up each other's voices and neither were wearing masks. So this is indoors, amongst themselves. Sure. I mean do whatever you want with this resolution. I don't know that this is going to be the thing that's going to stop OPD from being the epicenter of spreading things, might make them healthier. I have no idea. Good luck.

Juanito Rus: Thank you, Ms. Steffen. At this time, I see no other hands in the queue. Madam Chair, I return the meeting to you.

Regina Jackson: Okay. Thank you very much. At this point we should take a vote on the resolution. Commissioner Dorado?

Jose Dorado: Did we have a motion on the floor?

Regina Jackson: No.

Jose Dorado: If not, I'll make the motion.

Regina Jackson: I think she raising a good point. I'm sorry. It's a little late. Thank you.

Jose Dorado: I move that we adopt this resolution.

Brenda Harbin-Forte: I'll second, Harbin-Forte.

Jose Dorado: Chair Jackson?

Regina Jackson: Commissioner Dorado, can you hear me?

Jose Dorado: I can hear you now. Yes.

Regina Jackson: Okay. We're voting now.

Jose Dorado: Yes.

Regina Jackson: Okay. Thank you. Commissioner Gage?

Henry Gage, III: Yes.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

February 11, 2021

- Regina Jackson: Commissioner Garcia?
- Sergio Garcia: Yes.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Harbin-Forte?
- Brenda Harbin-Forte: Aye.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Singleton, she may have had to drop off. Okay. So I will vote aye. So we have five affirmative and one absent for this. And you know what, Emily? I'm sorry. We were having a Commissioner Jordan vote as well given the last one, so you should vote for the rest of the meeting. Commissioner Jordan?
- David Jordan: Yes.
- Regina Jackson: Okay, great. So we actually have six and then one absence and the absence is Commissioner Singleton who told me she would have to drop off at 11. Okay. So let's move forward to the meeting minutes. Does anyone have any questions about the minutes? Commissioner Dorado.
- Jose Dorado: Yes. On page 24, the minutes of January 28th, it says under item twelve, community reports. It says regarding community policing, 15-01. Edits on policy have been completed. Well, they certainly haven't been completed, so I just like to make an amendment completed be deleted and substituted with begun.
- Regina Jackson: Okay. Very good. Thank you. Does anyone else have any other edits to the meeting minutes for January 28th? Okay. Why don't we also take edits for January 30th and then we could just do one public comment for them both. Does anyone have any edits for the January 30th minutes? Commissioner Dorado, is your hand still up or is it...
- Jose Dorado: Oh, I'm sorry.
- Regina Jackson: That's okay. That's okay, this is hard for me to know now. Are there any comments for the January 30th minutes? Okay. I see none. So why don't we go to public comment and see if there are any comments for January 28th, first and January 20th or 30th in the public comment. Sorry.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you. Madam chair. If any member of the public wishes to comment on item 13, tonight's agenda, please raise your hand in the Zoom queue. Going once, going twice, I see no hands raised Madam Chair.
- Regina Jackson: Okay. Thank you very much. So since it's been properly moved and seconded, we will take the vote on January 28th first and then a separate vote on January 30th. Commissioner Dorado.
- Jose Dorado: Did we have a motion? If not, I move that we approve the minutes of January 28th.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

February 11, 2021

Regina Jackson: Thank you. I appreciate you keeping me on my game. I'm getting a little dizzy here. All right, so I will second. Has been properly moved and seconded. [crosstalk 05:40:15] Okay. It's been seconded by Commissioner Harbin-Forte. Let's vote. Commissioner Dorado?

Jose Dorado: Aye.

Regina Jackson: Thank you, Commissioner Gage?

Henry Gage, III: Yes.

Regina Jackson: Thank you, Commissioner Garcia?

Sergio Garcia: Aye.

Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Harbin-Forte?

Brenda Harbin-Forte: Aye.

Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Jordan?

David Jordan: Yes.

Regina Jackson: Thank you. And aye, for myself, that is six votes, one absence. January 30th, can someone offer me a motion to accept the January 30th minutes please?

Jose Dorado: I moved that we approve the minutes of January 30th.

Regina Jackson: Thank you. Is there a second?

Brenda Harbin-Forte: Second.

Regina Jackson: Thank you Commissioner Harbin-Forte. It's again, been properly moved and seconded. We've taken public comment and we are now ready to vote. Commissioner Dorado?

Jose Dorado: Aye.

Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner gage?

Henry Gage, III: Yes.

Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Garcia?

Sergio Garcia: Aye.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

February 11, 2021

- Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Harbin-Forte?
- Brenda Harbin-F: Aye.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Jordan?
- David Jordan: Yes.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you. And aye for myself, six affirmative one absent and we are almost done. So let's advance that slide to committee reports. So I would like to say that, it's probably best for us to not have reports from every single committee, every time. So we will move around. I would like to say that I am standing up two Ad Hocs tonight. One for the IAD policy that Chief Armstrong has recommended that he needs quickly. Those members will be Henry Gage, David Jordan, and myself. And then I'm also standing up the police chief's goals and evaluation committee. And the folks that will be on that, the commissioners that will be on that Ad Hoc will be Marsha Peterson, Tyfahra Singleton, and Sergio Garcia.
- Regina Jackson: Now for the police chief's goals and evaluations. I know that Chief Armstrong just talked about wanting to deliver those within the first hundred days. I will leave it to you all to engage Chief Armstrong, whether it's at the 100th day or the 60th day, so you all can work together and craft. You all just go ahead and let me know how you're moving. I think everybody's got Chief Armstrong's email, cause it didn't change. Yes. Okay.
- Regina Jackson: Those are the two new Ad Hocs and we won't set up the other Ad Hoc that you asked for, Chief Armstrong, until further down the road. And I also recognize that there are a couple that are looming like social media and missing persons, so we want to be able to get to those just as soon as possible. Let's go ahead and take public comments.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you, Madam chair, if any member of the public wishes to comment on item 14 in tonight's agenda, please raise your hand in the zoom queue. The first speaker on item 14 is Megan Steffen. Good evening, Ms. Steffen.
- Megan Steffen: Good evening. I'm going to make it to midnight, just like a good Chinese person, since it's a lunar new year. Okay, so thank you all so much for making this item. I really appreciate it and I think that it gives the public a really good idea of what you all are working on. I do have some questions. The first question is whether or not it would be possible to honor the work of former commissioners, members of the public, and members of OPD, who also work on these commissions by listing them here so that people know exactly who's working on each of these committees.
- Megan Steffen: And my second question is, whether or not, some of these committees should be turned into standing committees and be more public because it appears that they need to be more permanent. I'm thinking especially of the Rules of Procedures Ad Hoc committee, which I think



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

February 11, 2021

has existed for a long time, and it feels like you all will have a need for that for much longer. I have more thoughts, but thank you.

Juanito Rus: Thank you, Ms. Steffen. The next speaker in the queue is Joseph Mente. Good evening, Mr. Mente.

Joseph Mente: Can you hear me?

Juanito Rus: You have the floor.

Joseph Mente: Very briefly. I just wanted to echo the appreciation of having these report outs. I think it really does build trust with the community. Thank you.

Juanito Rus: Thank you, Mr. Mente. The next speaker in the queue is a telephone attendee, last four digits 5802, that is Mr. Saleem Bey. Good evening, Mr. Bey.

Saleem Bey: Yes. Good evening. Saleem Bey. I wanted to comment on the actual pay independent investigation Ad Hoc committee and how it was hijacked by Mr. Alden, who was never supposed to have any type of connection to that and yet we found out that Mr. Alden has been speaking for us in our Ad Hoc at the city council and everything. Based on the fact that the whole reason why there's an independent investigation is because of Mr. Alden's employees, Ms. Karen Tom and Ms. [inaudible 05:46:39] who found different from the IAD investigation. So they found it unsustainable and IAD found it sustained. So I just want to make sure that Mr. Alden, who's never had a connection to it, shouldn't be representing our case in any way, shape or form. That's all I want to say.

Juanito Rus: Thank you, Mr. Bey. The next speaker in the queue is Assata Olugbala. Good evening Ms. Olugbala

Assata Olugbala: Good evening sir. There has to be some creation of an outreach committee. At this point, and for a long time, the participants of community members are not sufficient impacted community members. And we have people who were scholarly, who are mostly white that participate in these meetings. We need to get more of the black and brown community participating. And I still say, you need to work at getting language because we have a diverse language community of Spanish, Arabic, Hmong, Mandarin. And I see it at the school, and that mess about people can call you in a couple of days, five days before, that's not going to work. We got to find a way to build inclusion of people who are directly impacted. And right now we don't have that. We don't have it and we need it. It's absolutely necessary.

Juanito Rus: Thank you, Ms. Olugbala. The next speaker in the queue as a telephone attendee with the last four digits 9997. Good evening 9997

9997: Hi, can you hear me okay?

Juanito Rus: You have the floor.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

February 11, 2021

- 9997: I think that the commission really needs to reconsider how it's been doing Ad Hocs. I think, this last Ad Hoc, these last sets of Ad Hocs, the way they were rolled out, the way community members were invited, the entire idea of community representation and how that occurs and whether it's a good faith or genuine community representation, and then substituting transparency for community representation and thinking those two things are the same, has not been working. And I think that this last really large discussion shows that it created a worse outcome, less trust and more conflict. So I would hope before you declare two new Ad Hocs, that you sit down and have some rules about putting out the draft policies as they're created while also having a more rigorous way of defining what the community is before you invite community in as representation.
- Juanito Rus: Your time has expired. Thank you. At this time. I see no other hands in the queue Madam chair.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you very much. So the next item is agenda setting. We should have the resolution on the next agenda. We should have an action plan from our retreat to present at the next meeting. Are there other suggestions of things that should be on the next meeting agenda? From the commissioners?
- David Jordan: The resolution that we discussed earlier tonight should be on the...
- Regina Jackson: Yes. Yeah, exactly. Thank you. So I will go back and... Did I see Gage? Okay. Commissioner Gage. Commissioner Gage?
- Henry Gage, III: Thank you, chair. I believe Commissioner Harbin-Forte may be speaking to this, but I believe rules Ad Hoc will have an updated draft coming.
- Regina Jackson: Oh, great. Great. I'm sorry. I forgot about that one. Yes. Okay, excellent. Thank you. And certainly I'll be going back and trying to pick up. It might be time for another presentation from former Commissioner Harris on re-imagining. I will check in with her on that. And I know that we might be needing to schedule of training. I think commissioner Alden [inaudible 05:51:41], they'll talk about that. And I think there was another, the title is not concurrence with something else. Mr. Alden? Mr. Alden? I see your hand up, but I don't hear you. Okay. No worries. Why don't we go to public comment and then we can move this agenda forward.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you, Madam chair, if any member of the public wishes to comment on item 15 on tonight's agenda, please raise your hand in the zoom queue. First speaker on this item is Anne Janks. Good evening, Ms. Janks. You can unmute yourself. Ms. Janks, you've been lifted to the panel.
- Anne Janks: I'm so sorry. I really wanted to refrain from commenting to get you all out of here. I just really would urge you to add the less lethal and some of the other use of force topics that were never addressed in the use of force policy as it was passed. At the time that it was passed, we were assured that those items would be addressed in training bulletins and they would be addressed promptly. Every day, it immediately impacts members of our communities in terms of taser use,



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

February 11, 2021

handcuffing, et cetera. And I just think that they absolutely have to move to very close to the top of the list of things to address. Thank you.

Juanito Rus: Thank you, Ms. Janks.

Regina Jackson: Thank you very much, Ms. Janks. We've just got to figure out people's ability to commit to those things. I will definitely be scheduling them moving forward. [crosstalk 05:54:06]

Juanito Rus: There's one more speaker in the queue. I'm sorry Madam Chair.

Regina Jackson: Oh, I'm sorry.

Juanito Rus: That's okay. The next speaker in the queue is Assata Olugbala. Ms. Olugbala.

Assata Olugbala: Thank you, sir. I think I'm remembering correctly, that measure LL requires you to have, once a year, a town hall meeting. And I don't know if you've scheduled that or that you need to consider that. The other thing is I am very much interested in having the opportunity to hear from officers, not just tell them what to do, to hear response to what has been set forward with policies like use of force, [inaudible 05:54:50]. Listen to police officers. They have something to say, not all police officers are doing everything wrong and in some form of fashion to have an opportunity to hear the voice of those people who are putting their lives on the line and not to just automatically assume what they're doing.

Juanito Rus: Thank you, Ms. Olugbala. The next speaker in the queue is a telephone attendee with last four digits 5802, Mr. Saleem Bey. Good evening, Mr. Bey

Saleem Bey: Yes, Saleem Bey. Chair, I'm just going to read you these last couple of texts between yourself and I, and it said the chief admitted that OPD IAD closed IEP 13.10.62 investigation of my brother Waajid's case with no case files to investigate. Because OPD conveniently discovered Waajid Bey files were stolen by an ex OPD officer Brock who was subject to 13.10.62 investigation after it was closed. That means it's stealing the files meant that there was no investigation. Your answer chair was, "I have no answer as of yet. I will push because an outer agency inquiry should be done in order to bring that investigation to a responsible close." That's a criminal investigation. That's separate from the Ross investigation that's going on right now, which is an administrative investigation. We need a criminal investigation of why OPD is connected to the murder of my brother.

Juanito Rus: Thank you, Mr. Bey. And that was the last speaker on this item. Madam chair.

Regina Jackson: Thank you very much. We don't have any action on this agenda. The next item is adjournment. Would someone like to move? I see Commissioner Gage's hand. Nobody wants to adjourn?

Sergio Garcia: I second.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

February 11, 2021

Regina Jackson: Thank you very much. It has been moved by Commissioner Cage, seconded by Garcia, and we don't have to take public comment. Can we just vote to go? Commissioner Dorado?

Dorado: Aye.

Regina Jackson: Commissioner Gage?

Henry Gage, III: Yes.

Regina Jackson: Garcia?

Sergio Garcia: Aye.

Regina Jackson: Harbin-Forte?

Brenda Harbin-Forte: Aye.

Regina Jackson: Jordan?

David Jordan: Oh yes.

Regina Jackson: Thank you. And yes for me, Jackson. Well, thank everybody for vigorous conversation. It is now 11:26 and we have much work to do before now and the next meeting. I want to thank you all for voting both myself and vice chair Dorado in as your new leadership. We'll be working together and reporting out. And again, welcome to our newest commissioner Peterson and certainly welcome to our police chief Armstrong. You all get home safe or maybe you are home, sorry, and take care. Thank you so much, everyone. Bye-bye.

From: [Jennifer Tu](#)
To: [Regina Jackson](#); [Henry Gage, III](#); [David Jordan](#); [Jose Dorado](#); [Sergio Garcia](#); [Brenda Harbin-Forte](#); [Tyfahra Singleton](#)
Cc: [Love, Christine \(Chrissie\)](#)
Subject: e-Comment Agenda Item 11: Feedback on Militarized Equipment Ad Hoc Committee - proposed training bulletin
Date: Tuesday, February 9, 2021 10:06:47 PM

[EXTERNAL] This email originated outside of the City of Oakland. Please do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and expect the message.

Dear Chair Jackson, Commissioner Gage, Alternate Commissioner Jordan, members of the Police Commission,

I am a resident in District 3, and I am very disappointed in the Militarized Equipment Ad Hoc Committee training bulletin that was released a few hours ago, to be voted on Thursday evening.

I attended and spoke at the January 11 public forum, and heard the unanimous message from all public speakers that the Bearcat is a traumatic experience, especially for our Black & brown neighbors in the flatlands. We even had a teenager share his experience of what happened when the Bearcat was used against his family. I can't believe this young man had to take time out on a school night to share his family's traumatic experience!

At the January 11 forum, both Chair Jackson, Commissioner Gage, and Committee Member Anne Jenks noted that the community is clear we want to ban use of the Bearcat. Commissioner Gage noted that it could be possible to create a policy that excludes the Bearcat, but allows for the armored Suburban. Committee Member Omar Farmer offered technical expertise for how to make that happen.

I do not see any of that intent in the training bulletin that is included for discussion in Thursday's meeting! This training bulletin appears to allow for both the Bearcat and the armored Suburban, and does not distinguish when the armored SUV should be used instead of the Bearcat. This is the opposite of what several members of the Ad Hoc noted they heard from the public, and could be done!

I am so disappointed that the Ad Hoc held a public forum to solicit input, multiple members clearly stated the message they heard from the public, and then the policy that was created does not reflect that feedback at all.

Members of the Police Commission, this Oakland resident asks you to vote AGAINST approving the training bulletin in Agenda Item 11. It is not representative of public feedback, and does not reduce harm to our community.

Thanks very much for your time, and for your public service on this committee.

Sincerely,

Jennifer Tu
Oakland District 3

Love, Christine (Chrissie)

From: Megan Amanda Steffen <[REDACTED]>
Sent: Thursday, February 11, 2021 3:25 PM
To: Love, Christine (Chrissie)
Subject: Petition for tonight's Police Commission meeting
Attachments: Petition to Retire OPD's paramilitary BearCat_281 signatures.pdf

[EXTERNAL] This email originated outside of the City of Oakland. Please do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and expect the message.

Ms. Love:

Attached is a petition from 26 organizations, 2 Reimagining Public Safety Task Force members, 16 Reimagining Public Safety Task Force Advisory Board Members, and 281 other individuals that addresses item 11 in tonight's Police Commission meeting.

I would appreciate it if you could please submit this as part of the record for tonight's meeting. Thank you so much.

Sincerely,
Megan Steffen

Love, Christine (Chrissie)

From: Mary Vail [REDACTED]
Sent: Thursday, February 11, 2021 4:25 PM
To: Love, Christine (Chrissie)
Cc: grinage, rashidah; Mariano Contreras
Subject: My public comment for 2/11/21 Police Commission meeting

[EXTERNAL] This email originated outside of the City of Oakland. Please do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and expect the message.

- 1) Military equipment : I urge the Commission, up-front, to de-commission the Department's Bearcat. There is no good reason postpone a vote on this issue until the Commission and OPD finish process of adopting a general policy on military weapons.
- 2) The new police chief: I was hopeful when Chief Armstrong committed, elevated the issues of cultural change, accountability and NSA compliance. I will be watching as he builds his leadership team. Cultural change won't happen if the Chief includes on his leadership team any OPD supervisors who were involved in the rap scandal investigation/cover-up, the Pawlik shooting investigation, involvement in any NSA compliance issue that has drawn criticism from the Monitoring team or any employment decision characterized as racially discriminatory by the BPOA. Given the latest (2020) chapter in OPD's serial history of deviating from the law and its own crowd control policies (and being sued again), I don't think any OPD supervisor involved in making very wrong decisions on crowd control should be part of the Chief's and the Department's upper management team.
- 3) I am gratified to learn that the new internal investigations include a separate one concerning posts by current OPD employees posting comments critcising OPD reforms and policies relating to use of force, body camera use and rules with the purpose of preventing racial profiling. Same goes for Judge Orrick's comment that such posts go to the heart of the NSA and particularly to OPD's culture and his decision that the Court should/will do is own investigation of this matter..

Mary Vail

To: Oakland Police Commission members
February 11, 2021

As you consider the Oakland Police Department's revised policy for use of armored vehicles this Thursday, we strongly urge you to take action to retire OPD's paramilitary BearCat.

In addition, because OPD borrows BearCat vehicles from other police agencies and also has an armored Suburban SUV vehicle, we also urge you to act now to make the proposed Armored Vehicle Training Bulletin much more restrictive for BearCat deployments.

The streets of Oakland are not a combat field. Use of a military-style truck is not a proportional response to residential emergencies. The BearCat's presence strikes fear in the hearts of adults and children who experience it in operation. It triggers trauma for black and brown folks who live in the neighborhoods where it is most frequently used.

In 2018, Oakland police officers used the BearCat as a shooting platform to kill Joshua Pawlik, a homeless man sleeping on the ground with a firearm at his side. Five officers were fired and the City paid \$1.4 million to Mr. Pawlik's family. Oakland is now required by a federal court to create a new policy for armored vehicles. Yet, if the same situation occurred again, the policy before the Police Commission now would still authorize deploying the BearCat or a BearCat from another police agency.

The Armored Vehicles Training Bulletin before the Commission would authorize the Bearcat even if there is only "reasonable suspicion" of firearms use, a very low standard. The proposed Bulletin would not make the Bearcat a backup option to the armored SUV, even though the Suburban has sufficient ballistic protection. OPD officers have observed that the BearCat, acquired in 2008, is often in the repair shop, will not function much longer and that other options can be considered.

Oakland is currently reimagining how to achieve public safety for all residents. Although there is much we don't agree on, we are unified that militarizing police has not made us safer and that removing the tank-like BearCat from Oakland is a necessary step.

Sincerely,

ORGANIZATIONS

67 Suenos

Advancing Justice - Asian Law Caucus

American Civil Liberties Union of Northern California

American Friends Service Committee

Anti-Police Terror Project

BAY-Peace: Better Alternatives for Youth

Coalition for Police Accountability

CodePink Women for Peace, East Bay Chapter

Council on American-Islamic Relations, San Francisco Bay Area
Ella Baker Center for Human Rights
First Congregational Church of Oakland
Lighthouse Mosque
National Lawyers Guild - SF Bay Area
Oakland Neighbors Inspiring Trust
Oakland Privacy
Oakland Yard Wine Shop
Restore Oakland
Sarah Webster Fabio Center for Social Justice
Secure Justice
Seminary of the Street
Showing Up for Racial Justice (SURJ) Bay Area
Support Life Foundation
The Wellstone Club
United Native Americans
Urban Peace Movement
Youth ALIVE!

REIMAGINING PUBLIC SAFETY TASK FORCE AND ADVISORY BOARD MEMBERS

(Asterisk indicates organization is listed for identification purposes only)*

John Jones III, RPSTF Member, Just Cities*

Nikki Dinh, RPSTF Member

Eleanor Levine, RPSTF Budget and Data Advisory Board, Calls for Service Sub Group,
CodePink Women for Peace, East Bay Chapter

Omar Farmer, Legal & Policy and OPD Org & Culture Advisory Boards, Oakland Neighbors
Inspiring Trust

Tash H. Nguyen, Alternative Responses Advisory Board, Restore Oakland

Cheryl Fabio, OPD Org & Culture Advisory Board, Sarah Webster Fabio Center for Social
Justice

Gabriel Garcia, Legal & Policy Advisory Board, Youth ALIVE!

Maureen Benson, Data & Budget Advisory Board, Former Police Commissioner

Nicole Arlette Hirsch, OPD Org & Culture Advisory Board, Independent Consultant, UC Berkeley
Affiliated Scholar*

Robyn Levinson, Data & Budget Advisory Board

Paul Burton, OPD Org & Culture Advisory Board, District 2 Appointee, Pacific Media Workers
Guild, CWA 39521*

Leon Sykes, OPD Org & Culture Advisory Board

Megan Steffen, Legal & Policy Advisory Board

Heather Bromfield, Data & Budget Advisory Board

Joseph Mente, Data & Budget Advisory Board

Caitlin Tulloch, Data & Budget Advisory Board

INDIVIDUALS

(* Asterisk indicates organization is listed for identification purposes only)

Marcia Lovelace, 1st Congregational Church of Oakland, Genesis Community Organizing*

Dennis Fagaly, 1st Congregational Church of Oakland, Genesis Community Organizing*

Chika Okoye, Buddhist Peace Fellowship*

Morgan Curtis, Cantic Farm*

Cynthia Papermaster, CodePink Women for Peace*

D. Alwan, East Lake United for Justice*

Amber C. Straus, Eastlake United for Justice*

Kiernan Rok, Eastlake United for Justice*

Colin Miller, Environmental Justice Solutions*

Rev. Kurt A. Kuhwald, Faith Alliance for a Moral Economy*

Kate Vander Tuig, Futures Without Violence*

Penina Eilberg-Schwartz, IfNotNow*

Akintunde Ahmad, Imani Community Church*

Nancy Latham, Indivisible East Bay*

Liz Jacobs, Kehilla*

Annie Malcolm, Kehilla*

Suzi Goldmacher, Kehilla*

Lisa Young, Lake Shore Baptist*

AbdulKarriem A Khan, Lighthouse Mosque*

William Palmer, Life After Next*

Amelah, Lighthouse Mosque*

Allene Warren, League of Women Voters*

Alex B Webster Guiney, Oakland Unified School District*

Diane Dobson, Oakland Neighbors Inspiring Trust*

Kristine Wyndham, Parent/Educator*

Eulalea Cardenaz, SEneca Family of Agencies*

Ike Pinkston, The Frisco 5*

Kara Durand, TPMG*

Rachel Beck, Trinity Fellowship,* University Lutheran,* SURJ,* Decarcerate Alameda County*

Sydney Ji, UC Berkeley*

Eve Rodler, UC Davis*

MaryAnn Alvarado, Youth ALIVE!*

Ingrid Hogle, Berkeley Friends Meeting*

Sabrina Berger, Alameda County*

Meredith Bird, The Movement Cooperative*

Lauren M Gerber, Resident of Oakland since 1973

Xiadani Reyes-Cuevas, 67 Suenos

Evelyn Medina, 67 Suenos

Mohamed Taleb, Advancing Justice - Asian Law Caucus

Allyssa Victory, ACLU of Northern California

Camille Batiste, American Friends Service Committee

Nathaniel Phillipps, AFSC

Elyse Weiner, APTP

Leilani Salvador, BAY-Peace: Better Alternatives for Youth

Sameena Usman, Council on American-Islamic Relations, San Francisco Bay Area

Jose Bernal, Ella Baker Center for Human Rights

John Lindsay-Poland, AFSC

Kathryn Gilje, First Congregational Church of Oakland

Sara Kershner, National Lawyers Guild - SF Bay Area

James P Massar, Oakland Privacy

Julia Rhodes Davis, Oakland Yard Wine Shop

Jewel Jauregui, Oakland Neighbors Inspiring Trust

Ashley Claw, Restore Oakland

Brian Hofer, Secure Justice

Nichola Torbett, Seminary of the Street

Laura Wesely, SURJ Bay Area

Emily Zubritsky, SURJ Bay Area

Rachel Wilson, SURJ Bay Area

Elizabeth (Liz) Atkins-Pattenson, SURJ Bay Area*

Paul Kivel, SURJ Bay Area*

Steven Kanofsky, SURJ*

Jenny Tighe, SURJ*

Audrey Boochever, SURJ*
Joanna Cutrara, SURJ*
Winnie Ellerman, SURJ*
Lisa Dean, SURJ*
Jodi Becker, SURJ*
Laura Eberly, SURJ*
Christopher R Taaffe, SURJ*
Edward P Gronke, SURJ*
Charley Vallejo-Anderson, SURJ*
Eva Short, SURJ Bay Area*
Nancy Kurshan, SURJ Bay Area*
Eli Kaplan, SURJ Bay Area*
Sarah Freedman, SURJ Bay Area*
Michelle Maddex, SURJ Bay Area*
Jennifer Tilson, SURJ Bay Area*
Kelan Thomas, SURJ Bay Area*
Lianne Jones, SURJ Bay Area*
Holly Fincke, SURJ Bay Area*
Natalie Blackmur, SURJ Bay Area*
Dana Fallon, SURJ Bay Area*
Jennifer Pollack, SURJ Bay Area*
Ari Turrentine, SURJ Bay Area*
Albertina Prins, SURJ Bay Area*
Nicolas Dahlberg, SURJ Bay Area*
Connor Kelley, SURJ Bay Area* and Ella Baker
Center*
Morgan Prentice, SURJ Bay Area*
Sara Marshall, SURJ Bay Area*
Karin Ashley, SURJ Bay Area*
Gale Naylor, SURJ Bay Area
Debra Taube, SURJ Marin
Salah Elbakri, Support Life Foundation
Pamela Drake, The Wellstone Club
Quanah Brightman, United Native Americans
Sikander N. Iqbal, Urban Peace Movement
A Jenson
Cristina Graham
Barbara Atwell
Rosalyn Shyu
Dan Tonelli
Janani Ramachandran
Sammi Chan
Orion Davis
Kyle Chu

Lindsay Imai Hong
Hannah Smith
Leon Breckenridge
Jason Hill
Maria Navarro
Liz Smith
Lauren Barnum
Sarah Hartman
Nicole Shaffer
Alexandra Miano
Paula Te
Alice Grimm
Jessica Stern
Megan Hodapp
Mark Fritzel
Ingrid Shoemaker
Lindsey Frischer
Georgia Valentine
Kendall Allison
Frieda McAlear
Patrick Miller
Amy Whitehurst Morrison
Nicole Maguire
Adriana Galdos
Nadia Shihab
Savannah B Rogalski
Jo Hoffman
Timothy
Tasha Mente
Morgann Nieto
Jesse Mullan
Alexander Congrove
Aaron Parr
Emily
Ann WHIDDEN
Katie Funk
Jenny Miner
Kate Miles
nell scott
Amy Garlin
Althea Karwowski
Althea Karwowski
Jackie Hausman
Lisa Baggs

Kelly Knight
Althea Karwowski
Andrea Graeser
Monique Doryland
Laura Weide
Marcus Kryshka
Skylar McCormick
Tom Baker
Naushon Kabat-Zinn
Joanne Wong
Reisa Jaffe
Patti Beadles
Madeleine Taylor
Steven Sweeting
Sam Kober
Mark Olson
Mary Goss
Elizabeth Humphries
Amy Detrich
Rachael Devlin
rae
A.
Melanie Pflaster
Teresa Asma
Eve Fine
arielle usher
Melanie Pflaster
Jessica Gray
Melanie Pflaster
KL McGill
Clarissa Olivares
Sara Button
Alice Underwood
Jennifer Tu
Aaron Shifflett
Gregory Mengel
Janet Maughan
Nicole Gounalis
Ash Lynette
Orly raveh
Ruth Gerstle
Sabrina Wenske
Zoe
Alyssa Medilla

Kat Butchofsky
Dana Elliot
Zofia Burr
Tay Wolf
Brenda Lopez
Claudia Leung
Dana Elliot
Kelly Ding
Hoi-Fei Mok
Roman Rimer
Josie Ahrens
Forest Williams
Maria Kei Oldiges
Rory Woods
Charles Bowden
Elana Jacobs
shana kim
shana kim
Alec Nicholson
Brenda Lopez
Emma Rutland
Mike DeVito
Rebecca Selin
Casey McAlduff
Marge Sussman
Shawn Lee
Natasha Baker
Kim Robinson
Charlotte McGoldrick
Jasmine Dawn Fallstich
Kevin Scott
Pamela Gidwani
Liz Kroboth
Angelica Jongco
Angela Fernandez
Shamieka P
Bianca DiPalma Woo
Melanie Berzon
Cayden Mak
Dylan Cooke
Alex Miller
Amber Akemi Piatt
Samantha
Becky Lai

Liliana Torpey
Tiffani Patton
Eileen Torrez
Pete Woiwode
Lolita Roibal
Morgan simon
Elana Jacobs
Tammy Chang
Edward Frank
Lorin King
Michael Geier
Debra Israel
Joan Cardellino
Charlotte McGoldrick
Molly Dow
Tashiana Colston
Kara Wood
Rebecca Faith Odedeyi
Samantha
Jme McLean
Olivia
Steven Jeram
Priya Kandaswamy

Amit Shoham
Jonathan Davis
Emily Breunig
Danielle Ancin
Susan Tonus
Bridget Harcey
Lucy Andrews
Nubia Aguilera
Meike Matarazzo
Karen M Shain
Nora Trentacoste
Matt Martin
Benjamin Sulit
Logan Dean
Gretchen Grathwohl
Geeta Makhija
Alana Black
Debra L Wills
Jamie Yang
Anita Tenley
Taytum Sanderbeck
Kaila Greenstein

For updates, see the live document here:

https://docs.google.com/document/d/1_4amJAMvMWmNbPzugirFjZ5J08RUumKeziLwKf5TOcc/edit?usp=sharing