



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 10, 2020

Regina Jackson: Hello and welcome to the December meeting for the Oakland Police Commission. This is chair Regina Jackson, and I'd like to call the meeting to order. It is 6:32 PM. Commissioner Dorado, are you here?

Jose Dorado: Presente.

Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Gage.

Henry Gage, III Present.

Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Garcia. Okay, Commissioner Harbin-Forte.

Brenda Harbin-Forte: Present.

Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Smith.

Thomas Lloyd Smith: Yes, Present.

Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Singleton.

Tyfahra Singleton: Present.

Regina Jackson: Terrific. Commissioner Garcia, I still don't see him. So maybe he's in an outer room. And then alternate Commissioner Jordan.

David Jordan: Present.

Regina Jackson: Excellent. Thank you very much. Okay. We do have a quorum. Thank you very much, Mr. Rus for the roll call. So if we can go ahead and move the agenda to the welcome and public comment. I send the meeting back to you, Mr. Rus.

Juanito Rus: Thank you, Madam Chair. We received zero written public comments prior to this meeting. If any member of the public would like to make a comment during the open forum public comment section, please raise your hand in the Zoom queue, and you will be called in the order in which your hands are raised. At this time I see one hand in the queue. Let me switch the timer, excuse me. The first-hand belongs to Assata Olugbala. Good evening, Ms. Olugbala, can you hear us?

Assata Olugbala: Yes, I can hear you. Thank you. I'd like for the commissioners to pay attention to the overtime agenda that's going to be presumed at later on, particularly the Lake Merritt patrol. \$6,640 were spent, and this year \$199,000 over that amount. And my point is this, a lot of effort has been put in to what's going on at Lake Merritt. A lot of black people. I was in the park and recreations meeting yesterday and they formed an ad hoc committee to come up with a plan to deal with the issue of black people around Lake Merritt. That plan was implemented by the advisory board



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 10, 2020

through the administration, open police department, an opened fire department, and the open transportation, and advisory board came up with a plan to deal with black people.

Juanito Rus: Thank you, Ms. Olugbala. The next speaker in the queue is a telephone attendee with the last four digits, 0185. Good evening, 0185. Can you hear us?

Michele Lazaneo: I can. This is Michele Lazaneo, spokesperson for the Bandabaila family. In 2019, Oakland had 78 homicides. OPD's 2018 annual report presented to city council stated the average caseload for investigators was 6.9. The recommended national average was five. The homicide section included 16 staff, including seven police officers. Under the section Challenges Encountered, OPD wrote, "The frequent transition of investigators transferring in and out of CID has limited the pool of qualified investigators to select for reassignment into the homicide section. Given the current staffing level homicide investigators will continue to be challenged by large caseload, ultimately looking against the potential effectiveness of a unit and wellbeing of the investigator burnout." If a homicide investigator challenged with a 6.9 cases is at risk of burnout, imagine that burnout for a detective assigned 761 missing persons cases annually. Imagine how the burnout and the understaffing undermines the effectiveness of each investigation. If Jonathan was your son, would a ratio of two officers for 1,523 cases be adequate? Of course not. We haven't been-

Juanito Rus: Thank you, Ms. Bandabaila. Your time has expired. The next speaker in the queue is listed as Jeybo. Good evening, Jeybo. Can you hear us?

John Bey: Yes. Are you able to hear me now?

Juanito Rus: We can hear you. You have one minute. Whenever you're ready.

John Bey: All right. Now this is actually John Bey and I would also like to speak to that budget for OPD, which is totally out of hand. And notice that we are coming up on what will now be the 18th year of federal oversight, which means 18 years of failure to comply with the law by Oakland Police Department. The mayor came in saying she wanted to staff up the police department. It's made no difference, it has definitely had no positive effect on the community. And what Michele had just spoken about is a reprehensible that there are so few people assigned permanently to missing persons. And like she said, imagine if Jonathan was your son, or brother, or even friend, or you don't even know him. It's ridiculous the way OPD handles these things, there's more about their failure.

Juanito Rus: Thank you, Mr. Bey. Your time has expired. The next speaker in the queue is a telephone attendee with the last four digits, 5802. Good evening, 5802. Can you hear us?

Saleem Bey: Yes. Good evening. This is Saleem Bey, and I'd like to echo the last two callers in calling out OTD in general, but the current chief, since she's being paid to do this job, of why the Missing Persons is not fully staffed. Why it's overburdened and set up to fail? The reason why is because the majority of people that are affected by missing persons are black people and people of color,



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 10, 2020

right? So OPD doesn't have that as a priority. One of the things that was just issued out here that's dated November 19th, 2020 is OPD is asking for approval for an unmanned aerial system and how that affects surveillance of black communities, especially since we know that license plate readers are going through communities at a higher rate that are black by OPD. Design man aerial [crosstalk 00:11:11] is supposed to be used for-

- Juanito Rus: Thank you Mr. Bey. Time has expired. Excuse me, I'm trying to communicate with Commissioner Garcia and let them know how to get into the meeting at the same time. The final speaker in the queue on this item is listed as CRC Allies and Accomplices. Good evening, CRC Allies and Accomplices. Can you hear us okay?
- Reisa Jaffe: Oh, I'm sorry. That's a wrong Zoom thing. I'm sorry that this is Reisa.
- Juanito Rus: That's okay.
- Reisa Jaffe: I accidentally logged in.
- Juanito Rus: We will list you as Ms. Jaffe, it's all right.
- Reisa Jaffe: Yes.
- Juanito Rus: You have one minute, whenever you're ready.
- Reisa Jaffe: Sorry about that. I'm like what's going on? But I'm multitasking. Yeah. So I'm hearing a lot around the defund and about police keeping us safe. And I have been asking for several years, for some proof that the police are actually keeping us safe. The police chief comes on here and reports crime statistics, but it doesn't come on here and actually show us how they're keeping us safe. So I'm asking you again, please use your power to get the police chief to show us how police are actually keeping us safe. I don't want to hear crime statistics. I want to see how they are actually doing the job that we are paying taxes for. Thanks a bunch.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you, Ms. Duffy. At this time, I see no other hands in the queue. Madam Chair, I will turn the meeting to you and keep my eye open for Commissioner Garcia.
- Regina Jackson: Okay. Thank you very much, Mr. Rus. And I understand that Commissioner Garcia is on Zoom. I cannot see his name in the panelists section, so I'm not exactly sure how to...
- Juanito Rus: If he's a telephone attendee and I only have his number, you can tell him to raise his hand in the queue and I'll move them over, and please don't everyone else.
- Regina Jackson: Okay. So now that you see one hand go up, that might be [crosstalk 00:13:53].
- Juanito Rus: That appears to be him.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 10, 2020

Regina Jackson: Thank you. If you can call on him so we can make sure that his attendance is recorded.

Juanito Rus: He should be on the panel.

Sergio Garcia: Thank you.

Regina Jackson: Oh, fabulous. Okay.

Sergio Garcia: I am on, thank you. Thank you both.

Regina Jackson: Thank you, Commissioner Garcia.

Sergio Garcia: I have been on since 6:25.

Regina Jackson: And my apologies for the struggle of getting through the traffic to be promoted to panelists. We're glad we got you now.

Sergio Garcia: Okay.

Regina Jackson: Okay, thank you. So next step would be the update from interim chief Manheimer. Chief Manheimer, are you here?

Chief Manheimer: Yes, ma'am. I am. Can you hear me all right.

Regina Jackson: Excellent. Yes, thank you.

Chief Manheimer: Thank you so much. I have four very quick items in the update. I'll try and go through them quickly tonight. Of course, we always do start out with the crime update. I will say that if you, Mr. Rus could have Paul Chambers share his screen.

Juanito Rus: I just promoted him so he can share.

Chief Manheimer: Very good. Madam Chair, we did have an exposure risk at the administrative wing this week, and we are all working somewhat remotely, which we are trying to get through. So if I'm a little awkward tonight with having people in many different spaces, we have three presenters here from the PD today to go over a couple of things around budget and overtime with you at the very end of this presentation. So-

Regina Jackson: Before you move on, in terms of the exposure, are the officers okay, or?

Chief Manheimer: Yes, yes. Overall it's interesting. We had 20 exposures and likely the whole first six months. And just recently we have seen a spike in our exposures as well, primarily from community contact. And we had one with CeaseFire where they were doing a call in and we had to cease that activity.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 10, 2020

The one up in our wing, they went negative the next day. So there were false positives, but it was a good drill for us to decontaminate. And it was it's always a very scary wake up call. So thankfully we actually ended up without having those as confirmed cases up in the admin wing. However, we're all still staying remote for this week and getting another test tomorrow, before we come back to the office just to practice our best safety and model what it is we're asking all of our employees to do.

Regina Jackson: Okay, thank you.

Chief Manheimer: Thank you for that. Very briefly, so we continue with a spike in our gunfire resulting in homicide shootings in our neighborhoods, as well as other assaults. And I want to just share with you. Unfortunately, we hit the wall, you'll see on the chart, it says 97 homicides, which is a significant increase of 47%. We are actually at 100 this week, a very tragic figure to make. We have not been at 100 since 2012. And my understanding, as you know I'm the interim here, is that over the past five years, we had significant and wonderful reductions of 50% of our gun crimes. However, during this pandemic and significantly in these last two quarters, we have seen this increase. Overall, our robbery numbers have dropped. However, I will say that just today, we did put out a warning for folks with safety tips on a trend we're seeing with an increase of street robberies and carjackings used to commit those robberies on the street.

Chief Manheimer: We've made a couple of good arrests on that, but we thought an important to put the safety tips out. So as you see, the gunfire is still showing increases across all our categories and the ShotSpotter. Paul, if I can ask you to go right to the ShotSpotter, I think that map, now we do put this out and I know... Paul, can you scroll it up a little bit or there we go. Good, thank you. A little bit more, keep going, keep going. Very good. So this is the map that we put up weekly. Members, community members, anyone can go in, they can zoom in on these maps. We have them by beat as well. We do not give out the exact locations, that's proprietary to ShotSpotter, but also it's sort of a privacy awareness issue, but we do have this for the community so that they can zoom in and know the 100 block at any location where we do have the ShotSpotter, and we do hear, and I'm sure you all hear as well, the significant increase in those, not just the amount of areas, but the amount of shots in any one area.

Chief Manheimer: I will say that we've recovered over 1,155 guns this year. 918 of those relate specifically to crime, and that's a 41% increase over last year, but I'm really devastated to tell you that we're seeing more and more guns still out on the street. And we'll tell you in a few minutes, some of what we've been doing to counteract that, and just end with the fact that residential and commercial burglary incidents are seeing an increase in the commercial burglaries. And at least we've seen a decrease in residential burglaries as people, as you know, are more at home, particularly with the new shelter in place orders that we've had. So I want to go now and let you know, and it's very interesting that one of your commenters in public session has said, we hear a lot from the chief about crime and how it is in our community. We are very focused on that, as you know.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 10, 2020

Chief Manheimer: This is a huge spike in crime that our community's experiencing throughout the city, but I wanted to start today and let you know of what we are doing on the other side of that. You've heard we've recovered 1,155 guns. I mean, that's a significant, significant operation. And so what we did, and assistant chief, Alison, who will be presenting the overtime report to you in a few minutes, he is on the phone. He is in charge of all of our crime operations at CeaseFire and has all of the bureau chiefs and all of the units under him. He called in late August for a 60-day violence reduction plan. It was actually, I have to tell you, a 30-day violence reduction plan in which we made so many arrests, but recognized that a lot of those who we knew were active shooters because of the zero bail and the threat of COVID and the jail, were not staying in.

Chief Manheimer: And so we prolonged that to a 60-day violence reduction effort. And in that we really targeted simply those who were most involved in gun crime through a crime gun intelligence center and sort of the CeaseFire operations with our violence interrupters. We tried to divert folks away first, as we always do and call them to put down their guns. But if they do not, these are some of the results of that 60-day plan. We had a total arrests of 96 and they were 16 people for murder, 13 people for attempted murder, 11 assaults with a deadly weapon, and 41 for firearms offenses. And I know it's a small picture down there, but if you can see it, you'll note... Oh, here we go. Thank you, Paul. Actually, Paul, if you could go back to that first picture, I wanted to show it and it is very small, but in the bottom left corner, you'll see those rounds that almost look like they're sort of a nozzle.

Chief Manheimer: Yeah, you're pointing to them right now. What they are are they're drums that have about 50 to a 100 rounds in them and they can click right into just a handgun. And that's why we're hearing on the ShotSpotter rounds of 50 to 100. There's also the automatic assault rifles and automatic assault weapons. But this is something that has become very significant for us, are the amount of gun drums. So during this time span, as I said, we recovered over \$102,000 in cash. And we really want to recognize some of our law enforcement partners who helped us because we could not do this on our own. Crime is very regional right now. And we need to make sure that they understand they cannot do this on our streets in Oakland, particularly in our neighborhoods. I wanted to bring that to you and I wanted to assure you.

Chief Manheimer: We were going to go out with a large sort of press briefing on this and putting out the names of individuals. But frankly, we recognize that we're barely stemming the tide in gun crimes. If you can imagine the amount of efforts we took. We met with our justice partners, the DA, the sheriff, the probation chief, and the presiding judge. And we got a commitment that if we really only focus on those who will not lay down their guns, and we can prove the shooting targets and the shooters, then they are working with us to ensure that they do get a timeout off the streets. So we are working on another plan, which will again, include our partners. And I have some confidence that we're going to continue to be out there. One thing that's worked very well, especially out in Area 5, is that we've put our large command post van out there.

Chief Manheimer: And we are getting some more opportunity of recognition for our presence. Because our presence really makes that difference, we just don't have enough of that presence to go around in all the



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 10, 2020

neighborhoods. So that's my report on crime and what we're doing about it. As I said, our next plan will come to you before it goes out to the public, and I'll share that with you. I am excited, just changing the scene a little bit and to let you know, our 185th Police Trainee Academy begins next Monday. We are very concerned about, of course, COVID the Sheriff's Office had to actually pause their Academy. We are going to do it differently. We are going to have testing on site for them. We are going to split them up in different rooms and sort of start working on our virtual training. So we'll see how that goes. But I want to share that we're excited that there's a good demographic mix going here to have female at 19-20% is pretty exciting. Females are traditionally only about 11-12% in law enforcement.

Chief Manheimer: If this holds, and with mentors around this time, I hope it will hold, that's a good mix of male-female for our profession. By race, we have a really good, I'll say majority of minorities, and you can see the breakdown right there. We do have an effort of [foot 00:25:27] right now, as you know, Chair Jackson, to really focus on African-American females. And we are working hard on that. There's the educational breakdown for those of you who have a question about that. We have a really nice mix of education, and I think that's always important, not only just for a broader lens, but it also means that they're a little bit older and more mature. And bringing that in life experience this job is really beneficial and important. It's interesting, 19% of our POTs speak a second language.

Chief Manheimer: Here are some of those languages and they are always a benefit to us so that we can communicate in our native tongue and have cultural competency with our different, very diverse Oakland community. Oakland connection, 21% born in Oakland, 21% current residents, and as you know, that is another focus that we really want to get back to strong Oakland residents. We do have three black female applicants. We are really focused in, on providing the mentorship and getting them not only through this Academy, but really ensuring their sustainability within the department. So that concludes my report to you. And I will brief you and keep you updated as we go along for that. As a female in policing myself, I can tell you that going through the Academy, having never picked up a gun, not gotten to a lot of fights, it was very different for me in the training and having mentors truly helped with that.

Chief Manheimer: So Madam Chair, before I move into our presentation of the night on the overtime report that we've already presented to the finance committee and we'll present next week to the full council, I wanted to share with you that we request an item upcoming on the agenda for when you so determine you'd like to hear it on the calls for service analysis that we have hired a very noted consulting firm, to conduct for the re-imagining policing project. We did release data to the re-imagining committees, but this will actually be a very in-depth look at what potential for alternatives for service, percentages of those calls, et cetera.

Chief Manheimer: So if you all have an interest, please let me know and feel free to agendize that we will be presenting it to the committee. And I'd love to get it in front of you all early on in that process. Would you like me to move into the presentation around budget? We tried to get it agendized I'm not sure if it was. But the information is in your pack and on both the city's budget presentation



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 10, 2020

that they will be giving Monday at council, as well as our overtime report that I really wanted to spend a little time sharing with you all. So up to you, Madam Chair, if you'd like us to move right into that, or take a pause here for any questions on the other items.

Regina Jackson:

Thank you, Chief Manheimer. I actually would like to take a pause and allow commissioners to ask any questions. I personally want to say that in terms of the demographics, I very much appreciate reading what I read, given the fact that previously, I think we've heard that only 9% of officers are actually residents of Oakland. To see that current class being 21% is very impressive. And as you know, I have been a stickler on black females as they had not been part of, or actually able to complete if they were a part of a class for the last seven classes. So to see three, I am really, really hoping that we have three that actually graduate. And then I see a hand from Commissioner Garcia. And I would also like to ask a different question around the crime. I want to understand if we think there might be any retaliation, but I'm going to defer to Commissioner Garcia and then he is followed by Commissioner Gage. Commissioner Garcia?

Sergio Garcia:

Thank you. Thank you, Madam Chair. And thank you, Chief Manheimer for that very detailed report. The demographic mix is encouraging. I wanted to drill down in a couple of areas, one is on the educational background. Can you give us some color, a little more detail on what percentage of folks who have degrees either BAs or Masters have mental health or related degrees?

Chief Manheimer:

What we encourage, and we have a lot of our folks that we encourage, and that our cadets that are in our pipeline or come to us seeking application, to get their education first. And we always tell them, "Do not major in criminal justice or in law enforcement. We want you to get into the social sciences and broaden your horizons as much as you can to understand people and culture and history. So I can find that out for you. I hope I can find that out for you, I don't have it right now. I do think and that I hear a lot, there's psychology, there's social services, and social sciences, because this is really a people profession. But I don't want to mislead you, so I will tell you that I will get that information and share it with you next time. It's a really, really, really high degree, and I'm really pleased with that.

Sergio Garcia:

Thank you, thank you for that. I have one additional question. As Madam Chair pointed out, it is encouraging that 21% of folks in the Academy reside in Oakland. Can you give us more detail perhaps later on where the other 79% reside. That is, do they reside in adjacent cities or faraway towns or other counties? I think that might be useful as well.'

Chief Manheimer:

We actually have all of that and I can get that for you. What I have noticed, as you know, this is this is my third department as the interim here, usually when you're sitting on your hiring panels, they will apply for many, many departments. There's a lot of individuals who apply just here because they are interested in Oakland, have a connection to, were born in Oakland, or whatever. So there is a lot of Oakland centric applications here, which I think is good. We absolutely have that in-depth demographics, and what I think I'll do Madam Chair, if you want this, is I can just forward that as an informational memo from our recruitment staff.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 10, 2020

- Chief Manheimer: And I really want to recognize Lieutenant Aaron Smith, also President of the Black Officers Association, but in our training and hiring. And what he has done this last two classes is given our [Hiller Hind 00:00:33:08] study. He has constructed a blind, an anonymizing process wherein all the hiring panels all the way up through the executive chief staff do not know race, sex, demographics, where they're from, and/or what any other affiliations are. And so it's something we are committed to, and it's a nice balance right there. So I'll get you a more in-depth, and if anyone has any other questions, feel free to email me or through the Chair, and I can just get you a report. But Lieutenant Smith and Chief Drennon Lindsey through our internal race and equity team have really, really developed some nice pipelines with some of the local schools and our cadet classes. So I think I didn't have it in here, but a few of these are cadets including one that actually worked in the chief's office for a while. So it is really nice to be able to have a firm team because that is really our local kids who come up for our schools and through the city and know the city and have ownership.
- Regina Jackson: Excellent. Thank you very much. And will you also have an average age as well since you mentioned that some are older?
- Chief Manheimer: Yes, absolutely [inaudible 00:34:38]
- Regina Jackson: Terrific. We do have some follow-up questions, Commissioner Gage first and then Commissioner Harbin-Forte. Commissioner Gage.
- Henry Gage, III: Thank you, chair. Through the chair to Chief Manheimer, I have a concern to raise with you that I believe you'd be sympathetic to. I have observed and continue to hear reports of Oakland police officers who are not observing what I would believe to be our proper mask wearing protocols. Now, there's a number of corollary issues that arise from this sort of concern. Most obvious would be the health and welfare of your staff, as I'm sure you're aware of given this most recent exposure. I am also concerned that the Oakland Police Department could become inadvertently the disease vector for the county. And as you're also likely aware, our county and our region are unable to sustain any sort of substantial increase in the number of exposures or ICU beds that are needed for patients who are undergoing ventilation. I would appreciate if you would make sure that your line officers are aware of the need to wear mask, that they continue to wear mask, not just for their own safety, but for the safety of all of us.
- Chief Manheimer: Thank you so much. This is an increasing source of frustration and thankfully it's a very small... I think as this went along, we started escalating the sanctions and now we're up to full discipline any of those who do not have their masks on. So there are times folks will get out of the car, they may jump out of the car, but when you're on a fixed post, when you're engaging with the public, I am not only sympathetic, sir, but I am absolutely we are now enacting disciplinary measures with anyone without their mask within or without the building.
- Regina Jackson: Commissioner Gage.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 10, 2020

- Henry Gage, III: Thank you chair. I have nothing further.
- Regina Jackson: Okay. Very good. And Chief Manheimer, I think I mentioned to you I was involved in a pretty bad car accident in October, and when the police officer came up to me they did not have a mask on and I did announce myself as a commissioner and she went right back and got her mask. But I'm hoping that these recent rash of exposures is making very clear that this is not something that you can mess with. The engagement with individuals is really important, but we need everybody on the force available to serve. So thank you for that update. Commissioner Harbin-Forte.
- Brenda Harbin-Forte: Thank you, chair. Chief, I want to go back to the academy, the demographics, the second language. Did I overlook Spanish or there are no Spanish listed?
- Regina Jackson: It's actually not listed, which I thought was interesting.
- Chief Manheimer: Oh my goodness. It's not there, but it's clearly, there's, an awful lot of Spanish speakers, not only in our department, but in this class. That's interesting that it is not listed. Yes
- Regina Jackson: [inaudible 00:38:16] Oh, my God really that perfect [inaudible 00:38:19]
- Chief Manheimer: I will correct that one there for sure. We have Spanish speakers.
- Brenda Harbin-Forte: Thank you.
- Chief Manheimer: Yes.
- Regina Jackson: Okay. Let's see. And we have a question from Commissioner Dorado.
- Jose Dorado: Thank you, Chair Jackson. And thank you, Commissioner Harbin-Forte for bringing that up. Just a couple of quick comments. One is that I had requested the contract, both the original and the current ShotSpotter contract. So I can educate myself about the particulars of the program. So I just wanted folks to know that. And the second is that we will be meeting again, as soon as we can arrange our schedules to continue our conversation around white supremacy. And I just wanted to let folks know that's still an ongoing discussion and particularly because they're not seems there is in fact, a rising tension, unfortunately because our Donald Trump will not concede.
- Jose Dorado: And so his followers that subscribed to the possibility and there is none that he will be able to somehow win this election that he lost handily. We'll take some action when in fact they've run out of options, but there are a number of his followers who still do not believe that he lost, and there are a number of them armed that say they will never accept the valid results of the president elect Biden. So all of this, there's a growing concern. And I'd like to see that addressed in, in our, in our conversation. So I appreciate the opportunity to bring those two points up. Thank you.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 10, 2020

Chief Manheimer: Thank you, sir. And as you know, we are out of the office this week, though, working very hard and we will follow through with you. I actually was speaking with a couple of our labor associations today. The Black Officers Association or Asian Peace Officers Association and Latino Peace Officers Association, along with our POA. They are going to be meeting with a couple of the commissioners and they look forward to having some dialogue around that issue at that time as well. So I think that's another venue besides our followup on the external piece of it own. So I welcome that and I look forward to it and we'll follow up.

Jose Dorado: Thank you.

Regina Jackson: Okay. If there are no additional questions from commissioners Chief Manheimer, you feel free to proceed to the next component of your report.

Chief Manheimer: Okay, they're very good. And I do have a couple of questions chair that you did forward me. I'm really glad that we were able to get this on the agenda tonight. As you know, we did move forward to the city council just last Monday to their subcommittee on the budget. And so we are going to give you a short report that we will be giving to city council it's already out in your packet. And so I felt comfortable putting it in your packet. Our hope is to get these things that are police centric, that come up to city council to you all as well and as much in advance. So you'll have a good understanding of them and any issues around them that you would like to specifically address. So just very briefly to set the stage and bring up our Assistant Chief Allison, who will give you the first part of the update that we envisioned to be around the police department overtime, how it's funded, how it's addressed, what it goes to serve in terms of services.

Chief Manheimer: And then we're going to bring on a Chief Armstrong to discuss a little bit around the question around the 25 top earners. I did get a couple of questions Chair Jackson from you in advance, and we'll speak to those. I will set the stage to just let you know that the City of Oakland just had such a complicated first quarter or last quarter report. The first of the COVID related financial quarters that they wanted to wait and see how the second quarter went thinking as we all did that COVID would at some point be over by now and that the city would recalibrate their finances a little bit. Unfortunately as we all know now, not only did that not happen, but the fiscal freight train is just really coming down hard, not just obviously on the city, on every city in the entire country, but also on small businesses and in our community, the informational report that the city put out detailed the projections and looks at the fact that there is a significant shortfall of around \$30 million for the last fiscal year, which is added to for this fiscal quarter.

Chief Manheimer: So the primary reasons that the city gave in their informational report, and this is city overall city budget, the devastating impact of COVID-19 and the shelter in place since March of 2020, which necessitated actions to both curb the transmission saw a very great, great decrease in the ability of our businesses, small and large to operate in our city and like cities and counties across the country. It's severely weakened Oakland's economy and city revenues, and appears likely to have continued impacts. The city has talked about in its first report and what we are going to focus on tonight, the significant increase spending is attributed to our non-reimbursable overtime. It was



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 10, 2020

35 million at the end of the last fiscal year. Our informational report, which we are going to present to you was attached to the city's report. And as they mentioned every year, as the city auditor concluded in her 2019 report on overtime, which she does every year, the police overtime budget continued to be underfunded, not taking into account the historical spending patterns, which, we've gotten into a lot of other issues, which a Chief Allison will share with you.

Chief Manheimer: But I just wanted to set up a little bit where the city is. So you'll understand some of the reasons why we're focusing in right now on the police overtime. So without any further ado, I'd like to hand it over now to Assistant Chief Darren Allison, who is sort of our head of staffs, both the budget, but also our operations. So he's going to be a great person to connect two together for you. And then of course, we'll take questions after his presentation. And Chief Armstrong will speak a little bit to the 25 top earners in that question, and I'll move it forward with Chief Allison.

Assistant Chief Allison: Thank you, chief. Can you hear me, chief.

Chief Manheimer: We got you.

Assistant Chief Allison: All right. Perfect. All right. Good evening Chair Jackson commissioners. Thank you very much for this opportunity to discuss the department's use of overtime. My name is Darren Allison, the assistant chief. I will be going through the attached overtime report memorandum that was included with the packet and the areas I'm going to touch on is some of the reasons why we've exceeded our budget for not only the fourth quarter of fiscal years, 2019, 2020, but as well as the first quarter of 2020 and 2021, I'll talk a little bit at some of the structural shortfalls the deficiencies that occur or that exist, that help drive some of the overtime spending as well as cover the non-discretionary and discretionary overtime that we have broken up not only over those two fiscal years, but as we look at the overtime expenditures from fiscal year to fiscal year, one of the things I want to start out by saying is the police department is a service industry.

Assistant Chief Allison: And the initiatives we engage in that money, we spend the allocation of resources is driven towards our request for service expectations from our community leaders our community, as well as our government leaders. And as we look to adjust, spending or impact overtime, the question that we always have to ask ourselves at the department is what services do we need to reduce or what services don't we do anymore? And that's always a question that needs to be asked and answered in collaboration with not only the city, but even more importantly, the community. Some of the reasons why just as the start off that we've had additional spending beyond our budgeted overtime in the fourth and first quarters of this report include a number of factors. Some of which were actually covered this evening as of November 29th, and throughout the entire year, we've seen a marked increase in homicides and shootings.

Assistant Chief Allison: As the chief indicated, we are currently at 100 homicides, we've seen a 64% increase in assaults with a deadly weapon involving a firearm, which has brought us into well over 400 compared to a approximately 250 the previous year, these dramatic increases in violence have resulted in initiatives and strategies really pushed through and funded by overtime to try and stem the cycle



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 10, 2020

and course of violence, as well as to support investigations into those violent occurrences. I know it was mentioned early in a meeting that we've had exceedingly large vacancies throughout the organization. This includes our CID, which we are working to fill many of those vacancies actually within these next month or so with our watch change. But even then with the capacity of our staff that exists now, department-wide as well as the level of workload, a lot of the work that's being done to address violence and investigate violence runs into the overtime category and is a certain driver of overtime.

Assistant Chief Allison: Crowd management is another driver of overtime between April and September. We spent approximately \$3.78 million to facilitate demonstrations to address different marches, whether it was through traffic control or safety presence, or to just facilitate demonstrations in general. That was something that really uptick at the end of May continued through June and July and August, and was another key driver of our spending. In some demonstrations, we've saw thousands of demonstrators arrive to protest the murder of George Floyd. And we used resources to facilitate those demonstrations. And in some cases where individuals and opportunists attempted to hijack many of the peaceful demonstrations and enact riotous and violent activity, we use those same resources to bring peace and try and minimize impact. And we also noted during those events, we saw certainly widespread vandalism through several locations in Oakland, not only downtown, but East Oakland as well. And so that money spent was geared towards those demonstrations and those crime opportunists that spun out from individuals from those demonstrations, another driver overtime with sideshow. Sideshow has been around in Oakland, as long as I can remember going back my 25 years with the city.

Assistant Chief Allison: What we've seen with sideshow over the more recent years is as something that has not really slowed down. It used to be primarily driven through the summertime, but we have seen starting as early as either early spring or late winter, and continue on certainly even to around now and to fall beginning of winter and say it's gone from just a seasonal approach to almost a year round approach. And a lot of our sideshow activities end up in serious collisions involving serious injuries, or hindrance as well as violence, possession of firearms, individuals, discharging firearms, with some cases, shootings. And so to enact public safety and our ensure public safety and try and manage that activity throughout the year. We have dedicated resources every Saturday and Sunday to come into the department on over... Come into the city on overtime and attempt to bring peace to many of affected neighborhoods.

Assistant Chief Allison: And just over this time period, particularly from July to September, we spent approximately \$2 million to address the sideshow. Something that's also a very impactful and precipitates overtime is vacancies. We've had an attrition of about 60 sworn personnel and professional staff, which contributes to openings throughout the organization, not only in patrol, but other units, either investigative units or units like Ceasefire or CRT that are geared to addressing violence, which would require backfill. We've spent approximately \$3.36 million again between July and September to fill these gaps through the attritted vacancies. And currently, as we sit right now, I know the report says 47 sworn vacancies. We actually have 54 as I'm sitting here today and a 64 professional staff vacancies. And again, so that money is spent to try and fill those gaps for very



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 10, 2020

specific public safety, operational purpose. And I'll talk a little bit about service demands in the next section, but again, the vacancies certainly hurt our ability to perform a lot of our services.

Assistant Chief Allison: On top of our attrited vacancies are just are positional vacancies. We also have additional vacancies perpetual whereby extended leaves of absence. This could be due to injuries. It could be due to other matters that could involve administrative leave or sick leave, or even now under the pandemic, if individuals have to go into a quarantine or a recovery period, those vacancies are impacted as well. And as of December 2nd, we had 35 sworn additional on top the regular vacant unfilled positions and additional 13 professional staff on extended leave. So when you add those numbers together, particularly if you look at the sworn side, we're close to 90 positions that are not being filled for normal duties, again for patrol, investigations, violence, or crime reduction, and those units that are geared towards service and public safety.

Assistant Chief Allison: And I mentioned it again already COVID certainly has had an impact. We've had 41 confirmed cases as of November 17th, that number is actually much higher with the recent string of outbreaks. And every time we have a confirmed case that takes not only the officer who are the precious staff member who's affected or this positive offline for a couple of weeks, but if there is direct contact or exposure to other staff, it could take them out of play and offline for prescribed period of time while they get tested and wait their test. So that's our attempt to try and mitigate widespread exposure throughout the organization. So all those changes in shifts and individuals, again, sworn and professional like if they're not here, it affects our service.

Assistant Chief Allison: And we then use overtime to basically support the continued efforts of public safety and work. Next those are the drivers, some of the structural deficiencies we see with overtime, and these are really overarching structural issues that impact overtime include what the chief as she started this part of the presentation and mentioned is how our overtime is budgeted over the years, particularly over the last eight fiscal years, we've seen the expectations and requests for services from the police department increase and grow over time. And as we have seen that expectation grow over time, the budgeted overtime, as it remained less than 50% of our prior year's expenditures.

Assistant Chief Allison: And so when we look at how we're budgeted, we haven't seen a real accounting of any prior fiscal year spendings regarding the service that we're trying to deliver and a corresponding increase in that budgeted overtime. So that has been a challenge with a contributor, if you will, to some of our overspending. Another structural issue that we've seen is some of our overtime budget increases through our bargaining units. So these are the cost of living adjustments that have increased over the last several years of notes and they're the packet over the last several years from about fiscal year, 2006 to 2007, all the way to current fiscal year.

Assistant Chief Allison: We've seen about a 9% reduction and the police officer hours worked. So we've gone from about 505,000 hours work in 2006, 2007 to about 461,000 hours worked in 2019, 2020. Yet these expenditures and overtime costs have steadily increased from about 28 million in 06, 07 to about 41 million in 19, 20. And so, although we're working less hours, it's costing labor or more as the



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 10, 2020

cost of living adjustments for all the bargaining units in the organization have increased overtime. And although the overarching staff budget will account for the Cola increases, the overtime budgeted is not accounted. So when we get our budgeted overtime, what we can spend those costs of living adjustments do not factor in some other structural drivers of overtime include some of our legal mandates to include the negotiated settlement agreement, as well as some of the post mandates for training and for the NSA piece of it.

Assistant Chief Allison: One of the examples is our span of control and requirement for supervision in the field right now, policy requires that sergeants can only supervise no more than eight officers in the field. Secondly, we cannot use acting sergeants in patrol to supervise personnel. So if we have sergeants that are off, either for vacation training, sick leave, extended illness or absence, we cannot use actings and we cannot combine squads. And so to adjust and to address those gaps in supervision in the field, we will oftentimes have to bring in overtime sergeants. For extended absences we can special loan or transfer sergeants to fill those gaps. However, as you can imagine, if you move a sergeant from another position that might be an administrative assignment, whether it be a CID, ID or other, a departmental assignment, it just creates an impact to those organizations where they now have to use overtime to offset the loss of that sergeant.

Assistant Chief Allison: So the moving one resources to fill another gap just doesn't solve the overtime problem. It might solve the supervision problem. It doesn't solve the overtime problem. Another mandate that drives overtime is again on the training side post, which is a peace officer standards and training mandates that every officer received 24 hours of post-training every two years by policy and the settlement agreement, we require OPD to receive 40 hours of in-service training every 18 months, as well as 20 hours of supervisory training every 18 months. So, again, as you pull resources out of assignments, particularly patrol, which is our largest staff assignment at about over one third to 40% of our department, when those gaps exist, that requires overtime to fill those positions. And then additionally, we do have training, a lot of that training is conducted by personnel who are instructors as a collateral duty.

Assistant Chief Allison: So we don't have a large cadre of full-time instructors. We do have some for critical areas like firearms, defensive tactics, the escalation crisis intervention training. However, some of our other courses, staff use it or instruct as a collateral duty. So if they're offline to teach a class that could certainly create overtime assignments. Another area of impact is service demands. Currently we try and draw about 280 officers into patrol. Usually it's about 240. On average, when you factor out some of the vacancies, we really require a 210 at the minimum just to ensure that every single beat is filled 24 hours a day. I'll tell you that in my time here, the 210 minimum staffing is not even enough to be able to get to all of our calls for service in a timely manner. But if we want every beat field to at least have a chance to service the beats, as well as provide emergency response and officers' safety, we have to ensure a minimum stack of every beat is filled.

Assistant Chief Allison: And so if you factor in some of the other areas that I mentioned with training and extended absence and vacancies on any given night or in any given shift, you could have open beats. And to ensure that minimum staffing, we will backfill those beats to ensure that every watch and we



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 10, 2020

have three watches day watch swing shift, and nighttime, we ensure that those beats are filled every single night, which drives overtime. And as you can see, if you're looking at the charts that are included in a simple report, a large driver of our overtime is beat backfill and extension to shifts that backfill those, those areas. And then lastly, as far as one of the structural drivers is the critical understaffing we have just in general, even at if we were fully staffed. If you look at the uniform crime report published by The Federal Bureau of Investigations, the number of violent crimes, are [inaudible 01:02:00] sworn members noted outside in 2019 was about 6.97 per officer.

Assistant Chief Allison: If you take the national average in the last national average that we have access to as in 2016, the violent crime per sworn position was 3.5. So obviously our staff, our sworn staff see twice as many violent crimes per officer than the average large city agency. And so if you take that into account to try and get us to that average mathematically, you would need 1500 officers in addition, which is an additional 777 to our budget is 786 positions just to be at that national average of violent crimes per sworn position. And so because of the exceptional workload that our officers see everyday, as well as our professional staff, I don't want to forget about them. They are working tirelessly and diligently alongside our sworn officers to provide a service. There will tax and beyond capacity. And the overtime is certainly there and use to support their critical mission.

Assistant Chief Allison: And then the last part I wanted to touch on it, just generally going through our non-discretionary and discretionary overtime, when we talk about non-discretionary or mandatory overtime, I want to make sure that it's not something that is okay. Well if it's discretionary, we can do without, if it's non-discretionary, we can't do it that. I'd say by non-discretionary I say these are critical things that just by either policy or by the just good functioning of our patrol staff and public safety have to be done, or there could be significant service delays, safety issues, hazards, or a noncompliance with some of our administrative requirements. Discretionary. I don't want to devalue it by saying it's discretionary and corresponded with optional. I wouldn't say it's optional. I'd still say it's critical, but these are things that are in addition to the things we have no choice to do, but these are things that are critical for public safety that we also have to do.

Assistant Chief Allison: So in general, we've spent so far in the first quarter of the fiscal year, about 6.2 million on what we deemed mandatory or non-discretionary overtime. It's about 62%. The first quarters spending with overtime, it fills open beats which supports now in response, provides the FLSA requirements, which are the fair labor standards act requirements, as well as our holiday commitments that are compensation through our bargaining units, as well as the training that I had mentioned earlier, administrative investigations that are involved with either criminal investigations, internal affairs investigations.

Assistant Chief Allison: I'm going to say required investigations, use force investigations, call back if there is a homicide or a serious crime, or even a serious administrative issue where we need to call investigators, whether the IA investigators or criminal investigators out, the call back overtime is spent as well as court, as you can see, court is actually significantly lower than the first quarter and then is the



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 10, 2020

last quarter, obviously with the pandemic, there has certainly been less court openings, and so thereby less need for court overtime spending.

Assistant Chief Allison: And then the other side of it is the discretionary overtime. Again, certainly just as critical as mandatory, but these are things that are not necessarily policy driven, beat driven as like backfill. We spent so far in the first quarter, about 3.7 million, which accounts for about 38% of our first quarter spending of that first quarter, spending that 38%, about 66% or 2.5 million went towards sideshow that I talked about earlier, our crime and ceasefire response regarding the uptick in violence and some of our intervention strategies to address violence, as well as demonstrations that I mentioned earlier.

Assistant Chief Allison: The rest of the other 34% or so when to traffic investigations. And call-outs, we certainly had some foot patrol overtime to support the weekend details, as well as some of the foot patrols around the lake, particularly during the summer months where we were engaging in some educational initiatives regarding COVID social distancing and the wearing masks and so forth. So that is the end of my report. Chief I can either turn it back to you or we can go right over to a Deputy Chief Armstrong who will talk a little bit about our top 25.

Chief Manheimer: I think let's get through the chair.

Regina Jackson: Yeah, I'm sorry. This is a lot of very interesting information. I know that I have some questions so, and then I'm seeing some hands raised by the commissioners. So if you don't mind, if we can have the assistant chief available to answer those questions before we move on, is that okay?

Chief Manheimer: Perfect. That's great.

Regina Jackson: Okay. Terrific. So Assistant Chief Allison question. What I didn't hear is like, what is the helicopter and BearCat expense when you're looking at overtime? I mean, excuse me. Yeah. Overtime, is that factor been or is that separate and overtime has only attributed to the individuals.

Assistant Chief Allison: So what, you'll see Chair Jackson and very good question is oftentimes the equipment that you mentioned. We'll say, for example, the bearcat. That is going to oftentimes be deployed with our tactical team call-outs. And so you may see, again, the callback piece of it, because a lot of times we might get a tactical alert where individuals are off and they may have to come in and move the equipment to whatever the tactical scenario is. And that might be incurred cost from a personnel cost. That won't necessarily be an overtime costs just for that equipment, but the personnel coming out may bring that equipment.

Assistant Chief Allison: Other times when that equipment is used, what we have done to try and minimize the use of that piece of equipment, when there is not a tactical call up, but it's necessary maybe for a individual who might be armed and unresponsive in a vehicle, or might be the initial onset of a barricaded individual that is refusing to come out, that's armed, but may not be to the level of a SWAT call-out yet, we do and have trained on-duty personnel to deploy that piece of equipment, so we can



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 10, 2020

reduce the amount of overtime. So, we're not just calling out one person every single time who's specially trained. So we try and manage it through that aspect.

Assistant Chief Allison: But certainly if you see a SWAT team activation that's bringing out that equipment, that'll drive it. As far as the helicopter, it is a fully staffed unit. And we have, I believe about four pilots that work different offset hours to try and again, minimize overtime. Certainly if they're not here and the helicopter is not use, it's not flying, so it's not incurring costs those off hours when it's not flying. If there is a special need, then the two officers who are coming in to fly it could be charging to the callback overtime piece of it.

Regina Jackson: I thank you very much. I have just a couple more questions. With respect to your recent academy graduation, I know you had about 40 officers but you're also telling me that you have attrition of 60. Are we basically not graduating officers quick enough to be able to facilitate the attrition, or is there also the fact that they can't be swapped out for experienced folks, so you're having to roll them into the work at a slower rate? If you could just explain that I'd appreciate it.

Assistant Chief Allison: So, absolutely chair Jackson so, on average, and I know that we've had a recent spike in retirement attrition. We have had a lot of individuals reaching their average retirement and they are moving on in the retirement phase of their life. And on average, we see about six to seven or so individuals attrition out for various reasons each month. We have been able to slowly and incrementally increase and keep up with attrition by running about two and a half academies a fiscal year. Any time we go and dip below those academies per fiscal year, then most certainly it's very difficult to keep up with that attrition. And we noted having gone through the layoffs back in, I want to say around 2009, 2010, during that period of recession, it took us running almost overlapping academies just to bring us up from the high 600, low 700s up to the mid to upper 700s. And it took us several years just to get there.

Assistant Chief Allison: And so, one of the things with attrition is it can go very quickly if you're not running a couple of academies at least every fiscal years. And we want to run those academies. We want to make sure that they're fully staffed at 40-45 positions and that we're trying to graduate as close to that number as possible. If we have lower academy numbers then certainly just because you're running an academy, if it's not well seated, then you're not going to be able to keep up with attrition. And what makes it challenging now under the pandemic, is just the testing cycles and the ability to get people that are coming out to apply for jobs, even with shelter-in-place and the level of potential contact as first responders. The pool of applicants tends to be a little bit more challenging over the recent months.

Regina Jackson: Okay. My final question, because I see several commission hands up is, I was under the impression and I would presume that there would be some cost savings here, is that as soon as the pandemic or the shelter-in-place happened, I thought that the city administrator stopped ceasefire. And then there were some other policing measures that got stopped along with public works not cleaning streets and all that. If in fact that happened, how long was ceasefire down



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 10, 2020

before it was engaged again? Because it would seem to me that there should be some cost savings there, but I don't know.

Assistant Chief Allison: So, we never stopped the police staff ceasefire units, although because of organizationally wide vacancies and the high vacancy rate that we've had, we have not fully staffed all the ceasefire squads, but that's not unique to them. We also haven't fully staffed our CRT squads. So we try and moderate some of the overtime, backfill and overtime in patrol. But what actually paused were the direct communications and the call-ins. And that part was not only for trying to figure out how to do it with social distancing, but it's also for public health, bringing groups of individuals into a confined area to do those custom notifications. We had to restructure that and figure out how we can do it in a safe manner.

Regina Jackson: Okay. I thank you for the clarification. I have questions from commissioner Harbin-Forte followed by commissioner Garcia. Commissioner Harbin-Forte?

Brenda Harbin-Forte: Thank you chair Jackson. Also, chief Alison, let me ask about the overtime. I think it was I'm sorry. My screen is freezing, so I can't see the information, but it's regarding the football games, the professional football games.

Assistant Chief Allison: Yes, commissioner.

Brenda Harbin-Forte: And you indicated that it was some partial reimbursement. Tell me how does that work? And is there a contract that requires police to work those games?

Assistant Chief Allison: Yes. So commissioner through the chair, a lot of the driver and you can see there's a big financial difference between the fiscal year 19/20 from the first fiscal year of 2021. The large driver of the sporting events and Coliseum events were through the Coliseum. And it is in contract with AEG, who is the overall facilities management who handles different functions, not only safety [inaudible 01:15:29] police service [inaudible 00:07:32]

Brenda Harbin-Forte: Sorry.

Regina Jackson: Oh, we lost you.

Assistant Chief Allison: Can you hear me? Can you hear me?

Regina Jackson: Okay, yes.

Assistant Chief Allison: Okay. I apologize. So, they'll contract for police services and basically the amount of money spent is then reimbursed back to the police department. There are also events that are non Coliseum events where maybe individuals will want to have an event or a block gathering, or maybe it's a video shoot or a commercial in the city that requires traffic safety, and they may request three or



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 10, 2020

four officers or two officers, or have me. The need is for to come in and provide that security. Hold on one second. Just lost my headphone connection.

Regina Jackson: Yeah, we can hear you.

Assistant Chief Allison: Okay. I apologize. I'm trying to work through my technology. They may contract with officers and then those entities who are running those events will then reimburse the department or the city for that money spent.

Brenda Harbin-Forte: Can I ask again, let me follow up again with the Coliseum and the football game. If you are getting [crosstalk 01:16:47]

Assistant Chief Allison: For sure.

Brenda Harbin-Forte: then I assume that you're getting reimbursed for your full cost. Is it just partial reimbursement? I don't see why there isn't a net on that.

Assistant Chief Allison: Right. And so, I think when we say partial reimbursement, it means that not every non Coliseum event would get reimbursed, but certainly Coliseum events, every Coliseum would be not only full reimbursement, but there's also a cost overhead that's included. So, you may have an officer who is maybe at step one, the lower police financial step or pay step working event, but they're always billed at top step with a cost overhead. So, for Coliseum events, there is going to be a net reimbursement. It's a delayed reimbursement because obviously there's a billing factor and then a funding factor, so it's not in real time. But for Coliseum events, again, not all general events that are contracted, but for Coliseum events, there's certainly a one for one reimbursement.

Brenda Harbin-Forte: And so where are you capturing that reimbursement in your budget? Is it showing as some income somewhere? How [inaudible 01:17:57]?

Assistant Chief Allison: So, it's not in this report, but we do capture and we can provide the monies that have been reimbursed over time from our contracted obligations. So, I think that's something that our finance division can put together.

Brenda Harbin-Forte: Okay. And then a couple of other questions along those lines. Let me ask in terms of the contract itself, is it coming to an end? It seems to me that as we talk about, let me paraphrase add to it, I guess an addendum really, as we talk about where we can cut, it seems to me that one of the just from what I know, one of the least important functions would be working in those football games. We should I'd rather see police out covering the more essential aspects of their jobs. Although I'm sure it's a lot of fun to be at the professional games and everything, but it seems to me that we should start looking at taking those bodies and putting them in areas that are really needed, like such as having them, instead of being assigned to a game, look for missing children or work on missing children's cases. Those kinds of things.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 10, 2020

Assistant Chief Allison: So, two things to your point, commissioner is one, I mean, I think from the...we will see over the next several years, once the pandemic has lifted as I would seem to think, a reduction in the amount of cost incurred by sporting events, particularly the football games and the basketball games. Unfortunately we did lose the Raiders and the Warriors and so we won't be certainly staffing those events anymore. But I will say that when we are out there or when we were out there staffing those events, these were officers in addition to the existing officers that were out there on patrol. So, they were coming in on their days off to support that money. And that money was reimbursable. We would certainly be able to shift those resources to different matters, as you'd mentioned, however, if it was going to be in addition to, it would be a cost that we'd incur through over time that would be nonrecoverable through reimbursement.

Brenda Harbin-Forte: And I suppose that [inaudible 01:20:22] see the confirmed that it is full reimbursement, so that

Assistant Chief Allison: Yes.

Brenda Harbin-Forte: it is almost an "oh no, nevermind" type of thing. But to the extent that there are bodies and we do have to [inaudible 01:20:34] I think that can over time for some of [inaudible 01:20:38]. But we can't no more until we really [inaudible 01:20:45] how you capture the income and whether you're actually able to trace it, that you spent X amount in terms of providing the service and you got reimbursed Y amount and they have the same number, ends up being the same number. All right.

Assistant Chief Allison: Perfect.

Brenda Harbin-Forte: All right, thank you.

Assistant Chief Allison: Thank you.

Regina Jackson: Okay. Thank you. And now commissioner Garcia had a question.

Sergio Garcia: Yes. Thank you madam chair. I have a question regarding training. And it appears as I was browsing through the report attachment for, I was browsing through other reports and I was listening to you and I was looking for information regarding training and, and how training is budgeted, right?

Sergio Garcia: Key aspects to public safety training and what the Oakland Police Department ought to be doing is working on de-escalation and crisis intervention. I did not see that as a line item standalone budget item, and I think you mentioned that it is not. The implication there in my mind is that those items are not important or critical to what OPD is, or should be doing. I'm wondering if you could comment on that piece of the training allocation. I see training regarding what is required under the NSA. I see training around the academy and other types of training, but I did not see anything about de-escalation and crisis intervention.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 10, 2020

Assistant Chief Allison: Thank you, commissioner, very good question. And I will say that for us, de-escalation training, crisis intervention training is very important to us. In fact, we had just recently, I'm sure you all are aware, I purchased the virtual system, which is our new state of the art force option simulator. It's a very good piece of equipment and something that will really help us through our deescalation training. The way the training is budgeted is, and the way it's carried out is, we have required trainings every year. So, not only do we have range training, we have our what we call 10 hour force option training. And it's not just use of handguns, but it's also how we de-escalate from situations, how we approach situations tactically so we may not have to engage in force, how we use different tools to communicate, negotiate, and try and accomplish an interaction as safe as possible.

Assistant Chief Allison: And those are four hours of firearms, 10 hours of force options training is built in something that we do every single year. On top of that, as noted in the report, every 18 months, officers go through 40 hours of in-service training, half of which is required perishable skills training, which includes use of de-escalation force options. So, that's on top of the annual 14 hours. Now, what happens is, in the way reason why you don't see it as a overtime line item, when officers go to that training, we are not paying them overtime to go to the training. They go as their normal duty assignments. So, they sign up for their continued professional standards training during a workweek. That is their shifts. They get their deescalation training, all their perishable skills training every 18 months, or you see the overtime cost incurred is when they're there.

Assistant Chief Allison: They may open up a beat patrol and the backfill overtime then comes in and fills that overtime gap. As far as our instructor side of the shop, although we do not have a full-time cadre of instructors for every topical subject, we do have our force options team insider training that is a permanent team that talks about deescalation, use of ECW. We do have a full-time mental health supervisor and crisis intervention trainer that come in and don't incur overtime costs because that is their regular assignment. So, you won't see necessarily overtime budgeted because some of those critical training pieces we agree, are so critical that we've assigned full-time folks to it. And when they come into receive and accept that training, they're doing it on normal time. And the overtime is filling again, their prior assignments as they're leaving to accept that training.

Sergio Garcia: Got it. So, it's part of the NSA training requirement that requires the OPD to have all sworn personnel receive 40 hours of in-service training every 18 months. That's what you're referring to?

Assistant Chief Allison: Yes, it's that, and what's not listed there is the additional 14 hours per year that officers receive with force options and firearms.

Sergio Garcia: Got it. Thank you.

Regina Jackson: Okay. Thank you very much. So, as you could tell, we had a lot of questions, so I think we can move forward to the next segment of the presentation.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 10, 2020

Chief Manheimer: Oh, that's great. That would be your very police liaison deputy chief, Lauren Armstrong. We did have the question come through our chair regarding the top overtime earners, and there's always so much buzz around this. I thought it'd be good to peel back the layers of that a little bit for you all. Chair Jackson and chief Armstrong will be here to address that one, and then we can take any overall questions.

Regina Jackson: Okay. Thank you.

Deputy Chief Armstrong: Thank you, chair and to the other commissioners. Thanks for having me today. I'll just quickly go over a couple of things. I think chief Allison covered all of the real drivers of our overtime. I just want to speak to what at least to our top 25 officers who work overtime. Our overtime is not officer-driven. Officers don't get to just arbitrarily select to work overtime. They don't get to just stay on their own. Officers by policy, are mandated to receive command approval prior to working overtime and all overtime reports [inaudible 01:27:12] and approved by the command staff and audited by command staff. So, officers essentially after completing their overtime shift, they document the hours worked. That is audited by the supervisor, and then forwarded up to the commander who approved that overtime.

Deputy Chief Armstrong: There's also minimum state requirements for officers in terms of officers have to have an 8 hour rest period in between their overtime shifts, meaning that they cannot work more than a 16 hour period. And they also have to take a day off. So, officers cannot are not allowed to work seven days a week without a day off. We require a rest day, and we also require rest hours in between their shifts. Like chief Allison spoke to the vast driver of our overtime is the vacancies as well as the long-term leaves, whether those are sick leaves or administrative leaves or military leaves. The 90 vacancies that were mentioned by chief Allison is the largest driver of our overtime. The city is deployed into 35 beats. The city is deployed into 35 beats and one officer is assigned to each beat. If that officer were to use contractual discretionary time off, whether that was vacation or comp time or sick leave, that assignment would be filled by an officer on overtime.

Deputy Chief Armstrong: Chief Alison and I will say, we've been here a long time, and we have a different generation of officer. Not every officer is interested in working overtime on their time off. Overtime is voluntary, but fortunate for the department, we have a group of about 25 or 30 officers that willingly come in on their days off or extend their shifts to fill these vacant assignments when they become available. The impact is that if we run with an open beat, one of our 35 beats, that means a particular beat will not have a police officer assigned to that beat for that particular shift. Essentially, 35 officers average about 12,000 residents of the city of Oakland. With a city of over 420,000 and represents each officer really be a responsive to over 12,000 residents. If we don't have an officer on that beat, it's not only it enables our ability to respond to calls for service on that open beat, but it also becomes an officer safety issue because the adjacent officer will not potentially have a cover officer close by to provide that safety cover that is needed for potentially dangerous calls.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 10, 2020

Deputy Chief Armstrong: So, the department is our mandate that we do everything we can to make sure we have that minimum staff and have 35 beats on every shift covered to make sure we provide an adequate service to the community, but also making sure that we have adequate safety protocols for officers. Again, chief Allison also mentioned the other drivers of our overtime being our sideshow detail. Obviously, we've had challenges around sideshow throughout the city. It has become so large that it is more of a regional problem. We have been partnering with other local agencies to try to address it. But even within the pandemic, the sideshow groups that come to Oakland and other cities have become more mobile and they now communicate and actually move from city to city, depending on what city is prepared by having enforcement resources in that city. And so, when Oakland is anticipating a sideshow even to come to Oakland, we have staff in on overtime to address that.

Deputy Chief Armstrong: Again, it goes back to our 35 beat deployment. We have 35 officers out on the streets working their regular assignments. If a spontaneous event like a sideshow were to come to the city of Oakland, without those overtime staffing deployments dedicated to sideshow, it would essentially require several of those 35 officers to be pulled off of their beats and reassigned to address the sideshow activity that could lead to potential loss of life. And so, we try to avoid taking officers out of the 35 beats, not providing service to our 911 system. So we use the overtime sideshow detail for that. The demonstrations as well, we do everything we can when a spontaneous protest happens, to use what resources we have in the city at that time, whether that's our special resource teams like our crime reduction teams or our community resource officers, if something were to happen. But when they're not available or if it goes beyond their capabilities, we have to fill that on overtime as well.

Deputy Chief Armstrong: We've also seen in the last five years, a significant increase in entertainment and nightlife in the downtown. That represents on a weekend, around 10,000 people prior to the pandemic that would come into the downtown on a Friday or Saturday night. There again is only one officer assigned to beat one, one officer assigned to beat three for not only the downtown for the residents, but then also for the additional 10,000 people that come in to be patrons at clubs and restaurants and bars and things of that nature.

Deputy Chief Armstrong: That increase in visitors who we welcome to our city, but it also requires us to deploy additional officer resources to address fights, violence, shootings that occur sometime in the downtown, as a result of the additional residents and visitors that we have in the downtown area. So, that top 25 officers are really officers that we, as a department are aware of. We like I mentioned, we have overtime mandates around how much they can work, as well as the time needed to rest, so we can reduce the likelihood of any fatigue. And we also make sure that for good mental health and wellness, that they take days off to make sure that they can recover and be properly ready to serve. So chief, I'll pass it back to you unless there's any question.

Chief Manheimer: Thank you, chair Jackson, any questions from you all?



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 10, 2020

- Regina Jackson: I received an article some time ago from a citizen and was absolutely shocked to see that some folks can clock \$500,000-\$600,000 a year in their total compensation. Has there ever been any thought to caps? I know that the suggestion was that people try to increase their income in order to put their earned income over time, as they get closer to retirement in order to increase the amount of their pension. And I don't know if that's an actual act or what? It just seems really...
- Chief Manheimer: Right?
- Regina Jackson: It just seems so strange that, that would be allowed or even encouraged just because "it was needed" like there aren't other people who could also spread out that overtime.
- Chief Manheimer: Right. And I think there's three dynamics there. One, overtime is not what we call personable. So, when they figure out your final salary, many agencies have final highest three-year average or final year average that they figure your retirement. Overtime is not permissible. So, it's not counted in that. So it's not part of your income. It's an extra not audited, but yes, there are always and it's funny because in every department I've been in, there are these high overtime earners. And in a lot of ways, if you think of it, we either spend it on them or other officers.
- Chief Manheimer: There's a lot of officers, whether they're parents who live far out of town, they have other responsibilities. There are a lot of people who do not want to work the overtime. And so, when we have a short shift where we have to hold an officer over, we would prefer to call someone else in so that this officer isn't working. They already have an 11 hour shift, they may have been in court and then to hold them over. I mean, just the amount of fatigue adds up. And so, I think that watch commanders tend to know who actually enjoys the overtime because by then it's mandatory and we have to require someone to come in for the shift. So I think they tend to go with some of the folks who want that overtime.
- Chief Manheimer: Now it's a balance, right? We are worried about fatigue. We're worried about other things. And yeah, we do try and keep track. You'll be pleased to know we finally got a TeleStaff system that we've been trying to get for about eight years. So, part of it is that you can't really track it on a daily, weekly, monthly basis. You wait until the end of the year when it's reported through curse, not as a purse figure, but reported as income. So this is going to be better for us to manage that. I think you'll see that about a quarter of the folks on the list are your area commanders who are just by nature of this job in so many NCPC beats meeting several times a week with community groups. And another piece of it is these very high earners that you'll see in police and fire, who just actually, thankfully I think the whole system appreciates that they take a lot of these shifts than others, especially working moms.
- Chief Manheimer: I know when I was the mother who had to be home at night, so my husband could go to work, I very much appreciated these high earners. So, there's a little bit of all of it in there, but we are getting better now with TeleStaff about watching those caps.
- Regina Jackson: Okay. That's good to hear. Commissioner Jordan has a question.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 10, 2020

- David Jordan: Yeah. Hello. Chief Manheimer and other associated chiefs, my overarching question around the overtime issue is, it feels like in your descriptions of where these are coming from, it feels like some of these things are predictable. I mean, yeah, you can't necessarily predict the attrition and loss of staffing, which is going to cause some of this and things like other events that might come up, that you haven't been able to predict like protests and such. But it does definitely feel things like the training element that we just heard about though yes, the people who are taking the training are doing on their hours, that leaves an open shift, which somebody else then takes up as overtime.
- David Jordan: That seems a pretty predictable cycle that maybe should be addressed as well as yeah, maybe the people who are doing the over maybe the other people officers manning the events and things like that. It sounds as though some of them are being reimbursed for that. It does definitely feel like if they're coming in on their off hours so as to not keep a shift uncovered, then they are inevitably going to be working overtime because they're using their off hours to put in time at an event.
- David Jordan: And my question is, and there are other elements to this around. We have a...You...Chief Allison was able to describe to us the history of what the attrition looks like and what we can expect. And when you see officers potentially leaving due to retirement age, that's definitely a predictable loss. And this dictates to me yeah, maybe in order to cover some of these things, the predicted overruns in time, we would necessitate an increase of overall OPD budget, but would then represent a net decrease in actual costs, if we look at the amount that's being paid in overtime, which is extensive. And I just want to know, what does this conversation look like at a upper level with the city council and the mayor I assume? And has this been discussed? It seems pretty straight forward to me. I'm not a budget person necessarily, but I do question the logic of that. Yeah, that's it. Thank you.
- Chief Manheimer: I thank you. Chief Allison, did you want to handle that? I think I have a handle on it. I can't speak as to why we've historically been underfunded. Generally, the overtime budget doesn't cover even minimum backfill, much less all of the other enforcement efforts that the council actually wants us to handle on a regular basis. I don't know chief Allison if you're here on the call still?
- Assistant Chief Allison: Yeah. No, I'm still here chief and I know it's a very tricky subject because I mean budgeting overtime and budgeting in general for the police department is a larger city function for the city finance department. And so, I'm sure that there's a lot of factors that are weighed in across the board. I know that we have continually stated our case of why we spend our overtime, we've talked about steps on mitigating that expenditures, such as trying to control discretionary leave in a manner that is going to minimize backfill. To the commissioner's point about predictable over time, when we do our annual watch change draw, where people get to bid on the shifts that they work, they also bid on their weeks that they sign up for vacation or sign up for their training. So, we try and limit the number in a particular area so there's not one more impacted than the other or one week might be more greatly impacted than another week. And so, there are some steps that we tried to manage.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 10, 2020

Assistant Chief Allison: And one of the things, also, I think I failed to mention, and I think it's also important to note, is even when we look at our overtime expenditures, and as you can see what the report when you look at \$30 million spent when you're budgeted for 12, so on and so forth, when we look at the end of the year balance, some folks ask, "Well, if you have all these vacancies, you're obviously saving some money. What's going on with that funding?" And it absolutely is applied to our overspending. So, oftentimes, year to year, when you look at the extra spending, we factor in the salary savings for the unfilled vacancies and the roll-ups and the benefits and all of the fringe benefits that come with it, it gets you very close to balancing that offset or that overspent dollar amount. So, I just wanted to throw that out at you, and that's some of the conversations at a very upper level that we have and track on.

Chief Manheimer: I would just add, though, quite frankly, that we take this to the city council and city administrator every year, and I think that, in a lot of ways, it's just such a big number because we've been so historically underfunded in terms of staffing, that the way this department handles it is through these overtime allotments. So, all of these, if you'll look, and we are bringing this back to council as we did last year as well, which are the specific directed enforcement areas you would like us to stop, I think what we're going to end up having to do, Commissioner Jordan, this year is to probably sink down some of our special enforcement squad. So, traffic may have to be some down, or others may have to be sent back into patrol, which means that when we have [inaudible 01:44:43] and traffic safety, we're going to have to do it on overtime.

Chief Manheimer: So, it seems fairly predictable. The city has historically not funded it, at least half of it. I know that we tend to get beat up every year for it, but no one is really willing to stop the services and enforcement that are so important each year to continue, including the side show and the walking beats and the anti-looting details, et cetera. So, it is a structural imbalance that really, at some point, we would hope gets addressed more substantively.

Assistant Chief Allison: And through the chair, if I may, I just wanted to add, in practice, that actually, to the chief's point, had occurred at the beginning of the summer, I ended up having to collapse one of our traffic squads, as well as a couple of our foot patrol squads to ensure that patrol was staffed through the summer with some of the vacancies we were seeing then. And the attrition, although we had a recent academy class that is about to wrap up field training, so they will be able to offset some of the vacancies, the attrition just basically wiped out any gains we would have made through the summer. So, that is a real conversation. Again, it goes back to the original opening statements I was making about how overtime is really driven to provide a service, and when we are talking about reducing the funding, if we're not budgeted for the money we're spending, then we got to talk about what services we don't do anymore.

Speaker 1: And through the chair-

Assistant Chief Allison: Go ahead [crosstalk 01:46:15].



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 10, 2020

- Speaker 1: ... say that, as an impact, when we do collapse those units, for instance when we spoke of specifically collapsing walking units on the international boulevard, where those units were collapsed from, we immediately over the last five months have seen an increase in shootings and homicides in those very areas where we had taken walking officers away. So, that's also what we're cognizant of, is that there's going to be unintended response as a result of taking officers out of a location that we know is in desperate need of a police presence. So, that's the balancing effect that we have to work through, as well.
- David Jordan: Sorry, Chair Jackson. This is Commissioner Jordan. I just have a quick follow-up question. So, I did read that OPD just received a large grant for traffic enforcement. Well, what sort of dent is that going to make, given the fairly large budgetary shortfall the city is looking at this year and potentially the department as well? And also, I do understand what you're saying, and I understand that there needs to be some predictive budgeting for the possibility of overtime, but I mean, this really feels like an efficiency issue more than it feels... I mean, efficiency and underfunding.
- David Jordan: Like I said before, it feels like if we were to fund enough to cover the predicted over time to prevent over time, there would be a net decrease in actual costs, which in an environment where people are looking to defund the police, or at least reduced funding to the police, seems like it would make sense, even though on the face of it, it looks like additional funding for the department. I'm just very confused by all of the logic around that. It definitely feels like as a city we've settled for a real half measure around this. Thank you.
- Chief Manheimer: Thank you. Just really quickly for the grant. What that grant will afford us is, especially if we end up collapsing that traffic unit, being able to provide some over... Again, it's overtime money. Right? We can't go out and buy an officer with that, but it will afford us some overtime enforcement hours in the targeted locations where we're seeing a spike up in collisions, et cetera, and fatal accidents. So, we agree with you, Commissioner Jordan, greatly that this historic underfunding has really caused us, and we would argue, understaffing, but we can't do all things. And so, what we're trying to do is we recognize that there's not only budget cutting, but there's defunding, re-imagining, whatever it is you call it. Okay, here are the services, which ones do you want us to not do?
- Chief Manheimer: Because I would argue that we're not sitting here waiting to happily spend overtime. Most of this is trying to balance, as Chief Armstrong said, the crime versus the safety insecurity. And so, they're tied to items that in a normal funded budget would simply be the job of normal regular officers on the beat, but we don't have those because we're understaffed there. So, it is quite the issue, and the auditor's reports are an interesting read because they do talk specifically and at length about this issue of the city's underfunding to the tune of maybe eight to 16 million at times.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you. We have one last question. Commissioner Dorado?



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 10, 2020

- Jose Dorado: Thank you, Chair Jackson. I'm trying to understand the numbers around the service level demands. So, it doesn't say, or maybe I missed what the minimum staffing level is, but I think it's 35 officers in patrol. And I'm assuming that's per shift. So, doubling that, two officers per beat is 70 times three shifts is obviously 210, and then adding in the sergeants gets you around 240. So, if that's correct, where are the other officers, command staff, et cetera, factored into the numbers per, let's say, per shift, getting us up to where we are in terms of staffing minus the officers that are off on leave, sick, injured, et cetera? So, I'm trying to get an idea, a sense, of how those numbers work per shift, per day, per area. Hope I've made that clear.
- Chief Manheimer: For sure. Yes. Yes, sir. Chief Allison, can you take that one? It's, as I said, [inaudible 01:51:45] staffing group.
- Assistant Chief Allison: Yeah. I wouldn't call me a staffing group. But I would say that, first off, Commissioner Dorado, you're absolutely right, and the number's 210 for officers when you factor in the additional five sergeants per watch, times three, which is 15, plus both A side, B side, which is weekends, weekdays as an additional 30, puts you at 240, that has to be here every day. That does not count for the watch commanders. And so, every week we have four watch command positions, in East end, West end, and then an A side, B side, and then also the nighttime. So, if you figure that you have a West side that's going to work a day shift and a night shift, because we actually work them on 12 hours. That's two right there, plus two in the East for days and nights, that's four. And then if you factor in the weekend shift, that's eight. So, on top of the 240, it's actually another eight. It's the 248. They're the ones that are really 24/7, and so any one of them that is off for any reason that dips below that number could trigger a potential backfill over time.
- Assistant Chief Allison: With our watch commanders, unlike our officers, which as I mentioned earlier, we try and draw 285, but with a lot of vacancies, we sometimes are closer to 240. That 240 gets below 210 very, very rapidly. And so, whereas with the sergeants and lieutenants, the watch commanders, it's different, they are not drawn beyond their minimum numbers. So, when I say that there is 30 sergeants, other than maybe a handful of admin sergeants, which have been used in other various forms and fashions, whether to support CID or other administrative investigations, use force investigations, if the sergeant takes time off, we're immediately at our baseline. So, where there might be sometimes a buffer with officers, with sergeants and watch commanders, what you get is what's drawn into, and if it dips below, it's automatically triggering backfill. And I'm not sure if that answers your question, or if you want to elaborate further, I can try and go further.
- Jose Dorado: Well, let me try it this way. So, an ideal number would be what, with everyone assigned and filled in a position? That's one. And then, above that, because we have how many officers? And give me a number that excludes those on leave, injured, sick. So, I'm trying to see where the gap is between what the ideal number is, including patrol sergeants, watch commanders, et cetera, that's X, and then you have a gap between, or an amount between, that number and the total number of officers minus those on leave, training, sick and... training, sick, and vacation, et cetera. So, there seems to be a number there somewhere that I'm trying to get to over and above a fully staffed week, and that number that represents how many officers we have total minus those that



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 10, 2020

are out for injury, sick, et cetera. Because there seems to be a gap there that I'm not understanding.

Assistant Chief Allison: Well, you're right. And actually, there's actually a lot of organizations, a lot of consulting groups, including the one we have used for the calls for service day that actually do work studies to not only look at what is the staffing that you need but what is the level of service that you want? Meaning, I would like to see a emergency response time to be less than... between two to five minutes. I'd like to see priority two calls standing no longer than 30 minutes or whatever that that set is. And they take the call volume plus the level of responsiveness and many other factors that a lot of smarter statisticians do and researchers do, and they come up with that number. We actually, years ago, had a program that tried to do it for us, but it created this weird shift schedule that was really not optimal for the organization. It was kind of this rubric of you flare up and tear up numbers over a given watch period.

Assistant Chief Allison: But the bottom line for us is, is we, going back to us saying with the NSA mandates, we can't go over a sergeant and eight officers, and so a squad for us is a one to eight ratio. So, when we talk about drawing 35 [deets 00:14:41], we try and make sure that every squad, there's five squad, say, on the day watch shift. We try and make sure our try to draw, if we don't have big gaps throughout the organization, at least eight poor squads. So, although you're correct in assessment, minimum staffing should be 35 per watch, which is 105 per 24 hours, A and B 210, we realistically try to put eight per area, which is actually get you up to that 240 number that I mentioned earlier. And that doesn't count our TAC units. So, we have three PTAC units through the city, which gives you another 24 officers, which actually puts you at 264.

Assistant Chief Allison: Even with those squads that exist, every time we run our draw, even at 264, we're dipping below the minimum 210 number every week. And so, I will tell you that 210 is baseline and is not enough. 264, which is how we're currently structured, just by the evidence of where we're at with our overtime spending, is not enough. And so, if you start to go beyond that, structurally, you start to get into, "Okay, now we need not only additional officers, we need additional squads and additional sergeants, additional watch commanders, and even potentially additional areas because Hispanic control." And so, trying to get to that number is a, I think, a longer research project that would take, and I think that we are going to be looking towards our consultants to do, to figure out that work study and what is the optimal staffing that would minimize overtime and still provide that service.

Chief Manheimer: Chief Allison, if I could for Commissioner Dorado, because I'm trying to figure out, sir, are you wondering where the other officers other than the ones on patrol are? Because we do have 10 in investigations. Was that your question?

Regina Jackson: At this point, I think that I will talk with Commissioner Dorado, and maybe we'll talk with the Finance Department, figure that out, because we really need to move ahead.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 10, 2020

- Chief Manheimer: Okay. All right. I can also get him a breakdown. Yeah. I can just send also a breakdown if you like, of where all the [crosstalk 01:59:03] we can see are. Thank you.
- Regina Jackson: That will be helpful. Thank you. So, I think we're going to public comment now. Mr. Rus?
- Juanito Rus: Thank you Madam Chair. At this time, if any member of the public would like to make comment on item seven on tonight's agenda, please raise your hand in the Zoom queue, and you'll be called in the order in which your hands are raised. I see six hands raised. So, now, the first speaker in the queue is Lorelei Bosserman. Good evening, Ms. Bosserman. Can you hear us?
- Lorelei Bosserman: Sorry. I was trying to unmute. Hi, thanks. I want to address my comments to Chief Manheimer. I've mentioned at commission meetings before that I consider it inappropriate for you to spend so much time giving me... giving us, sorry, crime statistics. And I want to make it clear that it's not because I don't think that's important, and it's not because I don't think that is an easy part of your job. I know it's difficult, and I know it's important. Right now, I think a lot of us are feeling shell shocked about the number of homicides in Oakland and particularly in East Oakland. But the reason I say it's inappropriate to bring this to the Police Commission is that fighting crime is your job. It's not the job of the Police Commission. It's not their job to help you strategize, to help you figure out how to fight crime. That is your job. Their job is to make sure you engage in constitutional policing, you don't violate anyone's rights, and that you treat Black and White people the same. And every time-
- Juanito Rus: Thank you, Ms. Bosserman, your time has expired. The next speaker in the queue is listed as Tasha. Good evening. Tasha, can you hear us?
- Joseph Mente: Yes, can you hear me?
- Juanito Rus: We can hear you. Whenever you're ready.
- Joseph Mente: Joseph Mente. Through the Chair to Chief Manheimer, I'm on the task budget and data advisory board, I'm trying to figure out how to gauge the effectiveness of the various functional units within OPD. So far, I've been unable to gather a comprehensive list of performance metrics for each functional unit. One example from the NSA would be the percentage of investigations completed within 180 days. Do you have a list of these metrics as part of your management process? And if so, could you please allow the taskforce to view them? Additionally, after reviewing the call data, I noticed that the number of officers that responded to each call is conspicuously absent. It seems to me that would be essential to know how to allocate resources efficiently. Do you have that data, and if not, why not? Thank you.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you, Mr. Mente. The next speaker in the queue is Rachel Beck. Good evening, Ms. Beck. Can you hear us?
- Rachel Beck: Yes. Can you hear me?



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 10, 2020

Juanito Rus: We can hear you. Whenever you're ready.

Rachel Beck: Great. Thank you. After hearing the Department of Violence Prevention talk earlier this week about why they won't have the resources to deal with anything other than the people at greatest risk of committing or suffering a homicide, it is disheartening to hear OPD not say what every other department in the city is being asked to say, namely, what they will do without. Other city agencies are doing preemptive belt-tightening. OPD is really alone in not doing that. Thank you.

Juanito Rus: Thank you, Ms. Beck. The next speaker in the queue is John Bey. Good evening, Mr. Bey. Can you hear us?

John Bey: Yes. Good evening. I think we got to witness another example of the OPD song and dance because I believe Commissioner Dorado asked a clear, concise question. Didn't get an answer, but we'll get back with you later. And I think what we have a problem with OPD is they're the one department that no matter what the problem is, it's always something else external to them. Well, we have to have so much overtime because we have to have training for NSA. Well, why not just comply with the NSA anytime before the previous 17 years, and maybe you wouldn't have to do all that extra training, or you could have increased the staffing over the years.

John Bey: If Chief Allison, you'd been here for 25 years, and side shows are a problem all 25 years, you mean no one is able, in your time in the department, to come up with a solution to at least tamp that down a little bit? And I also thought you often skated the answer regarding the overtime with the football games. If it's money that you list as overtime, why is it there if you're getting reimbursed with money over the top of that?

Juanito Rus: Thank you Mr. Bey. The next speaker in the queue is Ms. Assata Olugbala. Good evening, Ms. Olugbala. Can you hear us?

Assata Olugbala: Yes. One of the first things I would want to know due to the fact that we are dealing with such a high level of crime, what are the intervention and the preventative strategies that you have in place that deal with crime? For instance, intelligence-led policing, the crime reduction team, ceasefire, even though ceasefire is an activist force intervention with the individuals of gains, you do have officers who are assigned to ceasefire. As it relates to your hiring practices, you did have, and I don't know if you still have, a program that concentrated on military heroes, you are targeting, hiring of veterans. Research has shown that this is problematic because a lot of those veterans suffer from post-traumatic stress syndrome. California law does allow for cities to create the requirement that officers live a certain distance from the cities that they work in. What is your position on that?

Juanito Rus: Thank you, Ms. Olugbala. The next speaker in the queue, I believe, is Reisa Jaffe. Good evening, Ms. Jaffe, can you hear us? CRC Allies and Accomplices, can you hear us?



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 10, 2020

- Reisa Jaffe: Well, gee, I thought I logged out of that account. Technology [crosstalk 02:05:58] works. I logged out. I don't know anyway, through the Chair to chief Manheimer, in all my time in the corporate world, people had to justify their staffing and I don't see you doing that. So, I heard the call-out about police officers going to protests, but I've been to protests where I've seen so many police officers just standing around, not actually doing anything that's keeping us safe. So, it's really time for you to do daily evaluations of where your staff are and how their actions are actually keeping the community safe, and adjust your staffing accordingly. That's how you cut overtime. Thank you.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you, Ms. Jaffe. The next speaker in the queue is Jasmine Fallstich. Good evening, Ms. Fallstich. Can you hear us?
- Jasmine Fallstich: Yes. Hi. Thanks. Through the Chair to the chief and staff, I just have a few questions. It's very confusing how the beats work. For example, beat 13 has an X, Y, and Z option, but many of the other beats only have X and Y. And I'm wondering if there's a document or a previous meeting that the public can be pointed to in order to obtain some greater clarity around how this works. Also, a question around why... Chief Manheimer mentioned that they don't get over time information until the end of the year. Why is that? That seems like that should be something easy to change. Maybe I misunderstood what she said, but that also seems incredibly problematic to not know what the overtime is until the very end of the year. And then, to echo a previous speaker, what are you going to cut? How are you going to make it work?
- Juanito Rus: Thank you, Ms. Fallstich. The next speaker in the queue is Megan Steffen. Good evening, Ms. Steffen. Can you hear?
- Megan Steffen: Yes. Thank you so much. Thank you to the Commission for asking the hard questions. I just wanted to follow up on something that Chair Jackson had asked about the amount of overtime for the helicopter pilots in the Bear Cat. I don't believe that question was ever answered. We heard that there were four pilots, but I'd love to hear how much over time that those pilots accrue. I also wanted to echo what others have said, especially when your callings, including many city staff sitting on this meeting, are going to be asked to forgo raises that were negotiated with their union. I, too, would like to know what you are willing to cut as the city faces this looming budget crisis. It's clear that it seems that you believe that you have reasons that accounting has continued this way and so sloppily, but it can't in the future. So, just beyond... Sorry. Thank you.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you, Ms. Steffen. The next speaker in the queue is a telephone attendee with last four digits 5802. I believe that he belongs to Mr. Saleem Bey. Good evening, Mr. Bey. Can you hear us?
- Saleem Bey: Yes. Saleem Bey. [inaudible 02:09:51] it's not enough for all the BS that we heard. First, the chief can racially profile the public comment in here, some of the public, and gleefully respond to non-Black public concerned citizens. When it's Black and Muslim related or missing persons related, OPD's failings, she is mute. For the OPC record, OPD was forced to reveal that they lost all murder investigation case files for my brother [inaudible 00:28:17]. How can you investigate if you lost all



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 10, 2020

the case files in violation of the NSA, which has never been reported by OPD? Do you, Chief, or any of the chiefs on the line, care? Obviously not. Chief Manheimer, like all her predecessors, has ignored multiple Black, Muslim cases repeatedly in violation of mayor [crosstalk 00:02:10:36].

Juanito Rus: Thank you, Mr. Bey. The next speaker in the queue is a another telephone attendee with the last four digits 9997. Good evening, 9997. Can you hear us? Telephone extension 9997, it appears you're still muted. You can unmute yourself. Seeing is that it's remaining muted, I will move to the next speaker and come back to you if you can figure out your muting. The next speaker in the queue is another telephone attendee with the last four digits 0185. I believe that's Michelle Lazaneo. Good evening, Ms. Lazaneo. Can you hear us?

Michele Lazaneo: I can. This Michelle Lazaneo speaking for the Bandabaila family. So, how does overtime translate into service? The detective assigned to Jonathan's case was sworn in in 2015. Can you hear me? Hello?

Juanito Rus: Hello? Can you hear us? I can hear you now. My apologies. That might've been a technical issue on my side.

Michele Lazaneo: Okay.

Juanito Rus: Whenever you're ready.

Michele Lazaneo: Okay. Michelle Lazaneo, spokesperson for the Bandabaila family. So, how does overtime translate into service? So, the detective assigned to Jonathan's case was sworn in in 2015, Jonathan went missing in 2019, his salary for the past five years was \$121,000, \$168,000, \$191,000, \$212,000 and \$234,000. He was new, he needed sufficient supervision and help, he was trying to solve 761 missing persons cases. It's clear that he had to work overtime due to this case being an unmanageable caseload. By design, being a rookie in an understaffed unit with only one other detective on staff, limited supervision and outdated policy from 2009, outdated and ineffective procedures, it was a recipe for disaster. When Jonathan's parents called OPD, they thought that Jonathan's case would get the attention that it deserves. With only two detectives in the missing persons unit, sufficient attention and resources were not possible. You spent \$800,000 to pay for the uptown walking detail. Missing persons got \$400,000. On December-

Juanito Rus: Thank you, Ms. Lazaneo-

Michele Lazaneo: Thank you.

Juanito Rus: ... your time is expired. At this time. I will attempt to return to the telephone attendee with last four digits 9997. Good evening, 9997. Can you hear us?

Speaker 2: Yeah. Hello?



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 10, 2020

- Juanito Rus: Hello. Whenever you're ready, you have a minute.
- Speaker 2: So, I had one question about the report, the OPD overtime report, on the table chart one. It has the actual as 41.5 for 1920. And in the city's report, that's 35, I believe, so I'm wondering if that discrepancy is because of the backfill, the vacancies, paid down some of the overtime before it became a cost. But I want to say, as the commission you can ask Chief Manheimer to come up with a plan to cut spending, ask her to make a list of priorities and what she would be willing to cut. Given that, there must be cuts in OPD this year. The city administrator said it, everyone in the council believes that's also true. It is not discretionary. It's not an option. It is something that must happen. So, pretending that they can't cut anything, the money's not going to come out of the sky. They need to cut. And this is your purview. It's your brief. Ask her to do it.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you. Your time is expired. At this time, seeing no further hands raised in the queue, I return the meeting to you, Madam Chair.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you.
- Juanito Rus: My apologies.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you. Chief Manheimer, there were several questions that were posed. I would like for you to try to address them as briefly as possible so that we can move on to the agenda, but I want to acknowledge those folks who requested the questions. And certainly, I am sure that you are all ready working on some recommendations for budget management, so for our public person who suggested that we give you that direction, I was on that track, but I'm sure that you are all ready thinking about that.
- Chief Manheimer: Yes, ma'am. That said, we do that exercise every year with city administrator, city council, and you'll be in that process as well. I'm going to go down very quickly in just bullet points, and they're not in the exact order. Our missing persons in all of our investigations positions are woefully underfunded. We have had to shift around a lot of our positions over to homicides and the types of significant and complex investigations so that we can do due justice for those who have lost their lives. We are working on other protocols and policies that I think we'll find some significant updates and changes for missing persons. We would still like to get a couple more investigators, however. Yes, we have metrics for all of our positions. Our metrics really are involved in our risk management meetings, which we do monthly in the department.
- Chief Manheimer: We will be working on slalom dashboards. This very body, this commission got, through [Pete Peterson 00:00:47] over in IT, a demonstration of our slalom dashboards. We are extremely excited to be meeting now with our new data manager analyst as well as the city and IT, and Pete and slalom, and we are going to be going public with those dashboards and then there'll be able to see the metrics, the measures and what it is that we hold ourselves accountable to, and that others who, like you, and our NSA and our city council and mayor, hold us accountable to. So



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 10, 2020

we're excited about that. We do have, after following this, calls for service analysis, which is coming out next week.

Chief Manheimer: It will be followed by an in-depth workload study. We have not done that for a very long time. Some of the very questions that Commissioner [Jordan 02:17:33] was asking us and Commissioner [Dorado 00:02:17:36], "Where do you put the staffing? How do you measure it out with calls for service? How do you balance it by beat? What are the peak times? What is the most efficient staffing?" We expect to have all of that done with this very, very noted consultant firm who does this across the country for the International City Managers Association justice programs, and we will keep you in the loop on that. Regarding the cuts, we asked the council last year, what they would like us to cut and gave them the buckets, if you will, of every one of those categories of overtime, which Chief [Alison 02:18:12] took quite awhile to illustrate in the charts that are attached in your packet for the public and for you all.

Chief Manheimer: The council said they would not be designating anything at that point, and we continue to do the things that they and our community expected us to do. The walking beats, the anti-robbery beats, et cetera. We certainly will be engaged in that process again, really with the council significantly and primarily this year, as we start to look at those services, right? It's level of service, it's how far you want to wait and how long you want to wait for a call for service in patrol, and the rest of it is what special enforcement and other responsive specialty units, traffic, et cetera, would you like us to cut. Really, we feel that it's up to our leaders to help with that decision. We certainly could just say, "We're cutting it all," but I just don't think that's the answer when we are responsible for safety on our streets and in our communities.

Chief Manheimer: But that will be a long process and you better believe we'll be having those discussions and they'll be starting now. There's also a re-imagining committee that will be coming up with their own recommendations, and all of that will be the iterative process as it moves forward to council, as we move towards the new budget discussion and decision-making in February, March, April, May, leading into the new council and the new fiscal year. We have successfully blocked out the massive sideshows for the better part of the past two years, and I don't want to go into all of the details of that, but it is having that amount of people that unfortunately, they then go to San Francisco and get into shootings and other cities and getting to shootings.

Chief Manheimer: But we have successfully blocked them for the most part, from the massive violence, gunfire, and traffic danger they've posed on our city streets. So without that detail, I think they'll be coming back, but we'll see. We'll see where the decision-making is. Intelligence led policing would love to bring that back to you another time. Ms. [Olibali 02:20:18], you're right. We have violence interrupters. We have a gun intelligence unit and the last three things I have, one is living in the city. Yeah. We would like to get to that at one point. As you see, we're only at about 20%, so we certainly couldn't make that the priority, the condition for hiring, but it's our goal. And then finally, the OT for the BearCat is pretty minimal. We have operators on every shift and we can get an itemizer out of the helicopter. I think Madam Chair, that was all of the questions, I hope.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 10, 2020

- Regina Jackson: Yes, and that sounded like lightening speed so thank you very much. I know this was a very important series of conversations and now we're going to move forward and hear from Commissioner Harris, and she also has a partner who will be presenting alongside her, Mr. Antoine Towers. So I am pleased to be able to ask Commissioner Harris to update us.
- Ginale Harris: Thank you, Chair. Can you hear me?
- Regina Jackson: Yes.
- Ginale Harris: Okay, great. Okay. So this evening, I'm going to be presenting on what has been happening this far in the re-imagining taskforce. I will say that it is quite interesting. People are a little bit confused about what defund the police means and what re-imagining means. That is what I have found out thus far. I sent a series of questions out to our facilitators, just so we can have a solid answer on some of the questions that I thought the public might be interested in, and one of them was, "What is the goal of the task force?" There seems to be many ideas on what the goal of the task force is, so I wanted to hear it from the co-chair and the chair... the facilitators, excuse me.
- Ginale Harris: And the answer was, the council resolution states, the goal of the taskforce is as follows: the city council hereby create the re-imagining public safety task force to rapidly reimagine and reconstruct the public safety system in Oakland, by developing a recommendation for council's consideration to increase community safety through alternative responses to calls for assistance and investments in programs that address the root causes of violence and crime such as health services, housing, jobs, et cetera, with a goal of 50% reduction in OPD general purpose fund budget allocation.
- Ginale Harris: However, I think that there was a lot of confusion in the beginning. Being a police commission appointee, I was only assigned to a group, November 11th. And to date, I have not received any invites to any of the meetings.
- Ginale Harris: The same second question I asked is, "What is the structure of the task force?" There are 17 task force members, and there are five advisory boards. The first advisory board is alternative responses, legal barriers and opportunities, OPD organization and culture, budget and data analysis, and youth. So I, on November 11th, was assigned to OPD organization and culture. However, again, there seemed to be some system that was already put in place prior to the advisory boards being up. I was only added on November 11th for whatever reason. Each of the advisory boards have three to six work groups under them for specific subjects, so what the subjects are, I don't have a clue.
- Ginale Harris: Number three, "How many meetings has the re-imagining taskforce had thus far?" There have been seven task force meetings so far and numerous advisory board meetings. How many advisory board meetings? I couldn't tell you.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 10, 2020

- Ginale Harris: "How many Oakland citizens are involved?" There are 147 people on the task force and the advisory boards, total. The goal is to get thousands of Oakland residents involved through community meetings and surveys.
- Ginale Harris: Five. "What policy training and budget implications have been discussed? Can you please identify the advisory groups?" To date, the task force has discussed the large host of potential policy training and budget implications. A summary of those issues are attached in a draft concepts and ideas derived from the responses of the task force members to the framework questions, which I have a document that I can supply to the public and to the police commission, so you can display it on your website. I know people are thinking that was not very specific or detailed information, and this is what we have been challenged with in re-imagining taskforce. So I'm going to let my co-facilitator Antoine Towers address some of this stuff as well. So if you can unmute him, that would be great.
- Antoine Towers: I'm unmuted.
- Ginale Harris: Okay.
- Antoine Towers: I was multitasking, so I apologize. I think part of a lot of the confusion that's been currently going on... Honestly, I'm multitasking in the house, so I missed a lot of conversation and dialogue, but it's like I said, us just basically having a fundamental structure of what it is that we supposed to start and be grounded on moving forward. I think that in our meeting that we had yesterday, we came to certain understandings and agreements, that a lot of us are currently finding that we are trying to be on an alignment and in a lot of ways, but still the structure of the process, it causes confusions, and just needing to know specifically what it is that we are supposed to be tasked with in order to move forward.
- Antoine Towers: My purpose, or I know a lot of us that are on the task force's main purpose or main goal is, just as long as whatever thing it is that we establish, we maintain security for the community, maintain the safety in the community, and certain confusions come, because it seems like that's the secondary within the process, and we want to make sure that that remains the primary, first, moving forward. That's what I had to add.
- Ginale Harris: Thank you, Antoine. I would like to just update the commission as well, as I found it very interesting that three of the five only Black, affected people on this task force were left off of the advisory boards. So I was very disappointed in that. And again, to date, I have not received invitations to be a part of these advisory boards, which leads me to believe that I'm not really clear on what they are trying to do. However, there was a letter sent out yesterday and somehow it made it to the paper. The five African-American people on this task force got together and put together proposed guiding principles because people were all over the place in this task force. Defund the police means different things to different people, and I am not sure if everybody on this commission read the proposed guiding principles. However, I can share a copy with you all and the public by request, if you like.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 10, 2020

Ginale Harris: With that said-

Regina Jackson: Absolutely.

Ginale Harris: Yeah. If you have any questions, please feel free.

Regina Jackson: Okay. So, first off, Commissioner Harris, I want to thank you for presenting to us, but more so than that, attending the meetings, some of which... I don't get how you haven't been invited to advisory board meetings, but then again, I guess I need to see an org chart of what the re-imagining taskforce actually looks like, because it sounds like an octopus.

Ginale Harris: Yes, ma'am.

Regina Jackson: But having said that, one, it sounds like you are frustrated and I certainly can appreciate that, but I think the deeper concern that I have is that while re-imagining was initially created with the thought in mind to reallocate funds to social services and other entities, I think my bigger concern is that if you're really going to reimagine public safety, what you have to prioritize in that process is how Black people become more safe, because they have been the ones that had been targeted. Would you agree with that?

Ginale Harris: Correct. Which is what the proposed guideline principles were derived out of.

Regina Jackson: [crosstalk 02:32:20] Okay.

Ginale Harris: [crosstalk 02:32:20] very concerning that three of the five only Black people on this task force that are affected by this gun violence and murder and all of that, were left off of the advisory boards.

Regina Jackson: Okay. So my second question... I guess it's a question comment is, and I see a hand up by Commissioner Jordan and I'll defer to you in just a moment, Commissioner Jordan, is that in terms of re-imagining public safety inside the city of Oakland, it really sounds like the city itself has to make a commitment to racial equity.

Ginale Harris: Yes.

Regina Jackson: And I've mentioned this before that I know there was a report done back in 2017, and I don't believe that there's been an update, but when we look at the entire system of city services, not just focused on police or police and fire, we also have to make sure that people feel safe in all of those entities. So that, for example, if there are employees of a city who would call the police on a citizen, that there are a certain number of protocols that need to have been addressed so that we're not using the police as bullies because someone is irate or having a challenge or what have you. So it seems to me like there should be an overarching commitment so that when you try to make changes inside one department, they're actually part of a paradigm shift in the culture of how people are treated inside the city. Forgive me. Does that make some sense?



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 10, 2020

- Ginale Harris: Yes, ma'am, it does. And the five members were, on along those lines, which is what the letter was derived out of. And I think the letter is important. I had no idea it was in the Chronicle, but the letter to the re-imagining taskforce itself for transparency, because we all felt the same way, and we had a lot of thought into it to steer us where we need to be. I mean, when you say defund the police and you say, cut, I'm okay with cut, but I'm not okay with, "Okay, well, if we cut, then what are we doing with it?" Right? And no one seems to be able to answer those questions. People say, "Oh, well we want social workers. We want this," but show me, or tell me, what that looks like. What does that look like? And today, with all our meetings we've had, I have not heard a sufficient answer that I think would be acceptable to the public. And if you'd like, I can read the letter out loud to you, so the public can hear it.
- Regina Jackson: Okay. So let me first call on Commissioner Jordan, since his hand has been up for a minute, and then we'll come back to you, because I don't know if he's got a question or if he's sharing information. Okay?
- Ginale Harris: Yes, ma'am.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you. Okay. Commissioner Jordan, you've been unmuted.
- David Jordan: Thank you, chair. And thank you, former chair Harris for updating us on what your segment of the task force has looked like. I am a member of one of the advisory boards. Specifically, I'm on the alternative response advisory board. And I do, in some ways, echo what I heard from [Janell 02:36:35] and Antoine and the other members, John, Carol, and there's one other that I'm forgetting. I've listened in on the task force calls as a member of public, and it does feel similar to most policy bodies, and even the commission itself is... A lot of work is done in a committee, or in this case advisory board. A lot of the conversation is happening there. A lot of the work and the research is happening in those spaces, and I think it's a shame that former Commissioner Harris and the people that she feels aligned with here, haven't been more fully embraced and brought into that process.
- David Jordan: And I think that in those spaces... and granted, I'm only a member of one of those advisory boards, so I don't know what the conversations look like there in the others, but there's definitely a spectrum of priorities. There is definitely a perception of a lot of what we heard early on in the year when people were just demanding we defund the police, and the priority is just to de-power and remove the police as a form of danger for Black people. And I think that I've always thought that that was only half of the equation, because as this group of five people are talking about, what we're talking about is a community who is most effected, both over-policed and under-protected, a lot of the time, just due to their proximity to the crime. If you go back and look at Chief Manheimer's map of violence reports, you can see what that looks like, and you can see in this city, as demographics continue to change the areas that are still most heavily people of color, specifically Black people, that's where most of the crime is taking place.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 10, 2020

- David Jordan: All of that said, I can quickly give you a little bit of an update on some of the things that my advisory board has been working on, and it is specifically the things that former Commissioner Harris was talking about. Where does that money go? Where does it go if we seek to reduce funding to the police while still maintaining safety in the community? Because that is honestly our highest priority. Increasing safety in the community is actually the highest priority. And in fact, in our rubric that we were applying to how we are working out where we prioritize things and what ideas we choose to add into the recommendations, the first element of that is, how does this improve safety in the community? And if it doesn't, or if we can't fully justify it, it's not a thing that we're moving forward with.
- David Jordan: So that said, quickly, I'll give you a few examples of things that we've been working on as alternatives. Some of those are policy things, not necessarily things that need to be funded, such as looking at decriminalizing some elements that are being policed, which we've talked about before, specifically homelessness, sex work, substance use, maybe even substance sales, although I feel like that's maybe a bigger ask, and applying a public health approach to those. Civilianizing some rules around traffic enforcement and things of that nature, expanding pre-arrest diversion and anti-recidivism programs. I know we have some of that focused specifically on youth that's in the beginning phases, but ideally we can expand that to people beyond youth, and then just community-led safety agenda, dissolving OPD outreach, homelessness outreach unit, and moving that fully into a civilian format, and things such as that.
- David Jordan: So those are just a few of the examples, and that's just specifically in the advisory board that I'm working with, and I'm not going deep into detail because we have a timeline and I'm sure there are people who are on this call as members of the public who also have been part of this process. I just wanted to add in and help eliminate some of that process. Thanks.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you very much, commissioner Jordan. I have a question of Commissioner Harris and you, just in terms of this process. I remember it was identified as a six month process, but I think it's been extended. Do we know how long it's going to be extended to? Because this is a mighty big project.
- Ginale Harris: I would say that, I think it's being recognized that this project is going to take some more thought. This is not a fly by night thing, and I think the five people that brought this letter about, brought it to light that everybody wants to speak around race, and equity, like you said, needs to come first. We are never going to be able to solve any of these issues by just taking away. We're scared over here in district seven. Scared. There were three murders in three days on my block alone. Three days in a row, back to back, and they got big guns out here. They don't got little hand pistols. They got stuff that goes [inaudible 00:27:11]. Like that.
- Regina Jackson: Mm-hmm (affirmative).
- Ginale Harris: Right? And so we're scared. My thought is, is that nobody wants to talk about the hundred murders that we had out here. Everybody wants to talk about public safety, but they leave out



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 10, 2020

the murders that are going on right now while we're trying to re-imagine safety. And they keep saying, "Take away, take away," but okay, if we take away, that's okay, but what are we going to put in its place? And these are the questions that we derived in the letter because we want to stay focused. We have people coming with ideas that say, "Well, we should improve our parks." Well, what does that got to do with murder?

Regina Jackson: Right.

Ginale Harris: I would love to have nice parks too, but that's not the priority when we [inaudible 02:44:01] because-

Regina Jackson: Commissioner Harris...

Ginale Harris: People say-

Regina Jackson: I'm sorry. Would you go ahead and read that letter, please? So that we can all have the benefit of that information?

Ginale Harris: Yes. Dear Oakland RPSTF steering committee, we have come together as Black members of the RPSTF, who all live in the flat lands of East and West Oakland, and part of the city's most impacted by the loss of life and violence that is plaguing our streets. When we signed up to be part of this task force, we did so because we fully support the need to reimagine public safety in Oakland. Public safety must be improved to better serve Black community members who are disproportionately experiencing and bearing the brunt of crime and violence in Oakland. Because of our desire for this effort to become successful, we are highlighting a gap that we observe, that if not addressed, will undermine our success. We are calling for the taskforce to vote on a set of guiding principles in the next task force meeting, that will be formalized the standards and the criteria by which we will finalize our recommendation.

Ginale Harris: These principles should then be shared with the task force advisory boards to further guide their work. We recommend the following guideline principles based on our lived experience and shared understanding that Black lives are being lost and harmed at the alarming rate in our city. Even more lives will be lost if police are removed without an alternative response being put into place, that is guaranteed to work as good as, or as better, than the current system. For us to do our job and stand behind any recommendation that we advance to the city council, we believe that it is important to adhere to the following principles.

Ginale Harris: One. Police reductions will be made when the suitable alternative is in place, that is proven to offer an equivalent or better impact on public safety. Equivalentents to include both timeliness and effectiveness of the response.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 10, 2020

- Ginale Harris: Two. If an alternative response is proposed, but has not been demonstrated slash proven, then a pilot transition period is needed during which two systems will operate in parallel until effectiveness has been demonstrated slash proven.
- Ginale Harris: Three. Estimated cost savings from a police budget reduction must first be directed towards the suitable alternative response, prior to being invested in an alternative solution that addresses a different need.
- Ginale Harris: Four. Anticipated cost savings may be directed toward a non-police response slash public safety solution, or an under-invested police service that will continue undermining public safety, if not more appropriately resourced, e.g. Investigations or missing persons, which I believe a member of the public highlighted that tonight.
- Ginale Harris: Five. Final recommendations adopted by the task force must include: one, description of recommendation. Two, cost analysis, startup and ongoing operating cost. Three, safety impact analysis, immediate impact, and longer term impact. Four, likely impact on overall workload per officer, including overtime fatigue and attrition. Five, transition slash implementation plan, timeline, and steps to move from current state to desired future state, including possible people slash organizations to implement. Six, evaluation criteria. How will we measure effectiveness of the proposed recommendations? Seven, community feedback. How has the broader community responded to the proposed recommendations? This agitated by the police beat and by race slash ethnicity.
- Ginale Harris: Six, recommended provider of an alternative response must possess: one, relevant technical expertise slash professional knowledge. Two, knowledge of the current local context for response types, and three, cultural relevancy.
- Ginale Harris: Without a set of guiding principles to guide our individual and collective efforts, we are likely to frustrate our efforts by create unnecessary and redundant work, and also by setting false expectations of each other. Advisory board members and the public, due to our lack of initial alignment, this is why we urge you to agendize these guiding principles for taskforce review enhancement, and a vote for approval as soon as possible. Please feel free to reach out to any of us individually should you wish to discuss in greater detail. Thank you for your leadership and your service of this complex process. So that was the letter that we sent.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you for sharing that. Wow. I'm very happy to hear that you all very clearly deliberated on that to provide some clarity, because it sounds like there isn't a lot of clarity. I see Commissioner Jordan's hand is up again. So I imagine he wants to add something to this conversation. You've been unmuted.
- David Jordan: Thank you. Yeah. So just quickly to answer your question specifically. Initially, the advisory boards' timeline was to provide recommendations essentially now, like at this point right now, which is a hundred percent not feasible and it has been pushed out till early spring at this point, because



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 10, 2020

honestly, a lot of what's happening there is maybe going deeper than people had initially expected, which I think is a good thing to the idea that in a time where we're looking at massive budget shortfalls and potentially budget cuts to OPD, regardless of what Reimagining Task Force has to say about how they'd like to use it, a lot of what's happening is around... How can we address some of these issues that don't necessarily aren't about using OPD funding. Meaning, some of that's potentially looking for sources of funding that are through grants, through county funding, through state funding.

David Jordan: There is a recognition that we don't want to make an unsafe community by drawing down resources from the department prematurely and leaving a service vacuum. That's nobody's intention, as far as I can tell and to that end, there's a lot of people working on advisory boards and parts of the task force specifically around just budget, just research, just data information around how the police works and finding improvements in efficiencies and making those part of the recommendations.

David Jordan: Also, looking at elements of policy, including state policy, and maybe even federal policy, that inform how the department functions and looking at advocacy efforts around those things as well. Not to say that these members, and their concerns in the letter they've written, don't have some merit. Clearly, there's a lack of communication, and I've also had some questions about... I don't know, people... The commitment by city council potentially or the mayor's office to make this happen.

David Jordan: It's a really incredibly short timeline to be asking a group of volunteers to come up with essentially a world changing group of recommendations that should be able to be instituted within a very short period of time and then provide results within one of the three funding cycles. I think that in some ways it was sort of set up to fail. That said, I think that all of the members of the task force and all of the members of the advisory board have some awareness of that and are working against that challenge as hard as they can, and there's a lot of people who are working very hard on this right now. So, thank you.

Regina Jackson: Thank you, Commissioner Jordan. So since Commissioner Harris has been excluded or not invited to some of the advisory group meetings, I'm trying to triangulate how information is in fact shared. Is there a report out from advisory groups to the task force? Is there any visual documentation? Meeting minutes, plans forward? Part of what I'm trying to figure out is, you all have been meeting for two, possibly three months, and I'm trying to visualize in my head this trajectory towards six months or nine months, what should have probably been a year from the gate anyway.

Regina Jackson: How are you all sharing information with each other, because it's clear to me that Commissioner Harris has been locked out of, what looks like bites, big chunks of information?

Ginale Harris: Well, during our task force meetings, we all go to breakout sessions, which everybody on the task force is included in those, but when we go back to our advisory boards, that's what some of the



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 10, 2020

members are being left off. You were supposed to be assigned to an advisory board from the beginning and three of the five that are affected were left off of these advisory boards and it was like, "Oh my bad," kind of thing, but I'm not feeling like, "Oh my bad." I'm feeling like, hmm, that's interesting.

Ginale Harris: So I was placed on an advisory board on November 11, to be exact, however, I have not been invited or have no way of getting in. It's COVID and we have to do things through technical devices. So people, I believe, their excuse was that they're sending stuff to my commission email, and I don't have a commission email, which they knew October 17th, but you give people the benefit of the doubt.

Ginale Harris: So I have given my task force emails several times, and I still have not been invited, but we do have breakout sessions and report backs, which PolicyLink, who's been hired to facilitate these sessions, is taking documents or notes down but I believe that they're posting notes on their website from whatever it is they collect.

Regina Jackson: Okay. So before I go to Commissioner Smith, I'd like to ask you, have you seen, what would ostensibly be, an org chart that lists out all of the advisory boards, all of the different groups that are engaging these 147 people? Have you seen this master plan for where everybody is?

Ginale Harris: Well, I've asked for that information from the facilitators, and I get a very broad answer. I got, there's 147 people on taskforce and advisory boards, and I get no specific information. I've never seen any specific information. So I will assume that there isn't any.

Regina Jackson: Okay. So you've not seen a visual graphic that delineates?

Ginale Harris: No.

Regina Jackson: [inaudible 02:57:21] Okay. All right.

David Jordan: Sorry, Chair Jackson. There is an org There's a website for Reimagining Public Safety Task Force. It's specifically for the task force, not for PolicyLink and the org chart lives there.

Ginale Harris: Right. Well, she asked me if I've seen it and I have not seen it. I've asked the facilitator to send them to me because I wanted to share it with the police commission and that has not been done.

Regina Jackson: Okay. So at this point, Commissioner Jordan, could you send us the website? I really want to try to figure out how to understand this. I've done a lot of work over my years around paradigm shifts, and I just want to try and figure out how I can interpret some of this. I also have some significant concern about these invitations that aren't being made or being sent to the wrong place. So I'm going to be making some calls tomorrow, but in the meantime, commissioner Smith has a question. You are un-muted commissioner Smith.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 10, 2020

Thomas Lloyd Smith: Thanks Chair Jackson, and thank you former Vice Chair Harris. It wasn't a question. It was a recommendation. I was thinking, so Vice Chair Harris by the vote of the police commission was voted to recommend us. I mean, and we are out front the Vanguard for policing in Oakland and so if she's not getting invited to the meetings that she needs to be attending at, then what I really was just trying to say is, I would motion that we have you put, and perhaps with the help of myself or whoever else wants to help put together a letter, and also formally contact them to explain to them that the police commission's representative is not to be locked out of the decision-making meetings. That's absurd. I mean, because effectively what we've done is we've put Vice Chair Harris in a place where she is representing us, bringing back information to us, reporting to us.

Thomas Lloyd Smith: So then we need to put our full weight behind her and enable her to get into the meetings where decisions are being made, and she can actually effectively report back to us. That's not what's happening now. So I think what we need to do is we just need to put together a letter with a unified message around that and then we need to send you out there along with Chair Harris to make sure that she does get the invitation, because the idea that we're being locked out of this information is absurd, given our standing

Regina Jackson: Absolutely. [crosstalk 03:00:14]. Go ahead. Sorry. I think I heard a motion, Commissioner Smith, that I'd like to second. Would you restate it please?

Thomas Lloyd Smith: Yeah. So my motion would be that we do two things. One, that we put together a letter that communicates to the Reimagining Policing Task Force that we want access for our police commission representative who's Ginale Harris to the decision-making meetings that we identify so that she can actually be a full participant, and two, that we have the chair, you Chair Jackson, deliver that message to them both by email, and then in person, as you figure out who to contact in that organization so that we can get a full briefing of what's going on and actually be included in the decision-making process.

Regina Jackson: I second that motion and I know we'll move without a public comment. Forgive me, I think I interrupted you Commissioner Harris. Did you want to make a comment?

Ginale Harris: Yes, ma'am. First, I just want to say thank you to Commissioner Smith for recognizing, and I do for full transparency, I want to let you know that I did let them know that I would be reporting this all back. So they know what I'm reporting and I did ask specific questions to expect specific answers and I did let them know that I am going to report back whatever they give me.

Regina Jackson: I thank you, Commissioner Harris. I don't really know what to say. This is frustrating and confusing, and we definitely need to get some clarification around it. Commissioner Smith, I appreciate your creating a very clarified set of next steps and I'm all over it. At this point, can you hold on Commissioner Harris while we get public comment to see if there is anything else that we need to be addressing before we take that vote and then let you get on to whatever you have to do next. I imagine sleep maybe.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 10, 2020

- Ginale Harris: Yes.
- Regina Jackson: Okay. Terrific. Thank you very much. Mr. Rus, can you do the public comment please?
- Juanito Rus: Thank you, Madam chair. If any member of the public would like to comment on item five on tonight's agenda, please raise your hand in the Zoom queue and you will be called in the order in which your hands are raised. At this time I see seven hands raised. The first speaker is Megan Steffen. Good evening, Miss Steffen, can you hear us?
- Megan Steffen: Yes. Thank you so much. Mr. Rus, you haven't put up your timer yet.
- Juanito Rus: My apologies. Thank you. I was about to start it, but I wasn't sharing it. There you go.
- Megan Steffen: I'm also a member of the advisory boards. You all should have gotten an email from Omar Farmer list, asking you to take a survey. Please take the survey. That's a side note. Commissioner Harris, you know how much I admire you and when you told me last night that you hadn't been being invited to advisory board meetings, I went to raise hell because I couldn't believe it.
- Megan Steffen: The person at PolicyLink, [Amman 00:03:03:58], who is facilitating the advisory board that you asked to join, the OPD culture and personnel advisory board, told me, after I gave him a piece of my mind, that you had been invited through the GHarristaskforce@gmail.com email address. I don't know if this has been a miscommunication or what. Carol Wyatt has been invited several times to advisory board meetings, according to them and not come. I'd like this cleared up as well. Thank you.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you, Ms. Steffen. The next speaker in the queue is Bruce Schmiechen. Good evening, Mr. Schmiechen. Can you hear us?
- Bruce Schmiechen.: Yeah. Can you hear me?
- Juanito Rus: We can hear you. Whenever you're ready.
- Bruce Schmiechen: Thank you. I'm Bruce Schmiechen, Faith in Action Coalition and I'm going to speak to a related problem, which is community outreach. The last two meetings this past week, a community engagement meeting and a regular task first meeting. If you went to the website and tried to get on as a member of the public, you were asked for a password and there was no password anywhere.
- Bruce Schmiechen: It was impossible to get on. I got on through a friend who's on one of the advisory boards who gave me the information. Most people don't have access to that. From day one, the outreach on getting people onto advisory boards was absurd. I had to set up a red light, like a siren at Faith in Action, seven days before the openings closed to get some of our people on. Nobody knew about



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 10, 2020

this. Our council members didn't communicate with us. I didn't get anything from my council member. It's been a travesty in terms of community engagement, I hate to say.

Juanito Rus: Thank you, Mr. Schmiechen. The next speaker in the queue is Joseph Mente. Good evening, Mr. Mente, can you hear us?

Joseph Mente: Yes. Can you hear me?

Juanito Rus: We can hear you. Whenever you're ready.

Joseph Mente: Yeah. So answering the question that I think some folks had around understanding what the product output has been of the various advisory boards is there actually is, at the beginning of agenda, of each of the task force meetings, a report out from each of the advisory boards of what they've been working on and how much progress they've made. I can't say that... It's taken us a long time to get to any sort of progress I would say in my opinion, but very recently there has been some progress. So I would encourage folks to make sure that if you're interested in that data, just come to the first several minutes and that's when that happens, before the rest of the discussion happens. Thank you.

Juanito Rus: Thank you, Mr. Mente. The next speaker in the queue is John Bey. Good evening, Mr. Bey. Can you hear us?

John Bey: Yes. Good evening. I would just, again, like to thank Commissioner Harris for the due diligence in staying on the issue, making it important and for bringing it to the commission, and I would say that's what representation looks like and at the same time, not to just be critical of the task force, but to approach them with some solutions, some at least minimum requirements for reality-based work. So I would just want to applaud Ginale for the work and rather than accepting it and maybe being dissatisfied and complaining about it, she got into action, which is what she does, which is why she's the perfect person to represent the police commission, and I want to thank her once again for her work and the commission for their support of her.

Juanito Rus: Thank you, Mr. Bey. The next speaker in the queue is Ms. [Assata Olugbala 00:03:08:28]. Good evening, Ms. Olugbala. Can you hear us?

Assata Olugbala: Yes. I'm not going to get in well with this task force, but I think it's really important to take into consideration the way once Ms. Harris explain what were some concerns then Mr. Jordan comes up and he doesn't say, "Well, let's look at ways we can address your concerns." Instead of doing that, you talk about what you and other people are doing on the task force. Same thing with other people talking about, I'm trying to find out if you've been really scheduled to be at the task force, what you need to do, anybody that wants to be involved in this, is look at the concerns that those five individuals have stated and try to understand those concerns and see if you can address those concerns rather than speak to what you're doing on the task force. Thank you.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 10, 2020

- Juanito Rus: Thank you. The next speaker in the queue is Tasha Mente. Good evening Ms. Mente. Can you hear us?
- Tasha Mente: Yes. Can you hear me?
- Juanito Rus: We can hear you. Whenever you're ready.
- Tasha Mente: Great. Thank you so much. I really appreciate the letter that the task force members put together. It was beautifully written and it's heartbreaking. I am not on the task force or the advisory boards, but I've been attending meetings frequently, and I have multiple acquaintances who are on the boards, and as Commissioner Jordan said, it was sort of set up to fail. It's been disorganized and what I've seen happen is that the members have taken up the mantle to coordinate and get the information and organization together that they need.
- Tasha Mente: So that's starting to pick up steam now. That said, that the job of the task force member is to come up with alternatives to policing, whether that's drawing on community organizations or changing city policy. So if the community is suffering, what does it take to change the culture of that community? So once we remove police violence, what does it look like to heal those wounds?
- Juanito Rus: Thank you, Ms. Mente. The next speaker in the queue is Jasmine Fallstich. Good evening, Ms. Fallstich. Can you hear us?
- Jasmine Fallstich: Yes. Thanks so much. Hello commissioners. Thanks for taking the time to hear my comments. I too have been attending a few of the task force meetings, the ones that I'm able to attend. I am not on an advisory board or on the task force. I just attend as a member of the public, and I think Chair Jackson's assessment that it's an octopus is a really good assessment. There's a lot of people and a lot of moving parts, and I think at times the facilitation has been somewhat lacking and so like the previous speaker, I really appreciate the five members who put this letter out there.
- Jasmine Fallstich: My assumption would have been that something like a guiding principles document already existed and since it doesn't, I think it really does behoove the commission to help Ginale and the other five members push that forward.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you, Ms. Fallstich. The next speaker in the queue is listed as, Anne. I believe that's Ms. Janks. Ms. Janks, can you hear us?
- Anne Janks: Yes. Good evening. So I am on a, I don't know, a working group and I attend the task force meetings when I'm able, and I've heard the same task force members raise these concerns and adjacent concerns repeatedly during meetings. It should not have been a surprise to anybody. I was somewhat saddened at the response to their very, very good statement of principles, a lot of discussion about how it was presented, and a lot of people trying to explain to them why their concerns weren't really their concerns and this wasn't their first effort to express it. I think it can't



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 10, 2020

be expressed any better and I really want to thank them for taking the time to craft that statement. Thank you.

Juanito Rus: Thank you, Mr. Janks. The next in the queue is a telephone attendee with the last four digits 5802. I believe that is Mr. Saleem Bey. Good evening, Mr. Bey, can you hear us?

Saleem Bey: Yes. [Hulu 00:24:02]. First, all the thanking Ms. Harris, after the selection committee stabbed her in the back is hypocritical. Second, Chair Jackson, I still didn't get my issue of OPD lost murder case files addressed by the chief. The chief continues to disrespectfully ignore OPB failing. Third safety begins and ends with community empowerment and investment, not bleeding it. No one was talking cause and effect. Poverty is the causation of crime and violence that is ignored. The police are the response thus the effect of poverty. Cutting community resources, exacerbates poverty, thus begets more crime. It's proven that you invest money to reduce poverty. The poverty related crime will reduce. Poverty increases violence and property loss increased policing increases profiling, just costing more in fines and jailing. Without investment in prevention, there will be no change.

Juanito Rus: Thank you Mr. Bey. At this time, I see no other hands raised in the queue. I return the meeting to you. Madam Chair.

Regina Jackson: Thank you very much. Once again, before the commission takes a vote on the motion, that's on the table, I want to thank you, Commissioner Harris for your work, for your reporting. I'm hoping that the letter and the phone calls as well as what you already started with your letter is going to clarify and hopefully move some things forward and get clarity. Well, clarifying clarity. I am just... Well, not typically have words that I I had really high hopes for this, and I'm hoping that it can really, really make some changes, some paradigm shifts, some culture adjustments in order to serve it's title, re-imagining for some positive outcome, because things are just getting more and more serious for the most disenfranchised areas.

Ginale Harris: Chair, I just want to add one more thing to my report out.

Regina Jackson: Yes.

Ginale Harris: And this is more for the public. We have meetings and they're on Zoom and sometimes you get Zoom bombers, but we have this feature it's called Q&A and I just want people to understand what black have to endure. So yesterday, while we're in the meeting, you go to the Q&A, and there were three things said on that Q&A. I hate N-I-G-G-E-R-S, kill all and N-I-G-G-E-R-S and F my P-U kitty-cat

Ginale Harris: And it was on and on and on and on and on, F-N-I-G-G-F, and I hate all and we're expected to just go on with the meeting as usual.

Regina Jackson: Oh my God.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 10, 2020

- Ginale Harris: Correct, and so nobody addresses it in these meetings. Nobody says anything. We just do business as usual, but see racism is very much alive and this goes to show that it lives in Oakland too. So-
- Regina Jackson: That's reprehensible, that... Yeah.
- Ginale Harris: Yes. Ma'am. So I just wanted the public to know that this is what we deal with, every single meeting, every single meeting. [crosstalk 03:17:56] Hurtful.
- Regina Jackson: Absolutely, and this is not considered a Zoom bomb, this is actually somebody writing in on that question answer piece?
- Ginale Harris: Yes. Ma'am and not just the one-liner.
- Regina Jackson: Yeah. Commissioner Harris-
- Ginale Harris: I just wrote it down and I just document it because I want people to understand that we feel.
- Regina Jackson: Yeah, I totally... This should not happen. You all should not have to deal with that. Nobody should have to deal with that, but especially in light of what you're being asked to do for free. So I'm going to ask you Commissioner Harris, if you can send me that letter so that I can make reference to it in the letter that I will draft and send me any other documents that they sent you so that I can reference it rather than try to look at my scribble scrabble notes tonight.
- Ginale Harris: No worries. Will do.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you, and at this point, I am going to ask the commission to vote on the motion that has been properly made and seconded. Sorry. I still... Man, I'm overwhelmed. So commissioner Dorado?
- Jose Dorado: Aye.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Gage?
- Henry Gage, III: Yes.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Harbin-Forte?
- Brenda Harbin-Forte: Aye.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Garcia?
- Sergio Garcia: Aye.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 10, 2020

- Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Singleton?
- Tyfahra Singleton: Yes.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Smith?
- Thomas Lloyd Smith: Yes.
- Regina Jackson: Okay. Thank you. The motion passes and I will start working on that draft letter tomorrow. It will be my goal to get it sent out tomorrow by close of business. Again, just want to give a really substantial thank you to you, Commissioner Harris, and I'll be following up with you tomorrow, okay?
- Ginale Harris: Okay. Very good. Thank you.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you, very much, Mr. Rus, can we move to the next agenda item please?
- Regina Jackson: Okay. The commission retreat, for those of you new to the commission, as well as those that have been hearing this anticipated conversation on the retreat, it has been listed on our agenda many times, and it has the focus of priority. The recommendations that came from the auditor in the audit that was released in may. The guise is that we've already approved the agenda and we have received two proposals. I have spoken with a few other folks who, when I told them we were looking to do it in January, said that they would not be able to submit, but I would like for both of the proposal submitters to be able to very briefly provide an overview of who they are and what they hope to do so that we might be able to vote on a facilitator and set a date in order to address these very important, really construct some protocols that we need to facilitate our own efficiencies around systems.
- Regina Jackson: Before I call the first person, are there any questions from the commissioners? Okay, great. So Blaze Consulting led by Franklin Hysten will be the first presenter. You have the proposals in your packet. Mr. Hysten.
- Franklin Hysten: Good evening. Can you hear me?
- Regina Jackson: Yes. Thank you.
- Franklin Hysten: Thank you, Chairperson Jackson. Thank you to the commission and greetings to the city staff and those in attendance. My name is Franklin Hysten and I'm the co-founder and principal of Blaze Consulting Group. We are pleased to propose our services to hold your commission retreat. Our organization, which is both minority and women led is made up of myself and my partner Jenjii Hysten. Together we have extensive experience providing facilitation and consulting services in the Bay area and throughout the State of California. For this project, I would serve as lead of this project and have myself supported city efforts at various capacities, including trainer, past chair of



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 10, 2020

two commissions and facilitator, most recently of the Sugar Sweet and Tax advisory boards, planning, annual planning and support Oakland Unite planning efforts, and I am proud to be an Oakland native.

- Franklin Hysten: Our proposal included in your packet is focused on the preparation and execution of the retreat and a follow-up report of the deliberations and your plans for your continued work, are the scope of work and design calls for a team of three. That includes myself Jenjii-Hysten, and Bianca Ortiz-Palin, who handles our production tech and visuals. We believe that visual tools are very important for work sessions like this given our virtual reality. And we want to provide you with a visual tools where you can see your group's work recorded and updated in real time. And so we want you to understand that we have a process that we would love to co-design with you that will build connection, engage creativity, innovation, and provide tools to make decisions and action steps clear. And we thank you for your consideration. Thank you.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you very much. If there are no questions we will go to the second facilitator Mr. Satterwhite. Mr. Satterwhite are you there?
- Dr. Satterwhite: Yes.
- Regina Jackson: Okay, terrific. You're on.
- Dr. Satterwhite: My name is Elmer Wiley Satterwhite, and I'm the founder and president of a non-profit consulting firm Leadership Incorporated. We are located in East Palo Alto, California. Over the course of my career, over the past three decades, I humbly say that I had un-duplicated consulting contracts with about 11000 to 1200 organizations and about 120 to 130 cities all over the United States. And the single city where I've had the most consulting contracts is the city of Oakland. Probably the biggest work that I've done in Oakland from my standpoint was when Mayor-Elect Ron Dellums, created a series of 65 task forces to do some transition planning that was very community focusing community debates. And I was the lead consultant in designing and facilitating that process. More recently, there's been a lot of discussion in Alameda County about Urban Shield and its transformation or dissolution, and I was also the lead consultant in facilitating that very challenging dialogue.
- Dr. Satterwhite: Our proposal is before you. And essentially we like to think our work is not transactional, but transformative. You want a plan, you get a plan, you want a proposal you get a proposal, which is transformational consulting. Creates the opportunity for an organization to make a culture shift, to rethink, to reimagine, to refresh its way of thinking and working in ways that prevail beyond the life of our consulting relationship with the organization, the essential elements of what we would propose to do as of course co-design. And then beyond that to conduct individual interviews or as permissible with the members of the commission, co-designed then out of the data that we collect in the agenda process and tools. And then facilitate an agenda that gets you to a series of products that are connected to the audit report that you got. But beyond that, some reimagining of or reaffirming of your vision, your theory of change, the role that you play and the



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 10, 2020

transformative impact that you want to have in the city of Oakland. Let me stop there. I'll answer any questions that you might have.

Regina Jackson: Thank you very much, Mr. Satterwhite. Commissioners, if you have any questions please raise your hand. Okay. So Mr. Hairston and Mr. Satterwhite, if you will hold on while we'll go to public comment. There may be some questions that come out of there. Mr. Rus.

Juanito Rus: Excuse me. I had an issue with my muting. Thank you, Madam chair. If any member of the public would like to speak on item six of tonight's agenda please raise your hand in the zoom queue and you will be called in the order in which your hands are raised. At this time I'm seeing one hand raised in the queue. Ms. Olugbala. Good evening Ms. Olugbala can you hear us?

Assata Olugbala: Yes. I was distracted for a minute and I didn't get the content of the subject matter that was going to be focused on. And I would hope that one of the subject matters would have to do with the issue of racism. I have observed over the course of the years when certain subject matters come up like Bam Billie kay. My issue is Singleton the police office grievance. And tonight when Ms. Harris gave her report and certain subject matters comes up, many commissioners get silent. They don't have anything to say and that's problematic because black people are going to be quite frequently the issue when we talking about policing. And if you don't have the ability to address it, something needs to be done about that because it needs to be addressed.

Juanito Rus: Thank you Ms. Olugbala. The next speaker in the queue is a phone after [inaudible 03:30:33] with the last four digits 5-8-0-2. I believe that is Mr. Bey. Good evening 5-8-0-2, can you hear us?

Saleem Bey: Yes. So my name's Bey. Obviously I must not be speaking English, because every time I speak I keep saying that, a family member of mine have all of their case files lost. How do you do an investigation if there is no case file? No one has contacted us, no one has followed up on this, no one is even taken ownership of this yet everybody sits here and listens to this. And what is it? Is it the vibration that is coming from a black person's voice that makes you not listening or not act? Because if your loved one's case files were lost you wouldn't stop, you wouldn't keep demanding action. So for the chief and the OTC, and especially the chair at this point that I called you out, to continue to ignore this is disrespectful. I'm not going to stop saying this until you find my brother's files or act on it accordingly.

Juanito Rus: Thank you Mr. Bey. At this time seeing no further hands raised in the queue. I turned the meeting to you madam chair.

Regina Jackson: Thank you very much. Fellow commissioners, it is my hope that we will select a facilitator tonight so that we can move forward with the agenda that we have not only been given by the auditor, but I'm very critical of follow up steps and protocols like policy design and all that. We need to help support our movements forward. Do you all have any questions of the consultants? Now would be the time. (silence) okay. I see-



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 10, 2020

Brenda Harbin-Forte: Sorry chair. I have a-

Regina Jackson: Hold on commissioner Dorado has his hand raised.

Brenda Harbin-Forte: Okay.

Regina Jackson: And then I'll you commissioner Harbin Forte.

Jose Dorado: Thank you, chair Jackson. To Dr. Satterwhite. My question is, I mentioned in the individual interviews with members of the police commission. What would those interviews consist of?

Dr. Satterwhite: The interviews will be linked to the outcomes of the entire process. I would invite you to share your thinking about the vision, about the various elements of the audit including the legal mandate in charge, the policy review process, the chief police evaluation criteria, the case prioritization, the OPC orientation program and the policy review process. These are a range of issues that are related to the audit. And so I would want to get your thinking on those deliverables and what the commission would do about them. And then in every case present that integrated data to the commission so that it can deliberate based on that baseline of data across with regards to all those different products. In addition, I will be asking you to share your thinking about what the priorities and key elements of a 2021 action plan could and ought to be for the commission, so that I will bring to you the synthesis of the feedback that I get. So that on each of the topics of discussion the commission has a baseline of information that is a synthesis of its collective thinking about these various issues.

Jose Dorado: And just a follow up question chair Jackson, to Dr. Satterwhite. Have you identified any other police commissions that are comparable to ourselves to the Oakland police commission?

Dr. Satterwhite: Oh, one of my deliverables and what you'll see in my proposal is to conduct research on best practices of police commissions in other jurisdictions. And so that will be a body of work that I'll undertake with the support and advice of some of the police commissioners in terms of how to address that task. So that's a task that I proposed to undertake and have commenced at this point.

Jose Dorado: Okay. Thank you. I saw that.

Dr. Satterwhite: Let me say though that I have... I mean, over the course of all the work that I've done in Oakland, I'm not unfamiliar with the city and a set of issues around the formation and the current work of the commission itself.

Jose Dorado: Thank you.

Regina Jackson: Commissioner Harbin Forte.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 10, 2020

- Brenda Harbin-Forte: Thank you chair Jackson. I have a question Mr. Satterwhite, regarding your billing rate. It appears you're charging a different rate for something and I wonder if you can explain if you have an-
- Dr. Satterwhite: And I would apologize for that if that is true in terms of the calculation, it's a typographical error. My billing rate is \$200 an hour.
- Brenda Harbin-Forte: 200?
- Dr. Satterwhite: Yeah.
- Brenda Harbin-Forte: So then-
- Dr. Satterwhite: And that pays for me, and a tech person, and a project administrator, and any other support that we would need.
- Brenda Harbin-Forte: So your bid then needs to be recalculated quite... At that \$200 per hour rate there is a big difference it seems to me in what your proposal says and what you would actually be charging at \$200 per an hour.
- Dr. Satterwhite: Yeah, I will certainly look at that, but we are projecting 70 hours at \$200 an hour which is about 14 grand. But I'll take a look at the figures and if there an error, then I'll be accountable for that error.
- Brenda Harbin-Forte: All right. At least one of the entries, I think the first one had it at about 212.50 An hour or something. And then there was a different hourly rate for some of the other calculations, that's what confused me. Okay. All right. Thank you chair I'm done.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you.
- Dr. Satterwhite: In my copy. My first entry is attending the orientation of briefing meetings, and doing the co-design process, and the projected hours are four in the class today is \$800.
- Brenda Harbin-Forte: Okay. Then maybe I'm thinking of the wrong calculation then, the wrong proposal. All right I'm sorry. I need to find then the proposals again.
- Regina Jackson: Okay.
- Brenda Harbin-Forte: All right. Thank you.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you.
- Brenda Harbin-Forte: Maybe one of the other commissioners [inaudible 03:38:41] I will switch one.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 10, 2020

- Regina Jackson: Are there any other questions of either Mr. Satterwhite or Mr. Hairston?
- Brenda Harbin-Forte: Madam chair.
- Regina Jackson: Yes.
- Brenda Harbin-Forte: Then what is the hourly rate for? What should I say?
- Regina Jackson: Blaze Consulting that proposal should be in front of you as well.
- Brenda Harbin-Forte: I don't have it right in front of me right now. I'm trying to look through. I got to go back into another computer screen. If I'm-
- Regina Jackson: Unfortunately [inaudible 03:39:22] co-hosting, I can't go out of it otherwise I'll have to leave the meeting.
- Brenda Harbin-Forte: All right. Does one of the other commissioners have it in front of them? [crosstalk 00:15:32].
- Regina Jackson: Mr. Commissioner Garcia has his hand up. So I'm going to mute you so that I can get him [inaudible 03:39:40].
- Brenda Harbin-Forte: Or even with [crosstalk 00:15:41].
- Regina Jackson: Commissioner Garcia your hand was up.
- Sergio Garcia: Yes indeed. Thank you madam chair. I do have it in front of me and it appears that there is a \$400 an hour. There's no column for it, but in terms of the hours allocated and the cost per deliverable, it appears that the heist proposal contemplates \$400 per hour.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you very much.
- Sergio Garcia: That was going to be one of the questions that I've. But I want to make sure that commissioner Harbin Forte has completed her questioning.
- Regina Jackson: Well, I think Mr. Rus actually put it up on the screen.
- Sergio Garcia: Yeah. I see it.
- Regina Jackson: Yeah.
- Brenda Harbin-Forte: So that's why-



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 10, 2020

- Regina Jackson: Go ahead.
- Brenda Harbin-Forte: I'm Sorry.
- Regina Jackson: Mm-hmm (affirmative).
- Brenda Harbin-Forte: Let me just go back. Can I see the fees for both? Where is the other proposal as well? Blaze then. [inaudible 00:17:01].
- Regina Jackson: While Mr. Rus is going back to the screen I'm going to call on commissioner Dorado. You've been on unmuted.
- Jose Dorado: Thank you chair Jackson. On the Blaze proposal the first item is eight hours at \$1,700, which is 212.50 an hour.
- Brenda Harbin-Forte: Thank you.
- Jose Dorado: Then the second one is five hours at 2000. So that's 400 bucks an hour. And the third one is [inaudible 03:41:40] which is eight hours at 3,400 that's 425 an hour. And then the last session report one is four hours at 1600. So that's that's \$400 an hour. So it's implying that there's multiple people involved in the different sessions even though they're counting one hour at a time.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you. Is there a question of Mr. Hairston or Mr. Satterwhite?
- Sergio Garcia: Great. I have a question.
- Regina Jackson: Go ahead commissioner Garcia.
- Sergio Garcia: Thank you commissioner Dorado for calculating the blended rate. There are some blended rates there in the heist report. I have a question regarding the process, in deliverables look a little different as between these two proposals. It appears that most of the hours spent here will be on facilitation of the retreat. I'm not sure if you can detail the specific activities that are involved in facilitation besides the retreat itself, right? Can you be more descriptive of what facilitation means? And I might as well ask the question about the report as well. What do you anticipate will be covered by your final report and the materials in that report? Can you give us a description of what that would include?
- Regina Jackson: So are you asking this of both the facilitators or you focused on one or the other?
- Sergio Garcia: I'm focusing this question on Mr. Hairston, the Blaze Consulting Group.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 10, 2020

- Regina Jackson: Okay. Very good. And let me provide just an overview. What I did was to share the audit report, the agenda that we had agreed upon and asked him to review and submit a proposal. So that's the pretty much the information I gave him. But Mr. Hairston go ahead and please respond.
- Franklin Hysten: Thank you so much. Yeah, let's get the budget clarified. You're right, there's some blended numbers there. So where you see the implied are the actual forged dollars an hour refers to the two master facilitators. And we also have admin assistant who gets balanced out in there as well, even with the 212.50 that creates those, so that is three. There are usually two staff that are applied and where it's 425, there are three [inaudible 03:44:40] for that activity. Our proposals really revolves and focuses on the retreat day in the work that has to be done to prepare for that retreat including the background research of your commission and the relevant issues related to the audit report. In your response to the audit report I did review some of the details that led to the creation of the agency and the commission, but there's certainly more that we want to be aware of.
- Franklin Hysten: And then we also are aware that we will coordinate with the commission leadership and staff. As we move towards scheduling the actual retreat and making sure that we're aligned on the outcomes that we want to reach, as well as the proper and well scoped pathway that will get us to our goals for the day. The facilitation of a retreat is the actual day of, and then the final piece will be the notes that come out of the retreat, presented in a way that is both attractive, but also allows you to be able to quickly go back to their information to see what your key deliberations were and the relevant action steps.
- Sergio Garcia: Thank you. I have a follow up question madam chair.
- Regina Jackson: Mm-hmm (affirmative).
- Sergio Garcia: This could be for both proposals. If you could both speak to the question of how specifically you would support the work of the Oakland police commission in regard to addressing systemic racism. One of our biggest issues that we need to address is the continued systemic racism within the OPD and as an institution. We have systemic racism in our society, every institution where we operate in this society has systemic racism, and our charge is to address how systemic racism continues to marginalize communities in Oakland. Can you each speak to how your work will assist us in supporting that work specifically?
- Dr. Satterwhite: Yeah. I'll begin. And thank you for the question. Let me just say that I know Franklin he's [inaudible 03:47:17] and I'm actually surprised that we're bidding on the same project and I wish him.. I really [inaudible 03:47:26] his firm the best in this case, but that said you can't deal with this issue in a transformative way in a single event. And so if I would have addressed that question in my proposal during their individual interviews, I would get feedback from the commissioners about how systemic racism is manifested in the police department and the principles and practices that you deem appropriate to address that issue in a fourth right way. And again, out of the interviews comes up a dialogue and out of the dialogue comes a pathway forward.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 10, 2020

Dr. Satterwhite: I would imagine that I would recommend that do not have one day, but that you have perhaps a day focused on alignment for 2021 and a responsiveness to the audit, but there has to be a separate co-design dialogue about how we step into this conversation about structural racism. And for me... And I may differ from others. Of course, I have a point of view and a set of principles and values about those issues. But in my work and supporting organizations step, there are three basic steps that have to be achieved, and they really can't be achieved as an agenda item at a single meeting. One is there's got to be some definition of what this is and what it means and how it's playing out in this case, in the area of police. Secondly, there's got to be alignment. If you think of a continuum from 1 to 10, everybody that is group will land somewhere.

Dr. Satterwhite: The most important thing for me is that everybody is to [inaudible 03:49:23] from 1 to 10, but that there's alignment, because when you have alignment it's like working with a closed fist rather than open thinkers. And that after you get clarity around definition and alignment, you then have to create and move forward with a strategy to implement the change to transform and to learn along the way so that you're in a continuous program improvement process, but that won't occur in a single event. It would be a dialogue to help the commission think about a journey that it wants to take and addressing that issue.

Franklin Hysten: Great.

Regina Jackson: Mr. Hairston, I think that commissioner Garcia wanted both of you all to answer the question.

Franklin Hysten: Great. Yeah, I believe that it's important to think about the structures that as the measure LL and the police commission as it was created, to take an examination of the very structures that already have been proposed in their agenda and think about where there are opportunities to look at lifting anti-racist values and ant-racist practices at the commission level, as well as within the department itself. In particular, our agency is working with groups to look at also in the importance of democratic voice and democracy, as well as having consensus and promoting equity. I would be interested in how equity is displaying itself, not only in the department itself in particular to the agenda that's been shared with me in the outcomes, but in particular for you all. How you all in your practices and how you do your code of conduct conduct for example. How those agreements and those policies will promote anti-racism and equity and carry an equity lens.

Franklin Hysten: I would look forward to... We're doing this equity work with a number of organizations throughout the Bay area right now in various capacities. We can discuss and I can go into detail, but each co-organization you have to learn it and get tailored to it. But we certainly have some practices. And to Dr. Sarah White's comment at his opening, I was far down this road before I realized that he was in this process. And so I would just say that I've known him since I was 19 and a youth commissioner in Oakland. And I would just say that he's the shelf that I'm trying to do some work on. So I wish him the best of luck as well.

Regina Jackson: And to your point commissioner Garcia. Initially when I proposed the retreat for an October timeframe, I was singularly focused on trying to be responsive to the city auditor's audit. I believe



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 10, 2020

quite frankly that these issue of anti-racism and the root causes in terms of how we show up to the work might well be a second retreat. I was hoping that we would be able to facilitate one retreat a year. And because as both Mr. Satterwhite and Mr. Heisen have suggested that that is some deep work and we obviously have heard some of the ramblings around re-imagining public safety, which may not be diving into root cause there. But that's more than a one day thing, but a lot of advanced work so that once we come together, we can go deep and efficiently. Commissioners are there questions for our proposed facilitators? Commissioner Dorado you've been unmuted.

Jose Dorado: Thank you chair Jackson. Just a quick one for Dr. Satterwhite. You've got on the list of very last item. You've got a meeting with the chair of the Oakland police commission at all to debrief the technical assistance project, you've got no charge. Does means that we'll have you doing that?

Regina Jackson: Hold on. I think I forgot to unmute Mr. Satterwhite. My apologies Mr. Satterwhite.

Dr. Satterwhite: No, I will be doing that. It's a pro bono service that was not... I didn't charge it to enhance the project, it's a natural way to conclude the work that we do. We would always conclude with a debriefing with the chair and others who you deem important to be involved. And we never charged for that at debriefing time, it's just a protocol and the way that we do our consulting practice.

Jose Dorado: Thank you very much.

Regina Jackson: Now I will also say to the commissioners that the last retreat... Well, the only retreat we had was done last year, and the bar that we set in terms of fees was \$10,000 for facilitation when we had to identify rental space, or food, or what have you that was over and above. So I know we have two very different proposals and I have no idea, it's not for me to be trying to negotiate a fee down. I just wanted to let everyone know as we talk about budget management where we have been in the past. Commissioner Singleton you are unmuted.

Tyfahra Singleton: Thank you, chair Jackson. So I just want to say that I feel like we have excellent candidates here and I'm especially moved by the work that Dr. Satterwhite has done at my Alma Mater [online 03:56:28] college. I was really excited to see that. And I've also personally experienced quite excellent facilitation from Blaze Consulting Group. So with that being said, I feel with what we've seen from the budget that we might consider being fiscally conservative and go with the lower cost consulting group. We can obviously have a discussion, but I would like to move that we select the Blaze Consulting Group for our retreat.

Regina Jackson: Thank you commissioner Singleton. Is there more discussion or is there a second to that motion? Commissioner Smith, you've been on unmuted.

Thomas Lloyd Smith: Yeah, I'll second the motion.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 10, 2020

- Regina Jackson: Okay. The motion has been... Excuse me. Been properly moved and seconded. I saw another hand commissioner Dorado.
- Jose Dorado: Yes. Thank you chair Jackson. What I see to be the... I'm very impressed with the proposal by Dr. Satterwhite, it's much more detailed than Blaze. And it seems to me that the major differences that the major difference is that Dr. Satterwhite has the conducting of the individual interviews that Blaze is not, and of course that's a substantial cost of 3,200. So, in the interest of negotiation, I would propose to Blaze if they would include that, I certainly would be in favor of voting in favor of Blaze.
- Regina Jackson: Okay. Thank you very much. Commissioner Garcia, followed by Commissioner Harbin-Forte, and we are three minutes away from needing to extend the meeting. Commissioner Garcia?
- Sergio Garcia: Thank you, Chair Jackson. I do think that these proposals, it's kind of apples and oranges. One of them is, 50% of the hours, I guess, 16, say 25 hours versus 70 hours. I think Commissioner Dorado picked up on the individual interviews, but 70 hours of work by the facilitator is substantial. It's a substantial investment. And so, I guess the way I see it, it's a lower cost to go with the Mr. Satterwhite option because you ended up getting more bang for your buck, if that's the way we want to go.
- Sergio Garcia: And if we're willing to invest, I guess the better way of seeing it for me, from where I stand is if we're willing to invest 70 plus hours in this process, Mr. Satterwhite is willing to invest that much time. And more, because he's not charging us for the final meeting with the Chair to debrief. So, we're looking at 70 plus hours. Then, I think that that's the most cost-effective way to get there, right?
- Sergio Garcia: I do believe that there are, in addition to the individual interviews with Commissioners, that there's some other deliverables here that appear to be a little more in-depth than the Blaze proposal and it could just be because it's broken out differently. But for example, the 2021 action plan. Not sure what that is, but that's 12 hours.
- Sergio Garcia: And if that action plan includes some of the items that you have already discussed, Madam Chair, with the facilitators, plus some of the anti-racist work that we have to do as part of this commission, and perhaps other things, because we're spending more time on the retreat, then I'd be in favor of actually going with a more in-depth retreat proposed by Mr. Satterwhite, than the second one proposed by the Blaze firm.
- Sergio Garcia: I don't want to spend too much time on this. I'm new to this, Madam Chair. I didn't participate obviously in the first retreat, but I do believe that more time is better. When you fashion retreat, I've always thought retreats are kind of... The deliverables are the time and energy you put into it, right? You could try to do a retreat in a day or half a day, but you're kidding yourself, right? Because there's so much to discuss. There's so many issues. There's so much planning. There's so



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 10, 2020

much debriefing that needs to be made. So, I'm always in favor of more rather than less, because you're always running out of time and that's all I want to say on that topic.

- Regina Jackson: No, thank you very much, Commissioner Garcia. We're going to have to put this aside for a moment. I need to get a motion to extend our meeting because it's now 10:30 and I... Let's see. Commissioner Dorado?
- Jose Dorado: I move that we extend the meeting for 30 minutes to 11:00.
- Regina Jackson: Okay. Is there a second?
- Thomas Lloyd Smith: Second.
- Regina Jackson: Commissioner Smith? Okay. It's been properly moved and seconded. We can go ahead and take that vote without doing public comment, correct? To extend the meeting?
- Thomas Lloyd Smith: Yes.
- Regina Jackson: Okay. Thank you so much. So, Commissioner Harbin-Forte?
- Brenda Harbin-Forte: Aye.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Smith?
- Thomas Lloyd Smith: Yes.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Dorado?
- Jose Dorado: Aye.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Garcia?
- Sergio Garcia: Aye.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Singleton?
- Tyfahra Singleton: Yes.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Gage.
- Henry Gage, III: Yes.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 10, 2020

- Regina Jackson: Thank you. And Aye for myself. So, we have extended the meeting to 11:00. So, now back to the hands that are up. Commissioner Harbin-Forte, you've been unmuted.
- Brenda Harbin-Forte: Thank you. One was a point of order, because I think we need a specific motion and I didn't hear that.
- Regina Jackson: Well, the motion that we received was from Commissioner Singleton. She wanted to put forth Blaze, but then, there were more questions on... Yeah. But we're not going to take a vote until after we've gone to public comment.
- Brenda Harbin-Forte: Okay. I wanted to... The other part that I had my hand up for was... And again, I thought I just heard Commissioner Singleton say, let's go with the lowest bidder. So, I was trying to figure out which one that was, but that would have been Blaze. [crosstalk 04:04:42] But with respect to the proposals, I agree with Commissioner Garcia that we really should try to look at... Well, I'm looking at experience. I'm more impressed with leadership and [inaudible 04:05:03] proposal. And so, I think that we ought to go with that to try to get as much as we can and the experience that he will bring, I'm impressed with.
- Brenda Harbin-Forte: I do think though, perhaps for example, some of the components can be cut down. For example, we may not need the 12 hours for the action plan. So, I don't think that will need to be included. I'm assuming that these are maximum hours in any event and maximum cost. And Dr. Satterwhite, I've been calling you Mister, but if you prefer doctor, I apologize, Dr. Satterwhite. Okay.
- Dr. Satterwhite: I prefer Omo.
- Brenda Harbin-Forte: Okay. [crosstalk 04:05:52] Thank you.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Smith?
- Thomas Lloyd Smith: Yes. So, I wanted to speak a little bit more on these two proposals. So, I think the key differentiating factor when I was thinking about this was in fact the costs, but that being said, when we try to compare one proposal against the other, I do believe that Dr. Satterwhite's proposal is more comprehensive. I do think there's still a question there about costs.
- Thomas Lloyd Smith: And so, if we do end up voting for that one, maybe there's an opportunity to do that dependent upon or conditioned upon fitting into a budget that we actually want to spend, because that... It's a pretty big difference in the costs of those two proposals. So, maybe we could... If we're going to point to the \$10,000 number, then maybe we could... If we end up approving that one, we could say yes, but contingent upon being able to fit his proposal into a [crosstalk 04:07:02] \$10,000 proposal, because if we were going to do that, and I knew he would come in at that number, then that would have an impact on which proposal I would choose. But at the number where it is now, \$14,000 for one, and I think it's 8,000 something for the other, I mean, that's a huge difference.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 10, 2020

Regina Jackson: Yeah. No, that makes sense. And if we were to set a ceiling not to exceed 10,000, then potentially, I can work with Dr. Satterwhite to cut away to get to 10,000 if he is amenable. And let me see, I think I have a question from Commissioner Garcia.

Sergio Garcia: I was just going to echo that when we're talking about the number of hours, the sheer number of hours and how comprehensive one proposal is over the other, we're talking about 25 hours versus 70, almost three X the number of hours. If we could potentially convince Omo if I will, if I can say that, Dr. Satterwhite, I think we could reduce the number of projected hours perhaps, and have a do not exceed that we feel comfortable with as Madam Chair has suggested. I would feel very comfortable with that approach. Because it's more than just cost, it's about the investment that we're going to be making and that our retreat facilitator will be making as well.

Regina Jackson: Okay. Thank you very much. I think at this point, we should go to public comments so that we can then deal with the motion that's on the table and make decisions with that in mind and then, move forward. So, if we're okay with doing that, I will send the meeting back to Mr. Rus for public comment.

Juanito Rus: Thank you, Madam Chair. If any member of the public would like to speak on item six, commission retreat, please raise your hand in the zoom queue and you'll be called in the order in which your hands are raised. The first hand in the queue is a telephone attendee with the last four digits 5802. I believe that is Mr. Bey. Good evening, Mr. Bey. Can you hear us?

Saleem Bey: Yes. Saleem Bey. And repeating what I have been saying, that keeps getting ignored, and when you're talking about dealing with racism and dealing with discrimination and dealing with different things and I'm saying that I'm a black Muslim and that a brother of mine who was a black Muslim was murdered, and when we went to the police after he's been murdered for 10 years, we found out that they didn't even have any of his case files.

Saleem Bey: When was the last time they had case files? They can't answer that. When was the last time they did any kind of investigation? They can't answer that. What type of investigation did they do? We don't know, right? But if I keep saying it and nobody is acting on it, then why are you up there if [inaudible 04:10:27] mandates that profiling and racial discrimination is your mandate? Act on your mandate and don't go to a retreat and talk about anything else unless you're talking about racial profiling and ending OPD's discrimination in the black community. The black and Muslim community.

Juanito Rus: Thank you, Mr. Bey. The next speaker in the queue is another telephone attendee with the last four digits, 5345. Good evening, 5345. Can you hear us?

Assata Olugbala: Yes. This is Assata Olugbala. When I spoke of racism, it cannot be assumed that your efforts to deal with that subject matter just includes the police department. You have to look at the possibility of implicit bias and explicit bias being a part of your being. As members of the commission, you have to dig into the prejudices and biases that you have. It's not just the police



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 10, 2020

department. The other thing is, based on the fact that the finance meeting on Monday of the city council is going to be looking at cuts. Are you talking about dedicated funds or are you talking about funds that you could spend with the possibility you may need to set those funds aside for potential cuts within your department or your commission? That discussion needs to be held because every department, every commission is going to have to look at some cuts with this \$62 million deficit that the city is facing.

- Juanito Rus: Thank you, Ms. Olugbala. At this time, I see no other hands in the queue. Madam chair, I return the meeting to you.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you very much. So, currently commissioners, we have a motion that has been moved and properly seconded that we have not taken a vote on, and that is to support the proposal of Blaze consulting. So, we need to take that vote and then, figure out our way forward.
- Regina Jackson: So, those who are in favor of Blaze consulting.... Commissioner Harbin-Forte, you've been unmuted.
- Brenda Harbin-Forte: No.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Gage, you've been unmuted.
- Henry Gage, III: No.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Dorado?
- Jose Dorado: No.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Garcia?
- Sergio Garcia: No.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Smith?
- Thomas Lloyd Smith: I abstain.
- Regina Jackson: Okay. Commissioner Singleton?
- Tyfahra Singleton: Yes.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you. And no for myself. So, the vote fails. Back to the conversation that we were a part of before. I heard several commissioners query as to whether or not the proposal submitted by Dr. Satterwhite, if it were to be reduced by way of hours, if that would be sufficient. Commissioner Smith?



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 10, 2020

Thomas Lloyd Smith: Yeah. So, I'd like to make a motion to approve the proposal by Dr. Satterwhite, contingent upon negotiating an agreement with him that does not exceed, let's say \$10,500.

Regina Jackson: Okay. It has been properly moved. Is there a second? I see a hand from Commissioner Dorado.

Jose Dorado: Yeah. Second.

Regina Jackson: Okay. It has been properly moved and seconded. We've taken public comment. I think the question I need to ask to Dr. Satterwhite is if he will entertain our motion, because if he won't, then it makes no sense to take the vote. Dr. Satterwhite?

Dr. Satterwhite: Yes, I'll entertain that motion and I will be reaching out to Franklin if you select our firm to consult about how to move forward.

Regina Jackson: Okay. Thank you very much. I do agree that both firms are outstanding because I've seen you both in action. Okay. So, now that we have confirmation from Dr. Satterwhite, it has been properly moved and seconded, and we can take a vote on this proposal. Commissioner Smith?

Thomas Lloyd Smith: Yes.

Regina Jackson: Commissioner Harbin-Forte?

Brenda Harbin-Forte: Aye.

Regina Jackson: Commissioner Gage?

Henry Gage, III: Yes.

Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Dorado?

Jose Dorado: Aye.

Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Garcia?

Sergio Garcia: Aye.

Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Singleton?

Tyfahra Singleton: Yes.

Regina Jackson: Thank you. Aye for myself. The motion passes unanimously and I have a hand up from Mr. Alden.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 10, 2020

- John Alden: Thank you, Madam chair. I just wanted to make sure I'm doing the appropriate staff follow up on the motion that just passed. I understand we have Dr. Satterwhite as the contractor with a not to exceed amount of 10,500. We do have a draft resolution in the packet for the commission to approve, and it has some fairly obvious blanks for the name of the contractor selected and the not to exceed amount. So, I have that information.
- John Alden: I would point out that there was one clause in there that just reads the police commissioner received proposals from X. And obviously, we put in there the names of the two contractors that we just heard from, but I might suggest that the commission also add to the end of that clause, the phrase, "and solicited contracts from" and then we can fill in there whichever other... Or "solicited bids from" whichever other contractors the Chair talk to, so we can show that we at least attempted to get bids from three or more bidders as required by the ordinance. If those edits sound correct, I would certainly appreciate if the commission were to move second and approve the resolution with those edits. Would that be all right with [inaudible 04:18:24]?
- Henry Gage, III: I move to approve the resolution with those edits. Yeah.
- Regina Jackson: Oh, okay. And Commissioner Dorado?
- Brenda Harbin-Forte: I'll second, Madam Chair.
- Jose Dorado: Oh. She beat me to it.
- Regina Jackson: Okay. Thank you. So, it has been properly moved and seconded to accept the edits inside the resolution. So hopefully, Mr. Alden, you have all the information that you need. I think we probably need to vote again since we have a different motion on the floor. So, we will take another vote. Commissioner Smith?
- Thomas Lloyd Smith: Yes. And just a point of clarification, it was to adopt the resolution and as you said, to accept the edits to the resolution.
- Regina Jackson: Yes. To adopt the resolution and accept the edits to the resolution. Okay. Thank you.
- Thomas Lloyd Smith: Yeah. [crosstalk 04:19:23].
- Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Garcia?
- Sergio Garcia: Yes.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Harbin-Forte?
- Brenda Harbin-Forte: Yes.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 10, 2020

- Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Gage?
- Henry Gage, III: Yes.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Dorado?
- Jose Dorado: Aye.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Singleton?
- Tyfahra Singleton: Yes.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you. And I'm sorry, aye for myself. So, the motion passes unanimously. Again, I want to say that I am very pleased that we were able to get such high quality companies to bid on work with the police commission. I certainly hope that although this time we didn't have the opportunity to work with Blaze consulting, maybe there will be opportunities down the road. I'm just excited that our arsenal of resources is growing as well. So, Dr. Satterwhite, I will be in contact with you tomorrow and Mr. Hysten, I will also follow up with you tomorrow as well. I thank you both for spending such time waiting to do the presentations and to hear the deliberations.
- Dr. Satterwhite: And as I've indicated, with your permission, I'd like to reach out to Franklin and have a conversation about,
- Regina Jackson: Absolutely. [crosstalk 04:21:03] I absolutely love the suggestion.
- Franklin Hysten: Thank you Omowale and thank you to the commission and the chair for your consideration. It was a pleasure.
- Regina Jackson: Absolutely. Thank you. Okay, Mr. Rus. We have 10 minutes to see how much more we can do.
- Regina Jackson: Let's see. I believe that Commissioner Dorado, didn't you suggest that we delay this item?
- Jose Dorado: Yes, ma'am, Chair Jackson. Let me just say briefly that I have edits virtually on all 12 pages of the 15-01 and I think it's important that we have our meetings as the ad hoc on 15-01, consisting of yourself, Commissioner Harbin-Forte and myself, and that we decide how we're going to incorporate public comment into this very important draft policy. So, I would definitely propose that we table it, but I wanted to say one other thing and that is that one thing that really strikes me is the fact in my opinion, that if the city and that city, in terms of our city, in terms of councils, going back to June of 1996, OPD and city staff, and particularly including the neighborhood services coordinators, had they sincerely and fully implemented community policing as of 24 years ago, we would be far, far along the road of answering some of the questions that the task force is grappling with now.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 10, 2020

- Jose Dorado: Not to mention that I do firmly believe that we would have grassroots based, neighborhood based organizations that would be in a very viable way dealing with the crime, particularly, the crime that we're seeing and the violence that we're seeing and the tragic killings that we're seeing, that we'd really have a infrastructure that would have a handle on how to deal with this as a community. So, I'm extremely frustrated that we've gone 24 years and tens of millions of dollars and this has not been anywhere close to being implemented. So, that being said, I would make a motion that we table our review of a 15-01 for now.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you very much. Commissioner Harbin-Forte? It's been properly moved.
- Brenda Harbin-Forte: I will second that.
- Regina Jackson: Okay. Thank you. It's been properly moved and seconded. Why don't we go to public comments since we have to do that anyway, and then we can talk about next steps. Mr. Rus?
- Juanito Rus: Thank you, Madam Chair. If any member of the public would like to make comment on item seven, please raise your hand in the zoom queue and you will be called in the order in which your hands are raised. The first hand... Let me switch my clock, excuse me. The first hand in the queue is a telephone attendee. The last four digits 5345. Good evening, 5345. Can you hear us?
- Assata Olugbala: Yes, I can. I think it's very important to weigh in on the fact that as a result of getting information from the Measure B committee, the CROs and the CRTs in one of their meetings were presented in terms of race representation. And CROs for the city of Oakland is only 9% African-Americans, 43% Latinos, 20 something percent white, 11% Asian. Same thing with the CRTs, only 7% of the CRTs are black. There is a disproportionate, low number of African-Americans represented in CROs and CRTs. Another step in the direction of why we are always the least involved and we are the most impacted. So, I don't know what this discussion is about, the neighborhood's coordinators or whatever, but I want answers about why we have such poor representation of the CROs and CRTs, as it relates to our African-Americans in the police department.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you, Ms. Olugbala. The next speaker in the queue is Megan Steffen. Good evening, Ms. Steffen. Can you hear us?
- Megan Steffen: I can hear you. Thank you so much. I just wanted to say with regards to this policy, that I'm very excited that Commissioner Dorado has marked it all up. I have also marked it all up and I'm looking forward to when public input will come. I also wanted to say that the community policing advisory board had a very interesting town hall on Monday, where they invited the heads of all of the NCSCs to be there. In the spirit of talking about racial equity, I was quite concerned to hear neighborhoods trying to sort of parse themselves off by interest as opposed to really using the opportunity to grapple with inequities within the city. And I appreciated what Commissioner Dorado had to say at that meeting and I hope that it was heard. Thank you so much.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 10, 2020

- Juanito Rus: Thank you, Ms. Steffen. The next speaker in the queue is listed as J, well, I believe that is Mr. John Bey. Good evening, Mr. Bey. Can you hear us?
- John Bey: Yes, this is John Bey, and perhaps if we're going back to the failures of OPD to invest in community policing, perhaps the crimes that were committed against our family by OPD and JTTF resources, which is budget, maybe they can be investigated and explained. And further, for 26 years, going on 18 of that now has been a documented failure by the Oakland police department because they continue to be under federal oversight and are unable to get out of federal oversight, yet they double the overtime and they consider that they're doing it a favor for the city and the residents by charging us considerably more on overtime for less overtime hours. That means they're overpaid on their base rate.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you, Mr. Bey. The next speaker in the queue is a telephone attendee with the last four digits 5802. I believe that belongs to Mr. Saleem Bey. Good evening, Mr. Bey. Can you hear us?
- Saleem Bey: Yes. Saleem Bey. Again, to reiterate with my brother just said, if these things had been addressed during the NSA or any time in the last 18 years, we wouldn't be coming here after 15 plus years telling you the exact same thing of how the black community is being mistreated. After we tell you how bad the black community has been mistreated, then the Oakland police officers said black officers are being mistreated [inaudible 00:31:55]. Unless you fully fund the neighborhood councils, give them a direction and resources and help in order to execute community safety, then anything that you impose upon them means that they are working for the police instead of the police working for the community. The police serve the community and they should be serving the safety needs of the community and held accountable for which communities are not meeting the safety indexes that say that they're as safe as Piedmont. People in the community deserve to be as safe in East Oakland and West Oakland as the people in Piedmont. The more money you spend on poverty, the less money you'll spend on OPD.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you, Mr. Bey. Your time has expired. At this time, seeing no further hands in the queue. Madam chair, I return the meeting to you.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you very much. So, I heard you Commissioner Dorado, when you said you've marked up all 12 pages. It sounds like the next step is to upload that document with your recommended changes, track changes or otherwise. And then, I thought I also heard Megan Steffen say that she has marked it up as well. So, we can get our ad hoc meetings started and hopefully invite Megan and whomever else would like to contribute to that conversation, so that we could be working in alignment and hopefully, fairly efficiently to get this really critical policy updated and then trained too. Does that sound like a good action plan, commissioner Dorado?
- Jose Dorado: Yes ma'am. It certainly does.
- Regina Jackson: Okay, terrific. So, that'll be how we move. And now we are, of course, at 11:00 where we... Our meeting is extended to 11. I'd like to know if we can get a motion.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 10, 2020

Regina Jackson: And I'd like to know if we can get a motion to extend it to 11:30, we should be able to finish up the meeting. Commissioner Brenda Harbin-Forte?

Brenda Harbin-Forte: Thank you, Chair. I'll move to extend the meeting to 11:30.

Regina Jackson: Thank you. [crosstalk 04:32:17] Commissioner Dorado?

Jose Dorado: Did we need to vote on the table of the motion, of the item?

Regina Jackson: [crosstalk 04:32:25] Well, we can... We need to extend the meeting first.

Jose Dorado: [crosstalk 04:32:30] I'll second the motion by Commissioner Harbin-Forte.

Regina Jackson: Terrific. So, it's been properly moved and seconded. Let's vote on the extension of the meeting to 11:30. Commissioner Harbin-Forte?

Brenda Harbin-Forte: Aye.

Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Dorado?

Jose Dorado: Aye.

Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Garcia?

Sergio Garcia: Aye.

Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Smith?

Thomas Lloyd Smith: Yes.

Regina Jackson: Commissioner Singleton?

Tyfahra Singleton: Yes.

Regina Jackson: Aye for myself. Commissioner Gage?

Henry Gage, III: Yes.

Regina Jackson: Thank you. Motion passes. The meeting will be extended to 11:30 and now a second round of votes to table, the community policing policy. Commissioner Smith?

Thomas Lloyd Smith: Yes.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 10, 2020

Regina Jackson: Commissioner Harbin-Forte?

Brenda Harbin-Forte: Aye.

Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Gage?

Henry Gage, III: Yes.

Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Singleton?

Tyfahra Singleton: Yes.

Regina Jackson: And Commissioner Dorado?

Jose Dorado: Aye.

Regina Jackson: And aye for myself. Did I get Commissioner Garcia?

Sergio Garcia: No you did not. Aye.

Regina Jackson: Great. Thank you. So, it has been approved unanimously and we will bring that back just as soon as we have coordinated the community engagement piece so that the ad hoc can move forward expeditiously. Now, we will move forward to item number eight, which is the review of CPRA pending cases. Mr. Alden?

John Alden: Thank you Madam Chair. Commissioners, I know it's late, so I'll be fast. Please do feel free to interrupt me or ask questions. I can get into any number of these items in a little more length and detail if you wish. I have four things I'd like to highlight tonight briefly. First is to update you on the status of our reorganization, which we've talked about before. The first phase of creating a chief of staff position has gone on very well. The finance department and Human Resources Management have approved and created the position. So, that is now officially a physician at CPRA. It is currently funded, but vacant and we are working on filling it on a short-term contract basis, while we do a permanent recruitment to create a permanent fill in that position. I am hopeful that we should have someone in there on a temporary basis while we're doing that permanent recruitment as early as January one.

John Alden: So, I'll keep you posted on how that goes. The second phase of the reorganization was of course, to alter some of the staffing to the commission. We've started the meet and confer process with the union about that and I was pleased that we had a really productive conversation and ended on a positive note. We still have small work to do there, but I'm feeling good about the direction that's headed. Second item I wanted to talk to you about is the Inspector General's office. As you know, with the passage of S1, it now is part of city charter that this commission will get to hire the Inspector General. The Inspector General position classification, the job description the city has



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 10, 2020

for that job needed to be updated accordingly, and I know the commission had some time ago, some specific language it wanted to have in that position description. So, working with the chair, we've been working on getting that position description altered to match the new charter language and the commission's past direction. That will require approval from the civil service board, which is going to be meeting next week on the 17th.

John Alden: And while that agenda hasn't been published yet, it's my understanding from Human Resources Management that they are working as hard as they can to make sure that that item is included on that agenda for next week. So, that means our Inspector General hiring processes moving very quickly. And that's good. I want to thank in particular Greg Preece and Ian Appleyard at Human Resources Management and Ed Reiskin in the city administrator's office, of course, who has been super helpful in making this move quickly. And also Richard Luna, one of the assistants over there who has been moving this quickly too. So, I'll keep you posted probably at our next meeting about how that went on December 17th.

John Alden: Another item that we should talk about is of course, the budget. You've heard a lot about that tonight. There will be more next week at city council, as you heard about the state of the budget, it is especially dire. One statistic that I learned earlier this week that gave me a little bit of shock was that the last two quarters for the city of Oakland showed a worse drop-off in revenue than any of the quarters during the great depression and the total revenue loss over the last few quarters was equivalent to the entire revenue loss over the four year period of the great recession for the city. So, just think about it that way. It's a pretty dramatic change. You have heard some conversation about how you can be involved in the changes to the police department's budget. We should also be aware that we might need to think about our own budget for CPRA, Inspector General and the commission.

John Alden: Now, our budget, as we've talked about in previous meetings is roughly 90% staff, another 5% or so fixed expenses like rent and utilities. And we have only a modest portion of the budget that is truly discretionary and mostly, that's money we would use for training, outreach, and contracting costs like the contract [inaudible 04:39:01] earlier tonight. So, if there were changes to our budget, those would have to come either through the collective bargaining process, lowering or altering compensation for employees, which is not something that we have control over at this level. Neither I as your department head, nor you as the commission have the ability to control that in Oakland. That process is done in negotiation through these unions with the city council. [inaudible 04:39:24] So, we'll have to wait and see if there are any changes there, but we may be asked to try to figure out a way to economize with respect to the very modest amount of discretionary spending we have. I will be in touch with you as I hear more from our finance department about that issue, but I sort of want to give you that overall sketch of what our finances look like and how they might change. I would recommend that the commission plan to agendize that topic at your first meeting in January, because I think by then, we'll have much more concrete information about what we need to do.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 10, 2020

- John Alden: Last thing I wanted to mention to you is our statistical report, which is attached to the agenda tonight, item eight. I think a couple main points there are that we're still working through a very significant backlog of cases at the intake stage, at the beginning stage of investigation. This comes largely because we had at one point, all three of our intake technicians out on leave at the same time. We did get some temporary folks in to help with that. They're still with us and so, now we actually have five intake techs going at once instead of three. And so, that backlogs coming down quickly. Another thing I should mention to you is that among the closed cases, you'll notice one entry about an allegation that we could not investigate because it was past the 3304 time limit. I want to reassure you that in that particular instance, that was because the complainant asked us to re-investigate some very old matters that had been investigated several years past.
- John Alden: And so, because those have been investigated previously under other complaints in years past, we were well past the one year statute of limitations on those issues. But this complainant also had some things to complain about that were recent, so we took a look at those and we're just unable to look at the materials that were already so old. So, I didn't want you to come away from that thinking that that was a sign anyone at CPRA had failed to investigate the case in timely fashion. It was just that someone came to us with some very, very dated complaints. Those are the highlights. If any commissioners would like to know more about any of those topics, I'd be happy to answer any questions you might have.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you, Mr. Alden. The only request that I have is that you make sure that HR sends us the final job description based upon whatever adjustments that measure S1 required, to the Inspector General position.
- John Alden: Sure. I could get that. Would you like me to send it to all the commissioners or just you?
- Regina Jackson: Please. Yeah.
- John Alden: Happy to send it to everybody.
- Regina Jackson: Absolutely. Thank you.
- John Alden: Yeah.
- Regina Jackson: Are there any questions for Mr. Alden? Okay, hearing none, we will go to public comment.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you, Madam Chair. If any member of the public wishes to speak on item eight on tonight's agenda, please raise your hand in the Zoom queue and you will be called in the order in which your hands are raised. This time, I see two hands raised in the queue. The first one is a telephone attendee with the last four digits 5345. I believe that is Ms. Assata Olugbala. Good evening, Ms. Olugbala. Can you hear us?
- Assata Olugbala: Can you hear me?



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 10, 2020

- Juanito Rus: We can hear you now. Whenever you're ready.
- Assata Olugbala: Okay. Apologize for the problems. I had an opportunity to be in a hearing of the ethics commission. The ethics commission have their hearings in public. The investigator does not make a decision on the issue. The investigator presents their findings to a hearing officer. That went on for two days. This particular investigation was a former city employee who was taking money from citizens for permits.
- Assata Olugbala: This system we have for our investigators is not transparent enough. It is not able to clearly identify credibility of the work that they're doing and something needs to be devised that develops transparency, accountability, because it's not happening and it needs to be happening that we can validate the work of the investigators.
- Juanito Rus: [crosstalk 04:44:25] Thank you, Ms. Olugbala. Your time has expired. The next speaker in the queue is a telephone attendee with the extension 5802. I believe that is Mr. Saleem Bey. Good evening, Mr. Bey. Can you hear us?
- Saleem Bey: Yes. Good evening. Saleem Bey. First of all, I'd like to comment on Mr. Alden. Mr. Alden, you oversee a CPRA that is the exact same failed investigators as CPRB, right? These are the same people that the city of Oakland residents voted in a super majority of no confidence and yet, the police commission after this vote picked up all of these people as your investigator. That goes directly to your credibility, Mr. Alden, and if it was a failed investigation that timed out because it was such a poor investigation, that's a catch 22 because somebody comes back and says "Can you look at it?" The failed investigators are the ones that made sure that the investigation needed to be re-investigated in the first place. So, that is something that needs to be addressed and the fact that the CPRA is the same as the CPRB goes to the credibility or the failed credibility of the OTC [crosstalk 04:45:49] as it was designed.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you, Mr. Bey. Your time has expired. At this time, seeing no further hands in the queue, Madam Chair, I return the meeting to you.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you very much. Can you advance the slide, please? Thank you. So, now we need to approve the minutes unless there are any edits. Can any commissioner let me know if there are any errors. Otherwise, please...
- Regina Jackson: Commissioner Dorado.
- Jose Dorado: I move approval of the minutes of November 12th, 2020.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you. Is there Commissioner Garcia?
- Sergio Garcia: I second.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 10, 2020

- Regina Jackson: Excellent. It's been properly moved and seconded. Let's take public comment and then we can come back and vote.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you, Madam Chair. If any member of the public wishes to speak on item nine of tonight's agenda, please raise your hand in the Zoom queue. I see one hand raised at this time. It's a telephone attendee with the extension 5802. Mr. Saleem Bey. Good evening, Mr. Bey. You can begin whenever you're ready.
- Sergio Garcia: The meeting's going to extend to another half hour.
- Saleem Bey: Yes. Once again, Saleem Bey. In regards to the failed investigation, or not even a failed investigation. Incompetence is not the word either. It's less than that. How do you lose somebody's file? Not only do you lose the case files, but I keep saying this and everybody sits up there on the dais like a bump on a log when I'm telling you about violations of the consent decree, of which you're under and are supposed to abide by. We can only say this so many times, you look at the meeting minutes, you'll look back and you'll see that we keep saying this thing, that doesn't need to be something special. The chief can go open up that and look in and start acting on it immediately. Why can't that be done? Why isn't anybody asking the chief why she won't address something as egregious as lost files? That is something that needs to be taken care of immediately, and I'm asking the police commission to do your job and contact the chief.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you, Mr. Bey. Seeing no further hands raised, Madam Chair, I return the meeting to you.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you very much. So, let's take a vote. It's been properly moved and seconded to accept the minutes of November 12th. Commissioner Harbin-Forte?
- Brenda Harbin-Forte: Aye.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Garcia?
- Sergio Garcia: Aye.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Smith?
- Thomas Lloyd Smith: Yes.
- Regina Jackson: Commissioner Singleton?
- Tyfahra Singleton: Yes.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Gage?
- Henry Gage, III: Yes.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 10, 2020

- Regina Jackson: Commissioner Dorado?
- Jose Dorado: Aye.
- Regina Jackson: Aye for myself. Motion passes unanimously. Item 10, please. So, I don't think everybody wants to meet on Christmas Eve, even if we are virtual. I'm just making an assumption there. I would like to recommend however, that we meet December 17th, which will be next Thursday and while we're meeting back to back, we will then have a little bit of a break until January and my proposal is that we have a focus meeting, training on racism and equity from the office of race and equity, Darlene Flynn. So, I'm happy to entertain any discussion, but I put forth that this meeting would be focused on just that subject. It likely would be about two, maybe two and a half hours, but it also facilitates one of the trainings that we are all required to have. None of us have ever had it before, because this is the first time it's coming up. Are there any questions? Okay. If there are no questions, I would love to entertain a motion. Commissioner Dorado.
- Jose Dorado: I move that we set our next meeting for December 17th, 2020.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you. Is there a second?
- Sergio Garcia: I Second.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you. Seconded by Commissioner Garcia. It has been properly moved and seconded. Let's go to public comment and then, we can take a vote.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you, Madam Chair. If any member of the public wishes to speak on item 10 on tonight's agenda, you may raise your hand in the Zoom queue and you'll be called in the order in which your hands are raised. At this time, I see one hand in the queue. It is a telephone attendee with the extension 5802, Mr. Saleem Bey. Good evening, Mr. Bey. Can you hear us?
- Saleem Bey: Yes. Saleem Bey. Yes. Again, his name is Waajid Bey. W-A-A-J-I-D B-E-Y. He was a family member. He was a grandfather. He was a father. He was a businessman. He had a payroll of over 200 black jobs in Oakland, and I think he wasn't just some person that you can write off and think that just because he was a black Muslim and that he doesn't get the same treatment as everybody else, that people don't care about him. This is why we'll continue to speak about this and until we get any type of action on something that is just basic service, the reason why you are a commission is for people to come to you and be able to ask for a service. We've been going to OPD and the city council for all these years saying the exact same thing. And as a matter of fact, if Ginale Harris was on there right now, she would be acting on it after I said it the very first time and moving it forward. Instead, we hear a bunch of bump on the logs up there and as a matter fact, Mr. Smith is representing police officers out in [crosstalk 04:52:59]
- Juanito Rus: Thank you, Mr. Bey. Your time is expired. The next speaker in the queue is a telephone attendee with the last four digits, 5345. Good evening, Ms. Olugbala. Can you hear us?



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 10, 2020

- Assata Olugbala: I can hear you. [crosstalk 04:53:22] Yes, sir. Thank you. I don't think you could have believed this meeting was going to go on without me mentioning the fact that Ginale Harris has not been able to maintain her position on the police commission and that was... The reason is because she was targeted by certain individuals, including the coalition for police accountability and others, and the fact that you don't address it, the fact that Singleton and Garcia sit there knowing that they came on that seat in a corrupt manner and they don't have the integrity to say, "I feel it's necessary that we look into what happened." Ms. Jackson, you told me you didn't want to be involved in the selection process, but I saw on the agenda for the approval of Mr. Singleton, that the mayor consulted with you, Jose Dorado, and Forte. So, you did it with [crosstalk 04:54:26] but you wouldn't do it for Miss...
- Juanito Rus: Your time has expired. At this time, I see no other hands raised in the queue, Madam Chair, I return it to you.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Harbin-Forte?
- Brenda Harbin-Forte: Yes. I just... I had a point of order question. I think the motion that we're talking about now and that public comments should be on is whether to schedule a meeting, move the December 24 meeting to December 17, and I'm wondering why we are talking about or getting public comment on anything other than the specific agenda item.
- Regina Jackson: Well, we can't control what they comment on, but the motion on the floor, which has been moved and properly seconded that we're getting ready to vote about is moving that meeting to December 17th.
- Brenda Harbin-Forte: All right. I understand but I do think that we... These meetings go on so long because people will not speak to the agenda items. They speak to everything other than the agenda items and in order to be fair to every member of the public, I would just really wish that people would confine their comments to the agenda items.
- Regina Jackson: I understand. We'll be redesigning some of the process starting in January. Would you like to vote?
- Brenda Harbin-Forte: Yes. I vote Aye.
- Regina Jackson: Okay. Thank you. Commissioner Gage?
- Henry Gage, III: Yes.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Dorado?
- Jose Dorado: Aye.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 10, 2020

- Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Singleton?
- Tyfahra Singleton: Yes.
- Regina Jackson: Commissioner Smith?
- Thomas Lloyd Smith: Yes.
- Regina Jackson: Commissioner Garcia?
- Sergio Garcia: Yes.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you. Aye for myself. Our next meeting will be scheduled for December 17th. It will have one subject which will be our race and equity training. Thank you. So, agenda setting and prioritization... Because our next meeting will be a training, I could imagine that we can do agenda setting for the January meeting at the end of our training. If that's all right with you all. I would accept a motion to table agenda setting and then go to public comment and then we should be almost finished.
- Sergio Garcia: So moved.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you, Commissioner Garcia. Is there a second?
- Jose Dorado: Second.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you, Commissioner Dorado. It's been properly moved and seconded. Let's go to public comment please.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you. Madam chair. Any member of the public wishes to speak on item 11 on tonight's agenda, please raise your hand in the Zoom queue. This time, I see two hands raised in the queue. The first is for telephone attendee, extension 5345. Good evening, Ms. Olugbala, can you hear us?
- Assata Olugbala: Yes. Thank you, sir. I think it's so inappropriate that any member of this body called for correctness on any level. On any level, when you avoid dealing with the fact that you had a member of the commission pushed out in a manner for which the tapes clearly see that misstatements were made. It was inappropriate. And you want order? You will have no order until you deal with the fact that Ginale Harris was not appropriately allowed to have a chance to be on the police commission again. She was targeted and what right do you have to go meet with the mayor to have a voice about who should be on the police commission? That was inappropriate. Don't talk about appropriateness when you have levels of inappropriateness going on all the time. So, I have a right, according to the Brown act, to speak and I don't have to be dictated [crosstalk 04:59:10] about what I say.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 10, 2020

- Juanito Rus: Ms. Olugbala. The next speaker in the queue is a telephone attendee with the last four digits, 5802. Mr. John Bey... Oh, Mr. Saleem Bey. Excuse me. Mr. Bey, can you hear us?
- Saleem Bey: Yes. Saleem Bey. First of all, freedom of speech means that I have the right to speak on anything as I see fit, right? All this blends directly into the Oakland police commission and their jobs. If you're not doing your job, then you wouldn't hear from me. I've been saying the same thing, like I say, for years, and years before some of the people who are tired of hearing about this got on the commission. If you acted or the people who put you on there had acted on these delinquent cases, then I wouldn't have to be on here telling you every other time about my brother Waajid. Act on it and you won't have to hear from me. Act on it, we won't have to show up and call you for your lack of action, but to tell somebody that you don't want to sit up here and hear what they have to say after you give the public one minute after they sit around for four hours and listen to the police give a BS report [crosstalk 05:00:36] and then you come up and say, we ain't got a right to talk but one minute and that you can't listen to what that one minute is.
- Juanito Rus: At this time, seeing no other hands in the queue, Madam chair, I return it to you.
- Regina Jackson: Commissioner Harbin-Forte?
- Brenda Harbin-Forte: Madam Chair, point of order. There's nothing that obligates me or any other commissioner to hear the public defame me, disparage me and make misrepresentations about anything that I have ever done. They are simply wrong. They do not have the right to continue to speak over and over and over again and to be repetitive at these meetings. They have an obligation to confine their comments to the agenda item on. If there is no limitation and they feel they can talk about anything at all, then why don't we debate the question of whether there really is a Santa Claus?
- Brenda Harbin-Forte: You do not have the right to talk about anything you want to talk about. There was an agenda. We've been meeting since 6:30. It is now 11:30. We have listened for five hours already and it is time for us to be more efficient at these meetings and for others to be sensitive and respectful of other people. The reason it takes so long to get to the end of the agenda is that we hear the same things over and over again. And I know we'll address procedures at another time, but I simply will not have anybody in the... A Member of the public, you do not have a right to accuse me of things. It's absolutely wrong and you will not make any misrepresentations about me. I don't have to take it and I will not take it. Sorry, Madam Chair.
- Regina Jackson: That's all right. Thank you. So, we are tabling this item. It was properly moved and seconded and we're voting now. Commissioner Harbin-Forte?
- Brenda Harbin-Forte: Aye.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Gage?
- Henry Gage, III: Yes.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

December 10, 2020

Regina Jackson: Commissioner Dorado?

Jose Dorado: Aye.

Regina Jackson: Commissioner Singleton?

Tyfahra Singleton: Yes.

Regina Jackson: Commissioner Smith?

Thomas Lloyd Smith: Yes.

Regina Jackson: Commissioner Garcia?

Sergio Garcia: Yes.

Regina Jackson: Thank you. Aye for myself. Mr. Rus, can you advance the agenda? I mean, we... It passes unanimously.

Juanito Rus: Your favorite item.

Regina Jackson: Motion to adjourn?

Brenda Harbin-Forte: So moved.

Regina Jackson: Thank you. Seconded? [crosstalk 05:03:27].

Regina Jackson: Thirded and fourthed. Okay. So, let's vote pretty quickly. Commissioner Harbin-Forte?

Brenda Harbin-Forte: Aye.

Regina Jackson: Commissioner Garcia?

Sergio Garcia: Aye.

Regina Jackson: Commissioner Dorado?

Jose Dorado: Aye.

Regina Jackson: Smith?

Thomas Lloyd Smith: Yes.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION
MEETING TRANSCRIPT
December 10, 2020

Regina Jackson: Singleton?

Tyfahra Singleton: Yes.

Regina Jackson: Gage?

Henry Gage, III: Yes.

Regina Jackson: And Aye for myself. We are adjourned. I will see you December 17th. Thank you so very much.
Good night.

Sergio Garcia: Good night, everybody.