



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION MEETING TRANSCRIPT

January 28, 2021

- Regina Jackson: Welcome, everyone, to the Oakland Police Commission meeting of January 28th, 2021. It is approximately 6:31, and delighted to have everyone here. First, we're going to call to order and now we are going to move to our establishment of quorum. So we're going to do a roll call. Commissioner Brenda Harbin-Forte?
- Brenda Harbin-Forte: Present.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Henry Gage?
- Henry Gage, III: Present.
- Regina Jackson: Excellent. Commissioner Jose Dorado?
- Jose Dorado: Presente.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Sergio Garcia?
- Sergio Garcia: Here.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Tyfahra Singleton?
- Tyfahra Singleton: Present.
- Regina Jackson: Excellent, thank you. And let me see...I do not see Alternate Commissioner David Jordan yet, but hopefully he'll be joining us. And then of course I am present. We do have a quorum. So now we can move forward to the welcome and the public comment. Just before we get to the public comment, I'd like to share a statement.
- Regina Jackson: Tonight, I am announcing that at our next regular meeting we will agendize a resolution. Calling for the Oakland Police Department's sworn officers to receive immediate vaccine access. As public safety officers standing on the front line and interacting every day with the people of Oakland, officers of the Oakland Police Department must be vaccinated for COVID-19. It's that simple. It's important for them. It's important for Oakland's community and it's important to the Commission as an oversight body.
- Regina Jackson: Public health and public safety go hand in hand, which is what we recognized when we vaccinated Oakland's firefighters weeks ago. Oakland relies on our police and our firefighters to show up for work every day and to interact with the public. We ask them to keep us safe. Vaccines, in this moment in time, are clearly a central part of that charge.
- Regina Jackson: Between now and our next meeting, I will continue to demand clear, reliable answers from public health officials about what legal or logistical obstacles remain before Oakland can vaccinate all of its police. And then I will ask my fellow commissioners and the public at large to support my call for this action on this crucial matter. In the meantime, we absolutely, critically require that our officers use the appropriate PPE at all times. Mask up everywhere. Thank you.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

January 28, 2021

- Regina Jackson: At this time, I would like to hand this over to Mr. Rus .
- Juanito Rus: Thank you, Chair.
- Regina Jackson: Public comment, please.
- Juanito Rus: At this time, if any member of the public wishes to comment during tonight's open forum, please raise your hand in the Zoom queue and you will be called in the order in which your hands are raised. One second, while I put the clock up. This time, I see two hands. The first speaker tonight is a telephone attendee with the last four digits 0185. Good evening, 0185. Can you hear us? Good evening 0185. You can unmute yourself if you're ready.
- Michele Lazaneo: This is Michele Lazaneo, spokesman for the Bandabaila family. Tatiana Dugger is 18. She was last seen in Oakland. Her family reported her missing to OPD, January 9th and four days later, OPD requested Butte County Sheriffs assume jurisdiction. OPD posted nothing about Tati on social media until January 20th. Doesn't this sound like Jonathan Bandabaila? January 11th, the FBI conducted a Joint Agency Operation called Operation Lost Angels. They recovered 33 missing children, and who were being sexually exploited for prostitution. Missing persons cases often lead to human trafficking, but remember, OPD's Missing Persons Unit has been understaffed for years. What can you do about it? Vice-Mayor Kaplan is bringing the issue of missing persons to the public safety committee meeting originally set for the agenda on February 19th. She is recommending the reallocation of \$668,000 from a California community policing grant to fully fund OPD's Missing Persons Unit. Money that OPD wanted to use for helicopter maintenance and computers. Please support Vice-Mayor Kaplan's proposal.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you.
- Michele Lazaneo: Thank you.
- Juanito Rus: Ms. Lazaneo, your time has expired. Sorry my apologies, Ms. Lazaneo.
- Juanito Rus: The next speaker in the queue is Megan Steffen. Good evening, Ms. Steffen.
- Megan Steffen: Good evening. Thanks so much, Mr. Rus. Can you hear me?
- Juanito Rus: Oh, we can hear you.
- Megan Steffen: Oh, you didn't start my time.
- Juanito Rus: Whenever you're ready.
- Megan Steffen: Okay, great. I'm just calling in to thank the Commission for adding item 12, the committee reports agenda item. I think that this item will help the public keep tabs on how many committees are currently running and what they're focused on. I do hope also that it might help the Police Commission keep tabs on how many ad hoc committees there are. And I'd like to suggest that



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION MEETING TRANSCRIPT

January 28, 2021

perhaps if a committee has an ad hoc committee has been in place for over say, nine months, that it might be transformed into a standing committee as it's need, might seem to be longer than just briefly as needed. Thank you so much for hearing my comments and for being so responsive.

Juanito Rus: Thank you, Ms. Steffen. The next speaker in the queue is Ms. Olugbala. Good evening, Ms. Olugbala. Can you hear us?

Assata Olugbala.: Yes. The [inaudible 00:08:46] Ginale Harris will not be ignored. I just left the meeting of the tenant protection board. I in the meeting of the OUSD Oakland Unified School District last night, I was at a meeting of the L-CAP committee earlier today. All of these meetings had interpretation in Spanish. The OUSD board meetings has Spanish, Arabic, Mam and Mandarin for those that need it. We fall short of having the opportunity to have public engagement for everyone. When we only have English as the way that you can be participants in the meeting, other committees, other resources use interpreters, and we have the equal access ordinance that is mandated that you provide Spanish and Mandarin to the citizens.

Juanito Rus: Thank you, Ms. Olugbala. The next speaker in the queue is a telephone attendee with the last four digits, 5802. Good evening, 5802. Can you hear us?

Saleem Bey: Yes. Good afternoon. This is Saleem Bey. First off, I would like to say that, like Ms. Assata that we'll never forget that Ginale Harris was railroaded off of this Commission after she was attacked for standing up against OTP and being one of the hardest working persons on the Commission, all of a sudden she isn't worthy to be on the Commission. That's politics. The second thing is, is that Mr. Alden has never been involved in our case yet over the last two weeks. Mr. Alden has been the person that's speaking for our case, our independent investigation. Mr. Alden could interpret 13262 as being qualifying for Senate bill 1421, which is transparency, but instead they're doubling down and keeping the 13262 investigation trying to keep it hidden underneath a cloak of supposedly 3304.

Juanito Rus: Time has expired.

Saleem Bey: Thank you.

Juanito Rus: The next speaker in the queue is listed as AJ, I believe that's Ms. Janks, and Ms. Janks is using an older version of Zoom. So I'm going to promote her to the panel. Good evening, Ms. Janks, can you hear us?

Anne Janks: Yes, I can. And I'm sorry. I did try to update my Zoom, I don't know why it's so-

Juanito Rus: It's all right. You have one minute whenever you're ready.

Anne Janks: Okay. Yeah. I just wanted to say that I will support a call to get the OPD officers vaccinated primarily because public health officials say that the people who are least compliant should be vaccinated first, but we've asked, you've heard repeatedly from the public. The public has asked the chief about the fact that they continue to be in public, engaging the public, not seeming to



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION MEETING TRANSCRIPT

January 28, 2021

care about whether they're exposing themselves or whether they're exposing the public to COVID. And it really is very regrettable that they are such a potential spreader of the disease. By all means, let's vaccinate them since they won't wear masks consistently. Thank you.

Juanito Rus: Thank you, Ms. Janks. The next speaker in the queue is Mr. Kevin Cantu. Good evening, Mr. Cantu. Can you hear us?

Kevin Cantu: Good evening. I'd like to echo what a speaker earlier said that more access in multiple languages and multiple formats would be spectacular. I understand that what works for me doesn't work for everybody. I think that I have just seen some discussion about the statement at the beginning of this meeting, and I am not sure that vaccinating police officers should be nearly as high a priority as vaccinating a lot of other people in our government and in our community. I understand that we have mishandled things like prison population vaccination, and police have more exposure, but let's vaccinate prisoners first.

Juanito Rus: Thank you, Mr. Cantu. At this time, I see no further hands in the queue. Madam Chair, I'll return the meeting to you. As a quick point of privilege, I believe the agenda as is put out to the public every meeting, there is a portion at the beginning where members of the public can request translation services and those are available upon request. So if any member of the public wishes translation services, they can request those and they can be made available through equal access.

Regina Jackson: Thank you for the context, Mr. Rus, appreciate that. If you can update the screen for me, that will be helpful. And I have been alerted that alternate Commissioner Jordan is having to do some troubleshooting. I don't know about other people, but the wifi with this rain, internet, all of that is a little wonky. So item four, as soon as we put it out there, we kind of take it back again. I was alerted that Commissioner Jackson had to resign before he got put on the Commission.

Regina Jackson: Fortunately for him, he recently was promoted to CEO of a major health entity and decided that the time commitment would probably not work. So unfortunately we will not be welcoming Commissioner James Jackson to Police Commission. And there will still be another mayoral appointee opening. With that, I don't know if any of the Commissioners have any questions or comments and then we can go to public comment. Okay. Seeing none, Mr. Rus, we'll go to you.

Juanito Rus: Thank you, Madam Chair, if any member of the public wishes to comment on item four on tonight's agenda, please raise your hand in the Zoom queue and you will be called in the order in which your hands are raised. The first speaker in the queue on item four is Ms. Asada Olugbala. Good evening, Ms. Olugbala. Can you hear us okay?

Assata Olugbala: Yes. I want to start off by saying referencing the language situation. At the Renters Board meetings, they have an interpreter every meeting, and it's not that you have to request to speak. The same thing at the school board meetings and be Commissioned meetings related to the school board. It's absurd that you have to make a request and it's not done. You have to provide the opportunity for people to have that service. The agenda is in English. It's not in languages. So they have one little small section that's in Spanish and Mandarin. Now going into this other thing about Mr. Jackson, God is a divine source and Lord intervenes sometimes. Ginale Harris, not being



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

January 28, 2021

on this board, we're going to have many occasions for which he is going to intervene. I think this is one. Ginale Harris should be on this Commission. It was wrong what happened. You will not deal with it. Until you deal with it, you have no credibility. That's all I'm going to say. God is the divine intervener at all times.

Juanito Rus: Thank you, Ms. Olugbala. The next speaker in the queue is a telephone attendee with the last four digits 5802. I believe that is Mr. Bey. Good evening, Mr. Bey. Can you hear us?

Saleem Bey: Yes. Good evening. Saleem Bey. I just want to reiterate the fact of the matter is that Ginale Harris was the only Commissioner who originally began fighting for the Bey case to be independently investigated. As soon as she stood up and said that she wanted this case investigated, she was attacked by the city attorney. She was attacked by the city administrator. She was attacked by the mayor. She was attacked by and also lied upon by OPD. Instead of dealing with this, you keep covering it up and every person that's involved in the cover-up of this case will ultimately have to bear the responsibility for covering up murders in this community. The evidence that we have is based on paperwork that was released by the city, the only people who are covering this up at this point is people who are covering it up for the city. So at this point, right now, you're covering up the murders in this community, connected to OPD. You're a part of this cover-up and therefore obstruction of justice.

Juanito Rus: Your time has expired. At this time, I see no further hands raised in the queue. Madam Chair, I return the meeting to you.

Regina Jackson: Thank you very much. Can you update the slide, please? Thank you. So item five is an update from interim police Chief Manheimer. If my memory is correct, I believe this is your last update. So we'll look forward to hear what you have to share.

Chief Manheimer: Thank you so much. Can you hear me all right, Chair Jackson?

Regina Jackson: Yes.

Chief Manheimer: Okay, great. Thank you. Yeah. I have a couple of things tonight and I'll end with just a couple of reflections and some of the charge that I was given from you and from the mayor and a couple of reflections on that and the goals. I did want to just start out with a couple of updates as we do every time and to thank you again for the strong statement on the COVID vaccine. It has been so grievous to us that so many departments and counties around us have all gotten the vaccine. And in fact, the prisoners in the jail did also get the vaccine, but not those guarding the prisoners. So I think that there is a disconnect around the recognition that I think, and Ms. Janks might call super-spreaders. And in fact, we are the first in and the first charged with close contact with those that we provide help for and transportation for.

Chief Manheimer: And I think that at the end of the day, yes, I want to say that our mask audits have improved greatly, but that is not to say that we are not in all of the communities most affected, and it's vital that we be given that recognition that for our community, as well as for ourselves, we get that vaccine. I want to thank you for that stand. Secondly, I want to share with you that we, as I spoke



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

January 28, 2021

to you last time, have been devastated by the issues that have come to light around social media, involving members of this department. We have done so much to overhaul our hiring and screening procedures over the last few years, to help ensure that offensive values do not represent our current department employees. We will share more with you as this goes on, but I want to reassure you that a full and thorough investigation, it will take part.

Chief Manheimer:

And I think I shared with you already that this is that opportunity and that moment, when we are going to reaffirm our values to inclusiveness and alignment with that which is expected, and that we will retain an external investigations firm working with our monitoring team that will conduct a full investigation. We will not leave any corner of the department unturned and that there are so many in this department who are so dejected and disgusted with some of the allegations that have come to light. The values of OPD are clear. We will not tolerate any form of hate speech, any expression that supports that, or any acts of subversion. I have a social media revised policy that we are bringing to you. That is going to be much more comprehensive in terms of giving us the tools and reassure our community, that we are conducting the random and routine audits, and we will be moving forward with additional controls as well as the investigation.

Chief Manheimer:

So we will keep you updated, Madam Chair, as we go along on this, while this will not be me. This investigation has been assigned high-level members of this department to work under the direction of our monitor, along with a very highly regarded external firm from San Francisco, an attorney firm. The third thing I wanted to share with you is I wanted to digress for a moment. I do share crime stats with you. I think it's important for you to all at least realize that during this time of the COVID pandemic, we've seen just such a significant increase in gun crime and violent crime. And let you know that... And I know you know this, Chair, because you're updated on every one of these and every one of these is a tragedy, but in 2021, just these 28 days of January, we've seen 14 homicides.

Chief Manheimer:

We had one at this time in 2020. The gunfire increases are across all categories. And I think what's really marked to me is that in the past it was more the group gang conflicts, and we were able to really identify more of the shooters. And that I think is why our ceasefire program has been so successful in the past. Part of what we're seeing now is a lot of gunfire over what I would call more routine conflicts that seem to escalate and involve gunfire at a much more alarming rate. To share with you what we're doing about it, because I think would just take a minute or two to let you know that, I'd like to put it over to a Deputy Chief LeRonne Armstrong. He is the Deputy Chief and Bureau of Field Operations area 2, which is East Oakland, which is seeing most of the cumulative trauma around this violence. And I'd like him to share just a couple of thoughts on it. Chief Armstrong, if you please.

Deputy Chief Armstrong:

Yes, Chief and good evening Chair and other Commissioners. Just want to share a current illustration of what we're experiencing out here in East Oakland in particular. Obviously like the Chief said, we're up to 14 homicides, citywide to date. Obviously we have a lot of tragedy in our community right now, and none of us are immune to the tragedy. Even one of my family members was a victim of one of these homicides. And so I don't feel like I'm any different. I think all other 13 families are feeling the dramatic grievance of these events across our city and the lives have been lost, have a tremendous impact on all of us as we try to repair our families and



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

January 28, 2021

move forward. So we are working hard to try to respond to this violence. We are hampered by resources.

Deputy Chief Armstrong: We had budget cuts that had a significant impact on our resources, but we did redeploy units to East Oakland in particular, providing a greater presence around areas where ShotSpotter data and crime report data is showing that these shootings and homicides are occurring. We are providing seven day a week coverage. That's increased coverage for weekends as well to manage the violence that we've experienced over the weekends as well. We also have been impacted by a new surge in sideshow activity in our city. That sideshow activity is becoming much more violent than we had previously seen. Last year in 2020, we had a detail dedicated to sideshow enforcement due to budget cuts and the cut funding of overtime.

Deputy Chief Armstrong: We no longer deploy that detail, but since we have taken away that enforcement detail, we've seen sideshow activity increase a thousand percent and culminating with what we experienced last weekend, which has been all over the news, a sideshow that reached large numbers around two to 300 cars, but also an additional two to 300 participants and spectators. And then we experienced over two to 300 shots being fired, including rifle rounds, across the city. So it's been a pretty difficult couple of weeks for the department and the city, but we are doing our best to respond and we are redeploying resources to address it. But the budgetary concerns are definitely having an impact. So I'll pass it back to you, Chief.

Chief Manheimer: Thank you. And I did, Chair [inaudible 00:28:44] Chief Armstrong doesn't often share his personal experiences, his lived experiences, having grown up in West Oakland, and I know suffering other tragedies as many have, in this incredible community. But I did want to just share that with you as an idea that we are invested and struggling with our community. In fact, we recognize that this cumulative stress on the community is something that we hope that we can help to provide some relief for, as we bring closure and really increase both our cold case and our victim services through a grant, we just received to have more of a liaison. So our homicide division is so busy and so involved in sort of the everyday nuance of trying to solve these cases that I think are victims who call in and even families, aren't getting the type of attention and sort of the walkthrough that they need to get.

Chief Manheimer: And so we have a grant now that is going to provide us more of a liaison with the families to help walk them through this traumatic process. I would like to, and I do want to just cover very briefly two things that have come up in almost all our meetings, and I've never had a chance to respond to. So one of those that came up as an issue is a concern about our 9-1-1 E-text program. And I think there's a misunderstanding about that. All of State of California has been given a mandate to enable texting to 9-1-1 for those who simply cannot call and verbalize. That would be a hostage situation or someone who has auditory difficulties, but it is not by any means, I don't want anyone in our community to confuse that with programs that other agencies have set up wherein you can as a community member, text in suspicious people or requests for patrol and other police actions. I think someone mentioned weaponizing the police or whatever, please miss-

Chief Manheimer: -the police or whatever. Please don't misunderstand. This 911 to text is simply for that critical emergency when someone cannot call in. So I wanted to address that, and then secondly,



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION MEETING TRANSCRIPT

January 28, 2021

regarding the tragic missing person, Tatiana Dugger, So I think there's some misconception around that. That is a Butte County case. She went missing and was reported missing in Butte County. Butte County had developed some information she may be in the Bay Area and had contacted us and asked us to conduct a welfare check at a certain place. We did that. We did not find her, but we recognized that there was evidence she had been there, and we have been working with both Butte County as well as four or five other jurisdictions where she has been. We happily put out some media on behalf of Butte County because she had been seen in our area. So just want to clarify that is not our case, but we are absolutely ... Anytime we have reason to believe that someone is missing here, we are going to work with that agency, the family, and anybody else. So that is that.

Chief Manheimer: Just to end, and I greatly appreciate the amount of time you afford me and the police department to share these updates with you. Yes, Chair, I believe this is finally my last meeting. I have been extended a couple of times. I am your COVID chief. I came in after the shelter in place, and little did any of us believe that as I completed my time here, we would still be in shelter in place. I want to say that over this time, it's been one of the most challenging times of my policing 37-year career, and I think we've learned and grown. I was speaking with one of the commissioners over the past couple of days as they were out there. I think we both said that the stress and the issues that we have gone through together, you as our oversight body and we as the police department, have been so challenging and stressful. Didn't always get it all right. Didn't always do it the best way, but I think all of us tried and learned from it.

Chief Manheimer: I appreciate the incredible depth of passion and commitment that this Oakland community has to dedicate to working on the issues around bringing us the best police department, the most progressive police department. I would like to say that some of my goals, and I don't want to go through all of these, Chair, but I think most importantly, as I came in, I was charged by the mayor and by you and our monitor to repair and restore the relationships with our oversight, our monitoring team to ensure that we really brought together a collaborative reform piece wherein we could work collaboratively with, and I want to thank you all for, on the commission, affording us that opportunity to be part of these ad hocs, to share the subject matter expertise and the impacts operationally, and to the men and women of the department and to the men and women of the community.

Chief Manheimer: So in closing, I'd just like to say that this has been the most amazing time. I am ultimately from the Bronx, and I felt like I was at home here in Oakland, because people are real. They want to be direct. They want the real story. At the end of the day, regardless of where anyone sits and what people think or experience with our department, they need to know we are very dedicated to this community and getting it right and aligning with you all and our community for safety and progressive 21st century policing. So that's it. I want to thank you for the continued feedback, mentoring, support that I got from you, particularly Chair Jackson, and for the continued work we do together. I appreciate it all. Thank you.

Regina Jackson: Thank you very much, Chief Manheimer. I realize that you are still in the office until February 5th, and I am looking forward to receiving a narrative update on whatever progress you're able to make over this next week. Certainly, I appreciate the overview of what you've been doing. I did



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION MEETING TRANSCRIPT

January 28, 2021

have a particular question. Will the revised social media policy, will that include the reported social misconduct, the social media misconduct? I know that the commission will likely ... We've already talked about creating an ad hoc to take that policy under advisement. I just wonder how far it goes.

Chief Manheimer: Yeah. So as you'll recall, we've had a social media policy with you all for a while, but I really think that was somewhat misnamed, because it really dealt mostly with our use of media for alerting around missing persons, around other community engagement, around crime and problem-solving, and really, in looking at it, it was somewhat deficient in terms of the officer and the department's use of social media appropriately. So we have submitted or we'll be submitting a beefed-up version, of course in draft form, as we'd really like to work through the ad hocs with you all on this. But it will be more directly addressing the issues that we see around officer use of social media. There are a lot of 1st Amendment issues, but there are clear delineations around what is sort of legal, what is approvable, and what the rights are and are not as a member of the department as you represent yourself within the community and where those values and those lines stand.

Chief Manheimer: So there are some pretty robust policies that we have to address it. We'd like to see some of that embedded in this policy. So the way our policy team works, they sort of look at the ICP best practice policy, the other departments' best practice policies, and then kind of put together a composite of what we think will best align with our Oakland values. That is what you'll see coming forward as I know you will be agendized in the social media policy, and we'd like to add this in for additional consideration, because it more directly goes to the heart of the issues that we're seeing with the social media use.

Regina Jackson: Perfect. Thank you very much. I see Commissioner Garcia's hand is up.

Sergio Garcia: Yes. Thank you, Commissioner Jackson. Chief Manheimer, thank you so much for your service and your dedication to the Oakland community, and happy to hear that you felt at home here in Oakland. My question relates to the handoff to our new police chief. You mentioned the key goal of coming into this job of restoring the relationship with the federal monitor. My question is what other critical goals and objectives may not be as apparent is that one or as prominent as that one were you pursuing for 2021 that would, in your view, be critical for the police chief to continue to prioritize to advance progressive 21st century policing in Oakland?

Chief Manheimer: Thank you. Through the chair, I actually have laid out the interim police chief goals, which I submitted in 27 July of '20. There's eight of them. I'm happy to just read them to you, but I agree with the chair that I would like to submit the narrative part of that in writing. But I'll give you an example. Just very briefly, there's sort of six bullet points. Obviously, transition is very important, and stability during the transition. The mayor will be completing her search over this next week or two down to the final four that you forwarded to her. One of the pieces of my charge was to provide stability during the transition. The other one was to reduce harm to the community by decreasing the racial disparities in police context. I'll get into more of these in writing, as I submit them to you.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

January 28, 2021

Chief Manheimer: Clearly, to support the reimagine policing process through the city and to determine alternative service delivery models in which we conducted a study on alternative service delivery and are continuing to staff that at a very intensive level. To create a pipeline into the department for local diverse hiring by increasing the number of homegrown future members who do reflect our community. I have shared some of those numbers with you, and I will share those again in written form. So we will submit those, and I think we've really made some great strides, certainly not me. We just take credit for all the amazing work that our people do, Lieutenant Aaron Smith and others in the Race and Equity Team, who have really increased the focus and the productivity around that goal.

Chief Manheimer: We are continuing, obviously, to further our NSA compliance through constitutional policing. We have at least one other task we've brought into compliance and two others that are close. I'll get a little bit more specific about those. We have implemented the 911 community grand jury recommendations, and we are very pleased with getting some of that gap in terms of, really, the poor service in terms of responsiveness because of the overwhelming old system and understaffing. Implementing Phase 2 of the racial disparity study addressing discipline, hiring, and training, and I am really very gratified and grateful to our subject matter expert, Deputy Chief Lindsay, supported by the department and her Race and Equity Team, Darlene Flynn of the Department of Race and Equity, and Dr. Eberhardt. We have taken every one of their recommendations and implemented them and really, I think, taken this recent equity to a new level in terms of providing a safe ombudsman within the department that has already started for ...

Chief Manheimer: I don't want to get too much into these, but I feel like these goals have really a focus to them, a lot of work left to do, but as I said earlier, I think that aligning a path forward in which this police commission with their enhanced capabilities around the OIG as well as the capabilities you have now through some staffing, some city attorney, et cetera is going to ultimately translate to your ability to be able to become the new, if you would, monitor of the department. I think that standing that up and recognizing that that would be the path forward for us finally getting out of the NSA because we have that police commission oversight that's able to handle what the monitor has started with the tasks, and so I think that path forward is really important. I think that if we continue to develop that, that is the way out of ... not out of, but completion of the NSA. I hope that answers your question.

Sergio Garcia: It does. Thank you. Thank you so much. That answered the question.

Regina Jackson: Okay. Excellent. Thank you very much. Are there any other questions from commissioners? Okay. Seeing none. Very much appreciate your update, Chief Manheimer. Will really look forward to the narrative as we get closer to your actual date, February 5th. Obviously, we'll be expecting to hear the announcement of a new chief, hopefully by the time that you leave, and I thank you very much. So let's go to public comment, Mr. Rus.

Juanito Rus: Thank you, Madam Chair. If any member of the public wishes to comment on items five on tonight's agenda, please raise your hand in the Zoom queue, and you'll be called in the order in which your hands are raised. The first speaker on this item tonight is an attendee named G. I



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

January 28, 2021

believe that is Former Commissioner Ginale Harris. Need to move her to the panel, however. One second. Excuse my son in the background. Ms. Harris, can you hear us?

Ginale Harris: Yes, I can hear. Thank you.

Juanito Rus: Whenever you're ready.

Ginale Harris: Thank you, Juanito. I just want to say to Chief Manheimer I know that it was a task for you to come in and try to clean up, so to speak, what was done over the past 18 years of being under the NSA oversight. In your short time here, you have established relationships, at least with me, and I just want to say thank you for your efforts. I was really hopeful that before you left, we would have some closure on some of these scandals or items that are outstanding. But I see that you will be gone February 5th, unfortunately. But I do want to say thank you for accepting the olive branch and being able to hear and own some of the things that I've brought to you. So thank you, and wish you well.

Juanito Rus: Thank you, Ms. Harris. The next speaker in the queue is a telephone attendee with the last four digits 0185. I believe that is Ms. Lazaneo. Good evening, Ms. Lazaneo. Can you hear us? 0185, you can unmute yourself whenever you're ready. (silence)

Michele Lazaneo: It is Michelle Lazaneo, and I just wanted to tell ... Can you hear me? Hello? Can you hear me?

Juanito Rus: We can hear you. Yes. My apologies. I'm muting because I have kids in the background.

Michele Lazaneo: That's okay. I just wanted to tell Interim Chief Manheimer that you're wrong about Tatianna Dugger, that posted on the OPD Police Department page is the Butte County sheriff's press release, written by Sheriff Kory Honea, dated January 19th, 2021. That press release says that the family called the Oakland Police Department on January 9th and that you received a missing persons report. That press release says that January 13th, OPD requested Butte County assume jurisdiction. That's literally the words written by the sheriff of that department that your department posted on your social media page. So how can you now say that I got the details incorrect when I'm literally taking the details from what your department posted to share with the community? Thank you.

Juanito Rus: Thank you, Ms. Lazaneo. The next speaker in the queue is Ms. Olugbala. Good evening, Ms. Olugbala. Can you hear us?

Assata Olugbala: Yes. I'd like to say that the handling of Jonathan Bandabaila's case in the Miesha Singleton case is totally unacceptable. I'd like to have a report. I've been asking the city counsel for the pilot program of Lake Merritt and what role the police department played in that pilot program. There should be some opportunity to determine whether there was racial disparity involved with that program. There is opportunities to say to you that I have spoken on issues that look at the best interest of our police officers. I've spoken on the police administration building and how inappropriate that building is to house anyone. I've spoken on the fact that Dr. Palmertree was not sufficient to deal with the issues of stress and trauma of our police officers, because he is only



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION MEETING TRANSCRIPT

January 28, 2021

certified as a marriage counselor. I've spoken on the issue just a couple of weeks ago that the city counsel was mandating that workers in supermarkets should get hazardous pay. I said, "What about our police officers? What about our firefighters? They need to get hazardous pay." So it's not always negative comments about the police department.

Juanito Rus: Thank you, Ms. Olugbala. Your time has expired. The next speaker in the queue is listed as Anne J. I believe that is Ms. Janks, and I will need to move her to the panel. Good evening, Ms. Janks. Can you hear us?

Anne Janks: I can. Chief Manheimer, I just wanted to thank you for your time here and to say that I think that one of the important things that you leave behind is having instituted this tradition of coming yourself to the police commission meetings and weathering everything that resulted from that, complaints about what you've said, complaints about your answers, complaints about what you didn't say, how long it was. Yet you came back the next time. That was not something that was happening previously. I think that's something that certainly the community is going to expect of the next chief. That's really something that you established. I deeply appreciate that, and I wish you the best.

Juanito Rus: Thank you, Ms. Janks. The next speaker in the queue is a telephone attendee with the last four digits, 5802. I believe that is a Mr. Saleem Bey. Good evening, Mr. Bey. Can you hear us?

Saleem Bey: Yes, Saleem Bey. I would like to say that Chief Manheimer is full of crap and that she is spouting a lot of political nonsense, that when we asked her directly, "What is the status of my brother, [inaudible 00:51:05] Bey's, murder case?", which is an open case, she came back and said that his files had been found after the administrative investigation had been done and therefore nothing to be done. Now, a murder case has no statute of limitations. So for you to come back and say that, "Oh my God. OTB found all these cases after the IED case was closed" and that there's nothing that you can do mean that you full of crap.

Saleem Bey: If you say that there's a zero policy on hate speech, I'm about to give you four or five documents you and the commission chair about hate speech, about OPD against Muslims, and then I want to see what you do with that. So I don't want to hear about there's a zero policy when we give you documents. So I'm going to give you and the chair documents about OPD hate speech against Muslims, and we're going to see what you do about it.

Juanito Rus: At this time, I see no further hands in the queue, Madam Chair. I'm going to turn it back to you.

Regina Jackson: Thank you very much. I just wanted to provide the commissioners an opportunity to ask any additional questions or make any additional comments. Our next message from Chief Manheimer will likely be in writing, so I just don't want this to get away from us, if you are so inclined. Commissioner Harbin-Forte.

Brenda Harbin-Forte: Thank you, Chair. I would like to thank Chief Manheimer for her time on the commission. Sorry, coming to the commission from her time as Chief of Police. I joined the commission in July, and I have been pleased with your reports. I've been pleased with your attempts to try to make



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

January 28, 2021

necessary changes in the police department. You come to a very challenging department, and I know it hasn't always been easy to address the issues that are sometimes unique to Oakland, but I did want to thank you for being there, for showing up, and for trying to do what you can.

Brenda Harbin-Forte: I agree that not everything has been roses, so to speak. I have challenged you on some things, as have all of the commissioners. But I do believe that you have been sincere in terms of trying to respond to the issues, and you've gone back and brought us additional information. We don't always appreciate what you bring us, because it's not always what we want to hear, and certainly there could have been things that could have been done better. I still remain concerned about the white supremacists in the organization and social media, those kinds of issues. But it has been a challenging time for all of us, and I want to thank you for your leadership, for stepping into the leadership role and trying to do the best you can. So thank you.

Regina Jackson: Thank you, Commissioner Harbin-Forte. Are there any other commissioners that wish to say anything? Okay. Well, my closing remarks will be this. I didn't have to look for Chief Manheimer. She would call or text or remain available to inform me on the goings-on, the challenges, the excruciating information that she was getting. This was, as Anne Janks mentioned, very different from my previous experience. So I definitely want to compliment you for that and certainly for being willing to take guidance as it related to handing out PPE in the community or how to engage when there was something that was really not cool going on. That was very good and very different.

Regina Jackson: I appreciate that you worked very hard, and although we are in the midst of a hot mess, hopefully you have put together a platform that's going to help us uncover the belly of the beast, the toxicity that remains. So thank you very much, and I look forward to getting my daily briefings or what have you between now and February 5th. So thank you. This is a tough job, and we appreciate your standing up to do it.

José Dorado: Chair Jackson?

Regina Jackson: Yes. Sorry, I didn't see your hand. Commissioner Dorado, thank you,

José Dorado: Thank you, Chair Jackson. Chief Manheimer, I just wanted to say thank you for being open to the discussions around white supremacy. There was quite a ramp-up in your attention, I have to note, after January 6th. But I still have to say thanks for the time and the effort you put into the meetings that we had around this critical subject and also the other subject matter of ShotSpotter. So I appreciated your, particularly in the white supremacy, bringing your command staff and the heads of the various officer associations, Asian, Black, Latino, and the OBOA. So that took a lot of effort, and I appreciated you doing that. Obviously, this is going to be an ongoing subject, but I do want to just say thank you for being open to it and thank you for moving on it as you did. I wish you the best of luck in the future. Thanks again.

Chief Manheimer: Just thank you all, and I will be submitting a deeper narrative on the goals. Appreciate it., Appreciate the opportunity and appreciate the recognition of the tough times, but trying hard. This department certainly does as well. Thank you.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION MEETING TRANSCRIPT

January 28, 2021

- Regina Jackson: Thank you very much, Chief Manheimer. Mr. Rus, can you advance the screen, please? Thank you. So at this time, I would like to invite Mr. Alden to provide some context for us prior to hearing several of the consultants who have bid for this responsibility. Mr. Alden?
- John Alden: Thank you, Madam Chair. I hope you can hear me okay. Is my sound quality all right tonight?
- Regina Jackson: Excellent. Thank you.
- John Alden: Lovely. Thanks. I'll just give a little bit of foundation here very briefly, and then pass the baton to commissioner Harbin-Forte. As the commissioners who have been on for a while will recall, there was a letter, an open letter to the public, that the Oakland Black Officers Association, the OBOA, submitted back in March of 2019. There were a variety of issues they raised in that letter. One of them, among others, was a concern that the hiring and promotional practices within OPD had a racially discriminatory effect. There was a concern that some of them might even be structured in such a way as to demonstrate a racial bias against Black officers and Black candidates to become officers.
- John Alden: The commission took action to issue a request for proposals to find a firm that could take a look at those issues in a global, but also very deep way at OPD. That's a very specialized skill. There are a number of contractors out there who are able to take a look at promotional practices to find racially discriminatory effect, look at hiring practices, and make recommendations about how those could be improved so as to have a more diverse set of candidates. They've also developed new techniques that folks, say, at CPRA wouldn't normally have for figuring those out, like certain kinds of statistical studies. So it was clear that this RFP would bring in some expertise we don't already have in our oversight system for this specific case.
- John Alden: It was about a year ago that the commission decided to move forward with an RFP. We are finally at the point now where that request for proposals has led us to bring three candidate firms here to the commission. Staff at CPRA and the commission staff and sorted through the submissions we got for the RFP. The three finalists that are before you tonight were the highest-scoring finalists. They all came within a few points of each other. So to further refine our processes, Commissioner Harbin-Forte, myself, and the chair conducted some interviews of all three of these firms.
- John Alden: I understand we might have some material from Commissioner Harbin-Forte about thoughts about those interviews. Then we have representatives from all three groups here tonight to answer any questions the commissioners might have. Commissioners, your task tonight is to select one of these three bids, and if you choose to select one of these three, we have a resolution in the packet tonight which we would then ask the commissioners to approve by filling in the appropriate name of whichever bidder the commission thinks is best. I would be happy to answer some questions about process. If there aren't any, I would then turn the mic over to Commissioner Harbin-Forte to speak further about her thoughts on these particular candidates.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioners, are there any questions of Mr. Alden regarding process?



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION MEETING TRANSCRIPT

January 28, 2021

- Regina Jackson: Okay. Then Commissioner Harbin-Forte, if you wanted to add some comments.
- Brenda Harbin-Forte: All right. Thank you, Chief. Thank you, Chief. Thank you, Chair. I think I have pandemic brain or something. I can't think some days. All right.
- Brenda Harbin-Forte: First of all, I want to say that I had the pleasure of introducing all three of the teams, their principals, and the other members. And I want to say as well that I was very impressed with all of them. They bring different things to the table, as you will hear from them when you talk with them. But each, I think, brings something unique in their own particular way.
- Brenda Harbin-Forte: It is going to be a challenging process, a challenging venture for them to get what we need, what the commission needs. But each one of them, I think, is up to the task.
- Brenda Harbin-Forte.: I would like to reserve further comments until the end, after we've heard from the presenters, Madam Chair. But I just wanted to say that I did, I really enjoyed interviewing all of them and getting their input and getting their responses to the tough questions that we put to them.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you very much, Commissioner Harbin-Forte. Now that we've had the comments, Mr. Alden, did you want to go ahead and introduce each entity?
- John Alden: I could do that. You'll see packets from each of the three finalists in the materials in the agenda. One of the groups is the Oppenheimer group. Amy Oppenheimer is here to present as to their bid. We also have StoneTurn presenting tonight. We have Mr. Holzer from there. And then we also have SRM presenting. Mr. Shea is presenting on their behalf.
- John Alden: Madam Chair and Commissioner Harbin-Forte. Unless you have a different preference, I'd suggest we have each of them just speak for a few minutes about themselves and their bid, and then have the other commissioners see what questions or conversation they might want to pursue.
- Brenda Harbin-Forte: I agree.
- Regina Jackson: That sounds great. Thank you.
- John Alden: Great. If it's all right, just because I have them written down in this order, on my sheet here, I would suggest we have StoneTurn go first. And I believe Mr. Holzer is on the line from StoneTurn. I think he would need to be unmuted.
- Regina Jackson: Mr. Rus, can you manage that or do I need to do that?
- Juanito Rus: Either way, Madam Chair. He's on the panel.
- Regina Jackson: Please go ahead, because I have four or five of-
- Juanito Rus: Get her her four versions of him. I'm not sure. I believe it's this first one. Mr. Holzer, can you hear us?



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION MEETING TRANSCRIPT

January 28, 2021

- Joshua Holzer: Yes, I can. Good evening, Madam Chairwoman, Mr. Alden. Thank you so much for allowing us to join. We actually asked all of our team to be here today and that's why there are so many of us. We like to make sure that everybody is available to be able to answer any questions you may have.
- Josh Holzer: We appreciate having the opportunity to bid. And also having the opportunity to do this follow up. I want to reiterate, as we did discuss during our last meeting, the multiple disciplinary nature of our firm and people that participated. And I think as Mr. Alden mentioned, the ability to do statistical analysis, which brings to light fact-based evidence on which we can provide guidance and provide information on the investigation back to the public, and to those who are looking to make changes within the Oakland Police Department.
- Josh Holzer: I've also got Mr. Timlin here. I would like to add a few other points from our discussion and to highlight a few additional things that we can bring to the table.
- Patrick Timlin: Thank you, Josh. Good evening, Madam Commissioner and all on the police commission. What I would like to add is, as Josh mentioned, we have a multi-disciplinary team and we have operational people who have been in police management assignments, but also have done work in the corporate world and private and government and police departments around the country.
- Patrick Timlin: Hundreds of investigations into exactly the allegations that are presented by the OBOA. So, we have deep experience in conducting these investigations. We also have deep experience in policy design and review and providing recommendations. Our team, our team members, and sit on a federal monitorships. At this time, we have a deep bench, very particular to the needs of the Oakland Police Department and the Oakland Police Commission.
- Patrick Timlin: We're happy to answer any questions that you may have at all on any of our team members or a process or anything else that might help you make a decision.
- Joshua Holzer: Yeah, I think Madam Chair, Mr. Holzer again. As you heard from the participants when you spoke with us, we actually also have some people on our team who have experienced some of the matters that the officers have brought up. And so they have personal experience that they're able to bring as well as studies they've done in the area to be able to bring to bear.
- Joshua Holzer: So that along with the other parts of the team, the statistical analysis, they give us a very good position to be able to provide this service. And in summary, we hope that we'll be able to work with you. And we look forward to being able to interact with the commission, the officers, the chief, and the rest of the staff as necessary.
- Joshua Holzer: We'll take any questions that you may have.
- Regina Jackson: Commissioners, do you have any questions? I see Mr. Holzer's hand up, but.. Hold on a second. Here. Okay, I see Commissioner Dorado's hand up.
- José Dorado: Thank you, Chair Jackson.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

January 28, 2021

- José Dorado: Service from the StoneTurn firm, one of my primary concerns with all three which, and I have to say they all are impressive. One of my primary concerns is what can you articulate in terms of how you can relate your extensive experience specifically to Oakland. In other words, how would you come in from "the outside" and really do an in-depth analysis that includes obviously the history of Oakland, going way back and including the negotiated settlement agreement that all have fostered the kinds of environmental conditions that prompted the original complaint from OBOA? So could you tell me how you would, in my opinion, break through that barrier coming in from the outside? Thank you.
- Joshua Holzer: Absolutely. Thank you very much for the opportunity. I'll answer the first part and then ask Mr. Timlin to follow up.
- Joshua Holzer: So first I think it's important to understand that many members of the team if not all of them have had the opportunity to look at these types of issues from a global perspective and from a multi-jurisdictional perspective.
- Joshua Holzer: Myself, from a federal government perspective, had the opportunity to answer these types and other types of issues all over the country. And in some cases all over the world, and not having necessarily all of the background of the locality, but having to come in, understand and learn and learn from the people. And I think to some degree that is actually a benefit because we are able look at it in an objective fashion. We're able to take that information in addition to the statistical information that we'll pull, and not have some the political or the other types of background that may influence our discussions in our decision.
- Joshua Holzer: And we can look at things from a fresh slate, understanding that there is a tremendous amount to take into consideration. And we have done a lot of work looking at the background and understanding a lot of the history. But it is not a place that we come from without familiarity. We've done this type of thing in the past.
- Joshua Holzer: Mr. Timlin.
- Patrick Timlin: Yeah. Thank you, Josh.
- Patrick Timlin: What I would add to that, to those comments, is that in our bid submission and also our interview, we submitted specifically our understanding of the scope. We recited back to the commission the RFP scope of services, where they dealt with promotion, when hiring practices, since January 1st, 2017, have had a racially discriminatory effect, motivated by racial bias. And then we recounted the OBOA's letter and allegations specifically to make sure we got it right, is my point.
- Patrick Timlin: And we also, in our discussions in our interview, we were careful to note that we did not know everything, but we would be looking to work with the commission to make sure that we had a holistic approach, but also a very surgical approach to address the issues that were clearly in play.
- Patrick Timlin: And I think that would work well with this investigation.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION MEETING TRANSCRIPT

January 28, 2021

- Joshua Holzer: So I think it's coming in and understanding the allegations that play today, understanding the history that may have led to these allegations and understanding what other issues that engage monitors or other suits in the past and bringing those things as well as, again, this physical analysis to bear, to provide an objective result for the commission review. And for hopefully moving forward and making some changes that will help the officers and help the Oakland Police Department in the future.
- Patrick Timlin: I'd just like to add... This is Pat Timlin again. We did research the history, going back in monitorships. So, 17, 18 years, we got a history that we were able to uncover. So it is voluminous. There's no doubt about it. And we would want to be in lock step with the commission and select, solicit rather, input from everyone to make sure we could get a real good idea of exactly how we should proceed after doing our own research, we would need to speak and interview many, many people on the ground.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you very much. Commissioner Dorado, you got your answers, correct?
- José Dorado: Yes, Chair Jackson. Thank you very much, gentlemen.
- Regina Jackson: Absolutely.
- Regina Jackson: Are there any other commissioner questions for this first group? And this is the StoneTurn group.
- Regina Jackson: Okay. Seeing none, Mr. Alden, would you introduce the next one on your list please?
- John Alden: Certainly. The next contractor we have on my list would be the Oppenheimer group, and I believe we have Amy Oppenheimer on the line to present for her firm.
- Amy Oppenheimer: Good evening. Yes, I'm here. I'm Amy Oppenheimer. Thank you for having me, and my partner, Vida Thomas, is also present. And I'm hoping I can put up a PowerPoint just to walk you through quickly who we are, so you have a little bit better idea, a visual to go with it.
- Amy Oppenheimer: Thank you. Excellent.
- Amy Oppenheimer: So we're a law firm. We are the Oppenheimer Investigations Group. In fact, I was the Law Offices of Amy Oppenheimer until January, but a number of the attorneys working with me formed a partnership with me as of January 1st. Vida Thomas is the most senior of the partners next to me. Both of us have done police investigations. You go to the next slide, I assume I can't for the [inaudible 01:15:41] too. Right?
- Juanito Rus: My apologies. If you have your PowerPoint available, I can share co-hosting with you, if you'd like to do it yourself.
- Amy Oppenheimer: I'm happy for you to do it, if you don't mind.
- Juanito Rus: Just let me know when to switch the side and I'm happy to do it.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION MEETING TRANSCRIPT

January 28, 2021

- Amy Oppenheimer: I will do that.
- Amy Oppenheimer: So we have 16 attorneys. We have a good capacity, a diverse team. We are almost all of us certified and from Association of Workplace Investigators, a professional organization of workplace investigators that I led the founding of 11 years ago, and compliant with California Business and Professions Code as a result of our doing our investigations as attorneys where, as an outsider, you'd have to be either an attorney or a licensed private investigator.
- Amy Oppenheimer: We've done hundreds of investigations. Probably about 60% we do our public sector and many involve police and fire.
- Amy Oppenheimer: And the next slide, we launched, as I told you in 2021. I don't want to take up too much of your time so we can go to the next one.
- Amy Oppenheimer: The five partners. I'm in the middle. And then from the left is Vida Thomas, Tina Ro-Connolly. To my right Zaneta Seidel and to her right Alezah Trigueros. Next slide.
- Amy Oppenheimer: And our mission is providing fair, timely, thorough investigations with sensitivity to everybody so that people feel heard, but that we are also providing very reasoned findings. Next slide.
- Amy Oppenheimer: Where our core values are impartiality cultural competence, excellence, and reasonableness, meaning that our goal is to help you figure out the proper diagnostics in this particular situation. And it's a little hard to scope this case without knowing more about those diagnostics. Are we going to be looking at some individual claims or are we looking only at the whole?
- Amy Oppenheimer: I would tend to think we're going to be doing some of each, but we'd want to do the first stage of working with the Oakland police officers and association, the Oakland Black Officers Association, and other organizations within the police department, so that we can determine more about what the both individual and group complaints are, because we'll be looking both at the overall pattern and also at individual treatment. Next slide.
- Amy Oppenheimer: We have been conducting investigations over 30 years. I think I covered some of this already. So why don't we go to the next one?
- Amy Oppenheimer: That's just a picture of everyone on the team. I highlighted some of the people who I think will work on this project. So if we go to the next slide.
- Amy Oppenheimer: That's me. The next one should be Vida. And Vida's from the Sacramento area. My office is in Berkeley. I've been a resident of either Berkeley or North Oakland for, oh, going on 40 years. Other than when I was up at Davis at law school. And Vida's been a long time resident of Sacramento. The firm is a Bay Area firm.
- Amy Oppenheimer: And I do want to turn this over to her at some point, because she's done even more police investigations than I have, although I have done police investigations, including a couple and for the Oakland Police Department.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION MEETING TRANSCRIPT

January 28, 2021

- Amy Oppenheimer: Next slide is Tina who is another partner, although probably won't work on this case. Her experience is from the public sector though at Contra Costa County, and as an attorney for the county, she worked with sworn officers as well. So she might be another person we would pull in to work on this.
- Amy Oppenheimer: And then the next person is just Zaneta. And then the next slide is Elisa to show you the partners. My guess though is that we would work with Vida being the lead. Tina might do some of the work on it, and then bring in a couple of associates.
- Amy Oppenheimer: So the next person is Kim DaSilva. She actually has had some experience on the Police Review Commission in Berkeley. She's a Berkeley resident and her past experience was working for the trial courts and for the state bar. And she did a little bit of volunteer consulting, my understanding is, for the Oakland Police Commission on one issue about three or four years ago. She also did mitigation work. And in that, with that background, was working on capital investigations.
- Amy Oppenheimer: Then another person who is very good with statistics and might well be working on the case, because it does involve a lot of statistics is Garrett Smith. He's a newer attorney, but he worked on a wage case for Oakland Police Department recently, so has some familiarity through that. Next slide.
- Amy Oppenheimer: So what we need to do first is really scope the work with you, figure out, like I said, if we're going to be working on individual and the overall and how to make that scopable so that we can get the best product for you in the end, at also a reasonable price. If we do too many individual investigations, that's going to bring up the price. So we might want to go with exemplars, more recent situations that are fresh and easier to investigate. Next slide.
- Amy Oppenheimer: Terms of a schedule. Once you decide about the contract, if you do choose us, we would be assigning a lead investigator within a week of the award. We would be putting together an investigative plan. It's an iterative process that we would be working on with you within a month. We'll probably want to be doing electronic surveys as a way to gather a lot of information. And we've done surveys and assessments in addition to investigations for many employers. So, that would be the next step.
- Amy Oppenheimer: And then determining whether we'll be doing individual interviews of who, reviewing all of the data. We might bring in a statistician, depending on what the statistics show. Sometimes it's clear. And within our ability, sometimes we need to partner with the statistician, with a goal of delivering a report within six months. Next slide.
- Amy Oppenheimer: There was... Oh, and I have to apologize for my own confusion about the nature of the RFP and the bidding process. We thought that... I did see that the most that you can allocate as 150,000. Certainly, we'd like it to come in at less. We charged by the hour. These are the rates for the people that we've discussed. And so we would do it with a Not-to-Exceed in the hope that it would come in substantially less, but that it would not come in more.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

January 28, 2021

- Amy Oppenheimer: And there was a question about past relationship. I have done about six investigations over the past 20 years involving, some involving City of Oakland, not the OPD, and a few involving the OPD. Also did training for the Oakland Police Department on bias, probably 15 years ago with another individual I worked with, Kenneth Hawkins.
- Amy Oppenheimer: Vida did one investigation a few years ago for the OPD, and then this recent one on overtime was her investigation. And then I mentioned that-
- Regina Jackson: Excuse me, Ms. Oppenheimer. I hate to interrupt. I'd like to ask that you wrap it up because we're a little going past time and I want to make sure that we are fair to the last one. Okay?
- Amy Oppenheimer: Of course. I'm sorry. Let me just ask, then, if Vida wanted to introduce herself and add anything and then we'll turn it over.
- Vida Thomas: Sure. Hello everyone. I'm Vida Thomas. And Amy's told you a lot about my background. I do think that our firm is especially qualified to perform this work because I think we, as Amy's highlighted, we bring expertise from the two areas that are going to be needed, the statistical analysis, which is important, but really is just the tip of the iceberg, but also the ability to interview individuals to gain that anecdotal and other evidence that we'll need to determine whether there's a pattern in practice or whether instead there are individualized, disparate treatment claims. Again, I could go on and on, but I want to respect everyone's time. Very much appreciate the opportunity to present our qualifications to all of you.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you very much. Commissioners, are there any follow-up questions to the Oppenheimer group?
- Regina Jackson: Okay. My seeing none, Mr. Alden, can we go to the next group please?
- John Alden: Certainly. Our last presenter is Mr. Shea from SRM and I believe he is also on the line.
- David Gray: He is, and my name is David Gray. I'm an attorney. I work with Dr. Shea, who is on the call with us. And if it's okay with you, I'll just speak for us here. And Dr. Shea, of course, is available to answer any questions as is Professor Robert Berry on the phone with us. One of our key members also available to answer any questions.
- David Gray: And just taking a step back for a minute. I want to say, this has been a history lesson for us. We've had to learn a lot about Oakland and I have great respect for the elected leaders of Oakland and how you've thought about putting together a commission and dealing with some of the very serious allegations that have been brought forth, specifically with the OBOA and the federal lawsuit.
- David Gray: It seems to us that trust is an important part of what you are establishing with your community. Having heard a little bit from your community, and we've listened to other meetings. Your people say what they mean. And I see this as you, the commission trying to come up with a framework to



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION MEETING TRANSCRIPT

January 28, 2021

address these very serious allegations in a way that is going to bring forth honesty and perhaps even some healing between the community and the police department.

David Gray: We have no past relationship, unlike some of our competitors, with Oakland. And we are basically on the East Coast. Dr. Thomas Shea is the Director of Police Studies at Seton Hall University. He's a member of Statewide Risk Management, which is our firm. As the Director of Police Studies, Dr. Shea has literally written books on how police are supposed to conduct themselves. He testifies in court, as do basically all of our principal members.

David Gray: And he is a retired lieutenant and has experience in a large city, a multiracial city in New Jersey. So he has certain experience to bring to the table to address these types of issues.

David Gray: Professor Robert Berry is also one of our key members. He's on the line with us tonight and can answer any questions. Professor Berry is a retired police chief from a large city in the state of New Jersey, and currently specializes in internal affairs investigations and acts as a hearing officer for police misconduct cases and disciplinary issues.

David Gray: There would be two attorneys assigned to this particular investigation at Oakland. Myself, my name is David Gray, and John Birmingham. What we would do is we've already put together an investigative plan, specifically designed for the allegations brought by the OBOA. And we think that we would be able to investigate this, specifically come in under budget, and do this in a way that is broad and expansive enough to interview and investigate all the individuals who could potentially be involved, because I don't think your public having listened to them on multiple occasions are going to accept anything less.

David Gray: And perhaps as importantly, I don't think the attorneys for the OBOA are going to listen to anything else. And they're going to want to see results and honest answers to the issues that have been raised.

David Gray: It's pretty clear that an investigation should be done. I think you're doing the right thing by doing it. I give a lot of credit to the other two firms who have presented their response to your RFP. And I do think that we each bring different things to the table. We've heard from Oppenheimer's firm. Excellent professionals, dealt with Oakland for a long time, have prior experience there. StoneTurn, nationwide, very good reputation. Our firm is a bit different. We identify about a half a dozen investigation RFPs such as Oakland's per year, which is much, much fewer than these other firms.

David Gray: But what we want to do is specialize and hone in our investigative approach in order to specifically meet not only your budget, but your expansiveness and the need for investigating how this is going to go on, who needs to be interviewed, and specifically what results we can bring. And I think you need those results in order to get the framework, to be able to move forward to bring truth and honesty and light to the situations and the allegations that have been brought forth.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

January 28, 2021

- David Gray: We have a plan in place that I hope Oakland considers using. We're here to answer any questions for you. And I think we have the specific experience, not only as prior police officers. Like I said, Dr. Shea is a retired police lieutenant, as well as the Director of Police Studies at Seton Hall University.
- David Gray: Chief Barry of course, a retired police officer, current professor and specializing in internal affairs investigations. As an attorney, I handle litigation. And while Dr. Shea and Professor Barry are usually on the stand testifying as experts, I'm usually the one asking the questions of experts in court. And we have attorneys who know how to prepare the certain reports and what certain, frankly what the attorneys at OBOA would be looking for and what answers your public is going to be looking for as a result of this investigation.
- David Gray: So I just want to make sure that I'm available to answer any of your questions, and commissioners, do you have any?
- Regina Jackson: Commissioners, please raise your hand if you have a question.
- David Gray: I see Mr. Garcia, Commissioner Garcia's hand.
- Regina Jackson: I was getting ready to go there. Thank you.
- Regina Jackson: Commissioner Garcia followed by Dorado. Thank you.
- Regina Jackson: Mr. Garcia, you need to unmute.
- Sergio Garcia: Thank you, Chair. Let me just unmute myself. Mr. Gray. Thank you for that presentation. I have a question for you. Sounds like you have an investigative plan that is specifically designed for OPD. And I do like what you said about developing a framework to bring out the truth, honesty, and extra full disclosure related to the serious allegations that are raised by the whole BOA. And you're saying you can do it on your budget.
- Sergio Garcia: My question to you is what happens if you faced resistance in the OPD? Resistance to the investigation, resistance to the framework that you have brought up to investigate the truth, the honesty, the full disclosure. In other words, people within the OPD who either want to be passive and not be too cooperative, or actively engaged in a standing of bringing out that truth, that honesty, and that full disclosure. A, do you have any experience in dealing with that kind of resistance? And B, specific to the OPD, if you faced any inkling that you have that kind of resistance, what would you do in response?
- David Gray: Commissioner Garcia, that's an excellent question, very insightful. I would say that when we deal with internal affairs investigations on our side of the bench, do we see it? Yes. Do we expect it? I don't want to tip my hand or bias anything, but it's very common when dealing on the internal affairs side of things that we run into, I don't want to say roadblocks, but passiveness, and individuals who want to evade questions. And that does not always mean that they're being uncooperative.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

January 28, 2021

- David Gray: It can be very nervous for a police officer to have to talk to an investigator. We're going to be speaking to your people. These are your police officers who, on top of their very difficult job, are now faced with the prospect of speaking to an attorney, a retired police chief, as somebody who they will look at as trying to investigate them. When really, what we want to do is entertain a dialogue, find out from them what happened, find out their side of the story.
- David Gray: Now, what I'm doing, Commissioner Garcia, is trying to draw out the truth a little bit with you and explain a little bit of the techniques that are used. I will say there are certain techniques that we are trained to use in the course of investigations. In fact, we teach these techniques to others. And I don't want to go into those in too much detail in this meeting, happy to do that at another time or in another meeting, but we do frankly expect some pushback. I'd be surprised, I'd be shocked if there wasn't based on the history that we've learned about. And that does not mean that is a negative thing. It is a protective thing.
- David Gray: I think that there are members of your police department that feel that they've been attacked. I think that there are members of your police department that maybe in the past deserved certain questions about what their conduct was. I think that there are certainly concerns that need to be investigated, and we would be ready and able to handle conduct during the course of our investigations if people try to evade the questions. I will say, that we are trained to deal with that.
- David Gray: Part of the job of an investigator and an attorney is to engage credibility. And in speaking with somebody, we, of course all our investigations are recorded, as you might know. But beyond that, when we take our notes and when we investigate and do our questioning, part of what we do is gauge the credibility of the answers that we get. And that factors into how we write up a narrative report, and present that to you. That's precisely what we would expect. And that's what you should expect of us when we present our findings.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you, Mr. Gray. Commissioner Dorado, you had a question?
- Jose Dorado: I did. The same question I asked of the Stoneturn Group, how will you break through the barriers of coming in from the outside and wading through the history of Oakland and doing it from the east coast?
- David Gray: Thank you Commissioner, for the question. There is a history, and we've accustomed ourselves to it and read about it and found out what we could. Of course, we haven't lived it like everybody on this call has. We cannot let that affect us in how we are bringing our approach to the table. I don't want to say we're outsiders because we certainly deal with police misconduct, and I don't want to say it's any misconduct, but internal affairs investigations, police investigations. This is our history, and this is what we do on a daily basis.
- David Gray: I don't want your specific history to affect our bias or how we go about doing our investigation. That being said, we have to put together an investigative plan that is transparent. I think you need to deliver, if I were in your shoes, and what we want to provide to you is a way to deliver transparency and honesty in addressing the allegations that were made by the OBOA. The way to do that is to conduct a fair, neutral, yet thorough investigation in a way that not only shows



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

January 28, 2021

respect to your police department, but also to your commission, and probably most importantly to your public.

Regina Jackson: Thank you very much. If the commissioners don't have any other questions, I think it would be important to get public comment. Then we can resume our discussion and make a decision. Everybody's okay with that. We will go to Mr. Rus.

Juanito Rus: Thank you, Madam Chair. If any member of the public wishes to speak on item six of tonight's agenda, please raise your hand in the Zoom queue and you will be called in the order in which your hands are raised. The first speaker in the queue is listed as G, I believe that's former commissioner Ginale Harris. I will promote her to the panel. Good evening, Ms. Harris, can you hear us?

Ginale Harris: Yes. I can hear you, Mr. Rus. Thank you.

Juanito Rus: Whenever you're ready.

Ginale Harris: Thank you. With all due respect to all three of the people who came forth, I find it very disappointing that this is what we ended up with. Again, you cannot have the fox overseeing the hen house, and we already know that there's internal racism because we had a report. The city had a report done. However, it was fluff. I remember one of these firms coming before us, presenting, and then they pulled out of the Bey investigation.

Ginale Harris: So, I was told that this was not their expertise, so I'm just wondering why they're here today if investigations was not their expertise. So again, I'm disappointed. But I don't think you should choose any of them because none of them sound like they know what they're doing, and they all have relationships with Oakland. So, I don't think you should choose any of them.

Juanito Rus: Thank you, Ms. Harris. The next speaker in the queue is a telephone attendee with the last four digits, 5802. I believe that is Mr. Saleem Bey. Good evening, Mr. Bey, can you hear us?

Saleem Bey: Yes. Saleem Bey. First of all, number three, that's associated with an ex-chief. No, because they have an association with the blue gang and the blue wall. And if you're doing investigations using ex-police that's fake. Number two, Oppenheimer agreed to investigate the Bey case and then backed out after someone in the city pressured them. Therefore, they delayed our case a whole year or more based on the fact that they were pressured. Therefore, they're untrustworthy.

Saleem Bey: Three only a black firm that's owned and controlled would be able to go in and see profiling and racism. If you have anybody else looking at racism, you're not going to get to the point of somebody who's affected by racism. Only people who have been affected by racism can go in and investigate and get into the profiling, and get into what needs to be done to do this. If you don't do that and you keep hiring white people who come in and say, "Oh, I have these degrees and I look good on paper." That's not going to do it.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION MEETING TRANSCRIPT

January 28, 2021

- Juanito Rus: Thank you. The next speaker in the queue is Ms. Assata Olugbala. Good evening, Ms. Olugbala. Can you hear us?
- Assata Olugbala: Yes, sir. Let me say this. The end result is to identify racial bias or implicit bias. There has been many efforts to identify these two things. Stanford was hired, Dr. Everhart, they did a study and identified racial bias in the police department. Last May, we had consultants to identify disciplinary procedures.
- Assata Olugbala: We are going through a process we already know, at least I know there is bias in the police department. The NSA said that there was bias on the part of officers towards citizens and residents of Oakland. And there is biased for 18 years that cannot, and has not been corrected. We have bias in the police department. We don't need consultants to find out it's there.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you, Ms. Olugbala. The next speaker in the queue is Ann J. I believe that is Ms. Janks, and I am going to promote her to the panel. Good evening, Ms. Janks, can you hear us?
- Ann Janks: I'm going to figure this out. You don't have to promote me. I'm really sorry. I'm sorry, but I just have to say that if you're going to come here and talk about how diverse your group is, don't show us a slide that shows that you're paying the black women less. And I will offer those women to bargain on their behalf to raise their wages. What I'd really like to see is beyond the determination of whether you meet some legal guidelines, although obviously that's part of the investigation.
- Ann Janks: I'm hoping that the investigation would include any other recommendations that may not legally demonstrate that you're doing a specific thing, but yet could still be improved. Because I think you run across a lot of stuff and I hope that it's as expansive a set of recommendations as possible. I don't really care that much about what your experiences are on other police departments. We're not trying to replicate other police departments. Thanks.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you, Ms. Janks. At this time, seeing no other hands in the queue, Madam Chair, I return the meeting to you.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you very much. At this time, do any commissioners have questions either of the prospective consultants or of Commissioner Harbin-Forte, Mr. Alden, or myself? Okay. I see questions from Commissioner Dorado and Mr. Alden. Commissioner Dorado, you're first.
- Jose Dorado: All right. Thank you, Chair Jackson. This is a question for the Oppenheimer Group. It's distressing to hear that, in fact, the group had pulled out of potentially representing the Bey case. Could they speak to why they did that? And secondly, if in fact we were to consider them despite that, despite their explanation, what would it take to have Ms. Thomas take the lead as a black woman in this investigation?
- Regina Jackson: Thank you, Commissioner Dorado. Ms. Oppenheimer, if you could briefly address Commissioner Dorado's questions.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION MEETING TRANSCRIPT

January 28, 2021

- Amy Oppenheimer: Sure. The Bey case is a very different case. This is about hiring and promotions. And as I found out more about the Bey case, the attorney who was going to be the lead had concerns that the type of investigation you would need would involve threat assessment. We are not threat assessors. That is a very specialized expertise. So, we advised that the city should look for somebody with those specific expertise.
- Amy Oppenheimer: I think there was a period of maybe two weeks where we said, we thought we'd be able to do it. And then as she found out more expressed, her concerns and we pulled out. And I apologize for whatever delay that would have caused. Yes. I think that Vida's prepared to be the lead on this, although she can answer for herself.
- Amy Oppenheimer: And I also want to clarify that people's rates and what they're paid are two different things. The hourly rates we charge are based on the years of experience, and Vida, Annetta, Elisa, and Tina are all partners. They have an ownership interest. And in fact, the draw that we take, Vida, Tina, and myself are all the same and our ownership interest differs because I've owned the business for 30 years and they are just starting to be owners.
- Regina Jackson: Okay. Thank you very much. Mr. Alden, Commissioner Garcia, followed by Commissioner Harbin-Forte.
- John Alden: Thank you, Chair Jackson. This is the first time that I've had opportunity to be working with the police commission during a request for proposals like this one. And one thing I appreciate about the process is that it pushes me to think a little bit more carefully about exactly what service we're seeking. I wanted to share an observation with the commissioners in that regard. One thing that is unusual about this bidding process is that the OBOA has made a series of allegations and they made them almost two years ago now.
- John Alden: And they alleged, because issues they're concerned about went through a period that was roughly two years prior to that. And so, as a result of that, as some of the other speakers you've mentioned, or you've heard have mentioned, there has already been a study about the discipline system in OPD. And that did conclude that there was a racially discriminatory effect within the discipline system. But it wasn't clear from that study, what the solutions might be or how it could be improved.
- John Alden: Now, we're working with other experts now on that in the city of Oakland. And I'm really glad for that, but I think it would be most useful if this particular investigation had some insight into how the structure of the police department could be changed. If in fact there is some discriminatory effect found in promotional and hiring processes, as many suspect. And while there are many other factors to consider, and I think I might not even be the right person to speak to many of those other factors, one of them to me was would we get some product back that would allow us to understand those structures and how to fix them for the future?
- John Alden: And I think that, to my ear, the Stoneturn Group, I thought it did a pretty solid job of explaining that in the interviews that we did with the Chair, and with Commissioner Harbin-Forte. I should mention too, that I thought a question that has come up as to what extent would we be looking at



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

January 28, 2021

individual claims of misconduct? Are there individual people inside the police department who have committed some explicit outward misconduct? And I should say that that, that issue has already been investigated. As you know, there's a one-year statute of limitation for those claims and that passed a long time ago. At least if you want to apply discipline to anyone in the police department.

- John Alden: So, to my mind that those are always important claims, but given that they've already been investigated as to any specific individuals and the statute is passed for imposing discipline, certainly we want to know about that. But I think the real value added from this study would be more that structural question I was talking about before. So anyway, it's just an observation, I had one in many things for the commissioners to consider.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you very much, Mr. Alden. Commissioner Garcia followed by Commissioner Harbin-Forte.
- Sergio Garcia: Chair Jackson. My question was actually beginning to be answered by Mr. Alden. My question was really related to whether the committee or the ad hoc committee here, Chair Jackson, Commissioner Harbin-Forte, and Mr. Alden had a recommendation to present to the full commission based on the interviews of each firm. We have heard from each firm, but in this context, it's hard to differentiate between all of them.
- Sergio Garcia: I think the ultimate question that I have is it's very similar to what Mr. Alden raised. That is, to what extent can we leverage this investigation as one that will give us more insights as to the structure of the OPD? And more specifically, more insights into racial disparities [inaudible 01:53:27] the several years of allocations that we know have substance so that we don't have a narrowly focused, quick and dirty investigation that gets at specific allegations, but, but does not shed on how those allegations have to do with years and years of racial disparities and discrimination within the Oakland police department.
- Sergio Garcia: That's a structural issue. I can't detect from the presentations tonight, which firm would be best suited for that. I can rely on what Mr. Alden said, he has a recommendation, or at least in the interviews, he's stating that the Stoneturn Group did a fair job in presenting on that specific topic of the broader investigation or dealing with the structure of the OPD. But I just don't have a good sense of how the other firms would. Thank you.
- Regina Jackson: Okay. Thank you very much. We'll go to Commissioner Harbin-Forte, who has probably equal insight to Mr. Alden, or more from the commissioner perspective. And then I'll jump in as well.
- Brenda Harbin-Forte: Thank you, Madam Chair, I did have a recommendation, do have a recommendation. I wanted the commissioners to hear from all three presenters before I weighed in. But I agree with Mr. Alden, out of the interviews, out of the packets, out of everything that we saw, I believe that the Stoneturn Group will deliver the best product, and they bring the type of experience that we need for this. They don't have a relationship with the city of Oakland or anything, or having completed any prior investigations from Oakland. So, there would not be any suspicion, any concern that there might be some prior relationship that might affect the objectivity that might be needed in terms of analyzing the issues.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION MEETING TRANSCRIPT

January 28, 2021

- Brenda Harbin-Forte: They do have strong law enforcement background, which is very good though, because they also know what are the best practices in police departments. But in addition to balancing out the law enforcement experience, they also have a team of diverse individuals that are from the community perspective as well. In particular, those who worked with youth organizations before, and have a real sense about what's important in a diverse community such as Oakland, and how the police department can best serve the needs of Oakland.
- Brenda Harbin-Forte: So, I believe that for all of those reasons, and again, the fact it's an outsider. But they have the experience that we need and I will, at some point, turn it into a motion that we hire the Stoneturn Group. On balancing out of all of the three, they are the best for us.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you, Commissioner Harbin-Forte. I am inclined to agree with you, based upon some of the background that was shared about having experience finding bias and trying to promote systems to address it and fix it, as well as the diversity of experience of the team. As you mentioned, from community from law enforcement, lawyers who are not law enforcement, working with young people. So, if our fellow commissioners want to ask us any other questions, I know specifically Commissioner Garcia, you wanted to know what we thought, and now you do. I don't know if there are any other questions that are coming up from that. We have taken public comments. So, if people are comfortable putting a motion forward, then we can entertain that as well.
- Brenda Harbin-Forte: Madam Chair, I'm sorry. Madam Chair, I indicated that I would be prepared to make the motion. So, if it's appropriate now, I will move that we select Stoneturn.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you.
- Jose Dorado: I second it.
- Regina Jackson: Oh, okay. I was going to say, I don't see any other questions, so yeah. Thank you very much. So it has been properly moved and seconded. We have already taken public comment, so we can vote. Let's see. Commissioner Harbin-Forte?
- Brenda Harbin-Forte: Aye.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Garcia?
- Sergio Garcia: Aye.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Dorado?
- Jose Dorado: No.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Gage?
- Henry Gage, III: Yes.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

January 28, 2021

- Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Singleton?
- Tyfahra Singleton: Yes.
- Regina Jackson: And aye, for myself. We have five affirmative, one no. And the motion passes. It is Stoneturn that we have selected to receive this work. And I am hoping between the commission and Mr. Alden, that we will be able to work some of the more systemic idea into the investigation, so that we can make sure to maximize. I am now seeing, and I don't know if these hands just popped up late or if they're newly popping up. So, I'm now seeing Commissioner Garcia and Harbin-Forte. Is this old?
- Brenda Harbin-Forte...: It's new.
- Regina Jackson: Okay.
- Sergio Garcia: Yeah. Chair Jackson, I just had a quick question regarding if you have any insights on whether the firm we've just selected will be reporting regularly to us during the course of their investigation?
- Regina Jackson: As it relates to confidentiality of their investigations, I believe that there might be opportunities to hear probably in closed session, some updates, until they complete the investigation and make those recommendations. That is my standing, certainly. Mr. Kennedy or Sawhney do you anticipate something different from what I have just shared here?
- Conor Kennedy: Can you hear me?
- Regina Jackson: Yes.
- Conor. Kennedy: Yes. I believe that because they're actively investigating a matter that was a complaint, that the penal code would require us to treat that as confidential, in addition to the Oakland municipal code. So yes, closed session updates would be the way that the commission could hear from the consultant. Thank you.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you very much. And Commissioner Harbin-Forte.
- Brenda Harbin-Forte: Yes, this is more point of order. If we need a motion to adopt the resolution, the proposed resolution, that's a path I will so move.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you. I actually forgot about the resolution. It's been properly moved, is there a second for the resolution?
- Sergio Garcia: Second.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you very much, Commissioner Garcia. So, I think we need to take another vote for the resolution. Commissioner Harbin-Forte?
- Brenda Harbin-Forte: Aye.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

January 28, 2021

Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Gage.

Henry Gage, III: Yes.

Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Dorado?

Jose Dorado: No.

Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Singleton?

Tyfahra Singleton: Yes.

Regina Jackson: Thank you. Aye for myself, as well. Again, we have four-

Sergio Garcia: Chair Jackson, you didn't take my vote.

Regina Jackson: Oh, I'm sorry. I'm sorry. Commissioner Garcia?

Sergio Garcia: Yes.

Regina Jackson: Okay. Now we have five affirmative and one no vote. So, the resolution passes as well. I'd like to thank all of the consultants, all the groups that bid on the RFP, we certainly appreciated hearing from you. And for the Stoneturn Group, I will imagine that Mr. Alden will be reaching out shortly. And for those of us that have any comments or thoughts as it relates to the service contract, please submit your questions or inquiries either directly to me or directly to Mr. Alden. Okay?

Amy Oppenheimer: Thank you for considering us.

Regina Jackson: [crosstalk 02:02:59] Thank you.

David Gray: Have a good evening. Thank you so much. Good luck.

Amy Oppenheimer: You do the same.

John Alden: Thank you all very much. We really appreciate it.

Regina Jackson: Thank you. Mr. Rus, if we can advance the slide please. Mr. Rus?

Juanito Rus: My apologies, Madame Chair. It's been advanced.

Regina Jackson: Thank you. Appreciate it. So item seven is OPD budget submission review, and this discussion will be led by Mr. Alden.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION MEETING TRANSCRIPT

January 28, 2021

- John Alden: I would certainly be happy to start, Madam Chair. I'll give a little bit of background, and then it's my understanding we'll hear a little bit from the chief of police on this one. As the commissioners, you may recall, one aspect of the current city charter is that it provides to the police commission the power to review OPD's proposed budget before approval in order to see if it complies with community needs. And in this regard, this commission has an unusual power that, to the best of my knowledge, is not seen elsewhere in the city of Oakland in that, usually, various boards and commissions might give some input about certain budget priorities, but don't usually have that charter power to review the budget.
- John Alden: So the budget, as you may know, is up right now. Each individual department is supposed to have proposals in to the department of finance next week about what they would suggest for their budget for the upcoming two-year fiscal cycle, starting July one of this calendar year. And then, of course, over the next few months after that, the city administrator and the mayor have opportunity to compare and contrast those different proposals from different departments inside the city and come up with the mayor's proposed budget, which usually moves forward to council in May.
- John Alden: So it's my understanding that this item is agendaized so the police commission could hear a little bit from OPD about what exactly they plan to submit for their budget so that they can, so that you the commission, can start providing some feedback in that regard given your charter powers to do that. Last year, I don't know that we actually got to this until very late in the cycle. And I think that makes it much harder for the commission to really effectively use this power.
- John Alden: The earlier the commission has opportunity to weigh in about the budget, the greater opportunity there is to have some ability to shape that budget. Obviously, once we get to say June, it gets a lot harder to make changes to the police department budget, because any change there necessarily implicates the change in some other department's budget. So the ideal budget that the police commission might want is probably something the police commission, in my opinion, would want to get into the habit of discussing with any chief of police around this time of year, each calendar year. That's the idea behind this particular item on the agenda. Madam Chair, I'll turn it back to you and see if we have something from the police department.
- Regina Jackson: Okay. Thank you very much. And I will announce to the commission and the public that when we decided to put this item up, obviously it had everything to do with the looming budget, the depressing numbers that we were hearing, trying to get an idea of what the thoughts and the plans were. Obviously this may or may not be impacted by re-imagining Public Safety's recommendations and any other creative options.
- Regina Jackson: I know that Chief Manheimer sent me a message saying that she wasn't going to be able to submit something for the agenda. I don't know, Chief Manheimer, if you can give us any sort of narrative that will clue us into what you all are thinking, whether it be in some part or whole. So anything that you can add would be very helpful.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

January 28, 2021

- Chief Manheimer: Thank you so much. Yes. So a couple of things. First, I think you may or may... You do know, chair. I know you know. But for the rest of the commission, we are actually doing something almost unprecedented, which is opening up our mid to the mid-year budget, which is in December.
- Chief Manheimer: We were asked to cut another \$15 million from our budget. And we are very focused right now on that. It is coming up to the council, but we have already started those cuts. And it's a significant amount of service impacts to include no more overtime and no more motor unit.
- Chief Manheimer: I'm sure you've heard some of the different significant cuts we're going to be facing in that eight of our community resource officers returning to patrol. And we are really focused right now on how to sort of make this all work within the police department and within the city's budget. We certainly recognize and endorse and support the need for the city to address the very real city fiscal crisis that our not only our city, but many cities are facing.
- Chief Manheimer: So, in regard to the new budget, the budget that is just going to be proposed to the council in June. That is, I did check in with our city administrator. As we have been given a target figure of cuts for about \$30 million. We, at this point, the way that works is we give a list to the city administrator with impacts and really it's an iterative process between he and the mayor and the city administration on what finally will be the proposed budget that will go forward. First of course, to the commission, as the mayor brings forward that budget publicly. And then to the city council.
- Chief Manheimer: So, we expect for that proposed budget to come to you sometime in early May, when it is finalized by the mayor. At this point that mayor's budget then is open for discussion. And certainly the council, the police commission, as they did last year, will weigh in on where their thoughts are on it.
- Chief Manheimer: But until then, there's really nothing formal as we don't actually make... Well, we do make a list. It's similar to what the city administrator did with the mayor for these December cuts. We give a list of all of the items that are sort of up for proposal. As you know, there are certain pieces of our budget that are mandated in terms of mandatory minimum staffing and patrol, in terms of police, prosecution, and investigation, that's required to bring these cases to court and for our Ceasefire and crime fighting units.
- Chief Manheimer: So we are not sure exactly what those proposals will be as it's an iterative process. And as you can imagine, the line items are many. And so in talking, to sum it up, in talking with the city administrator, he, after looking through the measure that provides for the charter review of the mayor's proposed budget by the police commission, that would be she guesstimated sometime around May 1st.
- Regina Jackson: So thank you very much, Chief Manheimer. I do have a question and perhaps some confusion that I hope that you can clarify. As it relates to... I recognize that the commission is not actually responsible for your budget. There's only the piece of wellness that we're actually asked to weigh in on, but it does seem to be a little out of sorts that we wouldn't see it until after the whole thing was finalized.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION MEETING TRANSCRIPT

January 28, 2021

- Regina Jackson: Given the \$15 million cuts already, does... And your narrative overview, is there a document that we can see and/or review that speaks to the demonstrated cuts that you've already made? And then, although it would not be you delivering the information, I think that it would be helpful to have someone, we'll hope that the next chief, whomever that is, come to the commission in perhaps late March or early April, as things start to get more solidified.
- Regina Jackson: We'd obviously like to be supportive while holding OPD accountable. But the surprise of where you're going, there could be perhaps some insights and/or creative suggestions that we could kind of thought partner with you. So I'm wondering what possibilities there are for that kind of conversation.
- Chief Manheimer: Great. Yes. And I think that the reason for some of the hesitation as well is to see where the re-imagining recommendations are. So there's a lot of moving parts here. I would think that March or so might have a little bit more crystallization around it. I think where the city administrator's concerned is that, to get things to you all, it really requires us publishing it in an open forum. And I think getting in front of the council that is going to have really their concerns. Their constituents will have concerns. There's going to be a lot of expectations for re-imagining. I would hesitate to get in front of the city manager. But I certainly think that as things start to crystallize, it will become more apparent. And I certainly that the new chief would take that up with the city administrator.
- Chief Manheimer: I will say to you though, there are two documents that are pretty informative for... And you'll recall that we did come to you, I believe the very last meeting and update you on the December 20th budget shortfall closure actions that the city administrator put together, which does outline all of those cuts that we talked about. And I'm happy to share that again with you all as I submit my goals.
- Chief Manheimer: And what's interesting about that is that if you think about that 15 million, that is actually for six months, you can sort of recognize that in the new budget year, which is 12 months, it's likely, although again, we have to leave this open to the mayor, the city administrator, the re-imagining recommendations, et cetera, that some of these would be extrapolated out because I don't know that it makes a lot of sense to eliminate the traffic unit and then bring it back, eliminate the CROs, and then bring them back and eliminate something else in about six months.
- Chief Manheimer: So, my sort of expectation is, and I could just sort of telegraph to you that the document you got on December 20th with where the city administrator and the mayor ended up presenting the cuts that they accepted out of all of the line items that we submitted is fairly similar to what you may see. And again, I don't want to telegraph that too much, but I would imagine that it wouldn't be too far off in that it's the realization of continuation and we've had to accommodate a lot of changes to make these short-term cuts.
- Chief Manheimer: So I'm happy to submit that again, the December 20th document, recognizing that the council is waiting for some adjustments to that, because we put it together so quickly. We and the fire department and other departments, we actually went back in and realized that there were certain changes because I don't want to bore you with all of this.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

January 28, 2021

- Chief Manheimer: There were some programs that were reimbursable. So we wouldn't actually realize the savings for them, because if you don't do it, you don't spend the money, but you don't get it back either. So all of that aside, I'm happy to submit that or have the new chief submit that. And the May 5th, I believe, is when the revisions for that. And those two should be sort of at least a working document of the beginnings of what we're going to put together for... We submit with impacts and then really it's the city administrative mayor and others. But I think that it's not a bad start.
- Regina Jackson: So, I appreciate very much your illuminating. And yes, I would like for you to add that along with your narrative. I think what I am trying to do, I'm three years in and sometimes people throw acronyms and then I have to roll back and say, okay, now wait a minute. What do they do? And so what I'm trying to do is actually get out in front of, particularly for our newer commissioners, to throw out CROs, then they've got to figure out, okay, what exactly do they do? And what exactly does... You know what I'm saying? In order to try and anticipate, well, how is that going to show up in terms of... You stopped doing something, what kind of hole does that leave? Right? So, that's why I think I'm asking for more detail, but I do-
- Chief Manheimer: Yeah, and I'm sorry for the acronym.
- Regina Jackson: That's okay.
- Chief Manheimer: It's Community Resource Officers. I know you know. It's all pretty illustrative in the here. And I'll send you the December 20th one when I send you my goals, keeping in mind that there will be a corrected one and not far off from this. Right? And coming into the... And believe me, the council is really waiting for it too, because I don't think everyone's happy with a lot of these cuts. So, I would imagine that while this is likely where the city administrator and mayor's thoughts might be. There's a lot to get to before we get to the next piece of it. But yes, and I will brief the new chief on sort of those concerns and expectations. I'm sure you will as well. Thank you.
- Regina Jackson: Excellent. Thank you very much. If there are no other questions from commissioners, we can go to public comment. I see no hands up. Mr. Rus.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you Madam Chair. If any member of the public wishes to speak on item seven on tonight's agenda, please raise your hand in the Zoom queue and you will be called in the order in which your hands are raised.
- Juanito Rus: The first speaker on this item is Kevin Cantu. Good evening, Mr. Cantu, can you hear us?
- Kevin Cantu: Good evening again. I'd just like to remind everyone that... My timer hasn't started. Can you hear me?
- Juanito Rus: I can hear you. There you go.
- Kevin Cantu: So this summer, a lot of us warned you that this was a health crisis and a financial crisis. And the police department has successfully managed to push real budgetary reform off to committees of committees of committees of committees of the... You've seen this stuff. And I think it's



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION MEETING TRANSCRIPT

January 28, 2021

unacceptable. I think it's unacceptable that we're looking at cutting fire department funding, but not actually changing the way we do policing. I yield my time.

Juanito Rus: Excuse me. I was still muted. Thank you, Mr. Cantu.

Juanito Rus: The next speaker in the queue is listed as G I believe that is Ms. Harris. I am going to promote her to the panel. Good evening, Ms. Harris. Can you hear us?

Ginale Harris: Thank you, Mr. Rus. I just want to say that I'm extremely disappointed, especially in the commissioners that don't have nothing to say. It's like, this is the fourth time in a row meeting that I've come to as a former commissioner. And I don't hear anybody asking any questions, especially the commissioners that were selected by the community. It's like speak up, ask questions because you're not asking enough questions. This budget is important. And it's like we're trying to balance things and nobody has nothing that they want to ask. I find that really, really odd. So speak up, please.

Juanito Rus: Thank you, Ms. Harris.

Juanito Rus: The next speaker in the queue is Ms. Assata Olugbala. Good evening Ms. Olugbala. Can you hear us?

Assata Olugbala: Yes. It's going to be extremely challenging for this whole city to deal with this \$62 million budget deficit, but I was extremely upset with a statement that was made as a result of a response to the sideshow that took place last Saturday. And where were the police?

Assata Olugbala: And seeing that a statement came from police officers, that they weren't able to respond to what was going on with the shootings and the mayhem because there weren't enough police officers related to the budget cuts. And I didn't think that was necessary to say that or to make those kinds of statements as if... It just almost sounds like the police department is going to punish the community for budget cuts. And I hope that that doesn't happen again.

Juanito Rus: Thank you, Ms. Olugbala. The next speaker in the queue is a telephone attendee with the last four digits 9997. Good evening, 9997. Can you hear us?

9997: Hi. Can you hear me?

Juanito Rus: We can hear you.

9997: Okay. Please start my time now.

9997: Okay. So I would mind to remind the commission that a \$15 million cut to a budget that is \$30 million over budget isn't a cut. It's a limit of how far that department will go over budget. So let's start there. I'm wondering what a \$15 million cut will look like in the coming budget, if that's what it is, when they're going \$30 million over budget every time.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION MEETING TRANSCRIPT

January 28, 2021

- 9997: What I would suggest is what I've seen with the commission is they're really lost in the sauce for the budget. They don't know how it works. They don't understand it. And that's why they sort of ignored it in the last fiscal year lead up. I'd like to suggest that you hire, and you probably have the power to do so in a very short time, a consultant to help you look through the budget and find real places to cut. Real places that cut the budget, not the overage. So more than 30 million in one year, more than 60 million in the biennial budget.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you 9997.
- Juanito Rus: The next speaker in the queue is a telephone attendee with the last four digits 0185. I believe that is Ms. Lazaneo. Good evening, Ms. Lazaneo. Can you hear us?
- Michele Lazaneo: It is again, Michele Lazaneo.
- Michele Lazaneo: How can OPD save money? Well, Independent reported this week disclosed that the city auditor approved \$245,000 for OPD to purchase equestrian services for OPD's mounted horse unit. A mounted horse unit is not a necessity. The site is owned by the city now, but run by a third party provider.
- Michele Lazaneo: OPD has two public information officers, and then they decided to add a media strategist who we believe makes over \$175,000 a year. Most police departments have sworn personnel who are trained in public information, and they respond as public information officers. How sad that you have three experts in public information, you have to social media and other aspects of Oakland's connection with the community and passing along of information is so poor. Those are two ways you can save about half a million dollars in Oakland's budget. Thank you.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you, Ms. Lazaneo.
- Juanito Rus: The next speaker in the queue is Mariano Contreras. Good evening, Mr. Contreras. Can you hear us?
- Mariano Contreras: Yes. I usually reserve any comment or statement after Chief Manheimer, but I was just a little disappointed and actually insulted by the Chief's characterization of the Reimagining Public Safety Taskforce possible recommendations by stating that possibly six months after recommendations that they're going to go back to the way things were. That's really an insult to the hundreds of Oakland residents who are working on advisory boards, making thoughtful recommendations, putting in countless of hours for the betterment of all Oakland residents. So I would just give some thought before you give that kind of characterization to many thoughtful Oakland residents. Thank you.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you, Mr. Contreras.
- Juanito Rus: At this time, I see no further hands in the queue. Madam Chair, I turn the meeting to you.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you very much.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION MEETING TRANSCRIPT

January 28, 2021

Regina Jackson: Can you update the slide please?

Regina Jackson: Thank you. So item eight is the effects of Measure S1. There are lots of changes, fortunately, that came along with the overwhelming public support for Measure S1. So, Mr. Alden, I think is going to take the lead in providing us an overview of what the effects are and how they will impact the commission's work and CPRA's work as well.

Regina Jackson: Mr. Alden.

John Alden: Thank you, Madam Chair.

John Alden: I'll try to give a short presentation. This is of course a long measure. And I should start by saying that we really owe a debt of gratitude to folks in the community that brought S1 forward and also to the city council for pushing to get it onto the ballot. That is of course one of the city council's powers, to put charter amendments onto the ballot. And finally for the members of the public who voted for it. I think this really improves the powers and the tools that we have at the police commission and at CPRA and at the Inspector General's office. I'm really excited about all these changes.

John Alden: Now, that said, we could spend quite a bit of time talking about any number of the changes in here. I thought that given that this measure just passed in November, it would be my recommendation that we start by talking about some of the changes that would require us to take some action over the next few months, so that we're thinking about collectively at CPRA and the commission about what our next steps are in terms of making sure we're implementing S1 appropriately.

John Alden: And on some of these, I've already started on. Some I've worked on with the chair. Some, I think, would require the commission's attention. There may be others that I've overlooked, and I'd certainly like to get commission direction about any others in addition to the ones in the memo I've given you, that you might need my help or support with, or that we should talk about in future meetings.

John Alden: I flagged four that stuck out in my mind as items that do require quick attention. The first one would be the city's enabling ordinance. There is an ordinance that implements some of the aspects of measure LL from four years ago. They created this commission and CPRA. That should probably be updated in order to match S1.

John Alden: Normally that job is done by the Office of the City Attorney, because they would provide legal advice to the city council whenever the city council was approving changes to ordinances. That said, I think as that package is put together, I think it would be useful for that to come here to the commission for the commissioners to take a peek at and give some advice about. I'm sure the city council would be interested in your thoughts. And I think it only makes sense that the commission should be kept in the loop about proposals that would go to the council in that regard.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION MEETING TRANSCRIPT

January 28, 2021

- John Alden: Another is that there's a specific authorization S1 for legal counsel for the commission. I want you to know that the chair and I have been working together on making sure that that funding is in the budget submission we'll be putting in next week. So I think that is in hand, but I would flag that for you as something to watch for in the city's budget process over the next few months.
- John Alden: The city's budget is not in the greatest shape as we've discussed earlier. It is probably a good idea for the commission to consider this as one of their budget priorities, to make sure it's added into the upcoming budget, despite that fiscal crunch, and that could require some advocacy by some of the commissioners.
- John Alden: The third one is adding the inspector general as a department head position and confirming that the inspector general is hired by this commission. That's a really important change and was one of the big motivations for putting S1 on the ballot.
- John Alden: First place, the chair and I have been working together with Human Resources Management and the Civil Service Board to start setting up the foundation for that. Last week, the Civil Service Board approved changes to the inspector general position description to match those new charter changes, including for example, clarifying with that inspector general reports to this police commission.
- John Alden: So we're now in a place where we can recruit for that position. And I'll continue to work with the Chair of Human Resources Management to start that recruitment process. We're hopeful that we can bring candidates to the commission late in the spring, so that perhaps we could have someone start as early as the beginning of this coming fiscal year, if not maybe even June.
- John Alden: And then finally the last one. And this is one that I think deserves some commission attention, perhaps at a future meeting, maybe our next one, is how we communicate the CPRA's recommendations and specific discipline cases to the commission chair. Measure S1 clarifies that CPRA must transmit those to the commission chair. That is a substantial number of cases. We receive about 500 public complaints a year. Of those, slightly more than half are usually cases that are mandated cases under the charter, meaning CPRA has to look at them. And there are something a little less than a hundred that usually have a fairly substantial written report that accompanies them.
- John Alden: So I'm having some conversation amongst the commissioners and the chair about expectations as to how CPRA should transmit those to the chair, I think would be helpful so that we all have an expectation of what that workflow is going to look like. So those are the four issues that I've flagged here that we might want to talk about. Perhaps the commissioners have some others, and I'd be happy to answer questions about these.
- Regina Jackson: Are there any questions of the commissioners? I don't currently see any hands up. Oh, there is one. Commissioner Gage.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION MEETING TRANSCRIPT

January 28, 2021

- Commissioner Ga...: Thank you, Chair. Director Alden, can you speak a bit more to the hiring process for the inspector general? That seems to be a position that we're going to need to certainly keep an eye on given the need for those particular services moving forward.
- John Alden: Absolutely. So, because the civil service commission approved the new job description for that position last week, we could start a recruitment right away. There are a few things that Human Resources Management will require from us. I've been working with the chair on those. Those would include some questions to ask potential candidates and a short statement about what an ideal candidate might look like using the recruiting materials.
- John Alden: The next step from there would be to figure out how we want to advertise or disseminate word about this opening and how long we might want to wait for applications to come in before the commission starts sorting through them. And then once that period's done, we should have a plan which could be done entirely by staff or entirely by the commission or something in between in which we sort through those applications and figure out which ones might be finalists to move forward to the full commission to consider.
- John Alden: Now, the closest experience I've had to this or this commission was my own experience as an applicant applying for my current position. And in that recruitment process, the commission had an ad hoc of commissioners that conducted a series of paper screens on resumes, then interviews by phone, then interviews at a public meeting, and then finally with the last set of candidates, interviews at the commission.
- John Alden: That could be a model here depending on the will of the current commissioners. Or we could go with any number of other models. This position is one in which the commission has great latitude in selecting finalists. There are only a modest set of civil service rules which we need to comply. And that's intentional by design because it's a department head position. The civil service rules are intended to create great flexibility for this commission and how the commission selects the ideal candidate. So I think perhaps a-conversation for the commissioners to have over the next month would be who among the commission is interested in working on that process, and what steps they might want to take in crafting that selection process.
- Henry Gage, III: Thank you, director. I'm glad to hear you say that we can move quickly to begin that process in earnest. There's clearly a need.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you, Commissioner Gage. Commissioner Dorado's hand is up.
- José Dorado: Thank you, Chair Jackson. Can you speak briefly on the types of matching that would be done in the enabling ordinance to integrate S1 into that ordinance?
- John Alden: Certainly. One issue that comes to my mind is there is some language in the enabling ordinance about administrative closures. That's a term we haven't used in the last few years. It had a very specific meaning at CPRB. It's hard to understand how that fits into the CPRA commission Measure LL model. And that's probably been overdue. So, I think that should probably be addressed.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

January 28, 2021

- John Alden: Beyond that, I think it's really a matter of having some of the attorneys at the city attorney's office and if the commission wishes their own attorneys to take a close look at that ordinance versus S1 and see if there's anything else that's not a match or not a fit. That might be a pretty, a dry procedural analysis but I think it's a smart thing to do at this point. Kind of like taking one's car in for maintenance regularly. This is the right time to double check that ordinance and have our lawyers really go over it closely and make sure we're not missing anything in there.
- José Dorado: Thank you.
- Regina Jackson: Commissioners, are there any other questions?
- Regina Jackson: So Mr. Alden, I know that there are a few effects that we are needing to pivot fairly quickly on, particularly the human resource component. Do we have some approximations about when we can get better in alignment?
- John Alden: Well, on the inspector general, I would say to my mind-
- Regina Jackson: I'm sorry. Go ahead.
- John Alden: I'm sorry.
- Regina Jackson: No, you go ahead. I'm sorry.
- John Alden: I think I must've misunderstood the question.
- Regina Jackson: I think you mentioned that with the inspector general, we thought that a hiring would probably come right at the top of the new fiscal year, July one, right?
- John Alden: I think that's about right. I think that depends largely on how quickly we get in quality applicants and how quickly the commission can move on screening them.
- Regina Jackson: Is there anything else that will require some movement?
- John Alden: I think that really the issue right now is figuring out which of the commissioners are interested in working on that project. And then, and of course you Madam Chair have the option of putting together an ad hoc, if you choose, and then making sure whomever on the commission is going to be lead on that starts working with presumably me and Human Resources Management on getting those applications in so we can take a look at them.
- John Alden: Human Resources Management will post an application window, electronically for the purpose. And the only thing we still need to do in that regard is let them know how we would describe an ideal inspector general and any questions we might want them to answer in writing as part of the application process.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION MEETING TRANSCRIPT

January 28, 2021

- Regina Jackson: Okay. So not terribly different from the process we went through to hire you or to get our police chief nominees.
- John Alden: That's right.
- Regina Jackson: Okay. Yeah. I feel confident that we will do an excellent job with that.
- Regina Jackson: Okay. That's great. Thank you.
- Regina Jackson: Are there any other questions before we go to public comment?
- Regina Jackson: Seeing none. I'll go to Mr. Rus.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you, Madam Chair. If any member of the public wishes to speak on Item 8 on tonight's agenda, please raise your hand in the Zoom queue and you will be called in the order in which your hands are raised. Excuse me while I put on my clock.
- Juanito Rus: The first speaker in the queue on this item is Ms. Rashidah Grinage. And I'm going to promote her to the panel. Good evening, Ms. Grinage. Can you hear us?
- Rashidah Grinage: Yes, can you hear me?
- Juanito Rus: We can hear you.
- Rashidah Grinage: Thank you. I wanted to point out that there is also a couple of items in the communication section, which is G, that require a discipline panel when the investigation of a complaint is not completed by 250 days, and also when there is no PDRD footage accompanying the incident. Both of those circumstances require that the investigation be turned over to a discipline panel for a resolution. So that's new and different and will require folks to really be trained in order to be able to complete that requirement. Thank you.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you, Ms. Grinage.
- Juanito Rus: The next speaker in the queue is Ms. Assata Olugbala. Good evening, Ms. Olugbala. Can you hear us?
- Assata Olugbala: Yes, it is my understanding that from a meeting that was either the finance committee... I can't remember what committee it was. But anyway, in that discussion on the budget, they are freezing all positions. And the conversation came up about positions that are mandated by voted measures, and the inspector general came up and they are checking into whether they can freeze that position, and through legal counsel. And I don't know how that's going to turn out. But anyway, the thing that I want to see is if they ever get an inspector general, is to investigate the and review the handling of the police misconduct as it relates to the CPRA, not the OPD, but the CPRA, because I'm very dissatisfied with their getting no results.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

January 28, 2021

- Juanito Rus: Thank you, Ms. Olugbala.
- Juanito Rus: At this time, I see no other hands raised in the queue. Madam Chair, I return the meeting to you.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you very much.
- Regina Jackson: Okay. So the next item on the agenda is again, Mr. Alden, review the CPRA pending cases and all the recent activities. Go ahead, sir. Oh, wait, I'm sorry. Commissioner Gage raised your hand. I didn't see it on that first screen. Commissioner Gage.
- Henry Gage, III: Thank you, Chair. I don't know if this needs to be done immediately, but I would request that the chair either form an ad hoc to begin the hiring process for the IG in earnest or that that matter be referred to the personnel committee for further action.
- Regina Jackson: Yes. I will plan to do that. Obviously, I would like to give commissioners a minute to think about that and whether or not they would want to be part of it, because obviously an ad hoc has a limited number of commissioners on it. And so those that might be interested, I can let them know what kind of hours of work it's going to be since I have been on both of the hiring positions, and that may or may not have impact. So I think that I'll be able to name that at the next meeting.
- Henry Gage, III: Thank you, Chair.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you.
- Regina Jackson: Okay. If there are no other hands up, we'll go to Mr. Alden.
- John Alden: Thank you, Madam Chair. With respect to our statistical report, I have some good news to report there and some bad. So, what I would point out in the statistical report is that you'll notice that the number of protest-related cases that we have remain the same. We continue to work on those. I'm happy with the progress that we're making. There isn't anything I can publicly report about that, but I anticipate those are going to be all resolved in time for the 3304 limits. But we probably won't see those resolutions until March and April.
- John Alden: With respect to the third page of this list, you'll see our pending cases and all other regards, other than the protest cases. There are 75 of those now, which is a very significant improvement over our last couple of reports. One reason that that number significantly improved has to do with our intake technician staffing.
- John Alden: So as I've mentioned to the commission previously, we had a real crunch in our intake section last summer. We had all three, at one point, of our intake technicians out on leave at the same time. That wasn't something we could control. Some were out for a fair bit. And that really made us significantly understaffed in that regard.
- John Alden: I am happy to say that Department of Finance, Human Resources Management and City Administrator's office were really helpful in getting for us some temporary intake technicians to



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION MEETING TRANSCRIPT

January 28, 2021

help with that crunch. And so the significant drop you see in total pending cases here is really because of the work of those temporary intake techs who really became very productive in November and December once they finished training back in October. That was Diane Carroll and Frida Caro. And we really appreciated their help.

John Alden: The sad news here is that as part of the city's budget crunch, we have had to substantially scale back on what are called temporary contract service employees. Both of those employees were brought on the temporary contract manner so that they could work for us for a short period of time. We knew that they wouldn't be long-term employees because of that, but we did have to end our work with them earlier than we would have liked because of the fiscal crunch. So I'm really grateful that they were able to help us substantially reduce our caseload intake. I am sad that they're not with us now.

John Alden: Since then, we've also had one of our prime intake techs retire over the holidays, and that was Ms. De La Cruz. And so we're going to miss her. I wish her well, but that does mean now we have a hole, and that we have one permanent position we'll need to fill.

John Alden: That bad news is followed by some good news. The city administrator's office did give us an exception to the overall hiring freeze to refill that position. And we're moving forward with filling that position on a permanent basis. We're doing interviews now. We hope to have that filled shortly. So I'll keep you posted about how that goes.

John Alden: And that said, we also have a very large number of closed cases on this list. You'll notice that these closed cases, 43 of them, are ones that were largely closed at the intake stage. And that reflects again, that significant portion of work done by our intake technicians catching up on a serious backlog we had.

John Alden: There are another set of cases that they worked on that had been assigned to investigators for a further deeper dive. Those cases that went to investigators are much more likely to have sustained findings than the ones that we close at intake. That is, in fact, part of the purpose of closing cases at intake, if they're not going to be sustained, and we can see that at an early stage, and then we closed them.

John Alden: And so what you see here is the work of intake technicians closing out some of those cases. The ones that are moving on and are more likely to be sustained remain on the pending list. So that's why this is a really large number of closed cases, but closed cases that weren't sustained. That's really unusual. And that's why you see that here. So, that concludes my explanation of what's going on with the statistical report.

John Alden: I should mention that a substantial part of our work at CPRA remains on the issue of the reorganization that the commission approved last summer. So those commissioners who are newer, this last summer the full commission ordered a reorganization around two parts of CPRA. So, one part of that had to do with reorganizing inside CPRA so that we could have a chief of staff, because we don't have enough mid-level management inside CPRA.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

January 28, 2021

- John Alden: I'm happy to say that we were able to work productively with the city administrator to make that position happen. I think I reported that previously. We now have a hire for that position. His name's Aaron Zisser. He comes to us with tremendous experience in the federal Department of Justice back in the Obama era, doing investigations of prisons and other law enforcement related entities. He was the auditor in the San Jose oversight system. And he has also worked on the investigation and even criminal prosecution of police officers for misconduct in several different venues. He's also been a very effective consultant in the past on the structure of oversight agencies. He did a great project for BART just a couple of years ago, helping them substantially improve their oversight system. And we're looking forward to him bringing that skill also here to CPRA. He's going to start in about two weeks. Hopefully at our next commission meeting, I can introduce you to him.
- John Alden: So really excited about that. On the other part of that reorganization was to bring the commission more robust staffing for its needs. We're still moving forward on that. I've been working with the human resources director in that regard. And that process is still in the meet and confer status with the applicable union. And I think we're going to make some good progress on that. I will keep you in the loop about how that's moving along as it progresses.
- John Alden: The third thing I should mention is I think a little bit of a follow up on our previous item. One of the folks who was speaking in public comment was mentioning, would we be able to fill the inspector general's position. And so far, the city administrator has authorized us to fill that position despite the overall general hiring freeze here in the city of Oakland.
- John Alden: And so I think you'll pick up here a trend that we've been authorized to make several hiring decisions despite the overall hiring freeze. And I think that shows a real strong support from the City Administrator's office for full staffing of, at a minimum, the charter mandated positions that we need to make sure that CPRA and the inspector general and the commission are able to operate it at full capacity. So I'm really glad that we've been getting that level of support, especially at a time when the budget's really tight. And I'm thankful to [Ed Ruskin 02:52:31] for extending that to us.
- John Alden: So those are the main things that I want to talk about in my report. I'm happy to answer any questions that the commissioners might have.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you very much, Mr. Alden. Are there any questions?
- Regina Jackson: Okay. For now I see none. Maybe we can go to public comments and some questions might come up later. Mr. Rus.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you, Madam Chair. If any member of the public wishes to comment on Item 9 in tonight's agenda, please raise your hand in the queue and you will be called in the order in which your hands are raised. The first speaker on this item is Ms. Assata Olugbala. Good evening, Ms. Olugbala. Can you hear us?



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION MEETING TRANSCRIPT

January 28, 2021

- Assata Olugbala: Yes. I can hear you. I looked at all 16 pages of the findings. Every page I counted all exonerated. On some pages are unfounded. And in some cases you had things like, I can't remember what it was, no jurisdiction, or...
- Assata Olugbala: It's just disgusting that when you have... Every time you come, you have either none or very few sustained cases. And tonight, not one case is sustained. Not one. And you have the audacity to give a report to brag as if something is being accomplished. What's been accomplished is you're not able to find officers guilty of misconduct. And you have the majority of the complaints being use of force, profiling, bias, performance of duty issues, and racial discrimination. And we don't find one case. This is ridiculous. And it happens every time. And you're bragging like you're doing something.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you, Ms. Olugbala.
- Juanito Rus: The next speaker in the queue is listed as G. I believe that is Ms. Ginale Harris. I'm going to move her to the panel. Good evening, Ms. Harris. Can you hear us?
- Ginale Harris: Thank you, Mr. Rus.
- Ginale Harris: So I just have one question. This is continuing on as it was prior. And I want to know, are the investigators doing investigations or are they still going off of what IA has established? I want to know, are these investigators going in the community and doing real investigations? That was the goal of the CPRA, which is why we asked for a reorganization, because nothing has changed. The name has changed but the people are still there. Same investigators, same people that still work there. The only thing is different is the lead.
- Ginale Harris: Now I respect the lead. However, the way they do investigations have to change, because we know that there's bias. We know that there is racism. We know that. You see it every day on TV. So you can't say it's not happening here.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you, Ms. Harris.
- Juanito Rus: The next speaker in the queue is Kevin Cantu. Good evening, Mr. Cantu. Can you hear us?
- Kevin Cantu: Yes. I just like to echo that. We see it happen in our communities. I've seen OPD tailgating a car in my neighborhood for no apparent reason. Not making a stop, just harassing someone. I yield my time.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you, Mr. Cantu.
- Juanito Rus: At this time, those are all the speakers on this item, Madam Chair. I return the meeting to you.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you very much.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

January 28, 2021

- Regina Jackson: So a question, Mr. Alden, because this issue of non-sustained or, excuse me, sustained cases to Ms. Assata's point have been ongoing for a while. I think I would like to figure out how you can educate us all without violating any confidentiality what the challenges are, because somebody somewhere is violating the policy.
- Regina Jackson: Any [crosstalk 02:57:50] about that?
- John Alden: Yeah, there are a few things I can say about that. I think as a general rule, the one thing that's simpler to understand is anytime we come in here, any one month and give a statistical report, it's a very small snapshot of the overall work we've been doing, right? So I think it is more useful to take a look at the work we've done over longer periods of time, like say a year, and see what the trends are in that regard. And in that regard, our sustained rates generally been significantly above the statewide averages. And it's hard to know for sure what that means.
- John Alden: It's certainly an indicator that we're working hard and also that our investigators are able to find misconduct when it becomes apparent in cases. So I do think that an important thing to also remember in these kinds of cases is that CPRA takes complaints from anyone who wishes to make a complaint about a police officer.
- John Alden: We don't control who's making complaints or what they're making complaints about. So, it's our job to make sure that we thoroughly investigate every complaint. That doesn't mean that every complaint that comes to us is necessarily a complaint about an officer's conduct. Sometimes we get complaints about things that officers did that actually are in policy, and so we have to fairly and objectively call those as they are.
- John Alden: And so I think for any oversight agency, one can't simply say that the quality of the work is judged by the sustained rates that they have, because that agency can't control the cases that come in.
- John Alden: I think that there are some ways that we can have better insight for the public into whether those cases are done well or not. I think the inspector general coming on will be an important part of that because they'll have the ability to take a close look at the cases that we're working on.
- John Alden: And in addition to that, I think the audit that the city auditor did a while back is useful too. I think that we are going to be able to show the next time we do that audit that we followed up on most of their recommendations pretty effectively. For example, we are doing many more interviews now. We have much better training for our investigators around how to do interviews. And we are much better at tracking and planning those cases at an earlier stage than we used to be. So, for example, we now have mid-level supervisors that work with investigators to craft investigative plans at the beginning of cases and make sure that we're correctly prioritizing the most important violations and making sure we put resources into the cases that are looking like they're most likely to be sustained and make sure we've done a thorough job.
- John Alden: Prior to my coming on, there really wasn't a process for prioritizing cases or getting investigator's assistance or help. They're kind of on their own, and in many cases, such inquiries incentivized to



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

January 28, 2021

simply get them done in the order in which their deadlines came as opposed to thinking about which ones are really the most important and which ones needed the most in-depth screening.

John Alden: I think our training is much better than it was before. Our investigators have been giving us some more positive feedback about feeling that they understand how to do the job a lot better than these two. That's a really substantial improvement. But I think one thing that is really hard in oversight is that low sustained rates, which is generally what we see across the state, are to my mind an indication that the way officers are behaving in the field doesn't match community expectation, and at the same time are consistent with their training.

John Alden: So in a disciplinary system like ours, we can only sustain an officer if they've done something that is contrary to policy or training. But if the community finds that policy and training does not meet their expectations, then you're going to have a lot of complaints and a very low sustained rate. And I think that it is a concern that we see in Oakland, as is the case in virtually every other city in California, a real strong disconnect between the expectations of the community and the way that officers are behaving in the field. And one of the great strengths of this commission, which will be only strengthened when the inspector general comes on, is that you can change those policies to make sure they better comply with public expectation. And I think that's a really important part of the solution to that sustained rate issue.

John Alden: So that's a lot that I've put out there, but I think those are some of the key points to think about when I look at these [inaudible 03:02:41] reports.

Regina Jackson: No, I'm very much appreciative. I think that what will be necessary is for you to take a look at giving us that one year overview so that we can see hopefully an increased level of sustained rates. And to your point about investigations, and to former Commissioner Harris' point, being able to kind of walk us through the process around how investigations are done now, because I do understand that you have more of a structure, so that both our new commissioners as well as our community can understand the steps, the levels, the complexities, this prioritization process that you can put in place.

Regina Jackson: I think all those things are really, really important. And then to your point about mixing policy with community expectation, there may be an opportunity to get that kind of feedback.

Regina Jackson: I don't know if we can have a graduate student or something so that we can begin to plan in alignment with what we're hearing, what we're seeing, and quite frankly, what some of us are thinking.

Regina Jackson: So, those are just my thoughts. Hopefully, we can work together to figure out how to present those pieces. Hopefully before the new fiscal year so that we can make some pivots as it relates to the IG.

Regina Jackson: And so, having said that, I see no questions. Let's go ahead onto the next slide, Mr. Rus.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION MEETING TRANSCRIPT

January 28, 2021

- Regina Jackson: So the commission retreat. We've had an awful lot of discussion since last year. As you all saw, it's a very big packet. And I am pleased to say that everybody on the commission, now, as well as former commissioners, had some contribution to make to it so that when we start at 10:00 AM sharp Saturday, January 30th, that we are not just looking at concepts and ideation, but we are already looking at some documentation, some structure, some recommendations that people have been spending time putting together in hopes that we can have some fruitful discussion and make some resolve.
- Regina Jackson: Our retreat is going to be from 10:00 to 4:00. I believe that we have posted the flyer everywhere. If not, it'll happen tomorrow. I don't know if any of the commissioners have any-questions. Again, the majority of things that we plan to handle are directly in response to structures and processes that we should have in place. Many are in alignment with the City Auditor's recommendations. And quite frankly, we just don't have a lot of time to sit down and work out processes and strategies. And so being able to capsule them here will be great. I think that Mr. Satterwhite has done an excellent job thus far, and we'll be able to facilitate a great series of discussions. I thoroughly expect everyone to be able to participate. This will be another great training opportunity for our newer commissioners and will allow us to do some jelling together. This pandemic has not really facilitated much opportunity, so this will be one of those unique things.
- Regina Jackson: So we will be virtual. It will be in a Zoom type format. We will start at 10:00 AM. We will go till 04:00 PM. There will be a lunch break. If you all have taken a look at the agenda, we've parsed out some time expectations in terms of how much time we spend on items, but it is full. It is a full agenda. Are there any questions? Okay. I'm seeing none. Why don't we go to... Uh-oh, I see one Commissioner Dorado.
- José Dorado: Thank you, Chair Jackson. This is just for the commissioners and also any members of the public that are going to attend. Come ready to work. Come ready to let your hair down. Come ready to... This is not going to be like a formal meeting in the sense that we're really looking to come together to gel, to use the chairs' words, do some real thinking, coming into the meeting, coming into the retreat about what it means to be on this commission, what our mission is and what you're bringing to the table and how you can compliment the other members on the commission. But just come ready to work. Thank you.
- Regina Jackson: Appreciate that, Commissioner Dorado. Yes. And the last time we did our retreat, we were actually together. We had some members of the community join us and we were at the Waterfront Hotel, so it was a nice space. I hate these Zoom scenarios. I'm Zoomed out, but because the design will be different than our commission meetings, I do think that it will be hardworking, but enjoyable and informal. And I expect us to get a lot of work done. So I'm excited. Are there any other commissioner comments or questions? Okay, great. So we will go to Mr. Rus for public comment then.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you, Madam Chair. If any member of the public wishes to speak on item 10 on tonight's agenda, please raise your hand in the Zoom queue and you'll be called in the order in which your hands are raised. I am seeing no... And there is a hand. The first hand in the queue is Ms. Assata Olugbala. Good evening, Ms. Olugbala, can you hear us?



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION MEETING TRANSCRIPT

January 28, 2021

- Assata Olugbala: Yes. Excuse me for not speaking on your retreat, but Mr. Olden, you have got to stop misrepresenting as if things are happening that are creating what we need to deal with the police misconduct. The CPRA is not getting results. Don't act like this is a one-time thing that this particular report reflects that you have no sustain. I've been coming to meetings even before there was this police commission where the same thing was happening. The investigation by the CPRA was getting nothing done. And you talking about what's happening across the state is the average, that's bull. You're going to make me lose my religion if you keep doing this, because this is people's lives that have been impacted, mostly black people. And I'm not going to let you make it seem like you're doing something when nothing is happening that needs to happen to get the results we need.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you, Ms. Olugbala. At this time, I see no other hands in the queue, Madam Chair. I return the meeting to you.
- Regina Jackson: Okay. Thank you very much. So it looks like we can advance to the next item on the agenda. And for those of you wondering, we are coming up to the end. So for meeting minutes approval, we will take January 7th first. Does anybody have any edits to the minutes? Okay. I see none. I want to be efficient? Can we do public comment for both January 7th and 14th or separately, but kind of a round-robin. Do the seventh, then do the 14th and then we'll come back and see if we can take action. Okay. I think that that'll be planned then. So Mr. Rus, we'll do public comment for January 7th, then we'll do public comment for January 14th and then we'll come back to see if we can approve the minutes.
- Juanito Rus: Very well. Thank you, Madam Chair. If any member of the public wishes to comment on the January 7th minutes of the police commission, please raise your hand in the Zoom queue at this time. Seeing no hands. If any member of the public wishes to comment on the January 14th minutes, please raise your hand in the Zoom queue. No hands on either date, Madam Chair. The floor is yours.
- Regina Jackson: Okay. Well, thank you very much. So given the fact that there are no edits, does anyone want to make a motion to approve the minutes of January 7th?
- Sergio Garcia: So moved.
- Regina Jackson: Okay.
- Brenda Harbin-Forte: Second.
- Regina Jackson: That is Commissioner Garcia followed by Commissioner Harbin-Forte. And I'm sorry, Commissioner Dorado, I didn't see you quick enough. So it has been moved and seconded. We've taken public comment. Can we take a vote please? So it's Commissioner Harbin-Forte?
- Brenda Harbin-Forte: Aye.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Garcia?



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

January 28, 2021

Sergio Garcia: Aye.

Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Gage?

Henry Gage, III: Yes.

Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Singleton?

Tyfahra Singleton: Yes.

Regina Jackson: Thank you. And aye, for myself. The minutes of January 7th are approved with-

José Dorado: Jackson, you forgotten me.

Regina Jackson: I'm sorry. Commissioner Dorado?

José Dorado: Aye.

Regina Jackson: Thank you very much. The minutes of January 7th are unanimously approved without edits. So now we'll go to January 14th minutes. Commissioner Dorado?

José Dorado: I move we approve the minutes of January 14th.

Regina Jackson: Excellent.

Sergio Garcia: I second.

Regina Jackson: Thank you, Commissioner Garcia. So it's been properly moved and seconded. Let us vote. Commissioner Dorado?

José Dorado: Aye.

Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Garcia?

Sergio Garcia: Aye.

Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Gage?

Henry Gage, III: Yes.

Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Harbin-Forte?

Brenda Harbin-Forte: Aye.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION MEETING TRANSCRIPT

January 28, 2021

- Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Singleton?
- Tyfahra Singleton Yes.
- Regina Jackson: Thank you. And aye, for myself. The minutes of January 14th have been unanimously passed without edit. Thank you very much. Can you advance the slide please? Committee reports. So at this meeting, and we're going to start trying to go back to something that we used to do and that's reporting out from standing and or ad hoc committees. What I'd like to do is set a schedule for who's actively doing work. So for example, we're also going to identify as a part of the ad hocs, what the goals are and what the status is. So for example, the ad hoc on the police chief nominations. Since we turned over those nominations to the mayor on January 7th, that ad hoc is no longer in place or it's completed its job.
- Regina Jackson: So for the purpose of right now and committee reports, I think it might make sense to have a report out from the rules of order and maybe militarized equipment, unless there's another ad hoc or I mean, we could do three, but I figured that we might do two or three at each meeting so that we can understand what the development is, if there are any challenges, if people need more help, that kind of thing. If that works for people, we will move forward. Commissioner Dorado.
- José Dorado: I just didn't want us to forget the ad hoc on a 15-01.
- Regina Jackson: Yes. So the ad hoc on community policing, and if you would like to report out that would be great. That ad hoc is you Commissioner Harbin-Forte, and myself. Would you like to give a view of what's coming with that one?
- José Dorado: Yes. Thank you, Chair Jackson. Just briefly, I just completed the edits on my version of the 15-01 that I'll be forwarding to you the Chair, the other two members of the ad hoc. One of our main tasks aside from doing the coming to an agreement as to the wording of what we're going to take to the commission, is determining how we're going to handle community input. And so I appreciate the input, the suggestions by both Megan Steffen and the Coalition of Police Accountability. They contributed a couple of extensive suggestions and how to do that. So we the ad hoc will be bringing those to the ad hoc so we can determine how we're going to do exactly that, bring in a community input so that what we present to the commission from the ad hoc is as refined a document as possible reflective of the needs and the wants and the perspective of the community.
- José Dorado: So this is where we're going. So we'll be having conversations, the ad hoc, on our meeting date, which we report on our next one and also on our progress on putting that input plan together.
- Regina Jackson: Excellent, Commissioner Dorado, and Commissioner Dorado is taking the lead on this ad hoc. And so if there are members in the public that would like to participate on the community policing ad hoc, please email him Commissioner Dorado, or email myself and let us know. And then as we get our plans together in terms of our meeting dates and things like that, and we can coordinate, and we know who has interest in working on it. Commissioner Gage.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION MEETING TRANSCRIPT

January 28, 2021

- Henry Gage, III: Thank you, Chair. I can provide a brief update on the, I believe it's referred to as the militarized equipment ad hoc. Which is somewhat confusing given that there's also a militarized equipment ordinance that's floating out there. Nonetheless, the ad hoc has been reviewing a training bulletin that would govern the use and deployment of the local police department's armored vehicle complement. We're expecting to have a final draft of that training bulletin ready for commission review likely by the next meeting. We're going to be getting back together this coming Monday for what's going to be our last meeting prior to coming back and requesting action. For members of the public who are unaware of the ad hoc composition, the commission representatives are Chair Jackson, Commissioner Harbin-Forte, and myself. We are joined by various staff from the Oakland Police Department, led by, or I should say coordinated by acting Lieutenant Joe Turner for the Policy on Publications Unit, as well as Katie [inaudible 03:20:56], and [inaudible 03:20:57] Janks, John Lindsay-Poland and Omar [inaudible 03:21:00]. Pause for a moment, if there's any questions from commissioners on this ad hoc.
- Regina Jackson: Commissioner Gage, I just want to correct the militarized commissioner representation. That's alternate Commissioner Jordan, rather than Commissioner Harbin-Forte.
- Henry Gage, III: My apologies.
- Regina Jackson: That's okay. I know that you're working with Commissioner Harbin-Forte on another committee, so that's fine.
- Brenda Harbin-Forte: Thank you.
- Henry Gage, III: My apologies. It's my confusion.
- Regina Jackson: That's okay. That's all right. So are there any questions at this time from the commissioners? Okay, that's fine. So why don't we go ahead and move forward. Commissioner Harbin-Forte, did you want to talk a little bit about the rules of order? That ad hoc is there's a co-chairing relationship between Commissioner Gage, Commissioner Harbin-Forte, and then Commissioner Garcia is on that ad hoc.
- Brenda Harbin-Forte: Thank you, Chair. Yes, we have proposed a revised set of procedural rules that will be further discussed at the retreat on Saturday. There are other rules that we intend to add and different other types of projects that we will undertake and including at some point doing a policies and procedures manual, but that will be long-term. But we have been working diligently, working hard, and we are looking forward to talking about the proposed amended rules at the retreat on Saturday.
- Regina Jackson: Excellent. Thank you very much. Unless someone thinks that another ad hoc needs to be reported out on right now, I think we've probably covered the top three or four, and we can go to public comment. Mr. Rus.



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION MEETING TRANSCRIPT

January 28, 2021

- Juanito Rus: Thank you, Madam Chair. If any member of the public wishes to comment on item 12 on tonight's agenda, please raise your hand in the Zoom queue. The first speaker on this item is Rachel Beck. Good evening, Ms. Beck, can you hear us?
- Rachel Beck: Yes. Thanks. Can you hear me?
- Juanito Rus: We can hear you. Whenever you're ready.
- Rachel Beck: Fantastic. Thanks. I just realized that I don't actually know what all of the existing committees are and I was wondering if it would be possible for us to get the number of existing committees, both ad hoc and standing, and list them by name just for clarity's sake. Thank you.
- Regina Jackson: And yes, we can. We actually have that document, so I'm not exactly sure why it didn't make it into the packet, but that's fine. We'll make sure it does in the future.
- Juanito Rus: Thank you, Ms. Beck. The next speaker in the queue is Ms. Assata Olugbala. Good evening, Ms. Olugbala, can you hear us?
- Assata Olugbala: Yeah. So you have the ability to seek out appropriateness on a many subjects, but when the subject comes up that something happened that was inappropriate as it related to the selection, a lack of selection of Ms. Janell Harris, and you act like and refuse to approach dealing with it. And all you have to do is sit down and look at the tapes of the selection committee meeting when there was disparaging comment made about Ms. Harris and Mr. Dorado, you know this, and you need to pursue it more. If you keep ignoring something that's very important. Somebody was out of a position and a manner that you should deal with it. And you're talking about rules of order, when you won't have any order, and it results in you not being credible. You cannot pick and choose things that you select that you're going to deal with. You have to deal with this now-
- Juanito Rus: Thank you, Ms. Olugbala-
- Assata Olugbala: Nothing can be right until you deal with this matter.
- Juanito Rus: At this time, I'm seeing no other hands raised in the queue, Madam Chair, I return the meeting to you.
- Regina Jackson: Okay. Thank you very much. If you can advance the slide for me, please. Thank you. So item 13, agenda setting and prioritization of upcoming agenda items. We have quite a few things that we have identified for the next meeting. So we will be setting up two ad hocs, one on the social media policy and the one on the IG, we will have a... I think Mr. Alden, aren't you going to do a report out on the concurrence process that we discussed?
- John Alden: I was going to call it the investigative process instead of the concurrent process, but yeah.
- Regina Jackson: Yes, absolutely. I'm sorry, that word is stuck in my head. So we will have that. And then we will also have the militarized training bulletin for consideration. There are a couple other items that



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION MEETING TRANSCRIPT

January 28, 2021

I've lost track of right now. Are there any other suggested items that we need to put on the agenda? I feel like after we complete the retreat, we may decide that there are going to be a couple of items that come directly from the retreat that we want to take up as well. And we'll probably have an IG update at that point as well. So if there aren't any other suggestions... Wait, did I see a hand? Yes. Commissioner Dorado.

José Dorado: Thank you, Chair Jackson. I think we may have just a short report on 15-01. I do expect between now and our next meeting, there'll be some progress.

Regina Jackson: Oh, great. Okay. So then we'll make sure to agendize that as well. Thank you. So if there aren't any more comments, questions, then we can go to public comment.

Juanito Rus: Thank you, Madam Chair. If any member of the public wishes to make comment on item 13 on tonight's agenda is raise your hand in the Zoom queue. The first speaker in the queue on this item is Ms. Assata Olugbala. Good evening, Ms. Olugbala. Can you hear us?

Assata Olugbala: Okay, hold up. Grandma will be right with you. The item that should be on the agenda for discussion is, how do you procedurally respond to issues that the community brings to you? And it never results in you completely ignoring what the people are bringing to you. Every item should have, if it's something that the community is requesting, the capacity for you to give a response. That's decency and not to ignore people. That's what the police do. Ignore people. You don't want to talk about Janell Harris, that's obvious, but you don't have a choice. The community is asking you to respond to the issue of what happened when she was pursuing being reappointed to the police commission and things were done wrong and you have to at some point, respond to them.

Juanito Rus: Thank you, Ms. Olugbala. The next speaker in the queue is listed as Anne J. I believe that is Ms. Janks. I will promote her to the panel. Good evening, Ms. Janks, can you hear us?

Anne Janks: Hi. My wifi has been a little dodgy, so forgive me if this has already been stated, but two other items are the dedicated arrest team training bulletin and the armed unresponsive training bulletin. I might not have heard it.

Regina Jackson: Yes. So Ms. Janks, we actually voted and approved both of those policies at our last meeting. I believe that was January 14th.

Anne Janks: Excellent. Sorry. Thanks.

Regina Jackson: No problem. No problem. Thank you for staying up on it.

Juanito Rus: And at this time, Madam Chair, I see no further hands raised in the queue.

Regina Jackson: Okay. Thank you very much. So I will get all of those items that have been suggested for us to address plus what comes from the retreat. And we will see a new agenda for the next meeting. Now, it's time for adjournment. Does anybody want to ask any questions about it or do you want to make a motion?



OAKLAND POLICE COMMISSION

MEETING TRANSCRIPT

January 28, 2021

Sergio Garcia: So moved.

Regina Jackson: Thank you, Commissioner Garcia. Is there a second?

Brenda Harbin-Forte: Second.

Regina Jackson: Thank you, Commissioner Harbin-Forte. Let's go ahead and vote. Commissioner Dorado?

José Dorado: Aye.

Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Garcia?

Sergio Garcia: Aye.

Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Gage?

Henry Gage, III: Yes.

Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Harbin-Forte?

Brenda Harbin-Forte: Aye.

Regina Jackson: Thank you. Commissioner Singleton?

Tyfahra Singleton: Yes.

Regina Jackson: Aye, for myself. It is unanimous. We are complete. It is 10:01 PM. Anyway, everyone get home safe, stay home safe, and we will see you hopefully on Saturday or at the very least at our next regular commission meeting. Thank you everyone. Appreciate you. Goodnight. Thank you.

From: [Elise Bernstein](#)
To: [Love, Christine \(Chrissie\)](#); [Alden, John](#)
Subject: My public comment for 1/27/21 Police Commission meeting
Date: Wednesday, January 27, 2021 12:00:56 PM

[EXTERNAL] This email originated outside of the City of Oakland. Please do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and expect the message.

Chrissie,
Please share the following public comment with all Police Commissioners.

Thank you,
Elise

Dear Police Commissioner,

I support the Coalition for Police Accountability's statement and recommendations regarding John Alden's presentation about the CPRA-IAD investigative process.

Personally, after the Police Commission (PC) was established with the former CPRB renamed CPRA, I have had concerns about whether CPRA had fully evolved to be an arm of the PC as a community voice, separate and independent of OPD. That concern was soon proven to have a factual basis as the transition CPRA Executive Director demonstrated his work with the IAD, and was dismissed.

My concerns greatly decreased with CPRA ED Alden's appointment, until now.

Measure LL and Measure S1 require totally separate and independent and parallel investigations by CPRA and IAD, with independent recommendations by both for possible discipline. No coordination of these two separate investigations is allowed out of public view. Differences in recommendations for discipline are to be settled by the PC in public.

I agree that any such discussions by the CPRA ED and OPD should include or be overseen by a third trusted party, either a PC chosen by the PC Chair or the PC Inspector General.

Thank you for your attention,

Elise
Member of Coalition for Police Accountability Steering Committee

[REDACTED]
Oakland D6
[REDACTED]