



City of Oakland

Mayor's Commission on Persons with Disabilities (MCPD)
Monday, November 20, 2023 5:30 p.m.-7:30 p.m.
Hearing Room 1, First Floor
One Frank H. Ogawa Plaza (City Hall), Oakland, CA 94612

Minutes

Commissioners: Cathy Eberhardt (Acting Chair), Noah Smith (Vice Chair), Ayanna Keeton, Marjorie Lynne, Kyle O'Malley, Fatimah Aure, Barry Robinson, Linda St. Julian, Anwar Baroudi, [Benjamin Bartu](#)

Commission staff: Anh Nguyen-ADA Programs Division Manager, Mark Romoser-ADA Programs Division Program Analyst I

Presenters: Matthew Malsin, Councilmember Kalb's office; Becky Frank and Hunter Oatman-Stanford, Caltrans; Michael Randolph, OakDOT

Other attendees: N'Sombi Hasan, Thomas Cloyd, Sheela Gunn, Councilmember Dan Kalb

Mark Romoser begins the meeting with a reminder of rules for in-person meetings:

- No food or open drink allowed in Hearing Room 1 to maintain a clean and professional environment.
- Drinks must be in a closed container to prevent any spills or accidents.
- When commissioners speak- please press the top-red button that says "mic" and when you are finished, please press the button again.
- To ensure clarity and transparency, when commissioners speak, please state your name before speaking.
- When a member of the audience is speaking or commenting- please first state your name and any affiliations you may have.
- Restrooms are located outside Hearing Room 1, near the elevators.

Acting Chair Eberhardt called the meeting to order at 5:35.

Roll Call

- At roll call, quorum was not established with five of ten commissioners present (X).

Commissioners	Present (x)
Cathy Eberhardt (Vice Chair)	X
Noah Smith (Vice Chair)	Absent (excused)
Ayanna Keeton	Absent
Marjorie Lynne	Absent (excused)
Linda St. Julian	X
Kyle O'Malley	Absent
Fatimah Aure	X
Barry Robinson	Absent
Anwar Baroudi	X
Benjamin Bartu	X

Open Forum:

- There were no comments in Open Forum.

Commissioner's Announcements

- Commissioner Bartu briefly introduced himself.

Approval Of Minutes

- Without quorum, minutes could not be approved.

Reusable Foodware Ordinance

- Matthew Malsin from Councilmember Kalb's office gave his presentation. He was joined by Councilmember Kalb for Q&A. Councilmember Kalb also gave some background for the ordinance.
- Acting Chair Eberhardt asked what Councilmember Kalb and his team wanted from MCPD. Councilmember Kalb replied that they were looking for specific feedback on the provisions of the ordinance,

and for support at the December 5 City Council meeting where it will be heard.

- Commissioner St. Julian asked whether the proposed ordinance applied only to restaurants or to all litter. Councilmember Kalb replied that it applied only to fast-food or fast-casual restaurants, but that those types of restaurants accounted for a large percentage of overall litter. He also mentioned that there is a state requirement to limit discharge of waste into San Francisco Bay.
- Acting Chair Eberhardt pointed out that many bottles are purchased in stores rather than in restaurants. Councilmember Kalb responded that there are other means to ensure recycling of bottles, such as the California Redemption Value bottle fee. He also mentioned that plastic pollutants have been found in the ocean, and that there are paper and fiber alternatives to plastic.
- Acting Chair Eberhardt asked why accessible water refilling stations weren't mandated by the ordinance. Mr. Malsin replied that the city attorney's office advised against including that requirement, and added that about one-third of city buildings have accessible refilling stations.
- Commissioner St. Julian mentioned that there is a lot of filth in Oakland.
- Commissioner Baroudi asked if a copy of the ordinance was available. Councilmember Kalb directed him to the agenda packet for the December 5 council meeting.
- Commissioner Baroudi asked why certain facilities were exempted from the ordinance. Mr. Malsin replied that the exempted facilities were those, such as hospitals and schools, where single-use foodware might be needed.
- Commissioner Baroudi asked what restaurants would do if the cost of reusables proved to be prohibitive. Councilmember Kalb replied that waivers would be made available in such circumstances.
- ~~Commissioner Baroudi asked why hospitals and other health care facilities were exempt. Braz Shabrell replied that a similar exemption exists in other city ordinances such as the rent ordinance.~~
- Commissioner Baroudi asked why the city attorney's office rejected the idea of mandating accessible water refilling stations. Councilmember Kalb replied that it is his office's policy not to share city attorney's opinions without their consent. He mentioned that he supported providing refilling stations in new buildings.

Commented [NA1]: •Braz was not at the Nov meeting.

- Member of the public Sheela Gunn commented that food delivery services like Doordash refuse to honor patrons' requests not to have single-use items included in their deliveries. They pointed out that the Climate Emergency Mobilization Task Force held a webinar on climate change and disability on November 17.
- Member of the public Thomas Cloyd asked what accessible refilling stations looked like.

Vision 980 Project

- Becky Frank from Caltrans gave her presentation. She was joined by Hunter Oatman-Stanford for Q&A.
- Commissioner Bartu expressed concern about the potential for gentrification resulting from improved access to West Oakland. Ms. Frank replied that such comments will be included in the process, and that Caltrans has worked with anti-displacement efforts throughout Oakland.
- Commissioner St. Julian asked why this project was happening now, and who will benefit from it. She echoed Commissioner Bartu's concerns about gentrification. Ms. Frank replied that Caltrans is engaging community members in the process.
- Commissioner St. Julian pointed out that bike lanes often result in a loss of parking spaces. Ms. Frank responded that parking and dropoff zones would be included in any project along the 980 corridor. Mr. Oatman-Stanford mentioned that community-based organizations would be consulted.
- Commissioner Baroudi asked whether the land would be transferred to the city. Ms. Frank replied that it would, and added that she was unsure whether the proposed boulevard would be a city street or a state highway. Mr. Oatman-Stanford added that Caltrans is not a land developer.
- Commissioner Baroudi asked what other plans Caltrans has considered. Ms. Frank noted that better street crossings, a capped freeway like one in San Diego, and noise abatement are possibilities.

Electric Vehicle Charging

- Michael Randolph gave his presentation.

- Acting Chair Eberhardt asked how long it takes to charge an electric vehicle. Mr. Randolph replied that Level 1 charging takes 12 to 24 hours, while Level 2 charging, with a charging device, takes 6.
- Acting Chair Eberhardt asked if there would be enough charging stations as more people adopt EVs. Mr. Randolph replied that lack of infrastructure was indeed an issue.
- Commissioner Baroudi asked if property owners would be responsible for the ramps used to cover charging cords. Mr. Randolph replied that that is the case in Cambridge, Mass., which has a pilot street charging program.
- Commissioner Baroudi asked if the city had adequate resources for enforcement. Mr. Randolph replied that the city is already getting questions about this.
- Commissioner Baroudi asked what public charging facilities looked like. Mr. Randolph replied that at present, the city has one fast charger, located at Lafayette Square, and that all such charging stations are required to have a van-accessible space.
- Commissioner Baroudi asked if there would be charging done along major roads. Mr. Randolph replied that it would be easier to do fast charging off-street.
- Commissioner Baroudi asked who owned the chargers. Mr. Randolph replied that the city owns a few, but that most are privately owned.
- Commissioner Baroudi asked whether the privately owned chargers were leased or permitted. Mr. Randolph replied that they were permitted.
- Commissioner Baroudi asked whether the permits were revocable. Mr. Randolph replied that there is a process for that.
- Member of the public Sheila Gunn expressed a desire for an autonomous electric vehicle, and pointed out that parking was already crazy in their neighborhood. They asked how well street charging would work in the rain, and how they, as a blind person, would know that the ramp or grate was there. They expressed a desire for no more obstacles on sidewalks. Mr. Randolph replied that DOT was in the process of developing guidelines for charging installations.
- Gunn asked about best practices in electric vehicle charging. Mr. Randolph referred them to Seattle and to Cambridge, Mass. He also mentioned that the field of electric vehicle charging is relatively new.

Ad Hoc Committee to Explore Hybrid Meetings

- Without quorum, the matter was tabled until December.

Staff Updates and Announcements

- Mr. Romoser read the staff announcements.

The meeting was adjourned at 7:03.