

**CITY OF OAKLAND**  
**Oakland Public Works**

**TO:** Tam Tran, Chair, Parks and Recreation Advisory Commission (PRAC)  
**FROM:** Liam Garland, Assistant to the Director of Public Works (OPW)  
**DATE:** May 8, 2024  
**SUBJECT: Informational Report: OPW Monthly Measure Q Update**

---

**SUMMARY**

This report provides:

1. OPW's updates to PRAC regarding the hiring of staff related to Measure Q-funded park maintenance services.
2. Delivery of Measure Q-funded services.

**BACKGROUND / LEGISLATIVE HISTORY**

Measure Q, approved by Oakland voters in March 2020, provides funding for City of Oakland services related to parks maintenance, homelessness services, and water quality, subject to civilian oversight. The Oakland City Council assigned PRAC the oversight role regarding the Measure Q expenditures related to parks maintenance and water quality services.

As a component of this oversight function, OPW routinely submits to PRAC updates on hiring of positions related to Measure Q-funded park maintenance services.

**STATEMENT OF THE ISSUE**

At the March 13, 2024, PRAC meeting, Commissioners expressed their frustration with OPW progress and explanation delivering accurate and easily understandable Measure Q performance data. At the April 10, 2024 meeting, Public Works Director G. Harold Duffey reported on results of maintenance efforts to date and a format for future reporting of parks maintenance efforts.

In this report, staff update PRAC on maintenance and other Measure Q reporting. This report shows progress toward routine, monthly collection of relevant reporting to PRAC.

This report focuses on the following six areas:

1. **Staffing:** Measure Q Section 3(B)(1)(m): "Providing dedicated staff at major parks. 'Major Parks' means City operated Community Parks, Region-serving parks, and Resource Conservation Areas, as those terms are used in the Open Space Conservation & Recreation (OCSAR) Element of the Oakland General Plan."

The table below provides detail on the positions funded by Measure Q and whether those positions are filled or vacant as of March 2024. These positions are primarily in the Parks and Trees Division of Public Works' Bureau of the Environment.

**Table 1: March 2024 Hiring**

Fund	Classification	#Filled	#Vacant	%Vacant
Measure Q	Administrative Assistant II	1		
Measure Q	Business Analyst II	1		
Measure Q	Capital Imp Proj Coord, Asst	1		
Measure Q	Construction & Maintenance Mechanic	1	1	50.00%
Measure Q	Custodian	3	2	40.00%
Measure Q	Electrician		1	100.00%
Measure Q	Engineer, Assistant I (Office)		1	100.00%
Measure Q	Gardener Crew Leader	21	5	19.23%
Measure Q	Gardener II	29	2	6.45%
Measure Q	Irrigation Repair Specialist	3	1	25.00%
Measure Q	Painter	2		
Measure Q	Park Attendant, PPT	4		
Measure Q	Park Equipment Operator	6	1	14.29%
Measure Q	Park Supervisor I	6		
Measure Q	Park Supervisor II	2		
Measure Q	Tree Trimmer	2	1	33.33%
Measure Q	Tree Worker	1	2	66.67%
<b>Total</b>		<b>83</b>	<b>17</b>	<b>17.00%</b>

Table 2 below shows Measure Q-related hiring and vacancies from December 2023 and March 2024. This table shows progress toward filling vacancies for Measure Q-funded positions. Future reports will complete the remaining months of this fiscal year.

<b>Table 2: Measure Q Funded Positions</b>	FY 2023/2024				
	Dec	Mar	Apr	May	June
# of Filled Positions	81	83			
# of Vacant Positions	22	17			
% Vacant Positions	21%	17%			

Measure Q’s goal is at least the equivalent hours of one full time staff member—what staff refer to as a full-time equivalent position or FTE—providing park services at each major park. There are also industry standards for number of parks maintenance FTEs per acre of park maintained. In 2008, the International City/County Management Association recommended a best practice of one (1) parks maintenance staff member per 12 acres of parkland and indicated a higher ratio if population density is higher. Oakland has a high population density and these major parks face frequent illegal dumping. Given these factors, staff adjusted the industry standard to one (1) parks’ maintenance staff to 10 acres. When a consultant is hired to develop the park assessments (see more at the end of this report), this preliminary industry standard will be reviewed, adjusted, and finalized.

To approximate FTEs per major park, staff began by tracking the total labor hours worked by staff at each major park. Then these total labor hours per park were converted into a FTE count per park by dividing the total work hours per park by the number of hours a FTE works per month. This results in an approximate number of FTEs per park per month. For example,

Arroyo Viejo Park’s FTE count of 5.73 is calculated by work orders showing 994 hours worked in March at this park, divided by a FTE’s approximate 173 hours per month (2080 annual work hours divided by 12 months).

<b>Table 3: Staff FTEs at Major Parks</b>	Acres	March 2024 FTE total	Measure Q Goal: 1 FTE/ park	Met goal?	Prelim Industry standard: 1 FTE/ 10 acres	Met goal?
Arroyo Viejo Park	10.1	5.7	1	Yes	1.0	Yes
Brookdale Park	4.7	1.3	1	Yes	0.5	Yes
Brookfield Park	14	5	1	Yes	1.4	Yes
Bushrod Park	10.1	4.1	1	Yes	1.0	Yes
Defremery Park	14	2.8	1	Yes	1.4	Yes
Dimond Park	14.3	1.9	1	Yes	1.4	Yes
Joaquin Miller Park*	150	3.3	1	Yes	15.0	No
Lakeside Park	122	7.2	1	Yes	12.2	No
Montclair Park	6.7	2.5	1	Yes	0.7	Yes
Mosswood Park	11	2.4	1	Yes	1.1	Yes
San Antonio Park	11.6	1.4	1	Yes	1.2	Yes

\*Joaquin Miller Park has 500 total acres, but 360 acres are resource conservation areas not considered in this analysis.

Each of the major parks—defined in Measure Q as the community parks and regional-serving parks in the General Plan’s OSCAR element—are receiving more than 1 FTE per park by March 2024 and most show more than 2 FTEs. Most of the remaining major parks are meeting the preliminary industry standard goal with the exception of Joaquin Miller and Lakeside parks.

Future reports will continue updating for relevant months and enable staff and the PRAC to evaluate trends through seasons and over time. With six months of data collected, staff will then be able to cross-reference these trends with the maintenance findings from the parks assessments referenced at the end of this report and update the preliminary industry standard goal for baseline FTEs per park.

- Ballfield Mowing:** Measure Q Section 3(B)(1)(a): “Mowing City operated sports fields frequently, every other week, or as may be required by the time of year.”

The Parks and Trees Division in Public Works’ Bureau of the Environment is responsible for ballfield mowing. Measure Q sets a priority to mow “frequently” and defines frequently as



This table shows a total of 31 ballfield mows in March. Fifteen parks (or 48%) met or exceeded the staff’s off-season goal of once per month mowing. Sixteen fields (or 52%) did not receive a mow. Three significant storms occurred in March, which hindered the amount of mowing that was possible. In addition, staff were troubleshooting how to properly enter work orders so that a mow is correctly recorded in this report. April data will show, as we enter peak season and data input improves, an increase in frequency of ballpark mowing.

3. **Trash and Litter:** Measure Q Section 3(B)(1)(b): “Collecting trash and litter several times per week, including Saturdays and Sundays, from the City’s most used parks, assuring equitable distribution of resources...”

Staff have provided a baseline goal and a Measure Q goal for number of times to service trash cans and pick up litter in each of the most used parks. The baseline goal is two times per week emptying of cans and picking up litter, 100% of the time. The Measure Q goal is the baseline goal of two pickups plus additional pickups on Saturday and Sunday, for a total of four weekly pickups that are completed 75% of the time. This goal translates into three or more weekly pickups (four pickups multiplied by 75%) at the major parks. The baseline goal and the Measure Q goal are separately reflected in the table below. Data on the emptying of trash cans started in April, so staff is currently reviewing the April data to ensure its accuracy and will report it at PRAC’s June 12 meeting.

Every Monday and Friday, the Parks and Trees Division empties parks’ trash cans and removes litter. The City’s most used parks—again defined as the community parks and regional-serving parks in the General Plan’s OSCAR element—can receive a separate visit in which litter is again picked up and trash cans are emptied.

Since the last PRAC meeting, staff inventoried the trash cans at each City park and entered the inventory into Cityworks. In April, staff serving the parks began to enter data on trash can emptying in Cityworks to provide reporting on this important Measure Q deliverable.

<b>Table 5: Weekly Emptying of Trash Cans at Most Used Parks</b>	# of trash cans	Times/ week cans emptied	Baseline Goal: 2x/week emptying of cans, 100% of the time	Goal met?	Measure Q Goal: 4x/week emptying of cans, 75% of time	Goal met?
Mosswood Park (11 acres)	2	Data shared at June 12 PRAC meeting	2	Data shared at June 12 PRAC meeting	3	Data shared at June 12 PRAC meeting
Bushrod Park (10.12 acres)	10		2		3	
Defremery Park** (14 acres)	13		2		3	
San Antonio Field**(11.62 acres)	21		2		3	
Brookdale Park* (4.66 acres)	6		2		3	
Brookfield Park (14 acres)	6		2		3	
Arroyo Viejo** (18.75 acres)	5		2		3	
Lakeside Park ** (75 acres)	95		2		3	
Joaquin Miller Park	49		2		3	
Montclair Rec Center Field	13		2		3	
Dimond Park (14.31 acres)	16	2	3			

4. **Restroom Cleaning:** Measure Q Section 3(B)(1)(e): “Cleaning Park Restrooms more than once per day, especially on weekends.”

The Facilities Services Division of Public Works’ Bureau of Maintenance and Internal Services is responsible for outside restroom cleaning.

Staff set a baseline goal of cleaning every parks’ restroom once per day, 100% of the time. Given April has 30 days, the baseline goal is 30 cleanings. Measure Q’s goal is to clean park restrooms “more than once per day, especially on weekends.” Staff have set a target of twice per day cleanings, including weekends, 80% of the time. The monthly target for April is 60 cleanings per park restroom (twice per day for 30 days) multiplied by 80%, resulting in a Measure Q goal of 48 cleanings per month.

Staff updated the prior restroom inventory, developed a new application to track restroom cleanings, resolved several persistent issues in using the application in the field, and adopted new procedures for staff and their supervisors to enter and track data.

The table below shows whether the baseline goal and Measure Q goals are being met in April 2024. This is the first time this data has been collected and it has undergone limited staff review for quality control, so there may be corrections incorporated into future reporting. Each cleaning count represents the restroom or restrooms being cleaned at the listed location. Where only one bathroom exists at a location, one count equals one restroom cleaning. In locations with multiple restrooms, one count represents multiple restrooms being cleaned.

<b>Table 6: Monthly Restroom Cleanings by Facility</b>	April 2024 Cleanings	Baseline Goal: 1x daily cleaning, 100% of time (30)	Goal met?	Measure Q Goal: 2x daily cleanings, 80%+ of time (48)	Goal met?
12th St & Lake Merrit Blvd	42	30	Yes	48	No
Astro Park / Eastshore Park	52	30	Yes	48	Yes
Bella Vista Park	23	30	No	48	No
Brookdale Park	17	30	No	48	No
Burckhalter Park	31	30	Yes	48	No
Caldecott Park	16	30	No	48	No
Central Reservoir Recreation Area	18	30	No	48	No
Cesar Chavez Park	27	30	No	48	No
Concordia Park	16	30	No	48	No
Davie Tennis Stadium	23	30	No	48	No
Dimond Park	47	30	Yes	48	No
Estuary Park	35	30	Yes	48	No
Frog Park Rockridge-Temescal Greenbelt	27	30	No	48	No
Joaquin Miller - Fire Circle	24	30	No	48	No
Joaquin Miller - Redwood Glen	25	30	No	48	No
Joaquin Miller Park - Meadow	71	30	Yes	48	Yes
Lakeside Park - Sailboat House	49	30	Yes	48	Yes
Lowell Park	29	30	No	48	No
Madison/Wilma Chan Park	41	30	Yes	48	No
Maxwell Park	26	30	No	48	No

McCrea Park	28	30	No	48	No
Montclair Park	48	30	Yes	48	Yes
Morcom Rose Garden	44	30	Yes	48	No
Mosswood Park - Theater Building	27	30	No	48	No
Pine Knoll	45	30	Yes	48	No
San Antonio	28	30	No	48	No
Shepherd Canyon Park	32	30	Yes	48	No
Snow Park	29	30	No	48	No
Union Point	36	30	Yes	48	No
Total	956	870		1392	

No reporting is provided for parks restrooms that are closed or operate only seasonally or by event: Arroyo Viejo (McConnell Field), Carter Gilmore, deFremery, Joaquin Miller-Sequoia Arena, Lafayette Park, Oakport Field, Otis Spunkmeyer Field, Raimondi, Officer Willie Wilkins, Willow Park, and Wood Minster. In addition, staff are troubleshooting a technical problem with the data collected at Joaquin Miller Park Ranger Station.

The table shows that 956 restrooms cleanings occurred in the month of April. Of these 29 parks with restrooms, 13 (or 45%) reached or exceeded staff’s baseline goal and four (or 14%) met or exceeded staff’s goal for the Measure Q benchmark. Two vacant full-time custodians were hired and onboarded this month, so staff expect to see increased cleanings in the May data.

- Water Quality and Related Litter Reduction:** Measure Q Section 3(B) and (3)(B)(k): “Services to address water quality and related litter reduction...[including] [u]pdating the City Storm Drainage Master Plan.”

The Watershed and Stormwater Management Division of Public Works’ Bureau of Design and Construction is responsible for updating the City’s Storm Drainage Master Plan, which is the initial primary beneficiary of Measure Q funding on water quality and litter reduction. The plan is estimated to be completed by Winter 2026.

This plan assesses the condition of the City’s storm drainage system and identifies areas prone to flooding. It includes an inventory and assessment of the City’s storm drainage system; studies to evaluate if drains and pipes have capacity to handle storm drainage flows; a prioritized list of improvements to reduce local flooding and to add green stormwater infrastructure designed to clean stormwater and provide urban greening benefits; preliminary cost estimates of storm drainage system improvements; and suggestions for funding sources to implement the planned storm drainage improvements.

To date, the plan’s hydrology and hydraulic modeling are over 95% complete. The storm drainage system condition inspection is 40% complete. The consultant is also identifying major system deficiencies based on modeling results, complaints, and maintenance information. For the highest priority deficiencies, watershed-based capacity improvement project alternatives will be developed (e.g. upsized storm drainage pipes, diversions, detention, floodwalls, pump station improvements, etc.). Designs to 10% will be developed for each selected alternative to better quantify the cost and to serve as the basis for future funding applications. The project has already identified 5 channel daylighting sites, 9

regional green infrastructure sites with flood control benefits, and 10 existing trash captures with maintenance issues.

Public Works will return to PRAC's July 10 meeting with a more detailed report on the stormwater initiatives funded by Measure Q, including those not related to the Storm Drainage Master Plan.

6. **Parks Assessments:** Measure Q Section 3(B)(1)(l): "Developing measurable tools to ensure equitable maintenance of all parks and open spaces..."

The Parks and Trees Division of Public Works' Bureau of Environment is responsible for park maintenance. It is currently procuring the help of a consultant to conduct park assessments. The assessment will categorize the City's parks and grounds by size, amenities, and facilities. It will first establish baseline acceptable conditions by asset type (i.e. pool, restroom, ballfield, pathway) and then provide recommendations for maintenance services necessary to restore park assets to fully operational status as measured against established baseline conditions. OPW will coordinate the development of these assessments with the Parks, Recreation, and Youth Development Department. These assessments and ratings will also engage community partners such as the Oakland Parks Foundation, and a nonprofit partner may conduct the park-by-park assessments. Staff expect the consultant to be selected and issued a notice to proceed by June 2024. The results of these assessments will return to PRAC so it can make recommendations to the City Council on Measure Q budget allocations during development of the FY 2025-2027 budget.

In sum, staff are making progress on Measure Q reporting on vacancies and hiring, dedicated staffing per park, ballfield mowing, trash and litter, outdoor restroom cleaning, water quality and litter reduction, and park assessments.

### **RECOMMENDATION**

OPW recommends that PRAC receive this informational report.

Respectfully submitted by:

/s/ G. Harold Duffey

G. Harold Duffey

Director of Public Works

Respectfully prepared by:

/s/ Liam Garland

Liam Garland

Assistant to the Public Works Director