CITY OF OAKLAND Oakland Public Works

TO: Tam Tran, Chair, Parks and Recreation Advisory Commission (PRAC)
FROM: Liam Garland, Assistant to the Director of Public Works (OPW)
DATE: June 12, 2024
SUBJECT: Informational Report: OPW Monthly Measure Q Update

SUMMARY

This report provides:

- 1. OPW's updates to PRAC regarding the hiring of staff related to Measure Q-funded park maintenance services.
- 2. Delivery of Measure Q-funded services.
- 3. A schedule for staff reporting on Measure Q items for FY 2024-2025.

BACKGROUND / LEGISLATIVE HISTORY

Measure Q, approved by Oakland voters in March 2020, provides funding for City of Oakland services related to parks maintenance, homelessness services, and water quality, subject to oversight. The Oakland City Council assigned PRAC the oversight role regarding the Measure Q expenditures related to parks maintenance and water quality services. As a component of this oversight function, OPW routinely submits updates to PRAC on Measure Q-related items.

STATEMENT OF THE ISSUE

At the May 8, 2024 meeting, Assistant to the Public Works Director Liam Garland presented the monthly maintenance report and received input from PRAC on the reporting efforts to date. That input has been incorporated in the monthly reporting below.

This update focuses on five areas:

1. **Staffing:** Measure Q Section 3(B)(1)(m): "Providing dedicated staff at major parks. 'Major Parks' means City operated Community Parks, Region-serving parks, and Resource Conservation Areas, as those terms are used in the Open Space Conservation & Recreation (OSCAR) Element of the Oakland General Plan."

Attachment A provides detailed information on Measure Q-funded positions. Attachment B provides detailed information on other positions primarily within Parks and Trees Division and Facilities Services Division but funded by other sources.

Hiring. The table below shows Measure Q-related hiring and vacancies for this month and prior months. Future reports will complete the remaining months of this fiscal year.

Measure Q Funded Positions	FY 2023/2024					
	Dec	Mar	Apr	May	June	
# of Filled Positions	81	83	82			
# of Vacant Positions	22	17	18			
% Vacant Positions	21%	17%	18%			

Dedicated Staff. Staff define Measure Q's dedicated staffing goal as at least one full-time equivalent (FTE) devoted per month at each major park. ¹ Staff also developed a preliminary industry standard for number of parks maintenance FTEs per acre of park maintained. In 2008, the International City/County Management Association recommended a best practice of one park maintenance staff member per 12 acres of parkland and indicated a higher ratio if population density is higher. Oakland has a high population density and these major parks face frequent illegal dumping, so staff adjusted the industry standard to one parks' maintenance staff to 10 acres. When a consultant is hired to develop the park assessments, this preliminary industry standard will be reviewed, adjusted, and finalized.

To approximate FTEs per major park, staff track total labor hours worked by staff at each major park. Then these total labor hours per park are converted into a FTE count per park by dividing the total work hours per park by the number of hours a FTE works per month. This results in an approximate number of FTEs per park per month. For example, Arroyo Viejo Park's FTE count for the month of April is 4.8. It is calculated by work orders showing 830 hours worked in April at this park, divided by a FTE's approximate 173 hours per month (2080 annual work hours divided by 12 months).

Attachment C shows the results. In April, 73% (or 8) parks met the Measure Q-derived goal of 1 FTE per major park, and 27% (or 3) did not. In addition, 64% (or 7) of the parks met the preliminary industry standard of 1 FTE/10 acres and 36% (or 4) did not. This is a decrease from last month in meeting these goals. However, this is largely explained by a very significant maintenance push at Lakeside Park. In April, 13.4 FTEs worked at Lakeside Park versus 7.2 FTEs in March. With this significant investment in Lakeside Park maintenance came fewer staff and resources able to be applied to other major parks.

Future reports will continue updating this data for relevant months. After several months of data collection, staff and the PRAC can begin to evaluate trends over time. With six months of data collected, staff plan to cross-reference these trends with the maintenance findings from the parks assessments referenced at the end of this report, and update the preliminary industry standard goal for baseline FTEs per park.

2. **Ballfield Mowing:** Measure Q Section 3(B)(1)(a): "Mowing City operated sports fields frequently, every other week, or as may be required by the time of year."

The Parks and Trees Division in Public Works' Bureau of the Environment is responsible for ballfield mowing. Measure Q sets a priority to mow "frequently" and defines frequently as every other week (or roughly two times per month), or "as [frequently as] it may be required by the time of year."

Public Works sets a different goal based on time of the year. During the off peak (or rainy) season from November to March, rain is likely and ballfields are used less, thus mowing is less frequent. Staff's goal in the off peak season is one mow per month at each field.

¹ OSCAR identified three resource conservation areas. Two of the three resource conservation areas have since been stewarded by the East Bay Regional Parks District. The third is the undeveloped portions of Joaquin Miller Park, where Public Works responds to service requests but does not provide proactive maintenance.

Off Peak (Rainy Season)			Peak (Dry Season)								
Nov	Dec	Jan	Feb	Mar	Apr	May	Jun	Jul	Aug	Sept	Oct
	ballfield	d mowing	1x/month		ballfield mowing 2x/month at minimum						

Peak (or dry) season is April to October. Rain is unlikely, ballfield use is high, and mowing is, and should be, occurring regularly. Measure Q says mowing should be occurring "every other week." In peak season, staff's goal is mowing ballfields twice per month at minimum, 100% of the time.

Attachment D shows the results. April is the first month of peak season so the goal is a minimum of 2 mows per month per park. The table shows a total of 62 ballfield mows in April. That is double the number of mows from March and slightly over the overall baseline goal of 60 mows per month (30 ballfields x 2 mows per month in peak season). However, in looking at this table park by park, it shows 10 parks were mowed more than the monthly goal, and 13 did not reach the goal of 2 mows per month. While these results may suggest an overinvestment in mowing at some fields and underinvestment in others, staff are prioritizing multiple mows at ballfields where field use is high.

3. **Trash and Litter:** Measure Q Section 3(B)(1)(b): "Collecting trash and litter several times per week, including Saturdays and Sundays, from the City's most used parks, assuring equitable distribution of resources..."

Staff define the City's most used parks as the community parks and regional-serving parks in the General Plan's OSCAR element. Trash cans are emptied and litter removed at these parks every Monday and Friday by the Parks and Trees Division.

Staff set two goals for trash and litter pickup. The baseline goal is two times per week emptying of cans and picking up litter, 100% of the time. To derive a Measure Q goal, staff took the baseline goal of two pickups, added a pickup on Saturday and Sunday to reflect Measure Q's language "including Saturdays and Sundays...", and then included an overall completion rate of 75% of the time. This Measure Q-derived goal translates into three or more weekly pickups (four pickups multiplied by 75%) at the major parks.

Data on the emptying of trash cans started in mid-April. The first couple weeks of data entry showed a lot of room for improvement. While 254 instances of trash can emptying were reported through Cityworks, 127 instances were entered but not correctly associated with a park due to problems in entry of the data in the field. Several parks showed no trash can emptying even though staff had completed work orders for trash can emptying at those parks. As a result, staff have reconfigured the data entry in Cityworks to make it easier to associate trash can emptying with a particular park, and supervisors and front-line workers are being re-trained to improve data collection. Staff will deliver May's trash can emptying report at PRAC's July 10 meeting.

Attachment E shows the format of that future report.

4. **Restroom Cleaning:** Measure Q Section 3(B)(1)(e): "Cleaning Park Restrooms more than once per day, especially on weekends."

The Facilities Services Division of Public Works' Bureau of Maintenance and Internal Services is responsible for outdoor restroom cleaning.

Staff set a baseline goal of cleaning every parks' restroom once per day, 100% of the time. This month's reporting is based on data collected through May 26. This early cut off is due to the short turn around time between compiling the data, conducting quality control on the data, and submitting this report to PRAC. With 26 days in the reporting period, the baseline goal is 26 cleanings per restroom (or one daily cleaning per restroom). Given there has not been time to quality control this data, mistakes may be corrected in future reports.

To derive a Measure Q goal, staff considered the ballot text's language to clean park restrooms "more than once per day, especially on weekends." Staff set a target of twice per day cleanings including weekends and then included the goal of meeting this twice-per-day standard 80% of the time. This Measure Q-derived target for May's reporting is 42 cleanings per park restroom (two cleanings per day for 26 days multiplied by 80%).

Each cleaning count represents the restroom or restrooms being cleaned at the listed location. Where only one bathroom exists at a location, one count equals one restroom cleaning. In locations with multiple restrooms, one count represents multiple restrooms being cleaned.

Attachment F shows the results. The overall count of 781 cleanings in May exceeds the overall monthly target of 728 cleanings for staff's baseline goal of one daily cleaning per park restroom. However, cleanings are falling short of both the baseline goal at a number of individual parks and for the Measure Q-derived goal of twice per day cleanings, 80% of the time. Staff are continuing to examine whether the explanation for this is resource allocation, data entry or compilation, or something else. Staff will return in future updates with an answer.

No reporting is provided for parks restrooms that are closed or operate only seasonally or by event: Arroyo Viejo (McConnell Field), Caldecott, Carter Gilmore, deFremery, Joaquin Miller-Sequoia Arena, Lafayette Park, Oakport Field, Otis Spunkmeyer Field, Raimondi, Officer Willie Wilkins, Willow Park, and Woodminster. In addition, staff continue to troubleshoot a technical problem with the data collected at Joaquin Miller Park Ranger Station.

5. Scheduled Staff Reporting to PRAC on Measure Q Topics

At the May 8 meeting, staff provided brief updates on the Storm Drainage Master Plan and the Parks Assessments. As shown below, fuller updates on both items will be included at PRAC's July 10 meeting. In addition, staff have drafted a schedule for Measure Q reporting to PRAC for Fiscal Year 2024-2025.

All	therpated Stan Reporting Schedule for F1 2024-2025
July 10	Status Update on Park Assessments
	Detailed Update on Stormwater/Water Quality Initiatives
	Monthly Maintenance Review
September 11	Adopted FY 2025 Budget
	Close of FY 2024 Budget
	Measure Q Minor CIPs

Anticipated Staff Reporting Schedule for FY 2024-2025

November 13	Quarter 1 Maintenance Review
December 11	Stormwater and Water Quality Update
January 8	Measure Q Budget Update
	Report on Parks Assessments
Feb-May	PRAC Develops Measure Q FY 2025-2027 Budget
	Recommendations
June	City Council Adopts FY 2025-2027 Budget

In sum, staff are making progress on Measure Q reporting on vacancies and hiring, dedicated staffing per park, ballfield mowing, trash and litter, outdoor restroom cleaning, water quality and litter reduction, and park assessments. Staff's reporting schedule provides information relevant to PRAC's Measure Q oversight responsibilities, including PRAC's Measure Q budget recommendations to City Council for FY 2025-2027.

RECOMMENDATION

OPW recommends that PRAC receive this informational report.

Respectfully submitted by:

<u>/s/ Michael Kashiwagi</u> Michael Kashiwagi Interim Director of Public Works

Respectfully prepared by:

<u>/s/ Liam Garland</u> Liam Garland Assistant to the Public Works Director

Attachments: A – Detailed Measure Q Funded Positions

- B Detailed Positions Primarily from Parks, Trees, and Facilities Services
- C Dedicated Staffing at Major Parks
- D Ballfield Mows
- E Trash Can Emptying
- F Restroom Cleaning

Attachment A – Detailed Measure Q Funded Positions

Fund	Classification	#Filled	#Vacant	%Vacant
Measure Q	Administrative Assistant II	1		
Measure Q	Business Analyst II	1		
Measure Q	Capital Imp Proj Coord, Asst	1		
Measure Q	Construction & Maintenance Mechanic	1	1	50.00%
Measure Q	Custodian	5		
Measure Q	Electrician		1	100.00%
Measure Q	Engineer, Assistant I (Office)		1	100.00%
Measure Q	Gardener Crew Leader	21	5	19.23%
Measure Q	Gardener II	29	2	6.45%
Measure Q	Irrigation Repair Specialist	2	2	50.00%
Measure Q	Painter	2		
Measure Q	Park Attendant, PPT	3	1	25.00%
Measure Q	Park Equipment Operator	6	1	14.29%
Measure Q	Park Supervisor I	6		
Measure Q	Park Supervisor II	1	1	50.00%
Measure Q	Tree Trimmer	2	1	33.33%
Measure Q	Tree Worker	1	2	66.67%
Total		82	18	18.00 %

Attachment B – Detailed Positions Primarily from Parks, Trees, and Facilities Services

Fund	Classification	#Filled	#Vacant	%Vacant
Comprehensive Cleanup Fund	Administrative Analyst I	1		
Comprehensive Cleanup Fund	Administrative Analyst II	2		
Comprehensive Cleanup Fund	Administrative Assistant II	1	1	50.00%
Comprehensive Cleanup Fund	Electrical Painter		1	100.00%
Comprehensive Cleanup Fund	Environmental Enforcement Officer	6	1	14.29%
Comprehensive Cleanup Fund	Facility Security Assistant, PPT		1	100.00%
Comprehensive Cleanup Fund	Heavy Equipment Operator	1		
Comprehensive Cleanup Fund	Painter	3	1	25.00%
Comprehensive Cleanup Fund	Public Works Maintenance Worker	22	2	8.33%
Comprehensive Cleanup Fund	Public Works Operations Manager	1		
Comprehensive Cleanup Fund	Public Works Supervisor I	3	1	25.00%
Comprehensive Cleanup Fund	Public Works Supervisor II	2		
Comprehensive Cleanup Fund	Street Maintenance Leader	11	2	15.38%
Comprehensive Cleanup Fund	Street Sweeper Operator	17	3	15.00%
Comprehensive Cleanup Fund	Tree Supervisor I		1	100.00%
Comprehensive Cleanup Fund	Tree Supervisor II	1		
Comprehensive Cleanup Fund	Tree Trimmer	4	1	20.00%
Comprehensive Cleanup Fund	Tree Trimmer Crew Leader		2	100.00%
Comprehensive Cleanup Fund	Tree Worker	1		
Facilities	Administrative Analyst II	2		
Facilities	Administrative Assistant II		1	100.00%
Facilities	Capital Improvement Project Coordinator	1		
Facilities	Carpenter	5		
Facilities	Construction & Maintenance Mechanic	6	1	14.29%
Comprehensive Cleanup Fund	Facility Security Assistant, PPT		1	100.00%
Comprehensive Cleanup Fund	Heavy Equipment Operator	1		
Comprehensive Cleanup Fund	Painter	3	1	25.00%
Comprehensive Cleanup Fund	Public Works Maintenance Worker	22	2	8.33%
Comprehensive Cleanup Fund	Public Works Operations Manager	1		
Comprehensive Cleanup Fund	Public Works Supervisor I	3	1	25.00%
Comprehensive Cleanup Fund	Public Works Supervisor II	2		
Comprehensive Cleanup Fund	Street Maintenance Leader	11	2	15.38%
Comprehensive Cleanup Fund	Street Sweeper Operator	17	3	
Comprehensive Cleanup Fund	Tree Supervisor I		1	100.00%
Comprehensive Cleanup Fund	Tree Supervisor II	1		
Comprehensive Cleanup Fund	Tree Trimmer	4	1	20.00%
Comprehensive Cleanup Fund	Tree Trimmer Crew Leader		2	100.00%
Comprehensive Cleanup Fund	Tree Worker	1		
Facilities	Administrative Analyst II	2		
Facilities	Administrative Assistant II		1	100.00%
Facilities	Capital Improvement Project Coordinator	1		
Facilities	Carpenter	5		
Facilities	Construction & Maintenance Mechanic	6		14.29%
Facilities	Construction & Maintenance Supv I	3		
Facilities	Custodial Services Supervisor I	5		
Facilities	Custodian	45		10.00%
Facilities	Custodian Supervisor		1	100.00%

Facilities	Custodian, PPT	3	3	50.00%
Facilities	Electrical Engineer II	1		
Facilities	Electrician	1	1	50.00%
Facilities	Electrician Leader	1		
Facilities	Facilities Complex Manager	1	1	50.00%
Facilities	Facilities Complex Manager, Assistant		1	100.00%
Facilities	Maintenance Mechanic	2	7	77.78%
Facilities	Manager, Building Services	1		
Facilities	Painter	4		
Facilities	Plumber	3		
Facilities	Pool Technician		2	100.00%
Facilities	Pool Technician, PPT		1	100.00%
Facilities	Project Manager		1	100.00%
Facilities	Stationary Engineer	8	3	18.18%
Facilities	Stationary Engineer, Chief	3		
LLAD	Administrative Assistant I	1		
LLAD	Arboricultural Inspector	1		
LLAD	Gardener Crew Leader	2		
LLAD	Gardener II	3	1	25.00%
LLAD	Manager, Park Services	1		
LLAD	Park Supervisor I	1		
LLAD	Park Supervisor II	1		
LLAD	Tree Trimmer Crew Leader		1	100.00%
Total		181	47	20.18 %

Attachment C – Dedicated Staffing at Major Parks

Staff FTEs at Major Parks	Acres	April 2024 FTE Total	Msr Q Goal: at least 1 FTE/park	Met goal?	Industry standard: 1 FTE/10 acres	Met goal?
Arroyo Viejo Park	10.1	4.8	1	Yes	1.0	Yes
Brookdale Park	4.7	0.4	1	No	0.5	No
Brookfield Park	14	2.6	1	Yes	1.4	Yes
Bushrod Park	10.1	3.2	1	Yes	1.0	Yes
Defremery Park	14	1.3	1	Yes	1.4	No
Dimond Park	14.3	3.0	1	Yes	1.4	Yes
Joaquin Miller Park*	150	0.8	1	No	15.0	No
Lakeside Park	122	13.4	1	Yes	12.2	Yes
Montclair Park	6.7	1.8	1	Yes	0.7	Yes
Mosswood Park	11	4.8	1	Yes	1.1	Yes
San Antonio Park	11.62	0.4	1	No	1.2	No
			% to Goal	73%		64%
		C	ount "Yes" =	8		7
		C	Count "No" =	3		4

*Joaquin Miller Park has 500 total acres, but 360 acres are resource conservation areas.

Attachment D – April Ballfied Mows

Monthly Mows of Ballfields	# of April mows (peak season)	Goal: off peak, 1x/mo; peak at least 2x/mo, 100% of time	Goal Met?
Allendale Rec Center Field	1	2	No
Arroyo Viejo-McConnell Field	5	2	Yes
Arroyo Viejo-Ricky Henderson A's Field	0	2	No
Brookdale Rec Center Field	1	2	No
Brookfield Rec Center Field	0	2	No
Burckhalter Park Field	0	2	No
Bushrod- Lower Field	2	2	Yes
Bushrod-Upper Field	0	2	No
Central Reservoir Park Field	4	2	Yes
Concordia Park Field	1	2	No
Curt Flood Field	0	2	No
Franklin Field	3	2	Yes
Garfield Ballfield	4	2	Yes
Golden Gate Rec Center Field	0	2	No
Greenman Field/Carter Gilmore	3	2	Yes
Jefferson Square Field	1	2	No
Joaquin Miller (Robin Perry) Field	0	2	No
Lowell Park Field	2	2	Yes
Montclair Recreation Center Field	4	2	Yes
Mosswood Rec Center Field	6	2	Yes
Oakport Field	3	2	Yes
Otis Spunkmeyer Field	2	2	Yes
Poplar Recreation Center Field	5	2	Yes
Pinto Park (Jones Field)	3	2	Yes
Raimondi Field	0	2	No
San Antonio Field	5	2	Yes
Shepherd Canyon Park Field	1	2	No
Sobrante Park Field	3	2	Yes
Tassafaronga Rec Center Field	1	2	No
Wade Johnson Park Field	2	2	Yes
Totals	62	60	
	% to Goal	103%	53%
		Count "Yes" =	16
		Count "No"=	14

Attachment E– Trash Can Emptying

Monthly Emptying of Trash Cans at Most Used Parks	# of trash cans	April times/month cans emptied	Baseline goal: 8x/mo, 100% of time	Goal met?	Measure Q Goal: 16x/mo emptying of cans, 75% of time	Goal met?
Mosswood Park (11 acres)	2	50	16	50	24	50
Bushrod Park (10.12 acres)	10	eting	80	eting	120	eting
Defremery Park (14 acres)	13	me	104	me	156	me
San Antonio Field (11.62 acres)	21	RAC	168	RAC	252	RAC
Brookdale Park (4.66 acres)	6	Data provided at July 10 PRAC meeting	48	Data provided at July 10 PRAC meeting	72	Data provided at July 10 PRAC meeting
Brookfield Park (14 acres)	6	uly 1	48	uly]	72	uly 1
Arroyo Viejo (18.75 acres)	5	at J	40	at J	60	at J
Lakeside Park (75 acres)	95	ided	760	ided	1140	ided
Joaquin Miller Park	49	prov	392	prov	588	prov
Montclair Rec Center Field	13	ata]	104	ata	156	ata]
Dimond Park (14.31 acres)	16	Д	128	Д	192	Ц
		0	1,888		2,832	
	•	% To Goal				
			Count "Yes" =		Count "Yes" =	
			Count "No" =		Count "No" =	

Attachment F – Restroom Cleaning through May 26

Monthly Restroom Cleanings by Facility through May 26, 2024	May 2024	Baseline Goal: 1x daily cleaning,	Cert	Measure Q Goal: 2x daily cleanings,	Ceel
	2024 Cleanings	100% of time (26)	Goal met?	80%+ of time (48)	Goal met?
12th St & Lake Merrit Blvd	30	26	Yes	42	No
Astro Park / Eastshore Park	45	26	Yes	42	Yes
Bella Vista Park	15	26	No	42	No
Brookdale Park	15	26	No	42	No
Burckhalter Park	25	26	No	42	No
Central Reservoir Recreation Area	13	26	No	42	No
Cesar Chavez Park	20	26	No	42	No
Concordia Park	13	26	No	42	No
Davie Tennis Stadium	18	26	No	42	No
Dimond Park	35	26	Yes	42	No
Estuary Park	25	26	No	42	No
Frog Park Rockridge-Temescal Greenbelt	24	26	No	42	No
Joaquin Miller - Fire Circle	33	26	Yes	42	No
Joaquin Miller - Redwood Glen	26	26	Yes	42	No
Joaquin Miller Park - Meadow	66	26	Yes	42	Yes
Lakeside Park - Sailboat House	40	26	Yes	42	No
Lowell Park	21	26	No	42	No
Madison/Wilma Chan Park	31	26	Yes	42	No
Maxwell Park	20	26	No	42	No
McCrea Park	21	26	No	42	No
Montclair Park	39	26	Yes	42	No
Morcom Rose Garden	32	26	Yes	42	No
Mosswood Park - Theater Building	25	26	No	42	No
Pine Knoll	33	26	Yes	42	No
San Antonio	36	26	Yes	42	No
Shepherd Canyon Park	32	26	Yes	42	No
Snow Park	26	26	Yes	42	No
Union Point	22	26	No	42	No
Total	781	728		1165	
	% To Goal	107%	50%	67%	7%
		Count "Yes"=	14		2
		Count "No"=	14		26