



DISTRIBUTION DATE: \_\_\_\_\_


## MEMORANDUM

**TO:** HONORABLE MAYOR &  
CITY COUNCIL

**FROM:** Melinda Drayton  
Interim Fire Chief

**SUBJECT:** FY 2019-20 3<sup>rd</sup> Quarter Overtime  
Report

**DATE:** August 3, 2020

City Administrator   
Approval

Date: Aug 7, 2020

### INFORMATION

This informational report provides data on the Oakland Fire Department (OFD) overtime policy, use, and accountability in Fiscal Year (FY) 2019-20.

On October 24, 2017, staff presented a report titled, "Fiscal Year (FY) 2016-17 Fourth Quarter Revenue and Expenditure Results and Year-End Summaries for the General Purpose Fund (GPF) and Eight (8) Selected Funds; and GPF Carryforward for FY 2017-18; and Overtime Analysis for All Funds" to the Finance and Management Committee.

Following the initial report, OFD has presented regular reports on departmental overtime. The most recent report was presented on October 22, 2019.

Through the 3<sup>rd</sup> Quarter of FY 2019-20, overspending above the City Council Adopted Budget continued, primarily attributed to overtime costs in public safety. Total all funds, the Fire Department's overtime spending, fiscal year to date through March 31, 2020 was \$18,087,410.

Per Ordinance No. 13487 C.M.S, in the event that a Department is projected to overspend in the GPF by more than one percent (1%), the Department must provide an action plan to the City Administrator. The City Administrator shall bring an Informational Report to the City Council within sixty (60) days following acceptance of the Revenue and Expenditure report by the City Council. The report shall list the actions the Administration is taking to bring the expenditures into alignment with the budget.

This report also provides details on how the Department aims to control overtime expenditures with real actionable changes to policies, procedures, and processes, and corresponding accountability mechanisms.

#### **Oakland Fire Department Authorized Staffing**

OFD operates twenty-five (25) fire stations located throughout the city, twenty-four (24) hours per day, seven (7) days per week. OFD is responsible for fire and medical dispatch, fire prevention, fire suppression, mitigation, emergency medical response, specialized rescue operations, fire investigation, emergency management, and fire code inspection within the city.

Currently, OFD has five hundred and nine (509.00) Full-Time Equivalent (FTE) sworn personnel and one hundred forty-two and twenty-three hundredths (142.23) FTE civilian personnel authorized, for a total of six hundred fifty-one and twenty-three hundredths (651.23) FTE.

OFD sworn personnel operate using a "chain of command" or "rank" system. Table 1 shows the Department's sworn rank organizational structure by job classification:

**Table 1. Sworn Ranks**

<u>Rank</u>
Fire Chief
Deputy Chief of Fire Department
Assistant Chief of Fire Department
Fire Marshal (Sworn)
Battalion Chief
Assistant Fire Marshal (Sworn)
Captain of Fire Department
Lieutenant of Fire Department
Fire Investigator
Engineer of Fire Department
Firefighter-Paramedic
Firefighter

There are seventeen (17.00) FTE 40-Hour staff positions; and there are four hundred and ninety-two (492.00) FTE 48-Hour shift positions totaling five hundred and nine (509.00) FTE sworn personnel. Operationally, OFD fire suppression shift staff are organized into three (3) shifts referred to as A, B and C Shift. Shift positions operate on a 48/96 schedule whereby members work two (2) shifts (48-Hours) followed by four (4) days off.

**Fire Suppression Minimum Staffing**

The Memorandum of Understanding (MOU) between the City of Oakland (City) and International Association of Fire Fighters, Local 55 (Local 55), guides working conditions of the represented OFD sworn personnel. Additionally, OFD provides Aircraft Rescue Firefighting (ARFF) Services at the Oakland International Airport under the terms of an MOU between the City and the Port of Oakland (Port).

Section 4.2.4 of the MOU between the City and Local 55 identified through the year 2027, daily minimum staffing levels for "Fire Suppression Staffing" of OFD sworn personnel. The MOU minimum staffing sets a daily number of sworn staff, broken out by specific ranks, which must be in the field at any given time. The total suppression staffing equates to one hundred and thirty-seven (137.00) FTE sworn personnel per shift and four hundred and eleven (411.00) FTE sworn personnel to cover all three (3) shifts. This staffing level includes the ARFF staffing requirements of a minimum of six (6.00) FTE sworn personnel (one (1.00) FTE Captain and five (5.00) FTE Firefighters).

**Table 2** below shows the minimum fire suppression staffing by rank required based upon these two (2) MOUs.

**Table 2. Fire Suppression Minimum Staffing By Shift & FTE**

Rank	Number of FTE			
	A Shift	B Shift	C Shift	Total A, B & C Shift Staffing
Battalion Chief	3.00	3.00	3.00	<b>9.00</b>
Captain of Fire Department	14.00	13.00	14.00	<b>41.00</b>
Lieutenant of Fire Department	18.00	19.00	18.00	<b>55.00</b>
Engineer of Fire Department	24.00	24.00	24.00	<b>72.00</b>
Fire Investigator	1.00	1.00	1.00	<b>3.00</b>
Firefighter-Paramedic	26.00	26.00	26.00	<b>78.00</b>
Firefighter	51.00	51.00	51.00	<b>153.00</b>
<b>Total Minimum Staffing</b>	<b>137.00</b>	<b>137.00</b>	<b>137.00</b>	<b>411.00</b>

Sworn personnel are assigned daily as follows:

- Three (3) Battalions staffed, with 1.0 FTE Battalion Chief each
- Twenty-four (24) Engine Companies, each staffed with a minimum of 1.0 FTE Officer, 1.0 FTE Engineer, 1.0 FTE Firefighter-Paramedic and 1.0 FTE Firefighter
- One (1) Aircraft Rescue Firefighter (ARFF) company staffed with a minimum of 1.0 FTE Captain and 5.0 FTE Firefighters
- Seven (7) Truck Companies staffed as follows:
  - Three (3) Truck companies with a minimum of 1.0 FTE Captain and (3) three Firefighters;
  - One (1) Truck company with a minimum of 1.0 FTE Captain, 1.0 FTE Firefighter-Paramedic and 2.0 FTE Firefighters;
  - Two (2) Truck companies with a minimum of 1.0 FTE Captain and 4.0 FTE Firefighters;
  - One (1) Truck company staffed with a minimum of 1.0 FTE Captain, 1.0 FTE Firefighter-Paramedic and 3.0 FTE Firefighters; and
  - 1.0 FTE Fire Investigator.

The positions shown in **Table 2** are the minimum number of sworn positions per shift. However, achieving this daily staffing level is hampered by the following:

- Vacancies;
- "40-Hour" Staff Assignments;
- Training;
- Vacation;
- Injuries;
- Deployments; and
- Other time off.

**Oakland Fire Department Fiscal Year 2019-20 Budgeted Overtime Funding**

In FY 2019-20, the Department had two (2) main funding sources for overtime, GPF (1010) and Measure Z (2252). As identified in Table 3 the FY 2019-20 GPF (1010) budgeted overtime funding is shown below:

**Table 3 Dedicated GPF (1010) Funding for Overtime Expenditures**

<b>FUND</b>	<b>FIRE DEPARTMENT ORGANIZATION</b>	<b>FY 2019-20 BUDGET</b>
<i>1010 - General Fund: General Purpose</i>		
	20241 - Fire Communications	<b>\$15,140</b>
	20251 - Communications Emergency Dispatch	<b>\$63,410</b>
	20311 - Fire Marshal's Office	<b>\$1,790</b>
	20331 - Inspectional Services	<b>\$48,878</b>
	20341 - Arson Investigation	<b>\$9,339</b>
	20371 - Vegetation Management	<b>\$137,776</b>
	20411 - Emergency / Suppression: Shift A	<b>\$1,370,166</b>
	20631 - In-Service Training	<b>\$18,314</b>
	20814 - Fire: Airport	<b>\$62,973</b>
	20816 - Fire: Support Services	<b>\$3,418</b>
	<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>\$1,731,204</b>

The other budgeted funding source for overtime in FY 2019-20 is two million dollars (\$2,000,000) from Measure Z (2252).

**First, Second and Third Quarter FY 2019-20 OFD Overtime Hours**

**Table 4** shows the Department's total overtime hours and costs during the first and second quarters of FY 2019-20.

**Table 4: First, Second & Third Quarter FY 2019-20 OFD Overtime Hours**

<b>Overtime Cost - 1st Quarter FY 2019-20 (07/01/19 - 09/30/19)</b>		
<u>Sworn Rank</u>	<u>OT Hours</u>	<u>Overtime Cost</u>
Battalion Chief	3,011	\$300,667
Fire Marshall, Assistant	50	\$5,617
Captain of Fire Department	10,206	\$883,033
Lieutenant of Fire Department	13,744	\$1,104,767
Fire Investigator	240	\$19,262
Engineer of Fire Department	16,017	\$1,208,169
Fire Fighter Paramedic	14,852	\$1,131,110
Fire Fighter	26,357	\$1,819,680
Total 1st QTR Sworn OT	<b>84,477</b>	<b>\$6,472,304</b>
Total 1st QTR Civilian OT	<b>3,929</b>	<b>\$267,035</b>
<b>TOTAL 1st QTR OFD OT</b>	<b>88,405</b>	<b>\$6,739,340</b>
<b>Overtime Cost - 2nd Quarter FY 2019-20 (10/01/19 - 12/31/19)</b>		
<u>Sworn Rank</u>	<u>OT Hours</u>	<u>Overtime Cost</u>
Battalion Chief	3,107	\$323,644
Fire Marshall, Assistant	32	\$3,677
Captain of Fire Department	8,597	\$770,836
Lieutenant of Fire Department	13,337	\$1,104,129
Fire Investigator	360	\$29,784
Engineer of Fire Department	15,578	\$1,204,726
Fire Fighter Paramedic	14,319	\$1,112,717
Fire Fighter	22,849	\$1,613,937
Total 2nd QTR Sworn OT	<b>78,179</b>	<b>\$6,163,449</b>
Total 2nd QTR Civilian OT	<b>3,879</b>	<b>\$264,793</b>
<b>TOTAL 2nd QTR OFD OT</b>	<b>82,059</b>	<b>\$6,428,243</b>
<b>Overtime Cost - 3rd Quarter FY 2019-20 (01/01/20 - 03/31/20)</b>		
<u>Sworn Rank</u>	<u>OT Hours</u>	<u>Overtime Cost</u>
Battalion Chief	1,914	\$208,538
Fire Marshall, Assistant	28	\$3,241
Captain of Fire Department	6,839	\$632,462
Lieutenant of Fire Department	9,051	\$755,443
Fire Investigator	254	\$22,302
Engineer of Fire Department	13,925	\$1,081,093
Fire Fighter Paramedic	13,188	\$1,026,959
Fire Fighter	12,598	\$946,308
Total 3rd QTR Sworn OT	<b>57,797</b>	<b>\$4,676,346</b>
Total 3rd QTR Civilian OT	<b>3,408</b>	<b>\$243,481</b>
<b>TOTAL 3rd QTR OFD OT</b>	<b>61,205</b>	<b>\$4,919,827</b>
<b>TOTAL 1st, 2nd &amp; 3rd Quarter FY 2019-20 OFD Overtime</b>	<b>231,669</b>	<b>\$18,087,410</b>

**Table 4: First, Second & Third Quarter FY 2019-20 OFD Overtime Hours**

<b>Overtime Cost - 1st Quarter FY 2019-20 (07/01/19 - 09/30/19)</b>		
<u>Sworn Rank</u>	<u>OT Hours</u>	<u>Overtime Cost</u>
Battalion Chief	3,011	\$300,667
Fire Marshall, Assistant	50	\$5,617
Captain of Fire Department	10,206	\$883,033
Lieutenant of Fire Department	13,744	\$1,104,767
Fire Investigator	240	\$19,262
Engineer of Fire Department	16,017	\$1,208,169
Fire Fighter Paramedic	14,852	\$1,131,110
Fire Fighter	26,357	\$1,819,680
Total 1st QTR Sworn OT	<b>84,477</b>	<b>\$6,472,304</b>
Total 1st QTR Civilian OT	<b>3,929</b>	<b>\$267,035</b>
<b>TOTAL 1st QTR OFD OT</b>	<b>88,405</b>	<b>\$6,739,340</b>
<b>Overtime Cost - 2nd Quarter FY 2019-20 (10/01/19 - 12/31/19)</b>		
<u>Sworn Rank</u>	<u>OT Hours</u>	<u>Overtime Cost</u>
Battalion Chief	3,107	\$323,644
Fire Marshall, Assistant	32	\$3,677
Captain of Fire Department	8,597	\$770,836
Lieutenant of Fire Department	13,337	\$1,104,129
Fire Investigator	360	\$29,784
Engineer of Fire Department	15,578	\$1,204,726
Fire Fighter Paramedic	14,319	\$1,112,717
Fire Fighter	22,849	\$1,613,937
Total 2nd QTR Sworn OT	<b>78,179</b>	<b>\$6,163,449</b>
Total 2nd QTR Civilian OT	<b>3,879</b>	<b>\$264,793</b>
<b>TOTAL 2nd QTR OFD OT</b>	<b>82,059</b>	<b>\$6,428,243</b>
<b>Overtime Cost - 3rd Quarter FY 2019-20 (01/01/20 - 03/31/20)</b>		
<u>Sworn Rank</u>	<u>OT Hours</u>	<u>Overtime Cost</u>
Battalion Chief	1,914	\$208,538
Fire Marshall, Assistant	28	\$3,241
Captain of Fire Department	6,839	\$632,462
Lieutenant of Fire Department	9,051	\$755,443
Fire Investigator	254	\$22,302
Engineer of Fire Department	13,925	\$1,081,093
Fire Fighter Paramedic	13,188	\$1,026,959
Fire Fighter	12,598	\$946,308
Total 3rd QTR Sworn OT	<b>57,797</b>	<b>\$4,676,346</b>
Total 3rd QTR Civilian OT	<b>3,408</b>	<b>\$243,481</b>
<b>TOTAL 3rd QTR OFD OT</b>	<b>61,205</b>	<b>\$4,919,827</b>
<b>TOTAL 1st, 2nd &amp; 3rd Quarter FY 2019-20 OFD Overtime</b>	<b>231,669</b>	<b>\$18,087,410</b>

## Ongoing Efforts to Identify and Reduce Overtime Usage

Unless the overtime in fire suppression pertains to a backfill of staffing due to leave, illness, or injury, all overtime requests must be approved by the Chief of the Fire Department.

While much of the overtime usage for OFD is in Operations, not all overtime in Operations overtime is specific to backfill. Overtime can also be triggered by Red Flag Warning days, lasting between 12-72 hours, Public Safety Power Shutoff events, Emergency Operations Center activations, and other special events where OFD is called to participate or prepare.

In November 2019, OFD graduated 17 new recruits. They are all currently working at their assigned stations on a probationary basis, offsetting the need for overtime and mandatory backfill. OFD did not have an academy in FY 2018-19.

Beginning October 2018, OFD began working with the Finance and Information Technology departments to add a more detailed level of time codes to provide for overtime tracking that can readily identify overtime by type such as Field Operations Minimum Staffing, Red Flag Days, Academy Cadre, Callback, Mutual Aid, Other Deployment Backfill, Training, Special Projects, etc. It is anticipated this will aid in identifying operational needs to better control and reduce overtime.

The Fire Dispatch Center has recently experienced a higher rate of overtime usage due to vacancies however over the last several months, the division has made progress to mitigate these costs.

OFD increased its budgeted positions to eighteen (18) Fire Communications Dispatchers in July, 2019. OFD had an increase in one (1) FTE in the Fire Communications Supervisor rank, as well, bringing the budgeted staffing to five (5). All of the supervisor positions are filled, although one (1) is on long term leave. The goal of the Communications Center is to continue to meet the operational demands of the department and eventually staff each shift (Day, Swing and Grave) with four (4) dispatchers and one (1) supervisor and to staff without utilizing either voluntary or mandatory overtime based on recent personnel increases.

The Fire Dispatch Center (FDC) relies on the guidance and recommendations of the National Emergency Number Association (NENA) which works with 9-1-1 professionals nationwide, public policy leaders, and emergency services and telecommunications industry partners to develop and carry out critical programs, staffing criteria, and initiatives in line with industry leading standards, training, and certifications.

Based on the Fire Dispatch Center's call volume in 2018 and by using the Erlang-C formula, a traffic modeling formula used in call center scheduling to calculate delays or predict waiting times for callers, NENA recommended OFD increase the number of dispatch personnel per shift to five (5). Increasing the FDC by two (2) full time employees to a total of twenty (20), as proposed in the FY 2019-20 budget, will do the following:

- Eliminate the need for excessive overtime.
- Cover all City leaves (Sick "SCK," Family and Medical Leave Act "FMLA," Vacation.
- "VAC," and Compensatory Time Unsworn "CTU") with four (4) minimum staffing.
- Reduce answering speeds.
- Lessens call abandoned call rate.
- Address increased call volume.

Several other events or circumstances also may trigger the use of overtime, including:

- Emergency Recall Incidents (this would cover any call back of sworn staff such as a Safety Officer or Assistant Sworn Fire Marshal having to work after hours – or up staffing an engine during an unanticipated emergency event).
- Incidents that happen at shift change will usually require OT to allow for exchange of personnel at the incident.
- Backfill for members assigned to special projects (Computer Aided Dispatch, Accela, Drill Tower, etc.).
- Backfilling apparatus committee to allow for them to perform other departmental roles and responsibilities outside of suppression.
- Backfilling for other approved travel such as trainings, conferences, and meetings out of the area.
- Instances where compliance is at risk or for disciplinary reasons; OFD recently had a member out of compliance with their Emergency Medical Technician license and the individual had to be placed on 40hr assignment that required backfill.

The proud men and women of the Oakland Fire Department are committed to providing the highest quality of courteous and responsive services to the residents of Oakland.

Staff continuously evaluate these strategies and personnel to ensure that OFD promotes and represents current best practices in order to increase the efficiency and effectiveness of the department. All Bureau Chiefs and Division Managers are encouraged to utilize all available tools and metrics to evaluate the goals, objectives, costs, and outcomes for their respective division.

Respectfully submitted,



MELINDA DRAYTON

Interim Chief, Oakland Fire Department

For questions on this report, please contact Gene Tom, Chief Financial Officer & Administrative Services Manager at 510-238-6353.