



Adhi Nagraj, Chair
Emily Weinstein, Vice Chair
Tom Limon
Clark Manus
Amanda Monchamp
Jahmese Myres
Chris Pattillo

February 1, 2017
Regular Meeting

The meeting was called to order at 6:03pm.

ROLL CALL

Present: Limon, Manus, Myres, Pattillo, Monchamp, Weinstein, Nagraj

WELCOME BY THE CHAIR

COMMISSION BUSINESS

Commissioners Nagraj, Weinstein, and Manus spoke about a tour of East Oakland they attended that was put on by CBE that Commissioner Myres helped to coordinate. The tour focused on industrial uses in East Oakland, the impacts they have on families and the surrounding communities, and the impacts that land use decisions have on people's lives.

Agenda Discussion

Secretary Merkamp requested to have the vote on meeting minutes move earlier in the meeting to have a quorum present.

Director's Report

None.

Committee Reports

Commissioners Manus, spoke about the January 25, 2017, Design Review Committee meeting which heard three items: a tower at 1314 Franklin, public art in the two public plazas at 24th and Harrison, and a hotel on Mandela Parkway near the Oakland/Emeryville border.

Commission Matters

None.

City Attorney's Report

None.

OPEN FORUM

Greg McConnell and Brandie Albright spoke about Macarthur BART Parcel B.

For further information on any case listed on this agenda, please contact the case planner indicated for that item. For further information on Historic Status, please contact the Oakland Cultural Heritage Survey at 510-238-6879. For other questions or general information on the Oakland City Planning Commission, please contact the Planning and Building Department at 510-238-3941.

♿ This meeting is wheelchair accessible. To request materials in alternative formats, or to request an ASL interpreter, or assistive listening device, please call the Planning and Building Department at 510-238-3941 or TDD 510-238-3254 at least three working days before the meeting. Please refrain from wearing scented products to this meeting so attendees who may experience chemical sensitivities may attend. Thank you.

El lugar de la a reunión es accesible en silla de ruedas. Para solicitar materiales en formatos alternativos o solicitar un intérprete de lenguaje de señas o un aparato para escuchar, por favor llame al Departamento de Planificación y Construcción al 510-238-3941 o TDD 510-238-3254 al menos tres días hábiles antes de la reunión. Por favor absténgase de usar perfumes en esta reunión para que las personas sensitivas a perfume puedan asistir.

此會議場地有適合輪椅出入設施。如需要其他格式的會議資料，或ASL手語服務，或助聽器，請於會議至少三(3)天以前聯絡規劃及建設局，以便安排服務，電話510-238-3941或TDD 510-238-3254。請勿塗搽香氛產品，參加者可能對化學成分敏感。多謝。



CONSENT CALENDAR

The Consent Calendar was called at 6:19pm.

1.	Location:	Utility pole in sidewalk adjacent to (fronting) 2000 36th Ave.
	Assessor's Parcel Number(s):	Adjacent to 032-2084-022-02
	Proposal:	To establish a telecommunications facility to enhance existing services by attaching an antenna and equipment to an existing wooden utility pole located in the public right-of-way (sidewalk).
	Applicant / Phone Number:	Ana Gomez/Black & Veatch (for Extenet /Verizon) 913-458-9148
	Owner:	PG&E
	Case File Number:	PLN16338
	Planning Permits Required:	Regular Design Review with additional findings for Macro Telecommunications Facility
	General Plan:	Mixed Housing Type Residential
	Zoning:	RM-2 Mixed Housing Type Residential
	Environmental Determination:	Exempt, Section 15301 of the State CEQA Guidelines: Existing Facilities; Exempt, Section 15303 of the State CEQA Guidelines: New Construction of Small Structures; Section 15183: Projects Consistent with a Community Plan, General Plan or Zoning
	Historic Status:	Non historic property
	City Council District:	5
	Finality of Decision:	<i>Appealable to City Council</i>
	For Further Information:	Contact case planner Moe Hackett at (510) 238-3973 or by email at mhackett@oaklandnet.com .

2.	Location:	The Public Right-of-Way Adjacent to 2252 90th Ave.
	Assessor's Parcel Number(s):	Nearest adjacent lot (046 547202300)
	Proposal:	To establish a telecommunications facility by attaching an antenna and equipment to an existing wooden utility pole located in the public right-of-way (sidewalk). The 50' wooden utility pole is existing.
	Applicant:	Extenet Systems (California) LLC. (for T-Mobile USA, INC)
	Contact Person/ Phone Number:	Ana Gomez (913) 458-9148
	Owner:	Joint Pole Authority (JPA) including PG&E
	Case File Number:	PLN16378
	Planning Permits Required:	Major Design Review to install a wireless Telecommunication Macro Facility on a PG&E replacement pole located in RD-1 Zone.
	General Plan:	Detached Unit Residential
	Zoning:	RD-1 Detached Unit Residential Zone.
	Environmental Determination:	Exempt, Section 15303 of the State CEQA Guidelines; New construction or conversion of small structures. Exempt, Section 15183 of the State CEQA Guidelines; Projects consistent with a Community Plan, General Plan or Zoning.
	Historic Status:	Not a Potential Designated Historic Property; Survey rating: n/a
	City Council District:	7
	Finality of Decision:	Appealable to City Council within 10 Days
	For Further Information:	Contact case planner Danny Thai at (510) 238-3584 or by email at dthai@oaklandnet.com .



3.	Location:	The Public Right-of-Way Adjacent to 2211 88th Ave.
	Assessor's Parcel Number(s):	Nearest adjacent lot (043 460501100)
	Proposal:	To establish a telecommunications facility by attaching an antenna and equipment to an existing wooden utility pole located in the public right-of-way (sidewalk). The 36'-6" wooden utility pole is existing.
	Applicant:	Extenet Systems (California) LLC. (for T-Mobile USA, INC)
	Contact Person/ Phone Number:	Ana Gomez (913) 458-9148
	Owner:	Joint Pole Authority (JPA) including PG&E
	Case File Number:	PLN16380
	Planning Permits Required:	Major Design Review to install a wireless Telecommunication Macro Facility on a PG&E replacement pole located in RD-2 Zone.
	General Plan:	Detached Unit Residential
	Zoning:	RD-2 Detached Unit Residential Zone.
	Environmental Determination:	Exempt, Section 15303 of the State CEQA Guidelines; New construction or conversion of small structures. Exempt, Section 15183 of the State CEQA Guidelines; Projects consistent with a Community Plan, General Plan or Zoning.
	Historic Status:	Not a Potential Designated Historic Property; Survey rating: n/a
	City Council District:	7
	Finality of Decision:	Appealable to City Council within 10 Days
	For Further Information:	Contact case planner Danny Thai at (510) 238-3584 or by email at dthai@oaklandnet.com .

4.	Location:	The Public Right-of-Way Adjacent to 1301 90th Ave.
	Assessor's Parcel Number(s):	Nearest adjacent lot (046 547202300)
	Proposal:	To establish a telecommunications facility by attaching an antenna and equipment to an existing wooden utility pole located in the public right-of-way (sidewalk). The 37' wooden utility pole is existing.
	Applicant:	Extenet Systems (California) LLC. (for T-Mobile USA, INC)
	Contact Person/ Phone Number:	Ana Gomez (913) 458-9148
	Owner:	Joint Pole Authority (JPA) including PG&E
	Case File Number:	PLN16399
	Planning Permits Required:	Major Design Review to install a wireless Telecommunication Macro Facility on a PG&E replacement pole located in RD-1 Zone.
	General Plan:	Detached Unit Residential
	Zoning:	RD-1 Detached Unit Residential Zone.
	Environmental Determination:	Exempt, Section 15303 of the State CEQA Guidelines; New construction or conversion of small structures. Exempt, Section 15183 of the State CEQA Guidelines; Projects consistent with a Community Plan, General Plan or Zoning.
	Historic Status:	Not a Potential Designated Historic Property; Survey rating: n/a
	City Council District:	7
	Finality of Decision:	Appealable to City Council within 10 Days
	For Further Information:	Contact case planner Danny Thai at (510) 238-3584 or by email at dthai@oaklandnet.com .



5.	Location:	The public Right-of-Way in front of 1977 Auseon Ave on a JPA utility pole
	Assessor's Parcel Number(s):	(043-4593-003-00) nearest lot adjacent to the project site.
	Proposal:	Installation of a wireless telecommunication facility on a 37' tall wooden utility pole located in the public right-of-way. The project involves installation of one (1) canister antenna measuring 23.5" long and 7.9" in diameter at a height of 18'-9" and two radio units (7.9" tall and 7.9" wide) mounted at a height of 10'-6" and 13'-11" above ground.
	Applicant:	Black & Veatch for Extenet Systems
	Contact Person/ Phone Number:	Ana Gomez of Black & Veatch (913)458-9148
	Owner:	Pacific Gas & Electric. (PG&E)
	Case File Number:	PLN16416
	Planning Permits Required:	Major Design Review to install a wireless Macro Telecommunications Facility one (1) telecommunications canister antenna on an existing PG&E pole located in the public right -of- way in a residential zone.
	General Plan:	Detached Unit Residential
	Zoning:	RD-1 Detached Unit Residential-1
	Environmental Determination:	Exempt, Section 15301 of the State CEQA Guidelines; installation of telecommunication facility on an existing PG&E utility pole; Exempt, Section 15183 of the State CEQA Guidelines; projects consistent with a community plan, general plan or zoning.
	Historic Status:	No Historic Record – Utility Pole
	City Council District:	7
	Finality of Decision:	Appealable to City Council within 10 Days
	For Further Information:	Contact case planner Jason Madani at (510) 238-4790 or by email at jmadani@oaklandnet.com .

6.	Location:	The public Right-of-Way in front of 1715 57 th Avenue on a JPA utility telephone pole.
	Assessor's Parcel Number(s):	(038-3229-019-00) nearest lot adjacent to the project site.
	Proposal:	Installation of a wireless telecommunication facility on a wooden utility pole located in the public right-of-way. The project involves replacement of an existing 38' tall wood utility pole with 48' tall to install two (2) canister antenna measuring 23.6" long and 4.1" in diameter at a height of 18'; install two radio units (7.9" tall and 7.9" wide) mounted at a height of 10'-6" and 13'-11" above ground.
	Applicant:	Black & Veatch for Extenet Systems
	Contact Person/ Phone Number:	Ana Gomez of Black & Veatch (913)458-9148
	Owner:	Pacific Gas & Electric. (PG&E)
	Case File Number:	PLN16417
	Planning Permits Required:	Major Design Review to install a wireless Macro Telecommunications Facility two (2) telecommunications canister antenna to a replaced PG&E pole located in the public right -of- way in a residential zone.
	General Plan:	Detached Unit Residential
	Zoning:	RD-2 Detached Unit Residential-2
	Environmental Determination:	Exempt, Section 15303 of the State CEQA Guidelines; minor additions and alterations to a replaced PG&E utility pole; Exempt, Section 15302 of the State CEQA Guidelines; replacement or reconstruction of existing utility systems and/or facilities; Exempt, Section 15183 of the State CEQA Guidelines; projects consistent with a community plan, general plan or zoning.
	Historic Status:	No Historic Record – Utility Pole
	City Council District:	6
	Finality of Decision:	Appealable to City Council within 10 Days
	For Further Information:	Contact case planner Jason Madani at (510) 238-4790 or by email at jmadani@oaklandnet.com .



The Consent Calendar was called at 6:19pm.

Motion by Commissioner Pattillo to approve the Consent Calendar, seconded by Commissioner Manus.

Ayes: Limon, Manus, Myres, Pattillo, Weinstein, Nagraj

Noes:

Approved with 6 ayes and 0 noes.

PUBLIC HEARINGS

This item was called at 6:21pm.

7.	Location:	MacArthur Transit Village Parcel B
	Assessor's Parcel Number(s):	012 102501100 and 012 102501200
	Proposal:	Construct final stage (Phase V) of the MacArthur Station Project which includes: development of Parcel B with a 25-story tower (260 feet tall) with up to 402 residential units, 10,000 square feet of ground-floor commercial space, and up to 260 parking spaces.
	Applicant:	Boston Properties
	Contact Person:	Aaron Fenton (415) 772-0714
	Owner:	BART, MacArthur Transit Community Partners, LLC
	Case File Number:	DA10204, PUD06058-R01, PUD06058-R01-ER01, PUD06058-R01-PUDF01, TPM10561, T1600091
	Planning Permits Required:	Revision to PUD, Final Development Plan for Parcel B of the MacArthur Station Project, Tentative Parcel Map, Minor Variance for loading, amendment to Development Agreement to allow increased height.
	General Plan:	Neighborhood Center Mixed Use
	Zoning:	S-15 Transit-Oriented Development Zone
	Environmental Determination:	A detailed CEQA Analysis was prepared for this project which concluded that the proposed project satisfies each of the following CEQA Guideline provisions: 15183 - Projects consistent with a community plan, general plan, or zoning; 15183.3 - Streamlining for Qualified in-fill projects; 15164 - Addendum (to MacArthur Transit Village EIR); and/or 15168 & 15180 - Program EIRs and Redevelopment Plans, Each of which provides a separate and independent basis for CEQA compliance. The CEQA Analysis document may be reviewed at the Planning Bureau offices at 250 Frank Ogawa Plaza, 2 nd Floor or on-line at http://www2.oaklandnet.com/Government/o/PBN/OurServices/Application/DOWD009157 (see #50).
	Historic Status:	There are no Potential Designated Historic Properties located on the project site.
	City Council District:	1
	Date Filed:	June 30, 2016
	Status:	2 previous Design Review Committee public hearings; the project will be considered by the City Council at a future public hearing.
	Action to be Taken:	Recommendation to City Council
	Staff Recommendation:	Take public testimony, close the public hearing and recommend approval of the Project to the City Council.
	Finality of Decision:	No final decision will be made on the project at this time; recommendation to City Council, only.
	For Further Information:	Contact the case planner Catherine Payne at (510) 238-6168 or by email at cpayne@oaklandnet.com .

Commissioners Nagraj, Weinstein, and Pattillo recused themselves from this item.

Motion by Chair Nagraj to select Commissioner Myres as Chair *pro tem* for this item, seconded by Commissioner Manus.

Ayes: Limon, Manus, Myres, Pattillo, Monchamp, Weinstein, Nagraj

Noes:

Approved with 7 ayes and 0 noes.

Staff Member: Catherine Payne requested a motion to accept into the record the City's response to a letter from the Coalition for Appropriate Development and a motion to introduce a new Condition of Approval, Condition number 33.

Motion by Commissioner Limon to accept into the record the City's response to a letter from the Coalition for Appropriate Development, seconded by Commissioner Manus.

Ayes: Limon, Manus, Monchamp, Myres

Noes:

Accepted with 4 ayes and 0 noes.

Motion by Commissioner Manus to accept the introduction of a new Condition of Approval, Condition number 33, seconded by Commissioner Limon.

Ayes: Limon, Manus, Monchamp, Myres

Noes:

Accepted with 4 ayes and 0 noes.

Applicant: Terence McGrath with McGrath Properties, Aaron Fenton with Boston Properties, Strachan Forgan with Solomon Cordwell Buenz gave presentations.

Public Speakers: Mark Everton, Torin Block, Milo Trauss, Anna de Anguera, Kieryn Darkwater, Lauren Boas-Hayes, Christopher Kitner, Pamela Boskin, Jabari Herbert, Jason Lindsey, Shifra de Benedictis-Kessner, Joel de Valcourt, Aaron Eckhouse, Jeff Andrade-Fong, Joseph Chilcoat, Jim Bergdoll, David Jaeger, Ann O'Connor, Michael Lozeau, Sandy Spiker, Dave Campbell, Colin Dentel-Post, Mark McClure, Autumn Bernstein, David Long, Brian Pearson, Kayode Powell, Victoria Fierce, Ellen Kim, Erin Franks, Michael Prados, Clea Matson, Aaron Priven, Deb Frye, Martha Ekdahl, Eden Brukman, Ken Miller, Tommaso Sciortino, Alex Ludlum, Kelly Burbrink, Jeff Greenwald, Timiza Joseph, Lucia Hwang, Deirdre Snyder, Dan Tischler, Daniel Gregg, Don Howe, Nicole Vezina, Matt Regan, Drew Cooper, Robert Raburn, Rebecca Saltzman, Nicholas Roethlisberger, Ian Monroe, John Gatewood, Joan Lichterman, Tony Albert, Tom Murphy, Andre San-Chez, Daryl Carey. **Public Session Closed.**

Chair *pro tem* Myres called a 5 minute recess (9:00-9:05pm).

Motion by Commissioner Manus to affirm staff's environmental determination, to approve, based on the attached findings, and subject to the proposed conditions of approval: A revision to the Macarthur Transit Village PUD to allow a maximum height of up to 260 feet on Parcel B, an FDP for Parcel B, TPM10561, and an amendment to the Development Agreement to allow a maximum height of 260 feet on Parcel B and memorialize the provision of community benefits associated with the delivery of Parcel B improvements, and the addition of Condition of Approval 33 to reflect continuing design review beyond permit issuance up to certificate of occupancy, and to recommend to council that community benefits funds be spent in the immediate neighborhood, that the developers look into securing a grocery tenant, that the developers consider a community benefit of below market rate commercial space, and that the developer meet with the residents and neighborhood group to share information about the type of retail that the market can support and following that take feedback from the community about the type of retail they are interested in having, seconded by Commissioner Limon.



Ayes: Limon, Manus, Monchamp, Myres
Noes:

Approved with 4 ayes and 0 noes.

APPEALS

COMMISSION BUSINESS

Approval of Minutes

The vote for minutes was held at 6:17pm prior to the Consent Calendar to have a quorum present.

Motion by Commissioner Myres to approve the January 11, 2017, meeting minutes, seconded by Commissioner Pattillo.

Ayes: Limon, Manus, Myres, Pattillo, Nagraj

Noes:

Abstentions: Monchamp, Weinstein

Approved with 5 ayes, 0 noes, and 2 abstentions.

Motion by Commissioner Myres to approve the January 18, 2017, meeting minutes, seconded by Commissioner Monchamp.

Ayes: Limon, Myres, Pattillo, Monchamp, Weinstein, Nagraj

Noes:

Abstentions: Manus

Approved with 6 ayes, 0 noes, and 1 abstention.

Correspondence

None.

City Council Actions

None.

ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was adjourned at 9:52pm.

ROBERT MERKAMP

Development Planning Manager

Secretary to the Planning Commission

Planning and Building Department