****City of Oakland**

Equitable Climate Action Plan (ECAP) Community Advisory Committee [ad hoc]

Tuesday, December 12, 2019 – Special Meeting

6:00 p.m. – 8:00 p.m.

Classroom #2

150 Frank H. Ogawa Plaza, Oakland, CA 94612

Committee Members: Najee Amaranth (Co-Chair), Nicole Bratton (Co-Chair), Ryder Diaz, Anne Olivia Eldred, Margaret Gordon, Barbara Haya, Navina Khanna, Jody London, Ryan Schuchard, Susan Stephenson, Tyrone “Baybe Champ” Stevenson Jr., Dominic Ware, Jacky Xu. Alternates: Brian Beveridge, Bruce Nilles

Agenda

1. **Call to order, Roll call / Determination of quorum 6:00 – 6:05**
2. **Approval of draft meeting minutes (attached) 6:05 – 6:08**

*Seek motion to adopt the November 12, 2019 ECAP ad hoc Community Advisory Committee Meeting minutes*

1. **Public comment 6:08 – 6:20**

*Any person may directly address the Committee on any items within the jurisdiction of this Committee. Speakers wishing to address a specific item on the agenda may do so at the time the item is being considered.*

1. **Agenda modification 6:20 – 6:22**
2. **Committee Discussion: Transportation and Land Use 6:22 – 6:30**

*Full Committee – Finish Discussion from 11/12 and Vote*

1. **Committee Discussion: Buildings and Energy Use 6:30 – 6:45**

*Full Committee – Discussion and Vote*

1. **Committee Discussion: Material Consumption & Waste 6:45 – 7:00**

*Full Committee – Discussion and Vote*

1. **Committee Discussion: City Leadership 7:00 – 7:15**

*Full Committee – Discussion and Vote*

1. **Committee Discussion: Adaptation 7:15 – 7:30**

*Full Committee – Discussion and Vote*

1. **Committee Discussion: Carbon Removal 7:30 – 7:45**

*Full Committee – Discussion and Vote*

1. **Committee Discussion: Port Leadership 7:45 – 8:00**

*Full Committee – Discussion and Vote*

1. **Adjourn 8:00**

**Note: The Committee May Take Action on Any Item on the Agenda**

Public Comments: To offer public comments at this special meeting, please register with Shayna Hirshfield-Gold, Acting Sustainability Program Manager, before the start of the meeting at 5:45 p.m. Please note that the ECAP ad hoc Community Advisory Committee will not provide a detailed response to your comments but may schedule your issue for a future meeting. The Public Comment period is limited to 12 minutes. Time limits per individual speaker will be set at the discretion of the Chairperson, dependent on the number of speakers who register.

This meeting is wheelchair accessible. To request ASL interpreting, materials in alternative formats, captioning or assistive listening device, or any other disability related accommodation, please email adaprograms@oaklandnet.com or call (510) 238-5219 (V) or 711 (California Relay Service) at least three (3) business days before the meeting. Please refrain from wearing scented products to this meeting so persons who may experience chemical sensitivities can attend. Thank you.

**City of Oakland, ECAP ad hoc Community Advisory Committee**

**Meeting Minutes from Tuesday, November 12, 2019 Special Meeting**

***150 Frank H. Ogawa Plaza, 2nd Floor, Classroom 2***

**Item 1. Call to Order**

Meeting called to order at 6:13 PM by Substitute Co-Chair Jody London.

**Item 2. Roll call / Determination of Quorum**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **Committee Members** | **Present** | **Excused** |
| Najee Amaranth | X |  |
| Nicole Bratton | X |  |
| Ryder Diaz | X |  |
| Anne Olivia Eldred |  | X |
| Margaret Gordon | X |  |
| Barbara Haya | X |  |
| Navina Khanna |  | X |
| Jody London | X |  |
| Ryan Schuchard | X |  |
| Susan Stephenson | X |  |
| Tyrone “Baybe Champ” Stevenson Jr. |  | X |
| Dominic Ware |  | X |
| Jacky Xu | X |  |

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **Alternates** | **Present** | **Excused** |
| Brian Beveridge |  | X |
| Bruce Nilles | X |  |

Staff attendees: Daniel Hamilton (Sustainability Program Manager), Shayna Hirshfield-Gold (ECAP Project Manager), Danielle Makous (Sustainability Fellow), Sooji Yang (Sustainability Fellow)

**Item 3. Approval of draft meeting minutes (attached)**

**🡪 Motion to adopt minutes made by Jody; Bruce seconds**

* + No objections

**Item 4. Public comment**

* No comment

**Item 5. Agenda Modification**

* No modification

**Item 6. Committee Resolution: Building Electrification policy recommendations**

*Bruce presented new version of resolution (Attachment A).*

Bruce discussed the changes to the resolution that reflected the Committee feedback from the October meeting.

The Committee discussed these proposed modifications:

* Incorporate same thread of language focusing on benefits rather than deficits through all the “Whereas.”
* Discuss importance of offsetting costs so low-income people aren’t financially harmed in the last *Further resolved*.
* Change “homeowners” to “homeowners and renters” in 1st *Further resolved* paragraph.
* Add “as defined by federal guidelines for Oakland” after “low- and moderate-income” in 1st *Further resolved* paragraph.
* Change “while” to “and” in 1st *Further resolved* paragraph.
* Add “and solar” after “energy efficiency” in 2nd *Further resolved* paragraph.

**🡪 Motion to adopt these modifications made by Jody; Co-Chair Nicole seconds**

* No objections

**Item 7. Recap Committee’s Core Principles Framework from 10/22**

* Nicole reviewed the Committee’s Core Principles adopted from the last meeting.
* Ms. Margaret requested to include “public health impacts” in the Core Principles Framework.

**🡪 Co-Chair Nicole moves to vote on including “public health impacts” into the Core Principles Framework at the next meeting.**

* No objections

**Item 8. Committee Discussion: ECAP Intro**

* Shayna explained how committee input is incorporated into the ECAP writing process. City staff to post survey findings and synthesis of community input when finalized.

The Committee discussed pages 1-4:

* Nicole: Why is certain data sourced and not sourced?
  + Shayna: We found from looking at other city climate action plans that it’s not common practice to cite sources. But we cited a few in ours.
* Ms. Margaret: Include language about not contributing harm to others on Page 7.
* Bruce: Highlight solving public health problem (i.e., air pollution) together with climate change (can dedicate a page to nail this). Bring in BAAQMD.
  + Nicole: Have a separate page that speaks to public health impacts – something more defined that highlights the potential benefits of healthier outcomes
* Nicole: Concretely state “improve health outcomes” on Page 2, second paragraph.
* Ryan and Susan: Change “Realistic” to “Pragmatic,” “Workable,” or “Actionable” on Page 2.
* Barbara: Take out the misnomer of the “global consensus that we only have until 2030” on Page 2. We don’t have until 2030 to begin taking action; need to imply more urgency.

**🡪 Co-Chair Nicole moves to endorse concepts and the design with modifications discussed; Najee seconds**

* No objections

The Committee discussed Pages 5-12:

* Ms. Margaret: We should have maps.
* Nicole: Include all the disparity maps presented by the Equity Facilitator team.
* Bruce: Strike the “service” in front of “workers” on Page 5, second paragraph.
* Nicole: Add “low and moderate” before “workers [Add: and residents]” on Page 5, second paragraph.
* Bruce: The last sentence under edible food recovery is not really related. It’s about access, so I’m finding it doesn’t really fit on Page 7, 4th bullet point.
  + Ryder: You can just say “ensuring recovery of this high-quality, edible food”.

**🡪 Co-Chair Nicole moves to endorse concepts and the design with modifications discussed; Jody seconds.**

* No objections

**Item 9. Committee Discussion: Transportation & Land Use**

The Committee discussed Pages 13-19:

* Ryan: “Create a Zero Emission Vehicle Action Plan” is the thorniest action in the transportation plan. Curious about the City’s thinking on this.
  + Shayna: City received a CalTrans grant to create a ZEV action plan, and the action is a way to reference that plan into the ECAP and to provide some high-level direction on it.
* Ryder: There should a specific call out for trucks.
* Ryan: It would be helpful to have a goal. Quantify the goal on the ZEV action piece and call out sectors. Maybe a modeshift goal?
* Ms. Margaret: OakDot does not deal with trucks, and will they have a role when dealing with the Port? And there’s nothing about the Port and their vehicles included in the transportation + land use. Add language about electrifying trucks, rail, and infrastructure at the Port and City’s bulk terminal.
* Ryder: On Page 17, under bullet point “removing parking minimums”, is there an exception for ADA/handicap parking? Also under bullet point “require transit passes bundled with developments”, with what kind of developments? And who’s getting these passes?
  + Shayna: Transit passes would be provided by the developer or building owner to residents, in lieu or offering free parking. This is a strategy to facilitate a shift away from personal auto ownership toward transit use.
* Nicole: Add “protections from abuse” to the “remove barriers and incentivize affordable housing” item.
* Bruce: Are we going to have conversations about shutting down streets from cars (like SF’s Market street)? I feel like that’s the part that’s missing, that there are parts of the City where we say no more. Identify places in the City where we stop vehicles.
* Ryan: There are no climate goals in the 2019 Bike Plan. Need to clarify the bigger vision about making safe spaces for everyone?

**🡪 Co-Chair Nicole moves to vote on transportation and land use to next meeting, and for the Committee to read, review, and annotate all the sections before the next meeting to facilitate voting.**

* No objections

Shayna: Does the Committee want to bring the electrification resolution to the Rules Committee and then get it agendized at the Public Works Committee or have it on record here and keep it in the wings until staff or Council brings forward an electrification resolution, which is likely to happen in early 2020?

* Bruce: Go with option 1 so that we can get it on the agenda. If it’s helpful, I can work with Anne Olivia to do that.

**Items 10: Committee Discussion: Buildings & Energy Use**

Discussion on Buildings and Energy Use moved to next meeting.

**Meeting adjourned at 8:00 PM.**

**Attachment A – Final Draft of ECAP Committee Electrification Resolution**

**Resolution 001: Support for City Council Action to Ban the Use of Natural Gas in New Residential and Commercial Buildings**

**Equitable Climate Action Plan *ad hoc* Community Advisory Committee, City of Oakland**

WHEREAS, climate disruption is being fueled by the burning of fossil fuels, including “natural gas,” oil, and coal, and the disruption is already having devastating impacts on those who can least afford it and are least responsible for the problem; and

WHEREAS, the burning of these fossil fuels is the primary source of air pollution that plagues our communities with profound health impacts, particularly on children, the elderly, and those with respiratory ailments such as asthma; and  
  
WHEREAS, numerous peer-reviewed studies including by [Lawrence Berkeley National Laboratory](https://homes.lbl.gov/sites/default/files/lbnl-185629.pdf), the [National Institutes of Health](https://ehp.niehs.nih.gov/doi/full/10.1289/ehp.122-a27), [California Energy Commission](https://ww2.energy.ca.gov/2019publications/CEC-500-2019-049/CEC-500-2019-049.pdf), and [Johns Hopkins University](http://citeseerx.ist.psu.edu/viewdoc/download?doi=10.1.1.277.9376&rep=rep1&type=pdf) have documented unhealthy levels of nitrous oxides (NOx) in homes with gas cooktops, particularly noting the disproportionately negative impact on inner city African American children; and

WHEREAS, greenhouse gas emissions from the burning of gas exceed those of coal in the US and the three primary uses of gas are in energy production, in our buildings, and in the industrial sector; and

WHEREAS, the City of Oakland with the assistance of Bloomberg Associates has concluded that the city will not meet its climate goals without phasing out the use of gas in all of its residential and commercial buildings, including existing structures; and

WHEREAS, new buildings built all-electric are safer, cheaper to build and operate, and cleaner than new buildings constructed to use natural gas for heating, hot water, cooking and other purposes; and  
  
WHEREAS, a ban on gas in new buildings in Oakland and other communities can help stop the problem from getting worse and create the groundwork for clean energy technologies and the development of robust community based training and job creation at family sustaining, union scale wages; and

WHEREAS, the use of gas also creates [massive community safety and health risks](https://ww3.arb.ca.gov/research/aliso_canyon/aliso_canyon_methane_emissions-arb_final.pdf?_ga=2.61354223.2132491265.1564675860-1692574511.1493222316) throughout its life cycle, including its production, which often involves fracking and other dangerous and polluting extraction practices, from its transmission and storage, and its burning; and

WHEREAS, a peer-reviewed meta-study concluded that kids in homes with gas stoves were 42% more likely to have asthma than kids in homes without gas stoves; and

WHEREAS, the policy switch to all electric new construction will increase availability of electric appliances for the general population, and encourage inclusion of electric appliances in homeowners retrofits and upgrades; and   
  
WHEREAS, any upgrades to rental units often result in rent increases, evictions, and exacerbation of already high internal displacement levels for tenants in our communities; and   
  
WHEREAS, as a clean energy economy must include a clear prioritization on equity in order to create a prosperous economy and a better future for all; and

WHEREAS, the creation of climate related policies and programs are opportunities for creating local jobs, raising wages, addressing historical inequities for women and communities of color, improving the health of residents, and improving the quality of life for all; and

WHEREAS, the phase out of gas can result in lower utility bills when coupled with other strategies and utilizing efficient electric appliances, [such as heat pump hot water heaters](https://rmi.org/insight/the-economics-of-electrifying-buildings/); and can reduce fire risk, improve indoor air quality, and create more comfortable buildings; and

WHEREAS, by focusing on equitable climate policy development, Oakland and its sister cities will positively impact broader strategies on affordable housing development, reducing liability for gas infrastructure, adapting to climate change, and building local, family sustaining jobs in the clean energy economy; and

WHEREAS, Oakland can help lead in the absence of federal leadership by implementing climate solutions to benefit all people in our community, particularly those that have been disadvantaged by the ways in which our cities were originally developed. In this way, we can demonstrate a style of leadership that advances our policy and social needs to achieve the equity for climate and environmental justice; and  
  
WHEREAS, phasing out gas in existing buildings must not exacerbate Oakland high housing prices for low-income residents and high rates of internal displacement, and must involve subsidizing upgrades to homes and multifamily units for those who need assistance; now, therefore be it

RESOLVED: That this committee supports the City Council and Mayor Schaaf in banning the use of gas in new residential and commercial buildings; and be it

FURTHER RESOLVED: That the City Council and Mayor Schaaf should move forward immediately to develop an inclusive and community-engaged plan to address gas usage in the existing 170,000 residential and commercial buildings, without passing those costs on to low- and moderate-income homeowners, while protecting existing tenants by including protections against rent increases and evictions; and be it

FURTHER RESOLVED: That the policies developed should include energy efficiency in partnership with electrification efforts, taking into consideration energy consumption levels and the source of our cities energy as a whole; and be it

FURTHER RESOLVED: That program development includes equity provisions including: that subsidies made to support electrification efforts are dispersed in such a way that the benefits are shared with renters, policies are implemented to share the benefits of financing strategies like on bill financing between landlords and tenants, include provisions for the proper training of code inspectors, and language clearly defining enforcement policies, and include local hire provisions and job training for Oakland residents; and be it

FURTHER RESOLVED: That the City should examine ways to increase local renewable development and energy efficiency to offset the increased electrical load to the grid, and develop electrification policies in conjunction with other community plans, prioritizing equity and community resiliency in their development.

Dated: