



City of Oakland
Equitable Climate Action Plan (ECAP) Community Advisory Committee [ad hoc]

Special Meeting Agenda

Tuesday, July 14, 2020
6:00 p.m. – 8:00 p.m.
Via Teleconference

Committee Members: Najee Amaranth (Co-Chair), Nicole Bratton (Co-Chair), Ryder Diaz, Anne Olivia Eldred, Barbara Haya, Jhamere Howard, Navina Khanna, Jody London, Ryan Schuchard, Susan Stephenson, Tyrone “Baybe Champ” Stevenson Jr., Dominic Ware, Jacky Xu. Alternates: Brian Beveridge, Bruce Nilles

Pursuant to the Governor's Executive Order N-29-20, members of the ECAP ad hoc Community Advisory Committee, as well as City staff, will participate via phone/video conference, and no physical teleconference locations are required.

PUBLIC PARTICIPATION

The ECAP ad hoc Community Advisory Committee encourages public participation in the online meetings. Public comment will be taken at the beginning of the meeting, and at the end if time allows; there will not be public comment for each agenda item. The public may observe and/or participate in this meeting in several ways.

OBSERVE:

- To observe the meeting by video conference, please click on this link: <https://us02web.zoom.us/j/83361003619> at the noticed meeting time.

Instructions on how to join a meeting by video conference are available at: <https://support.zoom.us/hc/en-us/articles/201362193>, which is a webpage entitled “Joining a Meeting”

- To listen to the meeting by phone, please call the numbers below at the noticed meeting time: Dial (for higher quality, dial a number based on your current location):

+1 669 900 9128 or +1 346 248 7799 or +1 253 215 8782 or +1 646 558 8656 or +1 301 715 8592 or +1 312 626 6799. For each number, please be patient and when requested, dial the following Webinar ID: 833 6100 3619

After calling any of these phone numbers, if you are asked for a participant ID or code, press #. Instructions on how to join a meeting by phone are available at: <https://support.zoom.us/hc/en-us/articles/201362663>, which is a webpage entitled “Joining a Meeting By Phone.”

PROVIDE PUBLIC COMMENT: There are three ways to make public comment within the time allotted for public comment on an eligible Agenda item.

- Comment in advance. To send your comment directly to the Committee BEFORE the meeting starts, please send your comment, along with your full name and agenda item number you are commenting on, to Shayna Hirshfield-Gold at shirshfield-gold@oaklandca.gov. Please note that eComment submissions

close one (1) hour before posted meeting time. All submitted public comment will be provided to the Committee prior to the meeting.

- **By Video Conference.** To comment by Zoom video conference, click the “Raise Your Hand” button to request to speak when Public Comment is being taken on an eligible agenda item at the beginning of the meeting. You will then be unmuted, during your turn, and allowed to participate in public comment. After the allotted time, you will be re-muted. Instructions on how to “Raise Your Hand” are available at: <https://support.zoom.us/hc/en-us/articles/205566129> (“Raise Hand In Webinar”).

- **By Phone.** To comment by phone, please call on one of the above listed phone numbers. You will be prompted to “Raise Your Hand” by pressing STAR-NINE (“*9”) to request to speak when Public Comment is being taken on an eligible agenda item at the beginning of the meeting. Once it is your turn, you will be unmuted and allowed to make your comment. After the allotted time, you will be re-muted. Instructions of how to raise your hand by phone are available at: <https://support.zoom.us/hc/en-us/articles/201362663> (“Joining a Meeting by Phone”).

If you have any questions about these protocols, please e-mail Shayna Hirshfield-Gold, at shirshfield-gold@oaklandca.gov.

Agenda

1. Call to order, Roll call / Determination of quorum	6:00 – 6:05
2. Approval of draft meeting minutes (Attachment A)	6:05 – 6:10
3. Public comment <i>Members of the public will have up to two minutes each to provide comment on any portion of the agenda or other matters pertaining to the Committee.</i>	6:10 – 6:22
4. Agenda modification	6:22 – 6:27
5. Chair’s Report <i>Miesha Singleton Crossing (Nicole)</i> <i>Community Letter (Nicole, Anne Olivia)</i>	6:27 – 6:37
6. Staff Update/Responses to Process Questions <i>Staff Presentation</i>	6:37 – 6:45
7. Further Changes to Port Section <i>Staff Presentation</i>	6:45 – 7:00
8. Letter to City Council regarding ECAP Adoption (Attachment B) <i>Committee Presentation, discussion, and vote</i>	6:50 – 7:30
9. Additional Discussion on ECAP and REIA as needed	7:45 – 7:55
10. Next Steps: Discussion	7:55 – 8:00
11. Adjourn	8:00

Note: The Committee May Take Action on Any Item on the Agenda

Public Comments: Instructions on providing public comments are listed at the beginning of the Agenda. Please note that the ECAP ad hoc Community Advisory Committee will not provide a detailed response to your comments but may schedule your issue for a future meeting. The Public Comment period is limited to 12 minutes. Time limits per individual speaker will be set at the discretion of the Chairpersons, dependent on the number of speakers who register.

To request ASL interpreting, materials in alternative formats, captioning or assistive listening device, or any other disability related accommodation, please email adaprograms@oaklandnet.com or call (510) 238-5219 (V) or 711 (California Relay Service) at least three (3) business days before the meeting. Thank you.



City of Oakland
Equitable Climate Action Plan (ECAP) Community Advisory Committee [ad hoc]

Regular Meeting Minutes

Tuesday, June 23, 2020
6:00 p.m. – 8:00 p.m.
Via Teleconference

Committee Members: Najee Amaranth (Co-Chair), Nicole Bratton (Co-Chair), Ryder Diaz, Anne Olivia Eldred, Barbara Haya, Jhamere Howard, Navina Khanna, Jody London, Ryan Schuchard, Susan Stephenson, Tyrone “Baybe Champ” Stevenson Jr., Dominic Ware, Jacky Xu. Alternates: Brian Beveridge, Bruce Nilles

Pursuant to the Governor's Executive Order N-29-20, members of the Committee, as well as City staff, will participate via phone/video conference, and no physical teleconference locations are required. Public participation instructions were provided in the Meeting Agenda.

12. Call to order, Roll call / Determination of quorum 6:00 – 6:05

- Meeting called to order at 6:00 PM by Co-Chair Najee Amaranth. Susan Stephenson joined in at 6:10 PM, and Brian Beveridge joined in at 6:27pm.

Committee Members	Present	Excused
Najee Amaranth	X	
Nicole Bratton		X
Ryder Diaz	X	
Anne Olivia Eldred	X	
Jhamere Howard		
Barbara Haya	X	
Navina Khanna	X	
Jody London	X	
Ryan Schuchard	X	
Susan Stephenson	X	
Tyrone “Baybe Champ” Stevenson Jr.		X
Dominic Ware		X
Jacky Xu		X

Alternates	Present	Excused
Brian Beveridge	X	
Bruce Nilles	X	

13. Approval of draft meeting minutes (Attachment A) 6:05 – 6:08

Seek motion to adopt the February 25, 2020 ECAP ad hoc Community Advisory Committee Meeting minutes

- ➔ **Motion to adopt the February 25 minutes made by Jody; Anne Olivia seconds**
○ *Roll call: All in favor.*

14. Public comment

6:08 – 6:20

- Carrie Ramirez, of Youth vs. Apocalypse, read statements from youth in the organization.
- David Ralston, a member of Brower Dellums Institute and city planner, commended all efforts on the ECAP and the journey thus far. Ralston said that there are critical gaps that committee should consider in the ECAP:
 - Community priorities have not been fully incorporated (i.e. public bank, no deliverables or targets on food systems, not enough resilience hubs, lack of land use maps)
 - ECAP should be an element in General Plan
 - Oversight Equity Council to see across implementation of ECAP
 - Connect to ‘Defund OPD’ budget for funding stream to implement the ECAP

15. Agenda modification

6:20 – 6:23

- ➔ **Motion to move Youth vs. Justice (prev. Agenda Item 8) to the beginning of the meeting made by Anne Olivia; Najee seconds**
○ *Roll call: All in favor.*

16. Youth vs. Apocalypse

6:23 – 6:28

- Anne Olivia introduces Carrie and Carolyn from Youth vs. Apocalypse who read a statement/resolution
- ➔ **Motion to support the Youth vs. Apocalypse resolution made by Anne Olivia; Navina seconds.**
○ *Roll call: All in favor except Jody and Barbara who abstained, and Brian who was present but was not called to vote. Motion passes.*

17. Changes to Port of Oakland section in the ECAP

6:28 – 6:50

- Daniel explained direction from the City Administrator to remove Port actions and only reference the Port’s two existing plans: Seaport Air Quality 2020 and Beyond Plan and the West Oakland Community Action Plan (WOCAP). Shayna discussed with the EF team and leadership at WOEIP prior to the Committee meeting, and explained that the rewritten Port section affirms the City’s commitment to pursuing WOCAP implementation in alignment with ECAP goals and principles.
- Committee asks whether there is time to update the ECAP?
 - No more chances to change draft before committee consideration.
- Committee asks whether there is timetable for future updates to the ECAP?
 - Plan doesn’t specify regular updates, will be direction of Council or City Administration.
- Brian Beveridge explained WOCAP, and encouraged the Committee to become engaged with the Port’s decision-making due to the significant climate and GHG emissions impact of the Port’s activities. Encouraged Committee members to look at WOEIP and WOCAP for Port-specific items, and overlap between Port strategies and the ECAP. Stressed that there is now a window of opportunity because the Port Commission has been

sympathetic to West Oakland climate impacts. Brian feels that City cannot reach GHG goals without reducing emissions at the Port.

- Jody London calls for focus on practical aspect of the committee’s advisory role given the City administration direction.
- ➔ **Motion to write a Committee letter to the City Council, Mayor, City Administrator, Port Commission, and the Port Executive Director expressing disappointment that Port Actions were removed from the ECAP, and expectation that the Port continues to work with the City on alleviating its impact on surrounding communities made by Jody London; Anne Olivia seconds.**
- Committee discussion followed on overall disappointment and need for explanation from the City Administrator on the decision to omit Port Actions from the ECAP. The Committee further asked:
 - About the legal authority of bypassing the public comment process,
 - Daniel answered that staff will find out and report back to the Committee.
 - Whether the existing Port plans fall short of the removed ECAP Port Actions,
 - Daniel confirms Port is likely fall short of original ECAP goals.
 - And whether the Committee’s objection to the process that took place and the content of the Port section of the ECAP can be included in the staff report.
 - Daniel answered the staff report has already been finalized, but staff can request that the ad hoc Committee be included in the presentation.
- ➔ **Motion to write the letter discussed above before the Council meeting, and include that the Committee objects to the handling of the situation in the Staff PowerPoint presentation to Council made by Najee.** *No Committee member seconded the motion.*
 - **Roll call: All in favor.**
 - The Committee designated members who will write the letter: Jody, Ryan, Barbara, Anne Olivia, and Brian. Jody will send an email.
- ➔ **Motion to schedule a special meeting made by Navina; Anne Olivia seconds.**
 - **Roll call: All in favor.**
 - Shayna will send out a doodle poll to schedule the special meeting and the link to the Port Task Force meeting this Friday at Brian’s request.

18. Committee Discussion: 2030 Equitable Climate Action Plan (final draft)

Discussion and possibly vote. See Attachment B, available at

<https://wettransfer.com/downloads/5e52ee810d945a04e24b4b5c5cdf9eb120200616234322/ef52bf>

- Shayna noted that formatting is still in process, and Appendices have yet to be formatted and included, but narrative content is final. Staff intends to have full document completed by end of this week, and still need to add 4 appendices. Expresses gratitude to Committee.
 - Many priorities and concerns from the Committee are incorporated in the final document, including crosscutting equity sections (Public Health, Housing Security, Food security); incorporation of food security and urban agriculture considerations into Action items A-6, CR-4, and CR-3; expanding the scope of T-4 (public transit) beyond just cost; incorporating energy efficiency and energy resilience in B-2 and A-2.
 - New Action: City Leadership 5: Establish Oakland Climate Action Network

➔ **Motion that the Committee writes to Council to support the adoption of the REIA and its recommendations/direction in entirety made by Anne Olivia; Najee seconds**

- *Roll Call: All in favor*

➔ **Motion to send a letter to Council that says to explicitly state creation of public bank in the ECAP made by Najee; Anne Olivia seconds with Amendment to include that Council gives direction to staff to include all of the community priorities that were removed from the ECAP.**

- *A complete roll call vote did not ensue; no vote was held.*
- The Committee discussed its role in prioritizing actions to be included in the ECAP, acknowledged limited City staff capacity to rewrite the Plan, and reaffirmed its commitment to highlighting only the major priorities that the Committee were considered valuable by the community but that the ECAP was unable to incorporate. Brian stressed the importance of focusing the letter on the need for the Port to be held accountable for progress under the ECAP. Committee members agreed.

~~7. **Racial Equity Impact Analysis** 7:15 7:40~~

~~*See Attachment C*~~

8. Next Steps: Discussion 7:50 – 8:00

- Najee recommended that the Committee members show up to the Council meeting. Shayna will send out a link that explains how to join a Council meeting as an attendee. The Committee members interested in writing the letter to Council should get in contact with Najee.

9. Adjourn 8:05

- Meeting adjourned at 8:07 PM.

Dear Mayor Schaaf and Members of the Oakland City Council:

For over a year, the ECAP Ad Hoc Community Advisory Committee has had the pleasure of working with City staff on development of the Equitable Climate Action Plan (ECAP). The City has employed a community-driven process for assessing priorities, and paid particular attention to engaging diverse voices and viewpoints. Particularly noteworthy has been the engagement of the equity facilitator, a group which led meetings across the city, analyzed the ECAP for equity opportunities and impacts, and serves as an example for other jurisdictions. We encourage you to use and meaningfully apply the priorities and feedback you have received through this ECAP development process.

There are a few items to which we wish to call your attention, as we believe they will help the City achieve its goal of an equitable path toward cost-effectively reducing Oakland's local climate emissions a minimum of 56%, transitioning away from fossil fuel dependence, and ensuring that all of Oakland's communities are resilient to the foreseeable impacts of climate change, by 2030. The Ad Hoc Committee recommends the City Council be mindful of the items below as you adopt the ECAP.

The Port of Oakland is capable of making greater contributions. The Ad Hoc Committee appreciates the steps the Port has taken in recent years to reduce its air pollution emissions. There is still significant room for the Port to do more to reduce its emissions of greenhouse gases that have a disproportionate impact on the residents of West Oakland, near the maritime operation, and East Oakland, near the airport. The ECAP recommends two actions for the Port:

- Reduce Emissions from Port Vehicles and Equipment
- Reduce Emissions from Electricity

The Port of Oakland should be one of the bright spots of the ECAP. Zero-emission port equipment and heavy-duty trucks are making some of the fastest-growing advances in clean technology. Zero emission vehicles for ports that are now commercially-available include battery-electric drayage trucks, battery-electric terminal tractors, conversion kits for battery-electric terminal trucks, zero-emission transport refrigeration units, electric forklifts, electric railcar movers, electric mobile and ground power units, and electric mobile shore power cable management systems.

The State of California has funding available to cover the incremental cost of all of these technologies through California CORE and the Hybrid and Zero-Emission Truck and Bus Voucher Incentive Project ("HVIP"). Other ports like the Port of Los Angeles and Port of Long Beach are making good use of the resources available and leaning in to deploy zero-emission trucks and off road equipment.

Furthermore, on June 25, 2020, the California Air Resources Board approved a first-of-a-kind rule requiring that manufacturers of trucks and other port-related vehicles sold in California transition to being zero-emission -- including 100% of drayage trucks being zero-emission by 2035. There is no good reason why an equitable climate plan for Oakland should not at least be following suit with other ports -- and better yet, leading -- and putting Oakland's Port at the forefront.

Create a community bank. A key request in the community meetings and at meetings of the Ad Hoc Committee was for the City to create a public or green bank. We encourage the City to take

action on Action CL-4: Explore Creation of Public or Green Bank, early in the ECAP implementation.

Prioritize establishing the Oakland Climate Action Network. Action CL-5 calls for the City to help residents of the City's frontline communities develop better capacity to engage on climate, sustainability, and equity issues. This is extremely important and we encourage the City to implement this action as soon as possible. The Ad Hoc Committee appreciates the diverse perspectives and expertise from across the City that comprise our group, all with a focus on ensuring that all residents of our City participate in and benefit as we transition to a low-carbon economy. These voices can be amplified and increased through the Oakland Climate Action Network.

The Ad Hoc Committee extends our thanks to the City's sustainability staff for their tireless service, particularly Shayna Hirshfield-Gold. We congratulate the City on adopting, with the modifications recommended above, an innovative ECAP that puts people at the center of the work.

Sincerely,

Najee Amaranth and Nicole Bratton, Co-Chairs
ECAP Ad Hoc Community Advisory Committee