



*Jennifer Renk, Chair*  
*Natalie Sandoval, Vice-Chair*  
*Sahar Shirazi*  
*Maurice Robb*  
*Josie Ahrens*  
*Alex Randolph*  
*Owen Li*

**March 19, 2025**

REGULAR Meeting

**BUSINESS MEETING**

**3:00 PM**

**Via: In-person**

**MEETING CALL TO ORDER :** Chair Renk at 3:00 p.m.

**WELCOME BY THE CHAIR:** Chair Renk

**ROLL CALL:** Haneefah Rasheed

**Commissioners Present:** Renk, Li, Shirazi, Robb, Ahrens, Randolph

**Commissioner(s) Absent:** Sandoval

**Staff Present:** Catherine Payne, Haneefah Rasheed, Christopher Tan, Timothy Green, Alexia Rotberg, Michael Branson, Laura Kaminski, Lakshmi Rajagopalan, Edward Manasse

### COMMISSION BUSINESS

- **Agenda Discussion:** At the March 5, 2025, Planning Commission meeting, the Planning Commissions asked questions regarding the Brooklyn Basin parking and shuttle. However, Secretary Payne erroneously indicated that we would revisit the body with an information report, but in fact, it has to be scheduled prior to providing a response. Secretary Payne stated that it was determined that the questions were factual about how the shuttle was operating and the regulations that were adopted, but she cannot provide analysis or opinion about them. However, she provided facts under Commissions Matters as a result of questions from the body.
  - **Director's Report**
  - **Informational Reports**
  - **Committee Reports**
  - **Commission Matter:** Secretary Payne and Christopher Tan responded to specific questions about Brooklyn Basin from the March 5, 2025, Planning Commission meeting. Formal informational report will be provided in the future.
  - **City Attorney's Report**
- **OPEN FORUM**

At this time members of the public may speak on any item of interest within the Commission’s jurisdiction. At the discretion of the Chair, speakers are generally limited to two minutes or less if there are six (6) or less speakers on an item, and one minute or less if there are more than six (6) speakers.

**Public Speaker(s):** John Klein

**CONSENT CALENDAR**

The Commission will take a single roll call vote on all of the items listed below in this section. The vote will be on approval of the staff report and recommendation in each case. Members of the Commission may request that any item on the Consent Calendar be singled out for separate discussion and vote.

**PUBLIC HEARINGS**

The hearing provides opportunity for all concerned persons to speak; the hearing will normally be closed after all testimony has been heard. If you challenge a Commission decision in court, you will be limited to issues raised at the public hearing or in correspondence delivered to the Planning and Building Department, at, or prior to, the public hearing.

The Commission will then vote on the matter based on the staff report and recommendation. If the Commission does not follow the staff recommendation and no alternate findings for decision have been prepared, then the vote on the matter will be considered a “straw” vote, which essentially is a non-binding vote directing staff to return to the Commission at a later date with appropriate findings for decision and, as applicable, conditions of approval that the Commission will consider in making a final decision.

<b>#1</b>	<b>Location:</b>	<b>Citywide</b>
<b>Assessor’s Parcel Number(s):</b>	N/A	
<b>Proposal:</b>	Amend the following chapters of the Oakland Planning Code (Municipal Code Title 17): (1) Amend Chapter 17.101C (D-BV Broadway Valdez District Commercial Zones) to expand the permitted pedestrian-oriented activities within the District; (2) Amend Chapter 17.95 (S-13 Affordable Housing Combining Zone) to clarify Affordability Thresholds; (3) Amend Chapter 17.96 (S-14 Housing Sites Combining Zone) to revise required Minimum Densities, including to align with base zoning districts, and to expand allowed temporary uses; (4) Amend Chapter 17.101G (D-LM Lake Merritt Station Area District Zones) to permit Artisan Production Commercial Activities; and (5) Make related miscellaneous changes to chapters 17.95, 17.96, 17.101C, and 17.101G.	
<b>Applicant:</b>	City of Oakland, Bureau of Planning	
<b>Contact Person/ Phone Number:</b>	N/A	
<b>Owner:</b>	N/A	
<b>Case File Number:</b>	ZA24018	
<b>Planning Permits Required:</b>	Planning Code Amendment	
<b>General Plan:</b>	Citywide	
	<b>Zoning:</b>	S-13, S-14, D-BV, D-LM
<b>Proposed Environmental Determination:</b>	The proposed amendments to the Planning Code rely on the following California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) findings: (1) a determination that no further environmental review is required following the certified Oakland 2045 General Plan Update - Phase 1 Environmental Impact Report	

	pursuant to Public Resources Code section 21166 and CEQA Guidelines Section 15162 or 15163; (2) a determination that no further environmental review is required following the certified Broadway Valdez District Specific Plan Environmental Impact Report pursuant to Public Resources Code section 21166 and CEQA Guidelines Section 15162 or 15163; (3) a determination that no further environmental review is required following the certified Lake Merritt Station Area Plan Environmental Impact Report pursuant to Public Resources Code section 21166 and CEQA Guidelines Section 15162 or 15163; (4) this proposal is exempt pursuant to CEQA Guidelines section 15183 (projects consistent with General Plan and zoning); and (5) this proposal is exempt pursuant to CEQA Guidelines Sections 15061(b)(3) (general rule, no significant effect on the environment). Each of these findings provide a separate and independent basis for CEQA clearance and when viewed collectively provide an overall basis for CEQA clearance.
<b>Historic Status:</b>	N/A
<b>City Council District:</b>	Citywide
<b>Finality of Decision:</b>	Planning Commission will receive public comment, discuss, and make recommendations to the City Council. Final decision by City Council.
<b>For Further Information:</b>	Contact Case Planner <b>Timothy Green</b> at (510) 238-6436 or by email at <a href="mailto:tgreen@oaklandca.gov">tgreen@oaklandca.gov</a> .

If you wish to be notified on the decision of an agenda item, please contact the case planner for the specific agenda item.

**Case Planner Timothy Green** gave a verbal and visual presentation of the project.

**Strategic Planning Manager Laura Kaminski and Planner Lakshmi Rajagopalan** provided responses to commissioners’ questions.

Commissioners provided questions and comments regarding item.

**Public Speakers:** none

**Motion by Comm. Randolph** to accept the following revision into the record:

1. Amending Title 17 of the Oakland Municipal Code (The Planning Code) to:
  - a. Expand the pedestrian-oriented activities permitted in Chapter 17.101C (D-BV Broadway Valdez District Commercial Zones);
  - b. Clarify the affordability thresholds in Chapter 17.95 (S-13 Affordable Housing Combining Zone);
  - c. Revise the required minimum densities, including to align with base Zoning Districts, and to clarify the definition of Development Project, in Chapter 17.96 (S-14 Housing Sites Combining Zone); and
  - d. Permit Artisan Production Commercial Activities and institute the Central District Entertainment Venue Permit in Chapter 17.101G (D-LM Lake Merritt Station Area District Zones);
2. Amending the Planning Code to incorporate related miscellaneous changes to Chapters 17.95, 17.96, 17.101C, And 17.101G; And
3. Making appropriate California Environmental Quality Act findings.

With the following revision recommended by Planning Commission:  
 In Chapter 17.101G, Table 17.101G.01 strike all references to L24 in the Alcoholic Beverage Sales row and replace each with L17.

**Seconded by Comm. Shirazi**

**Action:** 6 Ayes, 0 Nays

**Motion by Comm. Randolph** to recommend that the City Council conduct a public hearing and upon conclusion end up in ordinance:

1. Amending Title 17 of the Oakland Municipal Code (The Planning Code) to:
  - e. Expand the pedestrian-oriented activities permitted in Chapter 17.101C (D-BV Broadway Valdez District Commercial Zones);
  - f. Clarify the affordability thresholds in Chapter 17.95 (S-13 Affordable Housing Combining Zone);
  - g. Revise the required minimum densities, including to align with base Zoning Districts, and to clarify the definition of Development Project, in Chapter 17.96 (S-14 Housing Sites Combining Zone); and
  - h. Permit Artisan Production Commercial Activities and institute the Central District Entertainment Venue Permit in Chapter 17.101G (D-LM Lake Merritt Station Area District Zones);
2. Amending the Planning Code to incorporate related miscellaneous changes to Chapters 17.95, 17.96, 17.101C, And 17.101G; And
3. Making appropriate California Environmental Quality Act findings.

With the following revision recommended by Planning Commission:  
 In Chapter 17.101G, Table 17.101G.01 strike all references to L24 in the Alcoholic Beverage Sales row and replace each with L17.

**Seconded by Commissioner Robb**

**Action:** 6 Ayes, 0 Nays

<b>#2</b>	<b>Location:</b>	<b>3400 Ettie Street</b>
<b>Assessor's Number(s):</b>	<b>Parcel</b>	007 060701902, 007 060700400, 007 060700500, 007 060700600, 007 060700700
<b>Proposal:</b>	Request for Major Variance and Conditional Use Permit, Regular Design Review, and Tentative Parcel Map (TPM) to allow for the alteration and extension of an existing non-conforming Trucking and Truck-Related Industrial Activity with related off-street parking in the HBX-4 zone; to facilitate the upgrading and expansion of an existing AAA towing operation. Development will include the voluntary merging of twelve (12) legal lots, the demolition of four (4) existing buildings, the construction of a new 15,294 sq. ft. commercial building and redesigned surface parking lot, and sitewide landscaping improvements.	
<b>Applicant:</b>	MSA Architecture + Design	

<b>Contact Person/ Phone Number:</b>	Shawn Anderson, (415) 852-4915
<b>Owner:</b>	Tulloch John F Corp.
<b>Case File Number:</b>	PLN24042, TPM11446
<b>Planning Permits Required:</b>	Tentative Parcel Map (TPM), Regular Design Review (DR), Major Variance and Major Conditional Use Permit (CUP)
<b>General Plan:</b>	Housing and Business Mix
<b>Zoning:</b>	Housing and Business Mix-4 (HBX-4), S-13
<b>Proposed Environmental Determination:</b>	A detailed CEQA Analysis was prepared for this project which concluded that the project is exempt from further review under CEQA Guidelines Section 15302 – Replacement or Reconstruction and CEQA Guidelines Section 15183 – Project Consistent with Existing Community Plan or Zoning. The CEQA Analysis may be reviewed on the City’s website at: <a href="https://www.oaklandca.gov/resources/environmental-review-docs">https://www.oaklandca.gov/resources/environmental-review-docs</a> .
<b>Historic Status:</b>	N/A
<b>City Council District:</b>	3
<b>Finality of Decision:</b>	Appealable to City Council
<b>For Further Information:</b>	<b>Contact Case Planner: Alexia Rotberg, Phone: (510) 418-8534, Email: <a href="mailto:arotberg@oaklandca.gov">arotberg@oaklandca.gov</a></b>

If you wish to be notified on the decision of an agenda item, please contact the case planner for the specific agenda item.

**Case Planner Alexia Rotberg** gave a verbal presentation of the project

**Applicant Jonathan Arban** gave a verbal and visual presentation of the project.

**Applicant Jeff Hanusin** provided responses to commissioners’ questions.

Commissioners provided questions and comments regarding item.

**Public Speakers:** none

**Motion by Comm. Renk** to affirm staff’s environmental determination and approve the design review major conditional use permit and major variance subject to the attached findings and conditions with the following two revisions:

1. The change to condition of approval #52 that should read: washing of trucks may occur on the property, including the property currently owned by the applicant subject to all applicable laws and regulations.
2. Subject to an additional condition of approval that should read: Explore the opportunity for additional lighting on the site on the Hannah Street side of the project and explore additional safety lighting along project frontage on Hannah.

**Seconded by Commissioner Shirazi**

**Action:** 6 Ayes, 0 Nays

## APPEALS

The Commission will take testimony on each appeal. If you challenge a Commission decision in court, you will be limited to issues raised at the public hearing or in correspondence delivered to the Planning and

Building Department, at, or prior to, to the public hearing; provided, however, such issues were previously raised in the appeal itself.

Following the testimony, the Commission will vote on the staff report and recommendation. If the Commission reverses/overturns the staff decision and no alternate findings for decisions have been prepared, then the vote on the matter will be considered a “straw” vote, which essentially is a non-binding vote directing staff to return to the Commission at a later date with appropriate findings for decision and, as applicable, conditions of approval that the Commission will consider in making a final decision. Unless otherwise noted, the decisions in the following matters are final and not administratively appealable. Any party seeking to challenge these decisions in court must do so within ninety (90) days of the date of the announcement of the final decision, pursuant to Code of Civil Procedure section 1094.6, unless a shorter period applies.

- **COMMISSION BUSINESS**

- Approval of Minutes

**Date:** March 5, 2025

**Motion to approve:** Commissioner Ahrens

**Seconded by:** Commissioner Randolph

**Action:** 5 Ayes, 1 Abstained

- Correspondence
- City Council Actions

- **ADJOURNMENT** Chair Renk at 5:03 p.m.



**CATHERINE PAYNE**  
Development Planning Manager  
Planning and Building Department

**NEXT REGULAR MEETING:** April 2, 2025