# **ATTACHMENT G2**

## **Staff Response to Public Comments**

The public comment period for the draft Safety and Environmental Justice Elements was open for 90 days from March 24, 2023 to June 22, 2023. The City received a combined total of over 400 comments from 17 comment letters, community meetings and events, and feedback submitted via Konveio – an engagement platform where community members were invited to add their specific feedback to both documents. Thank you to all those who submitted comments and shared your voice – the City values your time and dedication to making Oakland a healthier and safer place for all.

Comments have been summarized and organized by element and into the following categories support, suggestion, question, concern. Staff responses to all comments are included in the tables below. To view the full comment letters and Konveio feedback see Attachment G1. Comment Letters on Safety and EJ Elements.

## **Table of Contents**

afety Element Comments
Brian Olson, California Geological Survey3
CA Board of Forestry and Fire Protection
Councilmember Kalb-Save The Bay
Save the Bay, West Oakland Environmental Indicators Project, Oakland Climate Action Coalition, Faith in Action East Bay, Roots Community Health Center, Black Cultural Zone, Brotherhood of Elders Network, East Oakland Youth Development Center
Shelley Mitchell
San Francisco Bay Area Planning and Urban Research Association (SPUR)8
Deeply Rooted
Port of Oakland13
nvironmental Justice Element Comments
Bay Area Air Quality Management District (BAAQMD)15
Beth Teper
Councilmember Kalb – Save the Bay
Frontline Catalysts Youth Leaders
Hannah Germonprez
HOPE Collaborative, The Greenlining Institute, Mycelium Youth Network, Communities for a Better Environment, Homies Empowerment, Oakland Climate Action Coalition, East Oakland Neighborhoods Initiative
Margie Lewis
Oakland Arts Commission
Port of Oakland23

Ryder Diaz	
Save the Bay, West Oakland Environmental Indicators Project, Oakland Climate Action Coal East Bay, Roots Community Health Center, Black Cultural Zone, Brotherhood of Elders Netw Development Center	ork, East Oakland Youth
Sharifa Taylor	27
Shelley Mitchell	
San Francisco Bay Area Planning and Urban Research Association (SPUR)	
West Oakland Community Action Plan (WOCAP) Steering Committee	
Deeply Rooted	
Gustavo Getierrez	
Michael Belman	
Mycelium Youth Network's Youth Leadership Council	
Yuli Martin	

## **Safety Element Comments**

Name/Organization /Agency/Meeting	Summarized Comment	Response to Comment
Brian Olson, California Geological Survey	<ol> <li>Suggestions:         <ol> <li>The City should supplement the Liquefaction and Landside Hazards section with a discussion of Earthquake Zones of Required Investigation (EZRI) for liquefaction and consider providing a map of these zones</li> <li>The discussion of earthquake probability should be updated using the third Uniform California Earthquake Rupture Forecast (UCERF3). Consider referring readers to the CGS website for a map that is continually updated</li> <li>The City should also discuss that some areas may be within a Tsunami Design Zone determined by the California Building Code (CBC)</li> </ol> </li> </ol>	Comments noted. Chapter 2 language has been updated (see page 2-1,2-2, and 2-22)
CA Board of Forestry and Fire Protection	<ol> <li>Suggestions:         <ol> <li>Add language to reference the most current CAL FIRE FRAP Maps.</li> <li>Change the legend and colors on the map on Figure SAF-3 to match the Local Hazard Mitigation Plan Figure 15-2 map</li> <li>Include a map that shows land uses for the VHFHSZ and SRA</li> <li>Add references and links to other Planning Documents if the City has them. Add language to meet AB 2140 requirements</li> <li>In the Emergency Evacuation Section on page 4-5, add language to include evacuations under a "range of emergency scenarios". Add language to collaborate with other City Officials upon the next update to the LHMP to ensure AB 747 requirements are met within the LHMP</li> <li>Add language that states "local ordinance require development standards that meet or exceed title 14, CCR, division 1.5, chapter 7, subchapter 2, articles 1-5 (commencing with section 1270) (SRA Fire Safe Regulations) and title 14, CCR, division 1.5, chapter 3, article 3 (commencing with section 1299.01) (Fire Hazard Reduction Around Buildings and Structures Regulations) for SRAs and/or VHFHSZs"</li> </ol> </li> </ol>	<ol> <li>Language has been updated to reference the most current CAL FIRE FRAP maps (see page 2-6)</li> <li>Figure SAF-3a has been updated (see page 2- 8)</li> <li>A new map has been added Figure SAF-3b (see page 2-9)</li> <li>Language has been updated to reference the City's Emergency Operations Plan and to meet AB 2140 requirements (see page 1-3)</li> <li>Emergency Evacuation Section has been updated (see page 4-7)</li> <li>Links to the City's Legistar and language has been added (see page 2-11)</li> <li>New Action SAF-A.13 has been added and language has been updated on page 2-11</li> <li>SAF-2.3 has been updated (see page 2-13 and 5-3)</li> <li>Fire Safe Regulations have been added to SAF-A.8 (see page 5-2)</li> </ol>
	VHFHSZ 9. Add Fire Safe Regulations to SAF-A.8 and to the Fire Safe Development Codes	SAF-A.8 (see page 5-2) 10. SAF-A.48 has been updated (see page 5-11) 11. SAF-2.3 has been updated (see page 5-3)

Name/Organization /Agency/Meeting	Summarized Comment	Response to Comment
	<ol> <li>Add a policy to re-evaluate development after a large fire</li> <li>Add the following components to SAF-2.3 – risk analysis, fire response capabilities, fire safety, mitigation measures and design considerations for non-conforming fuel modification, and wildfire education maintenance and limitations and add language to ensure access and egress are designed with the Fire Safe Regulations as the minimum standard</li> <li>Add language to address long term maintenance of fire hazard reduction products, including fire breaks. Add language to SAF-A.31 to include private and public roads</li> <li>Create a policy for minimum standards for evacuation of residential areas in the VHFHSZ</li> <li>Add a map that shows areas with current inadequate access/ evacuation routes</li> <li>Create a policy or goal to create programs promoting public outreach about defensible space or evacuation routes and specific plans to reach at-risk populations</li> <li>Create a policy to ensure all new development has adequate fire protection</li> <li>Add a clear and direct policy or goal to maintain vegetation clearance on public and private roads</li> <li>The Fire Safe Development Codes section should clearly mention street addressing and clarify what the standards are</li> <li>Add language about community fire breaks and maintenance and about working with local Fire Safe Councils and other Community Organizations</li> <li>Identify areas lacking service. If there are no areas lacking service, this needs to be stated</li> <li>What is the CORE Program?</li> <li>SAF-A.30 references SAF-11, is it supposed to be SAF-13a?</li> <li>What is LUTE? If this is a plan, it should be referenced within the SE</li> </ol>	<ol> <li>SAF-A.31 has been updated (see page 5-8)</li> <li>New policy SAF-A.34 has been added (see page 5-9)</li> <li>SAF-A.33 has been updated to reference Figure SAF-13a (see page 5-9)</li> <li>SAF-2.5 has been updated (see page 5-3)</li> <li>SAF-A.8 has been updated (see page 5-2)</li> <li>New policy SAF-8.6 has been added (see page 5-9)</li> <li>The Fire Safe Development Codes section has been revised (see page 2-3 and 5-13) and a new bullet has been added to SAF-2.3 (see page 5-3)</li> <li>SAF-2.3 has been updated (see page 5-3)</li> <li>SAF-2.3 has been updated (see page 5-3)</li> <li>There are no areas lacking services, Chapter 4 has been updated with this language (see page 4-1)</li> <li>Added language on the Communities of Oakland Respond to Emergencies (CORE) Program and Community Emergency Response Training (CERT) Program (see page 4-5)</li> <li>Yes, SAF-A.30 has been updated to reference Figure SAF-13a (see page 5-9)</li> <li>Land Use and Transportation Element (LUTE), the narrative has been updated with the full spell out and a definition (see page 1-4)</li> </ol>
Councilmember Kalb- Save The Bay	Suggestions:         1. Provide access to personal and indoor air filters for residents of EJ communities to protect against impacts of wildfire smoke, as these	<ol> <li>New Action SAF-A.12 has been added (see page 5-3)</li> </ol>

Name/Organization /Agency/Meeting	Summarized Comment	Response to Comment
	<ul> <li>communities are already disproportionately exposed to industrial and mobile pollution</li> <li>Create a new action to develop an incentive program, such as a certification, for homeowners who go beyond minimum building codes and standards that can help reduce insurance costs.</li> <li>Add a new action to develop a funding, prioritization, and implementation plan for GSI for flood resilience, including long-term maintenance.</li> <li>Identify and plan for the risk of groundwater rise and the associated pollution and public health risk due to the inundation of improperly cleaned up toxic sites.</li> <li>Update SAF-4.3 to include identifying and requiring appropriate setbacks from creeks and shoreline areas to allow for intermittent flood surges. Ensure setbacks align with the City's Priority Conservation and Development Areas when possible. Plan for 3.5 ft of SLR by 2050 in alignment with state guidance.</li> <li>Require mitigation to prioritize nature-based adaptation and design elements wherever possible to promote the multiple benefits of flood protection, habitat restoration, and equitable recreational access, update SAF-4.4 to include this.</li> <li>Update SAF-5.2 to ensure toxic materials removed as part of cleanup efforts are disposed of in the least harmful manner so that the impact is not shifted from one vulnerable community to another.</li> </ul>	<ol> <li>Comment noted. The City cannot guarantee a reduction in insurance costs.</li> <li>Comment noted. Please check out <u>Oakland's</u> <u>Green Stormwater Infrastructure Plan</u> for more details</li> <li>New Action SAF-A.19 and new Policy SAF-4.4 have been added (see page 5-5). Additionally, updates have been made to SAF-4.1 (see page 2-34)</li> <li>Comment noted. SAF-4.3 includes setbacks and addresses this (see page 5-5)</li> <li>Comment noted. See SAF-A.20. Additionally, regional and citywide community engagement will likely reveal that SLR mitigation strategies should prioritize nature-based adaptation and design elements wherever possible.</li> <li>SAF-5.2 has been updated (see page 5-6)</li> </ol>
Save the Bay, West Oakland Environmental Indicators Project, Oakland Climate Action Coalition, Faith in Action East Bay, Roots Community Health Center, Black Cultural	<ol> <li>Suggestions:         <ol> <li>Related to SAF-A.12, we encourage the City to continue pursuing the 2017 Preliminary Sea Level Rise Road Map's goal of "leveraging Measure AA funding for wetland restoration"</li> <li>Prioritize utilizing greenbelts as a nature-based solution and risk reduction strategy for wildfires. Enhance greenbelts at strategic locations and identify appropriate locations for new greenbelts - especially in EJ communities.</li> <li>Additional indigenous forest treatment examples should be added to SAF-2.2</li> </ol> </li> </ol>	<ol> <li>SAF-A.12 has been updated (see page 5-3)</li> <li>A new bullet has been added to SAF-2.2 (see page 2-13 and 5-2)</li> <li>The first bullet under SAF-2.2 has been updated (see page 2-13 and 5-2)</li> <li>The fifth bullet under SAF-2.3 has been updated (see page 2-14 and 5-3)</li> <li>SAF-2.7 has been updated (see page 2-13 and 5-4)</li> </ol>

Name/Organization /Agency/Meeting	Summarized Comment	Response to Comment
Zone, Brotherhood of Elders Network, East Oakland Youth Development Center	<ol> <li>Include additional wildfire resilience solutions including high-density infill development and greenbelts.</li> <li>Address exposure to wildfire smoke, especially for BIPOC and EJ communities who are already disproportionately exposed to industrial and mobile pollution. The City should fund access to personal and indoor air filters for residents of EJ communities</li> <li>Nature-based design elements should be prioritized wherever possible to achieve multiple benefits</li> <li>Adopt or renew local policies that maintain space between cities to contain growth, prevent sprawl, and reduce wildfire risk</li> <li>Explore feasibility of a new Community Wildfire Resilience Zone around communities in high fire risk areas</li> <li>We recommend that the City focus new development and redevelopment in less vulnerable areas near transit and jobs to increase climate resilience and reduce climate emissions. In developed areas where sea level rise and extreme storms will bring intermittent flooding, resilient building standards should be applied consistently to minimize social and economic disruption from flooding</li> <li>Vegetation that has relatively high water content in vegetated areas serving as greenbelts or wildfire buffers to avoid ignition.</li> <li>Create a new action to develop an incentive program, such as a certification, for homeowners who go beyond minimum building codes and standards that can help reduce insurance costs</li> <li>Update SAF-4.3 to include identifying and requiring appropriate setbacks from creeks and shoreline areas to allow for intermittent flood surges. Ensure setbacks align with the City's Priority Conservation and Development Areas when possible. Plan for 3.5 ft of SLR by 2050 in alignment with state guidance</li> <li>Identify and adopt new standards to mitigate the risk of building damage due to increased liquefaction risk in areas susceptible to groundwater intrusion</li> </ol>	<ol> <li>SAF-4.3 has been updated (see page 2-24 and 5-5)</li> <li>Comment noted. This will be explored in Phase 2 of the General Plan as part of the Land Use and Transportation Element</li> <li>Comment noted, thank you.</li> <li>Comment noted. This will be addressed in Phase 2 of the General Plan as part of the Land Use and Transportation Element</li> <li>This is already included in SAF-2.3</li> <li>Comment noted. The City cannot guarantee a reduction in insurance costs</li> <li>Comment noted. This is outside of the scope of the Environmental Justice Element and would require updates to the building code</li> <li>Comment noted. This is outside of the scope of the Environmental Justice Element and would require updates to the building code</li> <li>SAF-5.2 has been updated (see page 5-6)</li> <li>See updates to SAF-4.1 (page 2-34 and 5-5). Additionally, see new policy SAF-4.4 (page 5-5)</li> <li>Comment noted, thank you</li> </ol>

Name/Organization /Agency/Meeting	Summarized Comment	Response to Comment
	<ul> <li>14. Require the use of flood resistant materials and building practices for new construction in areas of shoreline and inland flood risk from projected sea level rise and increased storm intensity</li> <li>15. Update SAF-5.2 to ensure toxic materials removed as part of cleanup efforts are disposed of in the least harmful manner so that the impact is not shifted from one vulnerable community to another</li> <li>16. Identify and plan for the risk of groundwater rise and the associated pollution and public health risk due to the inundation of improperly cleaned up toxic sites. New housing should not be approved or built on or near hazardous sites in flood-prone areas before cleanup has been completed and ensure Figure SAF-8) aligns with UC Berkeley's Toxic Tides mapping project.</li> <li>Support:</li> <li>17. We appreciate SAF-A.12's focus on ecologically sensitive solutions to flooding and look forward to being a partner in implementation</li> <li>18. We support SAF-2.2's goal of "contract[ing] with Indigenous groups with expertise in using cultural burning and other traditional ecological management and fire suppression techniques</li> <li>19. We strongly support SAF-3.5 and appreciate the incorporation of our feedback around GSI</li> <li>20. We support the comprehensive approach to sea level rise, including its emphasis on community partnerships (SAF-4.1), "use of best available science about projected sea level rise" (SAF-4.2), and focus on regional coordination (SAF-4.6).</li> <li>21. We support the policies around minimizing the risk of wildfire to new and existing developments.</li> </ul>	
Shelley Mitchell	Concern: 1. Table EJ-1, these are very general ideas for safety. I would like to see a focus on Mental Health Awareness and getting young people into programs that will help them address their mental health aiding to the future safety of Oaklanders.	1. New Policies EJ-8.12 and SAF-7.3 and new Action EJ-A.39 have been added (see EJ Element pages 9-15 and 9-16 and Safety Element page 5-8)

Name/Organization /Agency/Meeting	Summarized Comment		Response to Comment
San Francisco Bay	Suggestions:	1.	New action SAF-A.20 has been added (see
Area Planning and	1. Update Flooding/Sea Level Rise policies based on new groundwater		page 5-5)
Urban Research	research	2.	Section 2.2 Urban Fires has been updated
Association (SPUR)	2. Section 2.2 Urban Fire should describe how the Ghost Ship Warehouse		(see page 2-7)
	Fire impacted the Oakland community and how the City has taken	3.	SAF-A.48 has been updated (see page 5-11)
	action and will continue to learn about urban fires and build safety from		SAF-A.6 has been updated (see page 5-2)
	this tragic event		SAF-A.49 has been updated (see page 5-11)
	3. Update the Disaster Recovery Plan and include how equity priority		Comment noted, thank you.
	communities will be supported through the recovery process. Consider		Comment noted, thank you.
	emergency sheltering and short-term interim housing in the updated	1.	comment noted, thank you.
	recovery plan		
	4. Commit to specific language and actions around reducing structural		
	hazards from new and existing buildings		
	5. Add a new policy on installing gas shut-off valves in existing buildings at		
	time of sale, transfer of title, and when upgrades are planned for to gas		
	pipes.		
	6. Strengthen emergency preparedness policies to include day-to-day		
	wellness and health benefits for the community		
	Concern:		
	7. The Safety and Environmental Justice Element need to be more closely		
	coordinated		
Deeply Rooted	Suggestions:	1.	Comment noted. The City is not able to
	1. Add a new policy/action item to discourage accumulations of waste that		monitor waste accumulation inside private
	are susceptible to fires at home. Residents and especially people who		homes. Please see SAF-2.1 which focuses on
	have experienced incarceration should be involved to educate people		programs that seek to reduce the risk of
	on strategies to reduce fires		structural fires; however, determining leaders
	2. Add a new policy/action to ensure that people are not displaced due to		of these programs is outside the scope of the
	code enforcement. Align it with the proactive rental inspection, but		EJ Element
	ensure it goes beyond rental properties.	2.	Comment noted. See Action 2.1.3: Conduct
	3. Describe the implementation plan (timeline, objectives) for		Proactive Rental Inspections in the 2023-2031
	accountability and tracking of Safety actions and policies		Housing Element
	4. CBO's the city collaborates with during implementation will be	3.	Comment noted. After the adoption of the
	constantly evolving		Safety Element, staff will work on an

Name/Organization /Agency/Meeting	Summarized Comment	Response to Comment
	<ol> <li>Add a spreadsheet as an appendix, listing all the neighborhoods with details on issues, cost for cleanup, preventions and infrastructure needed</li> <li>Add language under SAF-5.1 to enforce regulation on refineries and concrete companies in the City</li> <li>Allow commercial vehicles and large trucks on Highway 580 in order to decrease pollution on the 880 and on flatlands roads and follow Caltrans research and engagement on removing Interstate 980 when determining feasibility and outcomes</li> <li>Add language to SAF-5.5 to use mycelium as a bioremediation technique to remove contamination from water resources</li> <li>Add new policy to create community education that explains the enforcement process, agencies and/or departments responsible, and their contact information.</li> <li>Add language under all policies/actions on enforcement (responsible departments/agencies)</li> <li>Add language under policy SAF-2.6 to require PG&amp;E to update their infrastructure and ensure that customers are not cost burdened</li> <li>Include additional recommendations to reimagine public safety examples include creating a civilian community ambassadors program, establishing a restorative justice web of support, hiring local Black and Brown residents to transform unused surplus land and vacant lots into safe spaces for community-led space activation, and more.</li> <li>Add language under policy SAF-8.9 to expand training programs and community education of resilience hubs</li> <li>Add language to create evacuation strategies for all particularly low-income people, the unhoused, and people living in houseboats</li> </ol>	<ul> <li>implementation plan identifying objectives, timelines, milestones, metrics, reporting etc.</li> <li>4. Comment noted, thank you. The City agrees</li> <li>5. Comment noted. This is outside the scope of the Safety Element</li> <li>6. SAF-5.1 has been updated (see page 5-6)</li> <li>7. This related to EJ-7.11 which has been updated (see page 9-13)</li> <li>8. SAF-5.5 has been updated (see page 5-7)</li> <li>9. New policy SAF-A.29 has been added (see page 5-7)</li> <li>10. The Planning and Building Department will be responsible</li> <li>11. Language has been updated on page 3-6</li> <li>12. SAF-2.6 has been updated (see page 2-13 and 5-3)</li> <li>13. New action SAF-A.33 has been added (see page 5-8)</li> <li>14. SAF-8.20 has been updated (see page 4-16 and 5-11)</li> <li>15. SAF-8.10 has been updated (see page 4-16 and 5-10)</li> <li>16. SAF-8.18 has been updated (see page 3-14 and 5-8). The General Plan does not control the City's budget and is unable to instruct funding redirections</li> <li>18. Comment noted, thank you. The City will continue to build out program details throughout implementation</li> <li>19. Comment noted. The City is not legally able to recommend specific architects, engineers or</li> </ul>

Name/Organization /Agency/Meeting	Summarized Comment	Response to Comment
	<ol> <li>Add language to SAF-7.1 to increase funding and support for community-based violence prevention programs and protect these programs and CBO's from budget cuts. Reallocate funding increases that OPD is receiving to community partners and resources and ensure that collaboration with the community is ongoing.</li> <li>Add language in SAF-1.2 Structural Hazards on specifics of the programs</li> <li>Add language under action SAF-A.6, regarding assistance to retrofit old residential buildings that are grandfathered in. Include minority contractors in the list for retrofitting contractors. City should provide subsidies if residents hire minority contractors.</li> <li>Add a new policy/action requiring new developments to use electricity rather than gas to mitigate gas-related hazards.</li> <li>Update SAF-A.36 to create at least 8 resilience hubs within East Oakland and add language to ensure that designated resilience hubs are seismically retrofitted</li> <li>Equip public schools, other public facilities, and decentralized facilities to serve as resilience hubs in case of disasters</li> <li>Add a new policy under Goal 7 that utilizes and maps vacant lands/parks as relief sites in certain disasters, displaced residents could access charging stations, counseling, and other basic needs at these locations</li> <li>Add language to SAF-8.10 to host a series of emergency preparedness work</li> <li>Add language to SAF-8.10 to host a series of emergency preparedness workshops that include the voices of residents who have survived past disasters, especially unhoused people who have extensive experience living outside of physical housing. Translate all the emergency related material for non-English speakers</li> <li>For Goal 8, ensure a variety of communities are engaged to appropriately address different adversities</li> <li>Conduct regular emergency preparedness drills and provide families with natural disaster plans and free emergency kits. Introduce neighborhood/block kits</li></ol>	<ul> <li>contractors. (Soft Story Retrofits FAQ www.oaklandca.gov/resources/ssretrofit-fa- gs)</li> <li>20. Comment noted. Please refer to <u>Oakland's</u> <u>Building Electrification Plan</u> for more details</li> <li>21. Comment noted, thank you. The <u>2030</u> <u>Equitable Climate Action Plan</u> includes the development of at least three Resilience Hubs by 2030, two of which (those serving West Oakland and East Oakland) will be located in areas at risk of flood hazards.</li> <li>22. Comment noted, thank you. See A-1 of the <u>2030 Equitable Climate Action Plan</u> which focuses on funding the creation and operation of resilience hubs</li> <li>23. Comment noted, thank you. This will be explored as part of the Land Use and Transportation Element in Phase 2 of the General Plan</li> <li>24. Comment noted, thank you. The City will continue to engage Oakland residents with lived experience throughout Element implementation. Additionally, EJ-8.10 covers translation of materials</li> <li>26. Comment noted, thank you. The City will continue to engage Oakland residents with lived experience throughout Element implementation.</li> <li>27. Comment noted, thank you.</li> <li>28. Comment noted, thank you.</li> </ul>

Name/Organization /Agency/Meeting	Summarized Comment	Response to Comment
	<ol> <li>Add language to SAF-4.1 on mapping sump pumps in all neighborhoods and ensure this information is transparent and publicly accessible</li> <li>Add a new policy/action under Goal 4 to include studies related to contaminated soil and sea level rise and explore using hemp to clean up contaminated soil</li> <li>Add language to SAF-4.3 to emphasize urgency of sea level rise and the need for guidelines</li> <li>Add a new policy/action under Goal 4 to establish a fund to respond to immediate needs of frontline communities and create a system for donations to be distributed directly and immediately to people impacted by disasters</li> <li>Add a policy/action under Goal 4 to remove bans on rainwater catchment and create a program for outreach and education of safe practices of rainwater catchment</li> <li>Prioritize flood mitigation strategies in West Oakland</li> <li>Add a new action under Goal 3 to maintain storm drains during heavy rains</li> <li>Add a new policy/action to Goal 3 to add training and education on sinkhole awareness and hazards caused by airport operations</li> <li>Add a new policy/action that gives priority to local residents when hiring for jobs that are created by the expansion of the Oakland airport</li> <li>Add a new policy/action that gives priority to local residents when hiring for jobs that are created by the expansion of the Oakland airport</li> <li>Add a new policy/action that gives priority to local residents when hiring for jobs that are created by the expansion of the Oakland airport</li> <li>Add a new policy/action to mitigate noise impacts from proximity to the airport</li> <li>Related to Safety Goal 7, the following updates are recommended a. Updated the Context Section to include stronger language around need for equity, using public health data, and inclusion of vulnerable populations in decisions and outcomes</li> </ol>	<ol> <li>29. Comment noted. Goal 4 policies/actions address sea level rise and Goal 5 policies/actions address contaminated soil</li> <li>30. Comment noted, thank you. Goal 4 addresses the urgency of sea level rise. Guidelines will be created as part of the updated <u>Sea Level</u> <u>Rise Roadmap</u></li> <li>31. Comment noted, thank you</li> <li>32. Comment noted, thank you.</li> <li>33. Comment noted, thank you. Identifying specific locations for mitigation strategies is too specific for the Safety Element. Flood mitigation strategies and additional details are included in Chapter 10 of Oakland's Local <u>Hazard Mitigation Plan</u></li> <li>34. Comment noted, thank you. The City will continue to explore and implement innovate community engagement practices. We invite your recommendations on how to expand and improve our practices</li> <li>35. Comment noted. This is included in Chapter 20 of Oakland's Local Hazard Mitigation Plan</li> <li>36. Comment noted, thank you. The City will continue to explore and expand topics the community should be educated on</li> <li>37. Comment noted, thank you.</li> <li>38. The City cannot legally mandate those kinds of local hire requirements.</li> <li>39. Comment noted, thank you. This will be addressed in the Noise Element in Phase 2 of</li> </ol>

Name/Organization /Agency/Meeting	Summarized Comment	Response to Comment
c. d. e. f. g. j. k. i.	reference policies from the Housing element to ensure affordable housing projects are serving low-income residents. Add language to SAF-7.1 to increase funding and support for community-based violence prevention programs. Additionally, protect these programs and CBO's from budget cuts. Reallocate funding increases that OPD is receiving to community partners and resources. Ensure that collaboration with the community is ongoing. Provide free and accessible "Know Your Rights" workshops in all neighborhoods Add a new policy/action to create programs for youth and adult transitional adult programs to increase incarceration diversion efforts Create a program to organize free self defense classes Guarantee housing for all people undergoing mental health issues Increase animal protection policies Regulate against tinted windows in cars	<ul> <li>the General Plan. This comment will be carried over.</li> <li>40. Comment noted, thank you. The City appreciates suggestions 40a-q and will carry them over to inform future public safety conversations.</li> <li>41. Comment noted, thank you.</li> <li>42. Comment noted, thank you.</li> <li>43. Comment noted, thank you. This will be explored as part of the Land Use and Transportation Element in Phase 2 of the General Plan</li> <li>44. Comment noted, thank you.</li> <li>45. Comment noted, thank you.</li> <li>46. Comment noted, thank you.</li> <li>47. Comment noted, thank you. The 2023-2031 Housing Element includes Goals, Policies, and Actions addressing homelessness</li> <li>47. Comment noted, thank you. Both the EJ and Safety Elements strive to address these concerns. Each Element provides specific goals, policies, and actions.</li> </ul>

Name/Organization /Agency/Meeting	Summarized Comment		Response to Comment
	p. Mandate a ban on guns or implement gun prevention laws		
	q. Create neighborhood-based watch patrols in all neighborhoods		
	41. Add language to SAF-1.2 to create a pre-project assessment and		
	approval process for buildings in hazardous zones.		
	42. Create a program to educate residents on the science behind		
	skyscrapers, and the status of constructing soft-story structures		
	43. Add a new action under Goal 1 to clarify Earthquake safe development		
	requirements such as setbacks, freeway entrances, buffer zones as part		
	of LUTE. Specify high risk zones such as West Oakland.		
	44. Add a policy/action under Goal 1 to create a program to engage		
	architects/planners/engineers to educate residents on Earthquake safe		
	construction.		
	45. Conduct a feasibility study on tearing down 580		
	46. Create a new policy/action under Goal 1 that caters to the specific		
	needs of unhoused people. Provide resources such as encampment		
	improvements and creating more housing for unhoused people		
	47. Add a new policy/action to repair and maintain infrastructure and		
	maintain emergency exit routes free of potholes. Regulations should be		
	through permitting, business licenses, and regular checks.		
	Concerns:		
	48. The community is concerned about affordable housing, wellbeing, job		
	stability, access to affordable healthy food, social connections,		
	neighborhood resilience, and access to physical activity.		
Port of Oakland	Suggestions:		Comment noted. See RTC/FEIR
	1. The Port's Draft EIR comments apply to section 3.2, therefore the Port is		Comment noted, thank you.
	re-submitting the 3 Draft EIR comments	3.	Comment noted. Heights have been
	2. Work with Alameda County Community Development Agency and with		decreased in the area near Hegenberger
	the Port of Oakland to ensure consistency with the ALUCP and the City's		Road, Doolittle Drive, and along Hegenberger
	various planning documents, zoning ordinance, and land-use		Drive and comply with Federal and State standards
	<ul><li>development proposals near the Airport</li><li>3. Decrease the maximum building height in the southernmost end of</li></ul>		statiualus
	Hengenberger Road to avoid impacting Airport regulations		

Name/Organization /Agency/Meeting	Summarized Comment	Response to Comment
	<ol> <li>Related to Overflight Notifications and real estate disclosures a buyer notification plan should be implemented so buyers are well informed of the overflights and associated noise prior to purchase. A deed notice on any parcel map, tentative map, or final map should be recorded with the Alameda County Clerk-Recorder stating that areas with the AIA are subject to overflights by aircraft using the Airport.</li> <li>Building design should contain upgraded windows and doors with sound proofing and sound dampening to reduce outdoor aircraft noise levels</li> <li>Regulate land uses within designated airport safety zones, height referral areas, and noise compatibility zones to minimize the possibility of future noise conflicts and accident hazards. Additionally, land should be developed with a variety of uses that benefit from being in close proximity to the seaport and airport.</li> </ol>	<ol> <li>Comment noted, thank you. This will be addressed in the Noise Element in Phase 2 of the General Plan</li> <li>Comment noted, thank you. This will be addressed in the Noise Element in Phase 2 of the General Plan</li> <li>Comment noted. Staff have reduced the heights in the area near Hegenberger Road and Doolittle Drive, and along Hegenberger Drive, per the Port of Oakland's request, to avoid impacts to Oakland Airport and comply with Federal and State standards. As part of the LUTE update in Phase 2 General Plan Update process, the City will evaluate residential/industrial conflicts especially in areas such as West and East Oakland, and evaluate measures, including limiting additional residential development in high pollution areas, and ensuring adequate buffering per latest USEPA standards, between industrial and residential land uses through land use designations</li> </ol>

#### **Environmental Justice Element Comments**

Name/Organization /Agency/Meeting	Summarized Comment	Response to Comment
Bay Area Air Quality Management District (BAAQMD)	<ul> <li>Suggestions: <ol> <li>Strengthen development review, agreement conditions, and policies limiting nonconforming continuances</li> <li>Define "adequately" buffered</li> <li>Consider adding specific example measures to address truck attracting businesses</li> <li>Consider requiring higher level air filtration systems, e.g. MERV 15 or 16, for any new residential buildings within 1,000 feet of major industrial areas or heavily truck-trafficked roadways</li> <li>Update EJ-1.9 to include truck-attracting businesses and create a new policy that requires new truck-attracting businesses to provide EV charging</li> <li>EJ-4.5 Improve Indoor Air Quality in Existing Buildings, should also apply to schools</li> <li>Locate "Air Centers" and "Resiliency Hubs" in public facilities that are accessible to frontline communities</li> <li>Prioritize investments to support active transit uses in EJ communities especially where there are existent grey infrastructure and other barriers to realizing "complete neighborhoods."</li> <li>See the City's adopted 2015 Priority Conservation Area map which suggest "corridor" areas for focused urban canopies and designated "green zones" in EJ communities</li> <li>Include a focus on "just transition" and "clean energy" career workforce opportunities</li> <li>Related to EJ A.11, consider including these as appropriate CEQA project mitigations and community benefit agreement actions</li> <li>Review the <u>Air District's Fugitive Dust White Paper</u></li> <li>Develop land use and infrastructure plans with frontline neighborhood groups and empowerment councils</li> </ol></li></ul>	<ol> <li>The City is implementing Action EJ-A.1 Amend the City's Zoning Code to strengthen policies limiting non-conforming uses - As recommended in the WOCAP, the proposed Phase 1 Planning Code Amendments contain important updates to nonconforming uses and conditionally permitted truck related businesses that will help with transitioning these businesses located near schools and homes to more compatible uses. Amendments to Section 17.103.065 focus on responsibly managing the impacts of heavy-duty trucks. The proposed new conditional use permit requirement and specific criteria and performance standards gives the City authority to review potential impacts related to new industrial businesses and provides objective criteria to evaluate the applicant's plans for truck management. Amendments to Section 17.114.050 related to Nonconforming uses are also included as part of Phase 1 GPU Planning Code Text Amendments. See also EJ-A.7 and EJ-A.8 on page 9-3.</li> <li>EJ-A.1 has been updated to a 600-foot buffer or whatever the minimum is required by state law (see page 9-2)</li> <li>This is covered in EJ-1.7 (see page 9-2)</li> <li>EJ-1.8 has been updated (see page 9-2)</li> <li>EJ-1.9 has been updated and new Actions EJ- A.11 and EJ-A.12 have been added (see page 9-2)</li> </ol>

needs for Neighborhood Air Action Zones "NAAZ"16. Update EJ-A.3 to include AB617 designated communities7.17. Strengthen language of EJ-A.5 to include implementation of a pilot study8.18. Strengthen language of EJ-A.6 to include areas along heavily traveled truck9.corridors and freeways and reference to the City's Priority Conservation10.Area/Sustainable Communities Plan11.19. Refer to the Air District's proposed industrial-residential interface overlay11.zone "IRIZ" policies and the similar approach for addressing12.	<ul> <li>Schools are included in EJ-6.4 (see page 9-11), EJ Goal 4 specifically relates to housing</li> <li>EJ-6.1 has been updated (see page 9-11)</li> <li>EJ-A.29 has been updated (see page 9-12)</li> <li>Comment noted, thank you.</li> <li>EJ-9.6 Labor Force Skills Development has been updated</li> </ul>
partnership21. Add a new policy that instructs the City to work with Caltrans and other regional/state/federal agencies to promote the greening of Oakland's primary goods-movement freeways22. Add a new policy that supports the development of an urban greening network in EJ communities that are currently lacking green space and outdoor activities23. Add a new policy that supports community-based stewardship models as part of urban greening capital project budgets and encourages partnerships with regional partners24. Related to EJ-A.1 change "businesses" to "uses" for clarity25. Policies should avoid land use conflicts between heavy industrial and 	<ol> <li>Comment noted, thank you</li> <li>EJ-A.16 has been updated</li> <li>Comment noted, thank you</li> <li>Comment noted. The update of the Land Use and Transportation Element will include a robust community engagement process that centers marginalized communities and involves neighborhood associations and community-based organizations.</li> <li>Comment noted, thank you</li> <li>EJ-A.3 has been updated</li> <li>EJ-A.5 has been updated</li> <li>EJ-A.6 has been updated</li> <li>Comment noted. We support the Air District's creation of such an overlay zone.</li> <li>EJ-A.8 has been updated</li> <li>New Action EJ-A.12 has been added (see page 9-4)</li> <li>New Action EJ-A.33 has been added (see page 9-13)</li> <li>Added to the first bullet on page 9-6</li> <li>EJ-A.1 has been updated (see page 9-2)</li> <li>Comment noted. Policies highlight this under Goal 1</li> <li>Comment noted, thank you</li> </ol>

Name/Organization /Agency/Meeting	Summarized Comment	Response to Comment
		<ul> <li>28. Maps have been updated</li> <li>29. Map has been updated</li> <li>30. Comment noted, thank you. This will be explored as part of the Phase 2 Zoning</li> <li>Amendments – your comment will be carried over.</li> </ul>
Beth Teper	<ul> <li>Suggestion:</li> <li>1. In Table AA-1, include Columbia Gardens as a neighborhood part of Brookfield Village/Hegenberger</li> </ul>	1. Census tract 4090 includes Columbia Gardens.
Councilmember Kalb – Save the Bay	<ol> <li>Suggestions:         <ol> <li>In EJ-1.3 prioritize nature-based mitigation solutions wherever feasible and align with other greening opportunities for multiple benefits</li> <li>Ensure EJ-1.17 includes green stormwater infrastructure for flood management</li> <li>Add details to EJ-2.4 to ensure green stormwater infrastructure elements are included in projects where feasible, uplift multi-benefit solutions, and GSI investments are prioritized in areas that are park poor, low-income, high urban heat index, and at risk of flooding.</li> <li>Update EJ-A.4 to include green jobs related to stormwater infrastructure maintenance and management and establish a program for both voluntary and compliance GHG mitigation fees to be invested locally and fund the Incubator</li> <li>Protect and restore natural floodplains along riparian areas to reduce flood risk, keeping new development out of 100-year flood zones.</li> <li>Add language on pg. 9-5 requiring major development and redevelopment projects to construct and maintain urban greening projects in the adjacent public right of way. Use data from existing plans to identify priority GSI projects in EJ communities and create a plan identifying funding to implement projects</li> </ol> </li> </ol>	<ol> <li>EJ-1.3 has been updated (see page 3-19 and 9-4)</li> <li>EJ-1.17 has been updated (see page 3-20 and 9-4)</li> <li>EJ-2.4 has been updated (see page 3-21 and 9-6)</li> <li>EJ-A.4 has been updated (see page 9-3)</li> <li>Comment noted. This speaks to issues outside the scope of the EJ Element</li> <li>Comment noted. This speaks to issues outside the scope of the EJ Element</li> <li>Comment noted. Oakland City staff are required to take mandatory trainings related to understanding and advancing Oakland's racial equity mandate, understanding equity, bias, and inclusive engagement. Staff are also encouraged to take additional trainings, e.g. on how to conduct a Racial Equity Impact Analysis.</li> <li>EJ-3.5 has been updated (see page 3-21 and 9-7)</li> </ol>
	has a strong focus on racial equity 8. Update EJ-3.5 to ensure community campaigns are expanded in partnership with community members	<ol> <li>Comment noted. This is outside the scope of the EJ Element. The City Council has authority over the Budget, to view the 2023-2025 Fiscal</li> </ol>

Name/Organization /Agency/Meeting	Summarized Comment	Response to Comment
	<ol> <li>9. Update EJ-A.15 to include increasing the budget of DPW in an effort to help manage illegal dumping and make the flatlands of Oakland a priority for illegal dumping cleanup</li> <li>10. Update EJ-6.5 to ensure strong coordination between agencies during climate emergencies, with in-language and culturally appropriate outreach targeted to the most vulnerable communities</li> <li>11. Update EJ-7.7 to ensure paving programs are aligned with other city initiatives including the Green Stormwater Infrastructure Plan</li> <li>12. Update EJ-7.12 to include the consideration of violence indicators when improving park safety and ensure safety improvements are made with adequate knowledge</li> <li>13. Update EJ-7.15 to ensure tree canopy efforts are aligned with climate resilience planning. Additionally, trees should be low on the allergenic scale, to serve EJ communities most impacted by air pollution and asthma.</li> <li>14. Update EJ7.16 to ensure urban greening efforts are aligned with flood and pollution prevention. GSI should be prioritized wherever feasible, especially high-risk flood areas</li> <li>15. Ensure the OSCAR and LUTE Elements include a citywide greening network</li> </ol>	<ul> <li>Year Budget <u>click here.</u> Additionally, EJ-3.3 prioritizes proactive illegal dumping cleanup in "hot spot" areas in EJ communities as identified in Figure EJ-15</li> <li>10. EJ-6.5 has been updated (see page 6-6 and 9-11)</li> <li>11. EJ-7.7 has been updated (see page 7-13 and 9-13)</li> <li>12. EJ-7.12 has been updated (see page 9-13). Additionally, this is relevant to the Open Space, Conservation, and Recreation (OSCAR) Element. It will be considered in Phase 2 of the General Plan process</li> <li>13. EJ-7.15 has been updated (see page 7-14 and 9-14)</li> <li>14. EJ-7.16 has been updated (see page 7-14 and 9-14)</li> <li>15. New Action EJ-A.30 has been added (see page 9-12)</li> </ul>
Frontline Catalysts Youth Leaders	<ul> <li>Concern:         <ol> <li>The proposed policies are too vague. We want specific, measurable, achievable, realistic, and timely goals.</li> </ol> </li> <li>Questions:         <ol> <li>When you say that you want resources to be invested in impacted communities, will that money go toward the communities themselves or to outside analysts/organizations?</li> </ol> </li> </ul>	<ol> <li>Updates have been made to Chapter 9 (see page 9-1)</li> <li>Intentional investment could come in the form of funds being distributed to local, community identified organizations that have existing relationships with impacted communities.</li> </ol>
Hannah Germonprez	<ul> <li>Suggestion:</li> <li>1. The City of Oakland's Summer Foods program would be highly beneficial to include in this report, specifically connecting the food served during the summer with local vendors and gardens to reduce emissions and provide higher quality food</li> </ul>	<ol> <li>Text has been updated to reference the Summer Foods program (see page 5-2)</li> <li>This is addressed in EJ-7.10 and will be further addressed in Phase 2 in both the Land Use and Transportation Element and the Open Space, Conservation, and Recreation Element</li> </ol>

Name/Organization /Agency/Meeting	Summarized Comment		Response to Comment
	<ol> <li>The Draft would benefit from including park accessibility (ADA compliant parks)</li> <li>Concern:         <ol> <li>I would like to echo another comment regarding language access. If the plan is only released and available in English, it is inequitable to close the commentary period until language justice is addressed</li> <li>The connection between safe use of parks and recreational facilities and unhoused individuals cannot be understated. Unhoused people need not just to be housed, but to have access to basic hygienic services. The City should invest in more public restrooms and more frequent servicing.</li> </ol> </li> <li>Support:         <ol> <li>I appreciate the detailed engagement that is detailed in this document Question:</li> <li>Will there be a citizens and impacted community advisory board to ensure equitable implementation of this plan?</li> </ol> </li> </ol>	4. ( 5. ( 6. 5)	Comment noted. The City is grateful for this recommendation on increasing civic engagement to non-English speaking folks. The City provided multi-lingual factsheets in Spanish, Chinese, Korean and Arabic and also had Spanish and Cantonese interpreters at Community Workshops. We are working to improve language accessibility and welcome your suggestions on ways to do this. Comment noted, thank you. Comment noted, thank you. See updates that have been made to Chapter 9. Additionally, the City welcomes your feedback as the plan is being implemented.
HOPE Collaborative,	Suggestions:	1.	New Policy EJ-8.12 and new Actions EJ-A.37, EJ-
The Greenlining	1. In addition to EJ-8.10 and EJ-8.11 we recommend that the City expand		A.38, and EJ-A.39 and have been added (see
Institute, Mycelium	their strategies to achieve inclusive engagement	1	page 9-16 and 9-15)
Youth Network,	2. The City's roles and responsibilities for EJ implementation should be	2. 1	EJ-A.36 has been updated (see page 9-15).
Communities for a	coordinated with Oakland Climate Action Network (OCAN)		Additionally, the General Plan Update goes
Better Environment,	3. Clarify the specific timelines, responsibility roles and priority levels for		beyond addressing climate issues and the City
Homies	each action and add cost estimates and funding plans for		has a responsibility to engage with all
Empowerment,	implementation to each action.		neighborhood support organizations
Oakland Climate Action Coalition,	4. Add a new policy that focuses on how the City can partner with the		New Action EJ-A.40 has been added (see page
East Oakland	community to advance community-driven initiatives 5. Add a new action that is focused on integrating community-led and		9-17) and additional updates on page 9-1 New Action EJ-A.38 has been added (see page
Neighborhoods	community-driven initiatives into City planning processes		9-15)
Initiative	6. Include a detailed overview of the EJ Element's Implementation Plan		New Action EJ-A.38 has been added (see page
	and develop a workflow to facilitate stronger interdepartmental		9-15)
	coordination and accountability among lead departments		An overview and a legend with definitions of
	7. When engaging residents, an effort should be made on the part of the		the various fields has been added (see page 9-
	city to engage both long-term legacy residents of EJ communities and		1)

Name/Organization /Agency/Meeting	Summarized Comment	Response to Comment
	<ul> <li>former residents who have since been displaced from these communities.</li> <li>Develop and incorporate this recommended implementation workflow for City staff to facilitate stronger interdepartmental coordination and accountability.</li> <li>The City should provide open access to implementation progress updates in a way that's accessible for all abilities and regularly updated</li> <li>The City should allocate funding for and hire a trusted third-party evaluator to annually review the implementation of the EJ Element in partnership with EJ Communities.</li> <li>Add a new action to actively seek federal, state and philanthropic funding, in partnership with EJ communities and develop proposals in alignment with community goals.</li> <li>Reevaluate departmental budgets within all City departments' budgets to support ongoing, meaningful and accessible community engagement for EJ Communities.</li> <li>We strongly recommend that the City do more to address the urgency of funding an ongoing, accessible and meaningful community engagement process. Further, we recommend that departmental budgets be finalized in partnership with EJ Communities and that relevant information and updates be transparently shared.</li> <li>Add a new action to establish or leverage a paid community advisory and oversight committee or board to support an equitable and community-driven implementation the EJ Element</li> </ul>	<ol> <li>Comment noted. The City will work to engage both long-term legacy residents in EJ communities and former residents who have been displaced from these communities to gain understanding that is informed by lived- experience.</li> <li>Comment noted, thank you.</li> <li>New Action EJ-A.42 has been added (see page 9-17)</li> <li>Comment noted. The City will explore this as part of implementation</li> <li>Comment noted. This is outside the scope of the EJ Element and General Plan</li> <li>Comment noted. This is outside the scope of the EJ Element. The City Council has authority over the Budget, to view the 2023-2025 Fiscal Year Budget click here.</li> <li>Comment noted. This is outside of the scope of the EJ Element and General Plan.</li> <li>Comment noted. This is outside of the scope of the EJ Element. The City Council has authority over the Budget, to view the 2023-2025 Fiscal Year Budget click here.</li> <li>Comment noted. This is outside of the scope of the EJ Element and General Plan. Creation of new commissions or advisory boards requires action by City Council. The City should utilize existing boards and commissions instead of establishing a new body.</li> <li>Comment noted, thank you. The City plans to partner with various community organizations throughout implementation.</li> <li>Comment noted, thank you.</li> <li>New Action EJ-A.37 has been added (see page 9-13)</li> </ol>

Name/Organization /Agency/Meeting	Summarized Comment	Response to Comment
	<ol> <li>In addition to establishing a paid community advisory board or committee to support implementation we recommend adding additional strategies, examples have been provided.</li> <li>Sharing resources for consideration in the design of the evaluation process and questions</li> <li>We have included additional details to emphasize how the OCAN provides the necessary infrastructure for the City to implement many of the proposed policies and actions within Goal EJ-8</li> <li>Develop and utilize a 'one-stop shop' platform that is a central system for community input with searchable data well organized by topic for use by all City department staff</li> <li>Update EJ-8.5 to better align with our shared definition of capacity building</li> <li>Support:</li> <li>We support the policies under Goal EJ-8 and commend the City for including many of the essential components for meaningful civic engagement.</li> <li>We support the City's partnership with the Deeply Rooted Collaborative and the Collaborative's ongoing and thoughtful engagement with Oakland residents</li> <li>We appreciate Policy EJ-8.4, Policy EJ-8.6, and Action EJ-A.30's mention of funding for meaningful community engagement.</li> </ol>	<ul> <li>21. New Action EJ-A.38 has been added (see page 9-15)</li> <li>22. Comment noted, thank you.</li> <li>23. Comment noted, thank you.</li> <li>24. Comment noted, thank you.</li> </ul>
Margie Lewis	Suggestion:	1. EJ-1.5 has been updated (see page 9-2).
	<ol> <li>Related to EJ-1.5, regulate polluting uses needs a community oversight board with power to implement findings</li> <li>Related to EJ-1.14, Community EJ Organizations need to be involved in determining the measures taken and in creating an accountability mechanism</li> <li>EJ-A.1 should include components of Community Oversight</li> <li>Related to EJ-A.5 EJ organization input should be include</li> </ol>	<ul> <li>Additionally, this is related to EJ-1.15 (see page 9-4)</li> <li>Comment noted, this is included in Oakland's Planning and Building Departments Standard Conditions of Approval</li> <li>Comment noted, thank you.</li> <li>EJ-A.5 has been updated (see page 9-3)</li> </ul>

Name/Organization /Agency/Meeting	Summarized Comment	Response to Comment
	<ol> <li>Who defines what is feasible in EJ-1.13?</li> <li>Related to EJ-1.16, are community partners considered equal partners?</li> <li>Related to EJ-1.4, what is being done to address existing adverse effects related to air quality, noise, or safety?</li> <li>Related to EJ-1.4, what is being done about existing facilities that pollute although they meet current standards?</li> <li>How can the City address polluting facilities who have been grandfathered in with old permits?</li> <li>Related to EJ-1.8, what about providing existing buildings such as schools, community centers and libraries with up to date filtration systems?</li> <li>Related to EJ-10.1, who will ensure distribution of spending and resources to EJ Communities happens? What is the mechanism for accountability?</li> <li>Related to EJ-8.4, who determines feasibility?</li> <li>Related to EJ-A.7, what criteria will be used for evaluation?</li> </ol>	<ol> <li><u>Standard Conditions of Approval</u> define what is feasible</li> <li>Yes, community partners will be considered equal partners</li> <li>EJ-1.4 has been updated to include details</li> <li>Refer to EJ-1.6</li> <li>See Action EJ-A.5 that will study implementation of an amortization pilot program in AB-617 communities.</li> <li>See EJ-A.3 which addresses this (page 9-2)</li> <li>See EJ-10.2 and EJ-A.34 which address this (page 9-17 and 9-12). Additionally, the City will do this as part of implementation of General Plan Elements</li> <li>Feasibility refers to constraints that the City has to work under – legal, financial, etc.</li> <li>This relates to the Land Use and Transportation Element in Phase 2 of the General Plan which will evaluate residential and industrial conflicts. Evaluation criteria will be developed through community engagement in Phase 2</li> </ol>
Oakland Arts	Suggestions:	1. EJ-8.3 has been updated (see page 9-14)
Commission	<ol> <li>Update EJ-8.3 to include Creative Strategies</li> <li>Update Table EJ-1 to include arts programming in the OSCAR</li> <li>Update sub-section title under section 6.1 to include infrastructure</li> <li>Revise language on page 6-2 for clarity</li> <li>Cultural facilities are not always built environment, they are also civic commons that can be enhanced to support arts and cultural expression</li> <li>EJ-A.25 and the issues surrounding cultural districts/corridors related to land ownership should be reviewed by Cultural Affairs</li> <li>Update language in the Guiding Principles to include cultural spaces, sports, and events related to Oakland's cultural richness</li> </ol>	<ol> <li>Table EJ-1 has been updated (see page 1-4)</li> <li>Sub-section title has been updated (see page 6-2)</li> <li>Narrative on page 6-2 has been revised</li> <li>Comment noted, thank you.</li> <li>Comment noted, thank you. This is relevant to Phase 2 of the General Plan and will be carried over</li> <li>Comment noted. The City will explore updating the Vision and Guiding Principles in Phase 2 of</li> </ol>
	sports, and events related to Oakland's cultural richness Questions:	the Vision and Guiding Principle: the General Plan

Name/Organization /Agency/Meeting	Summarized Comment	Response to Comment
	<ol> <li>Is an audit part of the process to ensure it's supportive of diverse small businesses be a worthwhile recommendation? The Cultural Affairs department has received significant number of complaints related to procurement.</li> </ol>	<ol> <li>Comment noted, thank you. This is outside of the scope of the EJ Element and General Plan. It will be explored further during implementation.</li> </ol>
Port of Oakland	<ol> <li>Suggestion:         <ol> <li>Related to EJ-A.8, utilize the West Oakland Truck Management Plan (WOTMP) as a framework to explore modifications to truck routes and truck management. Additionally, identify staff time and resources to maintain, update, and implement the WOTMP</li> <li>Include conditions in the special permit criteria that does not conflict with the City's Industrial Land Policy and consider exceptions for zero- emission industrial operations and truck-intensive activities</li> <li>As part of the LUTE in Phase 2, the Industrial Lands Policy and associated Industrial Land Use Planning Codes should be updated to include special permit conditions for new proposed residential activities located within 500 feet of heavy industrial businesses and truck- intensive industrial growth.</li> </ol> </li> </ol>	<ol> <li>EJ-A.8 has been updated</li> <li>Childcare facilities and schools are covered in EJ 4.3</li> <li>Comment noted. This will be carried over into Phase 2 of the General Plan</li> </ol>
Ryder Diaz	<ul> <li>Suggestions: <ol> <li>Consider expanding marketing around how people can report illegal dumping, and ensure materials are available in a variety of languages</li> <li>In reference to Section 2.1 Historical Context/Root Causes, the Ohlone people still are land stewards, use the present tense</li> <li>More protected bike lanes are needed</li> <li>Need to also address lead in schools, including soil and water</li> </ol> </li> <li>Question: <ol> <li>In Table EJ-5, is there information available on the total number of requests, not just requests per 1,000 people?</li> <li>Will new parks be created in neighborhoods that currently lack them?</li> <li>What about the air quality of homes near high-traffic corridors, freeways, factories, crematories, etc.?</li> <li>How is tree maintenance addressed?</li> <li>Does the parks access indicator take into account size and amenities of the park? Does it take into account density of residents that live around</li> </ol> </li> </ul>	<ol> <li>EJ-3.5 has been updated</li> <li>Language updated (see page 2-1)</li> <li>Comment noted. This is relevant to Phase 2 of the General Plan and will be carried over. Additionally, see EJ-7.1, EJ-7.2, EJ-7.3, EJ-7.4, and EJ-7.5</li> <li>See EJ-4.3 and EJ-4.4.</li> <li>See updated narrative in p. 3-14</li> <li>Yes, public facilities will be prioritized in traditionally underserved areas, see EJ-6.1</li> <li>Residential air quality is addressed in EJ-1.8 and EJ-4.5.</li> <li>Tree maintenance requests can be submitted via 311 and are prioritized based on public safety issues</li> </ol>

Name/Organization /Agency/Meeting	Summarized Comment	Response to Comment
	<ul><li>the park? What is the ratio of the density of residents to the area of the closest park?</li><li>10. Does the Types of Air Pollutants call out box on page 3-4, apply to trucks on the freeways or only heavy duty trucks that reside on Port property?</li></ul>	<ol> <li>9. These questions will be analyzed as part of the Open Space, Conservation, and Recreation Element in Phase 2 of the General Plan</li> <li>10. This refers to both stationary and mobile sources</li> </ol>
Save the Bay, West	Suggestions:	1. EJ-6.5 has been updated
Oakland	1. EJ-6.5 should ensure strong coordination between agencies during	2. Comment noted. See updates made to EJ-2.4
Environmental	climate emergencies and emphasize in-language outreach targeted to	(page 9-6)
Indicators Project,	the most vulnerable communities	3. The first bullet under EJ-1.17 has been updated
Oakland Climate	2. Workforce development for the implementation and maintenance of	(see page 9-4)
Action Coalition,	green stormwater infrastructure should be a function of the Incubator	4. EJ-2.4 has been updated (see page 9-6)
Faith in Action East	mentioned in EJ-A.4	5. EJ-2.4 has been updated (see page 9-6)
Bay, Roots	3. To maximize the climate resilience benefits in EJ-1.17, co-benefits	6. EJ-2.4 has been updated (see page 9-6)
Community Health	should include multiple climate and environmental hazards, including	7. EJ-3.3 prioritizes proactive illegal dumping
Center, Black	flooding	cleanup in "hot spot" areas in EJ communities
Cultural Zone,	4. Wherever possible, barriers should be integrated with green	8. Comment noted. Oakland City staff are
Brotherhood of	stormwater infrastructure	required to take mandatory trainings related to
Elders Network, East Oakland Youth	<ol> <li>Prioritize the funding and implementation of nature-based climate resilience measures, such as green stormwater infrastructure and</li> </ol>	understanding and advancing Oakland's racial equity mandate, understanding equity, bias,
Development Center	restored tidal wetlands, in and near impacted communities.	and inclusive engagement. Staff are also
Development Center	<ol> <li>Include plans for identifying and pursuing funding</li> </ol>	encouraged to take additional trainings, e.g. on
	7. The flatlands should be a priority for illegal dumping cleanup	how to conduct a Racial Equity Impact Analysis.
	8. Ensure training of Environmental Enforcement Officers has a strong	9. EJ-3.5 has been updated
	focus on racial equity	10. This is addressed in EJ-4.6
	9. Update EJ-3.5 to ensure community campaigns are expanded in	11. Comment noted.
	partnership with community members	12. Comment noted.
	10. Green infrastructure should be integrated into the city's stormwater	13. EJ-2.4 has been updated (see page 9-6)
	system to protect residents and community members from flooding	14. EJ-7.12 has been updated
	11. Prioritize legacy Black, brown, and indigenous residents for these land	15. EJ-2.4 has been updated
	transfers, discounted water rates, and reduced property tax	16. This is addressed in EJ-7.15
	assessments.	17. EJ-7.15 has been updated

Name/Organization /Agency/Meeting	Summarized Comment	Response to Comment
	<ol> <li>Prioritize legacy Black, brown, and indigenous small businesses in EJ communities for food innovations</li> <li>New CIPs for public improvements should incorporate green stormwater infrastructure wherever possible.</li> <li>Update EJ-7.12 to include the consideration of violence indicators when improving park safety and ensure safety improvements are made with adequate knowledge</li> <li>Incorporate green stormwater infrastructure into the urban forest whenever possible, especially in areas prone to flooding</li> <li>Where possible, prioritize the planting of multi-purpose trees, such as fruit trees, in addition to strictly shade trees</li> <li>Prioritize planting of low-allergenic trees in EJ communities, who are most impacted by public health concerns related to allergens, pollutants, and lack of access to health care.</li> <li>Incorporate additional nature-based resilience strategies, examples have been provided</li> <li>Focus green stormwater improvements for areas at risk of flooding with an emphasis on vulnerable communities</li> <li>Establish requirements for major development and redevelopment projects to construct and maintain urban greening projects in the adjacent public right of way</li> <li>Utilize overlay zones, ordinances, or resolutions to create new urban greening zoning requirements in areas regarding flooding, habitat, or other priorities.</li> <li>Green stormwater infrastructure should be integrated into bicycle and pedestrian infrastructure</li> <li>When engaging residents, an effort should be made on the part of the city to engage both long-term legacy residents of EJ communities and former residents who have since been displaced from these communities</li> </ol>	<ol> <li>Comment noted, thank you. See updates made to EJ-2.4, EJ-1.3, EJ-7.15.</li> <li>EJ-2.4 has been updated</li> <li>Comment noted. This speaks to issues outside of the scope of the EJ Element</li> <li>Comment noted. This will be explored as part of Phase 2 of the General Plan</li> <li>See updates to EJ-2.4</li> <li>Comment noted, see updates to EJ-2.4</li> <li>Comment noted. The City will work to engage both long-term legacy residents in EJ communities and former residents who have been displaced from these communities to gain understanding that is informed by lived- experience.</li> <li>This is addressed in EJ-8.1 and EJ-8.10</li> <li>See EJ-8.2</li> <li>Comment noted, thank you</li> </ol>

Name/Organization /Agency/Meeting	Summarized Comment	Response to Comment
	<ol> <li>Utilize accessible language as part of outreach by reducing jargon and prioritizing language that resonates with resident needs and priorities.</li> <li>Ensure there is a communications plan in place to inform residents of the new resources available to them</li> <li>Partner with and support the existing work of Oakland-based, BIPOC-led community organizations through adoption and implementation of the EJ Element</li> <li>We strongly encourage the City to move from informing/consulting with communities to collaborating with them and advancing community ownership by engaging organizations embedded in EJ communities</li> <li>Related to EJ Goal 9, we encourage the city to leverage existing programs in workforce development, green jobs, and support and training for small businesses. Additionally, outline the funding streams available for these important opportunities and evaluation measures</li> <li>In order to identify where to prioritize investments, the City should map tree canopy gaps and prioritize urban canopy expansion in communities vulnerable to urban heat effects, utilizing tools such as the Tree Equity Score</li> <li>Utilize the Oakland Climate Action Network to support implementation</li> <li>Prioritize legacy Black, brown, and indigenous residents of EJ communities for small businesses and pop-up food purveyors</li> <li>We also encourage you to outline plans for obtaining adequate funding for implementation and to include a stronger focus on accountability to impacted communities during implementation</li> <li>Develop a timeline for meaningful engagement with EJ communities and work closely with new and existing community advisory councils of BIPOC-led EJ organizations that are focused on ground-truthing the proposed interventions and compensate them for this work</li> </ol>	<ul> <li>36. Comment noted, thank you. See EJ-8.1 to EJ-8.6 and EJ-A.33 and EJ-A.36.</li> <li>37. Comment noted. This relates to the Land Use and Transportation Element which is part of Phase 2. This comment will be carried over</li> <li>38. See EJ-A.4. Additionally, please refer to Oakland's Equitable Climate Action Plan</li> <li>39. New Action EJ-A.30 has been added</li> <li>40. See updates to page 9-1. Actions items listed are considered next steps</li> <li>41. Comment noted. This is outside the scope of the EJ Element. The City Council has authority over the Budget, to view the 2023-2025 Fiscal Year Budget <u>click here</u>. Additionally, EJ-3.3 prioritizes proactive illegal dumping cleanup in "hot spot" areas in EJ communities as identified in Figure EJ-15</li> <li>42. Comment noted, thank you</li> <li>44. Comment noted, thank you</li> </ul>

36. Related to El-Goal 6, prioritize community engagement, feedback, and data         37. Establish temporary and permanent car-free areas, to be used for active transportation, parks, parklets, green infrastructure, pop-up community and commercial activity, and other uses that address community needs         38. By 2023, establish a program for both voluntary and compliance GHG mitigation fees to be invested locally. Prioritize projects in frontline communities         39. Articulate a citywide greening network that involves "greenways" along specific city creeks, connections to existing and proposed green streets and green corridors, and other amenities. This network should prioritize establishing connections between Oakland's neighborhoods, parks on the Bay shoreline, and regional parks as well as identify zones arise on the Bay shoreline, and regional parks as well as identify zones in meed of green infrastructure investments. Reflect the City's report on Priority Conservation and Development Areas, which provides further details about this greenway network         40. Short, medium, and long term goals should be clearly defined and coupled with tangible next steps to ensure accountability         41. Update EI-A.15 to include increasing the budget of DWW in an effort to help manage illegal dumping. With increased budget additional staff could be added and investment in equipment to better monitor and clean up illegal dumping         42. In partnership with community groups, develop an implementation monitoring and evaluation plan framework and reporting mechanism.         Support:       43. We support EI-AA, EI-1.17, EI-1.3, EI-4.6, EI-A.1, EI-2.4, EI-A.14, EI-2.3, EI-Goal 9         44. We apprecite the extensive inclusion of nature-based climate resillence and w	Name/Organization /Agency/Meeting	Summarized Comment	Response to Comment
and tree canopy policy.		<ul> <li>36. Related to EJ-Goal 6, prioritize community engagement, feedback, and data</li> <li>37. Establish temporary and permanent car-free areas, to be used for active transportation, parks, parklets, green infrastructure, pop-up community and commercial activity, and other uses that address community needs</li> <li>38. By 2023, establish a program for both voluntary and compliance GHG mitigation fees to be invested locally. Prioritize projects in frontline communities</li> <li>39. Articulate a citywide greening network that involves "greenways" along specific city creeks, connections to existing and proposed green streets and green corridors, and other amenities. This network should prioritize establishing connections between Oakland's neighborhoods, parks on the Bay shoreline, and regional parks as well as identify zones in need of green infrastructure investments. Reflect the City's report on Priority Conservation and Development Areas, which provides further details about this greenway network</li> <li>40. Short, medium, and long term goals should be clearly defined and coupled with tangible next steps to ensure accountability</li> <li>41. Update EJ-A.15 to include increasing the budget of DPW in an effort to help manage illegal dumping. With increased budget additional staff could be added and investment in equipment to better monitor and clean up illegal dumping</li> <li>42. In partnership with community groups, develop an implementation monitoring and evaluation plan framework and reporting mechanism.</li> <li>Support:</li> <li>43. We support EJ-A.4, EJ-1.17, EJ-1.3, EJ-4.6, EJ-A.1, EJ-2.4, EJ-A.14, EJ-2.3, EJ-Goal 9</li> <li>44. We appreciate the extensive inclusion of nature-based climate resilience and we're supportive of the opportunities the City has</li> </ul>	Response to Comment
	Sharifa Taylor	and tree canopy policy.	1 El-1 1 has been undated

Name/Organization /Agency/Meeting	Summarized Comment	Response to Comment
	<ol> <li>Clearly define "appropriate land-use and transportation strategies" and consider embedding health protective strategies</li> <li>Clarify the roles and duties of Environmental Enforcement Officers in EJ-3.4 and EJ-3.1, additionally define "periodically" in units of time</li> <li>Provide a data clearinghouse link to the supplemental resources mentioned in EJ-4.2</li> <li>Provide a link to the resource list mentioned in EJ-4.4</li> <li>Provide a link to the database mentioned in EJ-4.4</li> <li>Provide links to modelling tools and guiding documents</li> <li>Identify the lead agency for EJ-1.19, EJ-A.17, EJ-A.5</li> <li>Please share more specific details about the proposed Carbon Sequestration Incubator</li> <li>Question:</li> <li>If/when AB 1000 will all of the 500 feet safety buffers mentioned in the General Plan be updated to reflect the new 1,000 foot safety standard?</li> <li>How will EJ-4.3 be measured for success?</li> <li>What health protections are in place to make "vertical food farms" in industrial areas a successful food production practice?</li> <li>Will Oakland's compost program be expanded (or better marketed) as part of EJ-5.9?</li> <li>How is the City defining units of time in this document? Additionally, when does "ongoing" or "continuous" start in term of a timeline? Are there any monitoring/enforcement avenues community can use to monitor ongoing programs?</li> <li>What is the definition of "adequately buffered"?</li> <li>Who enforces CPTED? Could an uninformed/unarmed officer enforce this policy?</li> <li>How frequent does proactive cleanup happen? Which department or agency is responsible for the oversight of this policy?</li> <li>What mitigation protocols have been identified to make smaller grocery stores more accessible to EJ communities while protecting community health?</li> </ol>	<ol> <li>EJ-3.4 has been updated</li> <li>Links have been added to EJ-4.2</li> <li>Links have been added to EJ-4.4</li> <li>EJ-A.17 has been updated</li> <li>Links have been added to EJ-1.13 and EJ-1.18</li> <li>The Residential Lending Division of the Department of Housing and Community Development and the Sustainability and Resilience Division in City Administrator's Office will collaborate on EJ-A.17. EJ-A.5 will be led by the Planning and Building Department</li> <li>Details on the proposed Carbon Sequestration Incubator will be shared with the community as they are available</li> <li>Yes, EJ-A.1 has been updated to a 600-foot buffer or whatever the minimum is required by state law</li> <li>This is defined in Action 2.1.2 in the Housing Element (HE). EJ-4.3 has been updated to reference the HE</li> <li>EJ-5.4 has been updated to ensure vertical food farms are located in appropriate areas in the City</li> <li>Yes, community education efforts will be expanded. A new bullet has been added to EJ- 5.9</li> <li>Definitions have been added</li> <li>EJ-A.1 has been updated to a 600-foot buffer or whatever the minimum is required by state law</li> <li>Definitions have been added</li> <li>EJ-A.1 has been updated to a 600-foot buffer or whatever the minimum is required by state law</li> </ol>

Name/Organization /Agency/Meeting	Summarized Comment	Response to Comment
	<ul> <li>18. Will public restroom facilities remain accessible to Oakland's unhoused population at night?</li> <li>19. Is there a plan/timeline for when these documents will be uploaded in the top 5 languages spoken in Oakland? Additionally, will there also be a 90 day comment period for the folks using the translated documents?</li> <li>20. Is the statement "reestablishing the use elsewhere" referring to toxic and/or industrial site relocation within or outside of Oakland? How much will this study be concerned with things outside of Oakland's jurisdictional authority?</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>16. Proactive cleaning happens daily along major travel corridors and other areas observed by city staff prior to be called and reported to 311. Clean Community Supervisor and B.O.E. Public Works Operations Manager are responsible for oversight of the policy</li> <li>17. Comment noted. This is outside the scope of the scope of the Environmental Justice Element and will be addressed through Planning Code Amendments</li> <li>18. This is addressed as part of EJ-A.24</li> <li>19. Comment noted. The City is grateful for this recommendation on increasing civic engagement to non-English speaking folks. The City provided multi-lingual factsheets in Spanish, Chinese, Korean and Arabic and also had Spanish and Cantonese interpreters at Community Workshops. We are working to improve language accessibility and welcome your suggestions on ways to do this.</li> <li>20. See EJ-A.5</li> </ul>
Shelley Mitchell	<ul> <li>Concern:         <ol> <li>Table EJ-1, these are very general ideas for safety. I would like to see a focus on Mental Health Awareness and getting young people into programs that will help them address their mental health aiding to the future safety of Oaklanders</li> </ol> </li> </ul>	<ol> <li>New Policies EJ-8.12 and SAF-7.3 and new Action EJ-A.39 have been added (see EJ Element pages 9-15 and 9-16 and Safety Element page 5-8)</li> </ol>
San Francisco Bay Area Planning and Urban Research Association (SPUR)	<ul> <li>Suggestion:</li> <li>1. Remove CalSNAP from EJ-5.6, it is not a food assistance program</li> <li>2. Expand EJ-5.6 to support additional programs for retailers, such as grocery stores and farmers' markets, to supplement CalFresh with cash</li> </ul>	<ol> <li>EJ-5.6 has been updated to CalFresh</li> <li>The third bullet under EJ-5.6 has been updated</li> <li>Comment noted. City departments will continue to collaborate up to and through implementation</li> </ol>

Name/Organization /Agency/Meeting	Summarized Comment	Response to Comment
	<ul> <li>match incentives, healthy food incentives, or fruit and vegetable supplemental benefits</li> <li>3. Ensure synergy between existing plans and the EJ Element.</li> <li>4. The EJ element should explicitly state the risks imposed by groundwater rise and set a clear plan for how the City plans to mitigate them.</li> <li>5. Include updated specific building decarbonization policies that reflect actions identified in the Equitable Climate Action Plan. Set bold implementation goals for these policies to ensure all Oakland residents and families can live in homes with clean, emission free-air.</li> <li>6. We encourage deeper involvement of Oakland residents in this process that goes beyond a physical presence at community events</li> <li>Support:</li> <li>7. SPUR commends the City on its community engagement efforts. We are impressed with Deeply Rooted collaborative's efforts to share information and engage with a wide range of Oakland residents at popups and cultural events.</li> <li>Concern:</li> <li>8. The implementation section lacks specificity and fails to inform the reader of how goals will be achieved. More local context is needed to understand how the EJ Element will affect and improve specific Oakland neighborhoods and people groups.</li> </ul>	<ol> <li>This comment relates to both the EJ and Safety Element. See SAF-4.2, SAF-A.18, EJ-2.1. Chapter 2 of EJ Element discusses groundwater threats.</li> <li>The ECAP Building Electrification Plan is already underway. Additionally, see new action EJ-A.40 where ECAP and EJ will coordinate on the reporting</li> <li>Comment noted. The General Plan team will continue to innovate community engagement practices throughout Phase 2</li> <li>Comment noted, thank you</li> <li>Comment noted. See new Action EJ-A.40 and updated narrative on page 9-1</li> </ol>
West Oakland	Suggestion:	1. This is related to Housing Element Action 5.2.9.
Community Action Plan (WOCAP) Steering Committee	<ol> <li>Update EJ-A.31 to ensure that the participatory budgeting process includes adequate information about the potential health and environmental benefits and tradeoffs of various investment options so residents can make informed decisions</li> <li>Create a new policy to conduct a public information campaign to let residents living within 1,000 feet of a freeway know what the risks are and what mitigation measure they can take</li> <li>Related to EJ-8.2, require city staff to consult with AB 617 steering committees for related city actions</li> </ol>	<ul> <li>EJ-A.31 has been updated</li> <li>A new bullet has been added to EJ-1.16 (see page 3-20 and 9-4)</li> <li>EJ-8.2 has been updated (see page 8-8 and 9-14)</li> <li>See Appendix C: Existing City Policies Tracking Tool</li> <li>An explanation of EJ Principles has been added and linked. Additionally, the City will continue to use community engaged research models. For example, the EJ Communities mapping</li> </ul>

Name/Organization /Agency/Meeting	Summarized Comment	Response to Comment
	<ol> <li>In the WOCAP call out box on page 3-10, add a reference crosswalk table of WOCAP strategies addressed in the EJ Element. Explore including ECAP and EONI strategies as well</li> <li>Mention and reference the Principles of Environmental Justice and to tie this EJ Element to the rich national and local history of EJ work that serves as the foundation for future progress.</li> <li>Add a new policy to lobby Caltrans to increase the weight limit on freeways to support ZE trucks (to get diesel trucks off of neighborhood streets</li> <li>Review policies related to the Port and ensure that the tone conveys firm guidance to achieve environmental justice. Additionally, the Port should continue to improve good neighbor practices (such as providing meaningful community benefits, etc.)</li> <li>Work with BAAQMD, Port of Oakland Board, California Air Resources Board, and Terminal Operators to explore the potential for use of zero carbon or low-emission harbor and ocean-going vessels and to develop zero carbon trade corridors with other Pacific Rim trading partners</li> <li>Add a new policy indicating that the City will participate in the Sustainable Port Collaborative currently convened by the Port with participation by the Air District and WOEIP. Encourage additional collaboration from California Department of Public Health, Strategic Growth Council, Alameda County Public Health, CARB, CA DOJ, residents, and NGOs.</li> <li>Update EJ-1.15 to include enhanced development standards in buffer/overlay zones</li> <li>Define an "adequate buffer". We recommend applying a buffer of 1,000 feet especially downwind from heavy industrial use areas, freeways or urban roads with 100,000 vehicles/day. The definition should include wind patterns and the policy should include a recommendations or requirements for green infrastructure along heavy industrial uses</li> </ol>	<ul> <li>process involved a similar approach where staff worked with community organizations and EDF</li> <li>6. Comment noted. Policy barriers to ZE trucks will be explored as part of the Land Use and Transportation Element (LUTE) update in Phase 2 General Plan</li> <li>7. Comment noted, thank you</li> <li>8. EJ-A.3 has been updated (see page 9-2) Additionally see EJ-1.10</li> <li>9. Comment noted, thank you</li> <li>10. Comment noted, thank you</li> <li>11. Comment noted, thank you</li> <li>12. Comment noted, thank you</li> <li>13. Comment noted, thank you</li> <li>14. Comment noted, thank you</li> <li>15. Comment noted. This is will be explored as part of EJ-A.1 has been updated to a 600-foot buffer or whatever the minimum is required by state law. Additionally, see EJ-1.5 and EJ-A.7</li> <li>13. Buffers have been established as part of EJ-A.1</li> <li>14. Comment noted, thank you.</li> <li>15. Comment noted. See EJ-A.1 for truck-attracting businesses performance standards</li> <li>16. See updated page 9-1 and EJ-A.40 (page 9-17)</li> <li>17. Comment noted. To be addressed further in LUTE</li> <li>20. See EJ-8.1 and EJ-A.34 and EJ-A.36</li> <li>21. Comment noted, thank you. This City will explore this partnership</li> <li>22. Comment noted, thank you</li> </ul>

13. Expand EJ-1.5 to prohibit heavy manufacturing near residential uses, or conversely to prohibit housing near heavy manufacturing areas23. Comment noted. T the City has adopted barriers to contract14. Prohibit non-conforming truck-related and polluting/hazardous businesses inside EJ communities and compile a table that compares existing use vs. zoning use to identify non-conforming uses24. Comment noted. T with long time reside experiences. The cr requires action by 0 administrative processes to more carefully evaluate truck attracting businesses in EJ communities and connect applicants to resources via the Air District24. Comment noted. T with long time reside experiences. The cr requires action by 0 utilize existing boar of establishing a ne 25. Comment noted, the for the Environmer will continue to bui understand, regularly updated, and easy to navigate25. Comment noted, the collaborate with me to collaborate with me
<ul> <li>evaluation process. Community members should be involved in the evaluation in the evaluation process. Community members should be involved in the evaluation in the evaluatin the evaluation evaluating a new action around building city</li></ul>

Name/Organization /Agency/Meeting	Summarized Comment	Response to Comment
	<ol> <li>23. Work with CBOs and city purchasing/contracting to write a new action that will address and reduce barriers that may prevent community organizations from partnering with the City</li> <li>24. Add an Action under EJ-8.5 to increase the number of city and CBO Staff who are longtime Oakland residents and consider establishing a "boomerang" program for Oakland natives obtaining college degrees elsewhere to encourage them to return to Oakland after graduation. Additionally, create a boards and commissions leadership institute with the goal of building the capacity of residents to participate in leadership roles in the city.</li> <li>25. Add more detail about which type of events should have a youth focus; reach out to OUSD to see if they can collaborate on EJ-8.8</li> <li>26. Add an action about collaborating with places like healthcare providers, social workers, places of worship, senior centers, etc.</li> <li>27. Update EJ-A.30 from "study the feasibility" of a fund to "establish" a fund. Include writing fund equitable-use guidelines</li> <li>28. Update EJ-A.5 from "study the feasibility" to "develop", be more affirmative</li> <li>29. Update EJ-A.8 to clarify that when the truck route network will be revisited to use the fewest number of residential streets possible and add reference to improved signage for truck operators</li> <li>30. Add a new policy related to development of a comprehensive freight management plan to include design guidelines for truck routes and plan for retrofitting existing truck routes with green infrastructure.</li> <li>31. Add a new policy to pursue collaborations with local agencies to identify strategies to address concerns with truck routes, enforcement of truck routes, and feasibility of physical barriers for residential neighborhoods</li> <li>32. Identify a targeted funding stream to support neighborhood-scale interventions and investments for clean air improvements and</li> </ol>	<ul> <li>32. Comment noted, thank you. This will be explored in implementation</li> <li>33. Comment noted, thank you</li> <li>34. Comment noted, thank you</li> <li>35. This is covered in EJ-3.4</li> <li>36. Comment noted. Oakland City staff are required to take mandatory trainings related to understanding and advancing Oakland's racial equity mandate, understanding equity, bias, and inclusive engagement. Staff are also encouraged to take additional trainings, e.g. on how to conduct a Racial Equity Impact Analysis.</li> <li>37. Chapter 9 has been updated and EJ-A.40 has been added. Additionally, hiring a third-party of evaluate progress will be explored in implementation</li> <li>38. Comment noted, thank you. The City will continue to evolve our engagement practices throughout Phase 2 of the General Plan</li> <li>39. See EJ-1.5 and EJ-A.7 which address this</li> <li>40. EJ-A.9 addresses freeway pollution burden on residential neighborhoods</li> </ul>

Name/Organization /Agency/Meeting	Summarized Comment	Response to Comment
	<ul> <li>33. Collaborate with the Air District to conduct annual permit cross-checks for facilities to ensure that any facility with a conditional use permit also has an air district permit, where required.</li> <li>34. Add a new policy to develop a targeted proactive enforcement program to include enforcement "sweeps" at locations of concern</li> <li>35. Add a new policy/action to invest funds and staff time to improve the effectiveness of enforcement efforts related to illegal dumping, air quality violations, and truck driving, idling and parking.</li> <li>36. Add a new action to train city staff in the history, principles, best practices, and local data/issues of environmental justice</li> <li>37. Include a detailed overview of the implementation plan, including tracking the status of progress and ensuring this information is publicly accessible. Additionally, allocate funding and hire a trusted third-party evaluator to annually review the implementation of the EJ Element in partnership with EJ Communities.</li> <li>38. It would have been helpful to provide more education and orientation of SB 1000 at the beginning of the process for city staff, consultants, residents, and community groups. Would have liked to have an open line of communication to OPR staff to ask questions about SB 1000 during this process.</li> <li>39. Add a new goal and policies about distributional equity - specifically siting of polluting uses across the city</li> </ul>	
Deeply Rooted	contains no related policies Suggestions:	1. EJ-1.17 has been updated. Additionally, the City
	<ol> <li>Add language to policy EJ-1.17 to ensure residents have access to (hyperlocal) neighborhood data so that residents can evaluate the City's policies. Additionally, establish a Participatory Action Research effort with those who are most vulnerable to climate crises and environmental injustices</li> </ol>	<ul> <li>will continue to use community engaged research models.</li> <li>More information has been added (see page. 3- 10)</li> <li>EJ-3.4 has been updated</li> </ul>

and concerning clean water and how the City of Oakland can further support these efforts.comme EBMUD3.Update EJ-3.4 to increase patrolling beyond 9-5pm. Prioritize more resources in industrial zones5.EJ-A.154.Add programs to support unhoused people to access clean water examples include paying for equipment to make it possible to get water from fire hydrants7.EJ-A.5 H5.The green jobs program programs should offer an opportunity to hire local people and help with skills training and should have more ousinesses9.Comme program6.Add language in Actions EJ-A.4 on specification of green jobs. Specify10.Comme healthop	has been updated. Additionally, the
7. Add language in EJ-A.5 to co-develop an ordinance with EJ CBO's and low-income EJ community residents to prioritize identification and closure of existing polluting industries located in or near residential areas11. Comme 2030 Ed 2030	ent will be passed on to our partners at b has been updated ent noted. This is outside the scope of Element has been updated ent noted. View EBMUD lead testing ms <u>here</u> ent noted. View EBMUD lead testing ms <u>here</u> ent noted. The City does not provide care services and has no influence over care fees

Name/Organization /Agency/Meeting	Summarized Comment	Response to Comment
Agency/Meeting	<ol> <li>CBO's the city collaborates with during implementation will be constantly evolving</li> <li>Add a spreadsheet as an appendix, listing all the neighborhoods with details on issues, cost for cleanup, preventions and infrastructure needed</li> <li>Add language under EJ-A.1 to encourage the removal of industrial businesses near residential areas and ensure a 600- foot buffer instead of 500 feet.</li> <li>Involve Alameda County Health Department and County Supervisors Office in the development and implementation the EJ element.</li> <li>Add new action putting dumpsters in neighborhoods especially near unhoused communities. Add a program to place dumpsters with separate sections for hazardous material.</li> <li>Add more context under Goal 3- Illegal Dumping describing dumping activity that is not done by Oakland residents and is focused in under- resourced communities</li> <li>Add a new action item to evaluate all soil areas that are contaminated including groundwater and related cleanup plans</li> <li>Add a new action to introduce programs which enable the community/CBO's to access and monitor implementation of policies/actions</li> <li>Expand EJ-2.4 to add programs for data gathering and water capture</li> <li>Add language to EJ 3.2, to require all owners of vacant properties to be responsible for maintaining and keeping the property clean</li> <li>Prioritize the MLK shoreline and adjacent green space for restoration. Create more access and encouragement for East Oakland residents to use this park</li> <li>Add language to EJ A-21 to provide grocery stores at walkable distances in all neighborhoods. Ensure that food accessibility improvements are accessible for all abilities and are culturally appropriate</li> <li>Add language to EJ-5.5 to support individual residents in small-scale agriculture and distribution, through education and financial assistance</li> </ol>	<ol> <li>Subsection Illegal Dumping under section 3.1 Issues and Disparities has been updated with additional context</li> <li>Various regulators provide oversight, depending on the location and nature of contamination. Typically, simple fuel cases are handled by Alameda County. But, more complicated cases involving other pollutants have the potential to involve the Water Board, Dept of Toxic Substances Control, and/or the US EPA.</li> <li>EJ-A.34 has been updated.</li> <li>When a regulatory agency gets involved, we work with them closely to get their approval on investigation and remediation plans. We can do this through voluntary compliance or under a cleanup order. In the remediation phase, various permits from other agencies (e.g., Army Corps of Engineers and CA/Federal Fish and Wildlife) may also be needed.</li> <li>EJ 3.2 has been updated</li> <li>EJ-3.2 has been updated</li> <li>EJ-4.21 has been updated</li> <li>EJ-5.5 has been updated</li> <li>EJ-5.5 has been updated</li> <li>EJ-5.5 has been updated</li> <li>Information has been added to Goal 5 Chapter Overview (see page 5-2)</li> </ol>

Name/Organization /Agency/Meeting	Summarized Comment	Response to Comment
	<ol> <li>Add Policy/Action to create fresh air/breathing centers for unhoused people and low-income communities.</li> <li>Add language under Goal 5 speaking to the recent shutdown of several East and West Oakland food banks</li> <li>Add language to EJ A-20 to encourage liquor stores and corner stores to stock healthy foods</li> <li>Clarify if no use of diesel generators is also intended for residents. Residents use diesel generators at parks or other places for short periods of time to access power.</li> <li>Illegal dumping enforcement should not involve Oakland Police Department</li> <li>Add language to EJ-A.1 to increase staffing for Planning Code Enforcement and Department of Transportation and prioritize local hiring of residents for neighborhood clean-up teams</li> <li>Add language to policy EJ.A.15 to raise awareness and increase frequency of Oakland 's Bulk Pickup and Oaktown PROUD students program in EJ Communities</li> <li>Add more information on dedicated funding to implement these proposals</li> <li>Create programs to financially assist residents in replacing water pipes that have been contaminated with lead and other toxins</li> <li>Add anguage to EJ 7.5 to create bike lane infrastructure for workers and not only caters to recreational cyclists</li> <li>Add language to EJ 7.2 on creating neighborhoods which are accessible by biking/walking in 15 min</li> <li>Add language to EJ 7.5 to support local plant growth that supports a healthy insect population</li> </ol>	<ol> <li>The seventh bullet under EJ-A.1 has been updated</li> <li>Comment noted, thank you.</li> <li>Comment noted. Alameda County is the lead on this, to see the program that Alameda County offers, click here.</li> <li>EJ-A.15 has language that describes how the co- created community reuse and repair program will be targeted for residents of neighborhoods with the highest unemployment rates</li> <li>Comment noted. Figure EJ-26 shows the geographic disparities in park access at a neighborhood level. See the <u>Trust for Public</u> Land10-minute walk website for more information:</li> <li>Comment noted. Alameda County is the lead on this, to see the program that Alameda County offers, click here.</li> <li>See EJ-A.23, EJ-A.28 and EJ-A.29</li> <li>Comment noted, thank you. This is related to Phase 2 of the General Plan – your comment will be carried over</li> <li>Comment noted, thank you. Currently the City is (insert 15-minute neighborhood efforts). Additionally, this comment is relevant to the Land Use and Transportation Element and will be explored in Phase 2 of the General Plan</li> <li>Comment noted, thank you.</li> <li>Your comment is noted, thank you. This is too specific for the scope of the EJ Element.</li> <li>Comment noted, thank you. This is too specific for the EJ Element.</li> </ol>

Name/Organization /Agency/Meeting	Summarized Comment	Response to Comment
_	<ul> <li>43. Add a new policy/action to study sidewalk lighting and create a plan to ensure sidewalks are lit all the time</li> <li>44. Add language to EJ-7.5 to create a program to reduce crime on sidewalks</li> <li>45. Add language to EJ 7.7 Equitable Paving policy to repair sidewalks especially repair streets with potholes and streets in East Oakland.</li> <li>47. Add language to EJ-7.10 to create open gyms, playgrounds for youth, areas designated for skateboarding, recreation areas for pets, and rugby fields in parks.</li> <li>48. Add language to EJ 7.16 to create a program that provides unhoused residents with free access to bikes</li> <li>49. Add language to EJ 7.16 to create jobs by planting trees in neighborhoods.</li> <li>50. Add policy/action items to Goal 7 to enhance access to waterfronts as recreational areas and create more public spaces where it's legal to sit and lay down.</li> <li>51. Add policy/action items to Goal 7 public transportation safe and free for all.</li> <li>52. Add language to EJ-A.17 Ensure tap water sources are not contaminated with fluoride or toxins.</li> <li>53. Add policy/action under Goal 4 to supply residents with emergency equipment, water, and food for their home.</li> <li>54. Add language to Goal 4 to provide affordable housing for all residents</li> <li>55. Support residents through funding and assistance in acquiring solar panels</li> <li>56. Add a new policy/action to Goal 6 to increase mental health facilities and emergency response in areas that are not surveilled by police</li> <li>57. Add language to EJ-6.5 to create a program to assist residents on</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>47. Comment noted, thank you. Oakland currently utilizes <u>Crime Prevention Through Environmental Design (CPTED)</u></li> <li>48. Comment noted, thank you. This will be explored as part of the Land Use and Transportation Element in Phase 2 of the General Plan. Your comment will be carried over</li> <li>49. Comment noted, thank you. Check out <u>Oakland's 5-Year Paving Plan</u></li> <li>50. Comment noted, thank you. These programming examples will be considered in implementation</li> <li>51. Comment noted, thank you. This is covered in EJ-A.4</li> <li>53. Comment noted, thank you. This will be explored as part of the Open Space, Conservation, and Recreation Element in Phase 2 of the General Plan.</li> <li>54. Comment noted, thank you. See EJ-3.1</li> <li>56. Comment noted, thank you.</li> <li>57. Comment noted, thank you</li> <li>58. Comment noted, thank you</li> <li>59. Comment noted, thank you</li> <li>50. Comment noted, thank you.</li> <li>51. Comment noted, thank you.</li> <li>53. Comment noted, thank you. This is outside the scope of the EJ Element. Affordable Housing is addressed in the City's Housing Element</li> <li>58. Comment noted, thank you</li> <li>59. Comment noted, thank you</li> <li>50. Comment noted, thank you</li> <li>51. Comment noted, thank you</li> <li>53. Comment noted, thank you.</li> </ul>
	accessing basic amenities and pay bills 58. Add language to EJ-6.3 to create centers where residents can access mental health therapy services, substance use treatment, and programs	have a Public Health Department. Oakland's Public Health is overseen by Alameda County 62. Comment noted, thank you

Name/Organization /Agency/Meeting	Summarized Comment	Response to Comment
	<ul> <li>to increase access to health insurance, and create local clinics in all neighborhoods. Additionally, provide counseling programs and rehab and recovery programs to unhoused people</li> <li>59. Create a Cultural Center dedicated to specific cultures. Additionally, create a program to fund services that fulfill social needs and create opportunities for residents to learn about their histories.</li> <li>60. Create spaces for people with disabilities, spaces for more intergenerational conversations, and spaces for creative learning, music, and dancing</li> <li>61. Overall there should be an increase of family care resources and more funding for youth programming</li> <li>62. Ensure equitable education and resources in all K-12 schools and invest in social and emotional education at schools</li> <li>63. Add a policy/action to Goal 5 to create a program to ensure grocery stores sell products at efford providers and support more equitable and accessible to all. Do not use police force or criminalization to enforce street vending regulations. Reallocate this enforcement funding as grants to support small businesses</li> <li>67. Add language to EJ-5.8 to create programs to teach plant medicine and accessible to all. Do not use police force or criminalization to enforce street vending regulations. Reallocate this enforcement funding as grants to support small businesses</li> <li>67. Add language to EJ-5.8 to create programs to teach plant medicine and facilitate wellness activities. Additionally, provide access to nutritional education and cooking classes, with an emphasis on cultural and ancestral recipes</li> <li>69. Add language to EJ-5.7 to increase the quality of food in schools and provide more culturally relevant meals for students.</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>63. Comment noted, thank you. These types of spaces are included as part of EJ-6.1</li> <li>64. Comment noted, thank you. The City Council has authority over the Budget, to view the 2023-2025 Fiscal Year Budget <u>click here.</u></li> <li>65. Comment noted, thank you. This item is too specific for the scope of the EJ Element.</li> <li>66. Comment noted. See updates to EJ 5.5.</li> <li>67. Comment noted. The proposed Phase 1 Planning Code Amendments address this.</li> <li>68. Comment noted, thank you</li> <li>69. Comment noted, thank you</li> <li>69. Comment noted, thank you</li> <li>70. Comment noted. This item is too specific for the scope of the EJ Element.</li> <li>71. Comment noted</li> <li>72. See Goal EJ-5 and associated policies and actions and policies EJ-7.8 through EJ-7.16</li> <li>73. Additionally, The City does not have control over private hiring practices. Comment noted, thank you. Both the EJ and Safety Elements strive to address these concerns. Each Element provides specific goals, policies, and actions.</li> </ul>

Name/Organization /Agency/Meeting	Summarized Comment	Response to Comment
	<ul> <li>70. Add language to EJ 2.1 to provide clean water to residents in encampments who don't have access to running water and provide filter for purifiers</li> <li>71. Create a tour of the different neighborhoods in Oakland/The Hills/ most affluent neighborhoods and examine/explain inequities.</li> <li>72. Add a new policy/action to increase green spaces, health clinics, healthy grocery stores, and other community spaces, ensuring that job hiring emphasizes re-entry employment for formerly incarcerated applicants. Additionally, all public jobs should require consideration/employment of formerly incarcerated people.</li> <li>Concern:</li> <li>73. The community is concerned about affordable housing, wellbeing, job stability, access to affordable healthy food, social connections, neighborhood resilience, and access to physical activity.</li> </ul>	
Gustavo Getierrez	<ul> <li>Suggestions:</li> <li>1. Update "addressing homelessness" in Table EJ-1 to "addressing the root causes of homelessness and the systemic discrimination that homeless people face"</li> </ul>	<ol> <li>Comment noted. The purpose of Table EJ-1 is to show the relationship between the Environmental Justice Topic Areas with other Element Policies. Goal 4 of the Housing Element provides Policies and Actions to address homelessness – view it here.</li> </ol>
Michael Belman	<ul> <li>Suggestion:</li> <li>1. When moving into a home information on lead poisoning should be given to the occupants</li> <li>2. All parks should have bathrooms and water fountains at the very least and city in more play infrastructure.</li> <li>3. We need clean parks and public restrooms</li> </ul>	<ol> <li>See EJ-4.4 this Is included</li> <li>Comment noted. This will be further explored as part of the Open Space, Conservation, and Recreation Element in Phase 2</li> <li>Comment noted.</li> </ol>
Mycelium Youth Network's Youth Leadership Council	<ol> <li>Suggestion:         <ol> <li>Create public art/graffiti stations around Oakland so that graffiti would be condensed to allowed spaces</li> <li>Could add more public art supplies that are safer for the environment</li> <li>Include more information on how contamination affects people and the sources of contamination</li> </ol> </li> </ol>	<ol> <li>Comment noted, thank you</li> <li>Comment noted, thank you</li> <li>Comment noted, see policies and actions under EJ-Goal 2</li> <li>See EJ-Goal 8 related to community engagement and Safety Element Action SAF- A.23</li> </ol>

Name/Organization /Agency/Meeting	Summarized Comment	Response to Comment
	<ol> <li>Related to sea level rise, more information needs to be given to people who are most vulnerable</li> <li>Partner with local nonprofits to plant trees that can provide shading in areas where there are no trees</li> <li>Establish a simple permit process so that school based youth can plant trees in their school gardens and even public areas like Lake Merritt.</li> <li>Add more information on green infrastructure and how it can help with algae blooms</li> <li>There are not enough trash cans, especially around Lake Merritt; This plan should focus more on adding trash cans</li> <li>Support:         <ul> <li>We support adding electric stations</li> <li>We support the General Plan covering sea level rise and water contamination</li> <li>We support investing in green infrastructure</li> </ul> </li> </ol>	<ol> <li>Comment noted, thank you</li> <li>Comment noted. This is outside the scope of the Environmental Justice Element. For more details on tree installation check out Oakland's Urban Forestry Plan <u>here</u></li> <li>Comment noted</li> <li>Comment noted. This is too specific for the EJ Element and General Plan. The comment will be passed onto Public Works</li> <li>Comment noted, thank you</li> <li>Comment noted. This is outside the scope of the Environmental Justice Element. For more details on tree installation check out Oakland's Urban Forestry Plan <u>here</u></li> </ol>
Yuli Martin	<ul> <li>Suggestion:         <ol> <li>If we want civic engagement from other non-English speaking folks, the report should be in other languages or the workshops should be in other languages, otherwise people will not understand or participate and give feedback.</li> </ol> </li> </ul>	<ol> <li>Comment noted. The City is grateful for this recommendation on increasing civic engagement to non-English speaking folks. The City provided multi-lingual factsheets in Spanish, Chinese, Korean and Arabic and also had Spanish and Cantonese interpreters at Community Workshops. We are working to improve language accessibility and welcome your suggestions on ways to do this.</li> </ol>