

# CITY OF OAKLAND

## BUDGET ADVISORY COMMISSION

Meeting of the City of Oakland Budget Advisory Commission (BAC) held Wednesday, September 13, 2023, at 6:00 PM.

The Budget Advisory Commission meeting was held in Hearing Room 2 in City Hall.

### Commission Members:

Armand Bryan, Larisa Casillas, Guadalupe Garcia, Margaret Grimsley, Reisa Jaffe, JohnMcKenna, Mike Petouhoff, Caitlin Prendiville, Sarah Price

### City's Representative(s):

Nathan Bassett– *Finance Department*

### Meeting Agenda:

1. Administrative Matters [5 minutes]
  - Welcome & Attendance
    - i. Present: Commissioners Bryan, Casillas, Garcia, Grimsley, McKenna, and Petouhoff, and City of Oakland staff member Bassett. Absent: Commissioners Jaffe, Prendiville, and Price. Quorum was met for duration of meeting.
    - ii. Meeting was called to order by BAC Chair McKenna at approximately 6:05 PM.
2. Approval of Prior Meeting Minutes [5 minutes]
  - Minutes of BAC Special Meeting held August 23, 2023
    - i. Bassett noted that the minutes from the prior meeting would now be provided as draft with meeting materials and voted upon in subsequent meetings. Meetings prior to August still need approval and will be approved as they become available.
    - ii. McKenna requested a motion to approve the minutes after Commissioners reviewed. Petouhoff motioned, with Grimsley seconding and all present Commissioners voting aye.
3. Commissioners' protocol [5 minutes]
  - Commissioner Application review
  - Onboarding & Exit / Recruitment – Open spots
    - i. McKenna asked Bassett to provide an update on potential new Commissioners and whether there were updates. Bassett responded that he had no updates to provide presently.
    - ii. McKenna stated that he would be discussing item 6 for a moment, regarding election of the BAC Chair and Vice Chair, as he is stepping down from the board completely, and encouraged the other members to consider service as

either chair or vice chair. Commissioners also inquired of staff as to whether or not the elections needed to be formalized or informal. Bassett responded that he would review the charter and provide further information during the next meeting.

4. Finance Dept Update (5 Minutes)

- McKenna inquired if there were any specific updates from staff, to which Bassett responded that the only item he had was related to follow up on a request from the prior meeting to discuss the scope of the forthcoming police staffing and resource study with the City's Inspector General. He noted that he had scheduled a meeting with the Inspector General to discuss availability and the potential items that Commissioners may have questions on during their review.

5. BAC ad hoc on Review of Council's Budget Revisions - attached (45 Minutes)

- Prior to handoff to the BAC Ad Hoc group to discuss the memo, Bassett noted that they had received public comment for this item, and read an email sent by Loren Taylor on the subject of use of one-time funds for recurring expenses.
- Revise and approval final recommendation to Council
  - i. Commissioners discussed the budget process review memo, with discussion focused on overall review of the edits that the ad hoc group had made since the prior meeting. Casillas lead the discussion, noting that they had revised the memo to reduce the length, and provided clarifications where needed. Grimsley requested that the document be reviewed to ensure that all acronyms are spelled out on first usage.

The page about vegetation management that had been part of the initial draft had been removed and replaced with language to discuss the concerns of the public regarding administrative consolidations, with the mention of vegetation management as an example. Bassett requested that they add the word "contracting" after "vegetation management" in the paragraph under 5.1 on page 7. The Commissioners supported the minor edit, after which Commissioners discussed Bryan's request to include language about the costing of items by City Council members in their proposed amendments, with a question about the process of amending the City's Consolidated Fiscal Policy (CFP). Bassett replied that he could look into the process, and McKenna responded that this could be discussed in a future meeting but was not germane to the budget process review memorandum.

Petouhoff requested a friendly amendment to add language regarding use of one-time funds that had been removed from the memo through the editing process, and proposed to add this following wording on page 5 in Section 1.1 at the end of the section:

"In regard to the City Budget Presentation attributing the deficit to the loss of one-time COVID funds, both the CFP (section 1d) and the past policies of the Budget Advisory Commission recommend against using one-time funds for continuing cost commitments. However, when it is necessary to override this policy there should be a clear statement of the reasons for doing so, and including this in the City's budget presentation would have improved the

informational quality of the budget materials.”

Commissioners reviewed the language, with Grimsley motioning to add the language as provided in the amendment request, and Garcia seconding the motion. All present Commissioners voted aye.

Commissioners made a few final comments on the document, including Petouhoff mentioning that he felt the budget presentation needed to include a racial equity analysis component more clearly and add an item to a future BAC agenda to invite the Department of Race & Equity to present on the City’s racial equity in budgeting efforts in lieu of adding that to the report. McKenna asked for a motion to approve the document. Petouhoff motioned to approve the document with the addition of the word “contracting” after “vegetation management” in the paragraph under 5.1 on page 7, and the friendly amendment previously noted, and then forward to the Finance & Management Committee and City Council. Grimsley seconded the motion, and all Commissioners present voted aye.

- Send to ad hoc with guidelines for final edits and presentation
  - i. McKenna asked staff what the next steps were for the memorandum, and Bassett responded that he would research the timeline for the submission to the Finance & Management Committee, as well as City Council.

#### 6. Agenda Items for next Meeting [10 minutes]

- BAC norms review
  - i. McKenna noted that he wasn’t clear what this item referred to, and Petouhoff responded that this item was intended to be a discussion of how the ad hoc groups and memorandum timelines need to be structured to ensure proper time for review, as well as the duties and specifics of what the ad hoc groups need to review as part of their work. He mentioned that this had been placed on the agenda prior to the work on the budget process review memo, and that it would be good for discussion.
- Election of BAC Chair, Vice-Chair

#### 7. Open Forum [5 minutes]

- McKenna inquired if there was any other business, to which Bassett noted that he planned to meet with the Inspector General the following morning and wanted further direction from the Commissioners on the elements of the Oakland Police Department (OPD) staffing and resource study that the Commissioners had specific questions on. Grimsley noted that Council President Bas had requested the input of the Budget Advisory Commission on the study, and the Commissioners asked the following questions, which Bassett stated he would provide to the Inspector General as part of the request for her to appear before the Commission:
  - i. Are these items included in the scope of the OPD staffing study?
    1. Review of self-initiated calls, which Commissioner Grimsley stated constitute 60% of Police worktime in Oakland, according to information previously provided to her.
    2. Crime solving (case closure) rate
    3. Police Overtime usage

- a. Commissioner Petouhoff expressed a concern that the vacancy savings used in prior years would not be available in the FY23-25 biennial
4. How is the overall OPD budget being spent?
5. Patrol draw – the determination of OPD shifts and locations by seniority which determines deployment of officers and may impact the efficacy of policing
6. Number of officers on scene during an incident
7. Racial equity and bias training of officers, previously conducted by professor Eberhardt of Stanford University
8. Crime rate versus the number of officers, and the marginal return
9. Crime rate versus (un)employment statistics
10. What units will be included in the study and why?
  - a. Will this include Measure Z, special unit, and task force sworn officers?
  - ii. Is this study or audit building on previous studies or audits?
  - iii. What is the timeline for the Police Audit and Study? When will it begin and end?
- Petouhoff noted that the Commission still needed to determine who would present to the Finance & Management Committee and City Council. Casillas volunteered to be the presenter.
- Commissioners also requested that staff inquire about having the Director of Economic & Workforce Development present to the Commission on the City's economic development efforts, as well as the Director of Race & Equity on the City's efforts to incorporate racial equity into the budgeting process.

## 8. Adjournment

- Commissioner Petouhoff motioned to adjourn, with the meeting adjourned at approximately 7:15 PM.

**ATTACHMENTS:** Final draft BAC Report for Biennial Budget 2023-25; Draft Meeting Minutes of BAC Special Meeting held August 23, 2023