



Sahar Shirazi, Chair
Vince Sugrue, Vice-Chair
Jonathan Fearn
Jennifer Renk
Josie Ahrens
Natalie Sandoval
Alex Randolph

December 6, 2023
REGULAR Meeting

BUSINESS MEETING

3:00 PM

Via: In-person

MEETING CALL TO ORDER Vice-Chair Sugrue

WELCOME BY THE CHAIR Vice-Chair Sugrue

ROLL CALL Haneefah Rasheed, PSR, Sr.

Commissioners Present: Vince Sugrue, Alex Randolph, Josie Ahrens, Natalie Sandoval, Jonathan Fearn

Commissioner(s) Absent: Sahar Shirazi, Jennifer Renk

Staff Present: Christopher Tan, Haneefah Rasheed, Brian Mulry, Michael Branson

SECRETARY RULES OF CONDUCT none

- **SECRETARY MATTERS** Christopher Tan, acting secretary in place of Catherine Payne

COMMISSION BUSINESS

- Agenda Discussion none
- Director’s Report none
- Informational Reports – Form 700 Requirements

Krystal Sams, City Clerk, gave a verbal and visual presentation of the requirements.

– UCSF Benioff Children’s Hospital – Future Expansion Plans

Project proponents Vanessa Roshell-Stacks, Alicia Murasaki, & Katie Walsh gave a verbal and visual presentation of the project.

PUBLIC SPEAKERS for Benioff Children’s Hospital: Naomi Schiff, Mary Harper (ceded time to Naomi Schiff), Assata Olugbala

- Committee Reports none
- Commission Matters none
- City Attorney’s Report none

- **OPEN FORUM**

At this time members of the public may speak on any item of interest within the Commission's jurisdiction. At the discretion of the Chair, speakers are generally limited to two minutes or less if there are six (6) or less speakers on an item, and one minute or less if there are more than six (6) speakers.

PUBLIC SPEAKERS: Assata Olugbala, Bishop Henry Williams

CONSENT CALENDAR

The Commission will take a single roll call vote on all of the items listed below in this section. The vote will be on approval of the staff report and recommendation in each case. Members of the Commission may request that any item on the Consent Calendar be singled out for separate discussion and vote.

#1	Location:	2201 Valley Street
	Assessor's Parcel Number(s):	008-0658-009-01 & -010-00
	Proposal:	Request for an extension of prior approvals for a proposal to construct a new office building of approximately 450 feet in height containing approximately 740,000 square feet of office. The ground floor would consist of a mix of pedestrian oriented retail/restaurant space as well as a 1,600-square foot commercial space on West Grand Avenue designated as arts/maker space and a 2,800-square foot commercial space at the corner of Telegraph Avenue and 22 nd Street designated as arts/maker/performance arts space.
	Applicant:	TMG Partners
	Contact Person/ Phone Number:	Peter Bryan / 415-320-4016
	Owner:	BA1 2201 Valley LLC
	Case File Number:	PLN18-115
	Planning Permits Required:	Extension of the previously approved Regular Design Review; Major Conditional Use Permits and Minor Variances.
	General Plan:	Central Business District
	Zoning:	CBD-P/ Height Area 6 S-13
	Proposed Environmental Determination:	No further environmental review is required pursuant to the California Environmental Quality Act ("CEQA"), specifically Public Resources Code section 21166 and CEQA Guidelines section 15162 since there is no change in the project being proposed. The extension is also exempt from CEQA under CEQA Guidelines section 15061(b)(3) (common sense exemption).
	Historic Status:	Not a historic property
	City Council District:	3
	Finality of Decision:	Appealable to City Council within 10 days
	For Further Information:	Contact case planner Peterson Z. Vollmann at 510-238-6167 or by e-mail at pvollmann@oaklandca.gov .

Applicant Denise Pinkston gave a verbal response regarding the project.

Commissioners provided questions and comments regarding item.

Public Speaker(s): none

Motion by Commissioner Randolph to approve the extension.

Seconded by Commissioner Fearn

Action: 5 Ayes, 0 Noes

PUBLIC HEARINGS

The hearing provides opportunity for all concerned persons to speak; the hearing will normally be closed after all testimony has been heard. If you challenge a Commission decision in court, you will be limited to issues raised at the public hearing or in correspondence delivered to the Planning and Building Department, at, or prior to, the public hearing.

The Commission will then vote on the matter based on the staff report and recommendation. If the Commission does not follow the staff recommendation and no alternate findings for decision have been prepared, then the vote on the matter will be considered a “straw” vote, which essentially is a non-binding vote directing staff to return to the Commission at a later date with appropriate findings for decision and, as applicable, conditions of approval that the Commission will consider in making a final decision.

If you wish to be notified on the decision of an agenda item, please contact the case planner for the specific agenda item.

#2	Location:	Oak Knoll Development – Parcel 11; 8750 Mountain Boulevard
	Assessor’s Parcel Number(s):	043A476700400
	Proposal:	Final Development Plan (FDP) for Oak Knoll Parcel 11 involving the construction of 19 detached single-family residences which requires a Conditional Use Permit (CUP) in the D-OK-3 zone and is requesting an exemption for a reduction in the garage setback from the private drive aisle.
	Applicant:	Chris Hall, WHA Inc.
	Contact Person/ Phone Number:	(415) 658-1723 chrish@whainc.com
	Owner:	Oak Knoll Venture Acquisition LLC
	Case File Number:	PLN15378-PUDF05
	Planning Permits Required:	Regular Design Review (DR), Final Development Permit (FDP), Conditional Use Permit (CUP), compliance with CEQA
	General Plan:	Mixed Housing Type Residential
	Zoning:	Oak Knoll District Residential Zone - 3 (D-OK-3)
	Proposed Environmental Determination:	Final Supplemental EIR certified on November 7, 2017
	Historic Status:	Non-Historic Property
	City Council District:	7
	Finality of Decision:	Appealable to City Council.
	For Further Information:	Contact Case Planner Malinda Lim at (951) 756-4874 or by email at m_lim@interwestgrp.com

Case Planner Christopher Tan gave a verbal presentation of the project.

Applicant Chris Hall gave a verbal and visual presentation of the project.

Commissioners provided questions and comments regarding item.

Public Speaker(s): Assata Olugbala

Motion by Commissioner Fearn to approve the project, which was corrected later in the meeting, as noted below.

Seconded by Commissioner Sandoval

Action: 5 Ayes, 0 Noes

Motion by Commissioner Fearn to amend the previous motion to add CEQA findings as follows:

1. Rely on the Oak Knoll Mixed Use Community Plan Project Supplemental EIR as adequate under CEQA for analysis of the Oak Knoll Parcel 11 Final Development Permit pursuant to CEQA Guidelines Section 15162, and based on the attached findings (and incorporated herein by reference);
2. Approve the Oak Knoll Parcel 11 Final Development Permit, subject to the attached findings.

Seconded by Commissioner Sandoval

Action: 5 Ayes, 0 Noes

#3	Location:	Oak Knoll Development – Parcel 19; 8750 Mountain Boulevard
	Assessor’s Parcel Number(s):	043A476700600
	Proposal:	Final Development Plan (FDP) for Oak Knoll Parcel 19 involving the construction of 22 detached single-family residences which requires a Conditional Use Permit (CUP) in the D-OK-3 zone and is requesting an exemption for a reduction in the garage setback from the private drive aisle.
	Applicant:	Chris Hall, WHA Inc.
	Contact Person/ Phone Number:	(415) 658-1723 chrish@whainc.com
	Owner:	Oak Knoll Venture Acquisition LLC
	Case File Number:	PLN15378-PUDF06
	Planning Permits Required:	Regular Design Review (DR), Final Development Permit (FDP), Conditional Use Permit (CUP), compliance with CEQA
	General Plan:	Mixed Housing Type Residential
	Zoning:	Oak Knoll District Residential Zone - 3 (D-OK-3)
	Proposed Environmental Determination:	Final Supplemental EIR certified on November 7, 2017
	Historic Status:	Non-Historic Property
	City Council District:	7 – Treva Reid
	Finality of Decision:	Appealable to City Council.
	For Further Information:	Contact Case Planner Malinda Lim at (951) 756-4874 or by email at mlim@interwestgrp.com

Case Planner Christopher Tan gave a verbal presentation of the project.

Applicant: Chris Hall gave a verbal and visual presentation of the project.

Commissioners provided questions and comments regarding item.

Public Speaker(s): none

Motion by Commissioner Fearn to approve project based upon staff recommendations.

1. Rely on the Oak Knoll Mixed Use Community Plan Project Supplemental EIR as adequate under CEQA for analysis of the Oak Knoll Parcel 19 Final Development Permit pursuant to CEQA Guidelines Section 15162, and based on the attached findings (and incorporated herein by reference);
2. Approve the Oak Knoll Parcel 19 Final Development Permit, subject to the attached findings.

Seconded by Commissioner Randolph

Action: 5 Ayes, 0 Noes

#4	Location:	Oak Knoll Development – Parcel 23; 8750 Mountain Boulevard
	Assessor’s Parcel Number(s):	043A476700700
	Proposal:	Final Development Plan (FDP) for Oak Knoll Parcel 23 involving the construction of 31 detached single-family residences which requires a Conditional Use Permit (CUP) in the D-OK-3 zone and is requesting an exemption for a reduction in the garage setback from the private drive aisle.
	Applicant:	Chris Hall, WHA Inc.
	Contact Person/ Phone Number:	(415) 658-1723 chrish@whainc.com
	Owner:	Oak Knoll Venture Acquisition LLC
	Case File Number:	PLN15378-PUDF09
	Planning Permits Required:	Regular Design Review (DR), Final Development Permit (FDP), Conditional Use Permit (CUP), compliance with CEQA
	General Plan:	Mixed Housing Type Residential
	Zoning:	Oak Knoll District Residential Zone - 3 (D-OK-3)
	Proposed Environmental Determination:	Final Supplemental EIR certified on November 7, 2017
	Historic Status:	Non-Historic Property
	City Council District:	7 – Treva Reid
	Finality of Decision:	Appealable to City Council.
	For Further Information:	Contact Case Planner Malinda Lim at (951) 756-4874 or by email at mlim@interwestgrp.com

Case Planner Christopher Tan gave a verbal presentation of the project.

Applicant Chris Hall gave a verbal and visual presentation of the project.

Commissioners provided questions and comments regarding item.

Public Speaker(s): none

Motion by Commissioner Ahrens to approve project based upon staff recommendations.

1. Rely on the Oak Knoll Mixed Use Community Plan Project Supplemental EIR as adequate under CEQA for analysis of the Oak Knoll Parcel 23 Final Development Permit pursuant to CEQA Guidelines Section 15162, and based on the attached findings (and incorporated herein by reference);
2. Approve the Oak Knoll Parcel 23 Final Development Permit, subject to the attached findings.

Seconded by Commissioner Sandoval

Action: 5 Ayes, 0 Noes

#5	Location:	Oak Knoll Development – Parcel 24; 8750 Mountain Boulevard
	Assessor’s Parcel Number(s):	043A476700800
	Proposal:	Final Development Plan (FDP) for Oak Knoll Parcel 24 involving the construction of 25 detached single-family residences which requires a Conditional Use Permit (CUP) in the D-OK-3 zone and is requesting an exemption for a reduction in the garage setback from the private drive aisle.
	Applicant:	Chris Hall, WHA Inc.
	Contact Person/ Phone Number:	(415) 658-1723 chrish@whainc.com

Owner:	Oak Knoll Venture Acquisition LLC
Case File Number:	PLN15378-PUDF10
Planning Permits Required:	Regular Design Review (DR), Final Development Permit (FDP), Conditional Use Permit (CUP), compliance with CEQA
General Plan:	Mixed Housing Type Residential
Zoning:	Oak Knoll District Residential Zone - 3 (D-OK-3)
Proposed Environmental Determination:	Final Supplemental EIR certified on November 7, 2017
Historic Status:	Non-Historic Property
City Council District:	7
Finality of Decision:	Appealable to City Council.
For Further Information:	Contact Case Planner Malinda Lim at (951) 756-4874 or by email at mlim@interwestgrp.com

Case Planner Christopher Tan gave a verbal presentation of the project.

Applicant Chris Hall gave a verbal and visual presentation of the project.

Commissioners provided questions and comments regarding item.

Public Speaker(s): none

Motion by Commissioner Randolph to approve project based upon staff recommendations.

1. Rely on the Oak Knoll Mixed Use Community Plan Project Supplemental EIR as adequate under CEQA for analysis of the Oak Knoll Parcel 24 Final Development Permit pursuant to CEQA Guidelines Section 15162, and based on the attached findings (and incorporated herein by reference);
2. Approve the Oak Knoll Parcel 24 Final Development Permit, subject to the attached findings.

Seconded by Commissioner Fearn

Action: 5 Ayes, 0 Noes

APPEALS

The Commission will take testimony on each appeal. If you challenge a Commission decision in court, you will be limited to issues raised at the public hearing or in correspondence delivered to the Planning and Building Department, at, or prior to, to the public hearing; provided, however, such issues were previously raised in the appeal itself.

Following the testimony, the Commission will vote on the staff report and recommendation. If the Commission reverses/overturns the staff decision and no alternate findings for decisions have been prepared, then the vote on the matter will be considered a “straw” vote, which essentially is a non-binding vote directing staff to return to the Commission at a later date with appropriate findings for decision and, as applicable, conditions of approval that the Commission will consider in making a final decision. Unless otherwise noted, the decisions in the following matters are final and not administratively appealable. Any party seeking to challenge these decisions in court must do so within ninety (90) days of the date of the announcement of the final decision, pursuant to Code of Civil Procedure section 1094.6, unless a shorter period applies.

COMMISSION BUSINESS

- Approval of Minutes **Date:** November 1, 2023

Motion to approve: Commissioner Fearn

Seconded by: Commissioner Ahrens

Action: 5 Ayes, 0 Noes

- Correspondence: none
- City Council Actions: At City Council on Tuesday, December 5, 2023, San Antonio Park Master Plan was approved, and the appeal for 1431 Franklin was rescheduled to Tuesday, December 19, 2023.

ADJOURNMENT

Vice-Chair Sugrue at 5:20 p.m.



CATHERINE PAYNE
Development Planning Manager
Planning and Building Department

NEXT MEETING: December 20, 2023