

WATERFRONT BALLPARK DISTRICT AT HOWARD TERMINAL

Response to Comments / Final Environmental Impact Report

Prepared for
City of Oakland

December 2021



WATERFRONT BALLPARK DISTRICT AT HOWARD TERMINAL

Response to Comments / Final Environmental Impact Report

Prepared for
City of Oakland

December 2021

180 Grand Avenue
Suite 1050
Oakland, CA 94612
510.839.5066
esassoc.com



Bend	Orlando	San Jose
Camarillo	Pasadena	Santa Monica
Delray Beach	Petaluma	Sarasota
Destin	Portland	Seattle
Irvine	Sacramento	Tampa
Los Angeles	San Diego	
Oakland	San Francisco	

D171044

OUR COMMITMENT TO SUSTAINABILITY | ESA helps a variety of public and private sector clients plan and prepare for climate change and emerging regulations that limit GHG emissions. ESA is a registered assessor with the California Climate Action Registry, a Climate Leader, and founding reporter for the Climate Registry. ESA is also a corporate member of the U.S. Green Building Council and the Business Council on Climate Change (BC3). Internally, ESA has adopted a Sustainability Vision and Policy Statement and a plan to reduce waste and energy within our operations. This document was produced using recycled paper.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Waterfront Ballpark District at Howard Terminal, Response to Comments/ Final Environmental Impact Report

	<u>Page</u>
Chapter 1, Introduction	1-1
1.0 CEQA Process	1-1
1.1 Intended Use of the Final EIR.....	1-3
1.2 Mitigation Monitoring and Reporting Program	1-3
1.3 Assembly Bill 734; CEQA Section 21168.6.7	1-4
1.4 New Information in the Final EIR	1-5
1.5 Organization of This Final EIR.....	1-6
Chapter 2, Updated Project Information	2-1
2.0 Introduction	2-1
2.1 Updates Related to the Project.....	2-1
2.2 Certain Non-CEQA Updates.....	2-4
Chapter 3, Roster of Commenters	3-1
3.0 Introduction	3-1
3.1 Public Agencies.....	3-1
3.2 Organizations	3-2
3.3 Individuals	3-5
3.4 Landmarks Preservation Advisory Board (LPAB) Public Hearing.....	3-14
3.5 Planning Commission Public Hearing.....	3-14
3.6 Comments Received After Close of the Comment Period	3-16
Chapter 4, Consolidated Responses	4-1
4.0 Introduction	4-1
4.1 Project Description	4-2
4.2 Formulation, Effectiveness and Enforceability of Mitigation Measures	4-17
4.3 Recirculation of the Draft EIR	4-65
4.4 Port Operations and Land Use Compatibility	4-67
4.5 Truck Relocation	4-83
4.6 Rail Safety, Grade Crossing, and Grade Separation	4-101
4.7 Parking	4-121
4.8 Chinatown.....	4-126
4.9 Alternative 3: The Proposed Project with Grade Separation Alternative	4-139
4.10 Alternative 2: The Off-Site (Coliseum Area) Alternative	4-151
4.11 Quiet Zone	4-162
4.12 Affordable Housing.....	4-164

	<u>Page</u>
4.13 Gentrification and Indirect Housing Displacement.....	4-171
4.14 Environmental Justice	4-178
4.15 Urban Decay	4-189
4.16 Remediation Plans, Land Use Covenants, and Human Health and Ecological Risk Assessment.....	4-202
4.17 Bird Impacts from Fireworks Displays	4-216
4.18 Effects of Light and Glare on Maritime Operations and Safety	4-222
4.19 Comment Period Extension	4-232
4.20 BART Station Capacity	4-234
4.21 AC Transit Congestion Impacts	4-246
4.22 General Non-CEQA	4-256
4.23 Transportation and Parking Demand Management Plan and Transportation Management Plan Considerations.....	4-259
Chapter 5, Responses to Individual Comments.....	5-1
5.0 Introduction	5-1
5.1 Public Agencies.....	5-2
5.2 Organizations	5-253
5.3 Individuals	5-1395
Chapter 6, Responses to Public Hearing Comments	6-1
6.0 Introduction	6-1
6.1 Landmarks Preservation Advisory Board Hearing	6-2
6.2 Planning Commission Hearing	6-44
Chapter 7, City-Initiated Updates and Errata to the Draft EIR	7-1
7.0 Introduction	7-1
7.1 Text Changes to the Draft EIR.....	7-1
7.2 Implication of Changes to the Draft EIR	7-1
7.3 Changes to Chapter 1: Introduction.....	7-2
7.4 Changes to Chapter 2: Summary	7-2
7.5 Changes to Chapter 3: Project Description	7-111
7.6 Changes to Chapter 4.0: Introduction to Analysis	7-121
7.7 Changes to Section 4.1: Aesthetics, Shadow, and Wind	7-122
7.8 Changes to Section 4.2: Air Quality.....	7-124
7.9 Changes to Section 4.3: Biological Resources.....	7-175
7.10 Changes to Section 4.4: Cultural and Tribal Cultural Resources.....	7-184
7.11 Changes to Section 4.5: Energy	7-194
7.12 Changes to Section 4.6: Geology, Soils, and Paleontological Resources.....	7-199
7.13 Changes to Section 4.7: Greenhouse Gas Emissions	7-204
7.14 Changes to Section 4.8: Hazards and Hazardous Materials	7-224
7.15 Changes to Section 4.9: Hydrology and Water Quality	7-233
7.16 Changes to Section 4.10: Land Use, Plans, and Policies	7-247
7.17 Changes to Section 4.11: Noise and Vibration.....	7-253
7.18 Changes to Section 4.12: Population and Housing	7-260
7.19 Changes to Section 4.13: Public Services.....	7-262
7.20 Changes to Section 4.14: Recreation	7-263
7.21 Changes to Section 4.15: Transportation and Circulation.....	7-268
7.22 Changes to Section 4.16: Utilities.....	7-302
7.23 Changes to Section 4.17: Effects Found Not to Be Significant.....	7-304
7.24 Changes to Chapter 5: Variants	7-304
7.25 Changes to Chapter 6: Alternatives.....	7-313
7.26 Changes to Chapter 7: Impact Overview and Growth Inducement.....	7-317
7.27 Changes to Chapter 8: Report Preparers.....	7-317
7.28 Changes to Appendix BIO	7-318

	<u>Page</u>
7.29 Changes to Appendix CUL	7-318
7.30 Changes to Appendix TRA.2	7-318

Appendices

Appendix PRC	Public Resources Code Section 21168.6.7 and AB 1191
Appendix MMRP	Draft Mitigation Monitoring and Reporting Program
Appendix PUB	Public Hearing Transcripts
Appendix BIO	Biological Resources Supporting Information (revised)
Appendix CUL	Cultural Resources Supporting Information (revised)
Appendix SLR	Sea Level Rise-Related Supporting Information

List of Figures

Figure 4.6-1	Image of Typical Pedestrian Gate with Fencing	4-118
Figure 4.9-1	Grade Separated Site Access Options Considered.....	4-143
Figure 4.9-2	Extent of Construction and Access Constraints with Two Grade Separations.....	4-145
Figure 4.18-1	Lighting Receptors within the Turning Basin.....	4-225
Figure 4.18-2	Sports Lighting in Turning Basin	4-227
Figure 4.4-1	CEQA Historic Resources	7-185
Figure 4.9-2	Inundation at Extreme High Tide, 2050 (No Project)	7-240
Figure 4.9-3	Inundation at Extreme High Tide, 2100 (No Project)	7-241
Figure 4.9-4	Daily Inundation with Sea Level Rise (No Project)	7-242
Figure 4.9-5	Inundation at Extreme High Tide ~2025 (Post Project)	7-243
Figure 4.9-6	Inundation at Extreme High Tide ~2050 (Post Project)	7-244
Figure 4.9-7	Inundation at Extreme High Tide ~2100 (Post Project)	7-245
Figure 4.14-2	Event Day Security and Ticket Zone Plan	7-266
Figure 4.14-2.	MRS Event Day Security and Ticket Zone Plan – Maritime Reservation Scenario	7-267
Figure 4.15-15	On-Site Mobility Access Plan	7-275
Figure 4.15-18	Howard Terminal Bicycle/Scooter Routing.....	7-276
Figure 4.15-20	Howard Terminal Truck Routing.....	7-277
Figure 4.15-21	Howard Terminal Overall Mobility Access Plan	7-278
Figure 4.15-35	Off-Site Transportation Features – Grid 13.....	7-279

Tables

Table 3-1	State, Regional, and Local Agencies Commenting on the Draft EIR.....	3-1
Table 3-2	Organizations Commenting on the Draft EIR.....	3-2
Table 3-3	Individuals Commenting on the Draft EIR.....	3-5
Table 3-4	LPAB Public Speakers and Board Members	3-14
Table 3-5	Planning Commission Public Speakers and Commissioners	3-15
Table 4.0-1	List of Consolidated Responses.....	4-1
Table 4.6-1	Comparison of Average Daily Trains Crossing Data for Embarcadero West and Market Street between 11 a.m. and 11 p.m.....	4-109
Table 4.6-2	Daily 12-Hour and Daily Trains Crossing Data for Embarcadero West and Market Street.....	4-109

	<u>Page</u>
Table 4.6-3	Total Daily Crossings for All Modes (Vehicles, Pedestrians, and Bicycles) 4-113
Table 4.6-4	Annual Estimated Expected Collisions Based on the Federal Railroad Administration’s Highway Rail Crossing Accident Prediction and Severity Model..... 4-115
Table 4.7-1	Off-Street Parking Characteristics within 1 mile of the Project Site... 4-124
Table 4.7-2	Ballpark Attendees Who Drive—Parking Distribution 4-124
Table 4.8-1	Transportation Analysis Study Locations 4-128
Table 4.8-2	Off-Street Parking Characteristics within 1 mile of the Project Site... 4-130
Table 4.8-2	Parking Locations for Ballpark Attendees Who Drive 4-131
Table 4.8-4	Traffic Volume Changes for Streets in Chinatown (weekday evening ballpark event) 4-132
Table 4.18-1	Maximum Night Game Sports Lighting Luminance (Brightness) in the Direction of the Turning Basin 4-225
Table 4.20-1	Weekday Evening Game Arrivals—Line and Station Assumed Distributions 4-235
Table 4.20-2	Weekday Day Game Departures—Line and Station Assumed Distributions 4-236
Table 4.20-3	Existing Ridership Distribution..... 4-237
Table 4.20-4	Existing Plus Project Ridership Distribution 4-237
Table 4.20-5	BART Station Platform Capacity 4-238
Table 4.20-6	Lake Merritt BART Station—Vertical Circulation..... 4-239
Table 4.20-7	12th Street BART Station—Vertical Circulation 4-240
Table 4.20-8	West Oakland BART Station—Vertical Circulation 4-241
Table 4.20-9	Fare Gate Capacity 4-242
Table 4.20-10	Lake Merritt BART Station—Departure Line Load Capacity..... 4-243
Table 4.20-11	12th Street BART Station—Departure Line Load Capacity 4-244
Table 4.20-12	West Oakland BART Station—Departure Line Load Capacity 4-244
Table 4.21-1	Potential Options for Bus Lane Design on Broadway and Associated Implications 4-248
Table 4.21-2	Average Additional Delay (in seconds) per Bus per Intersection during a Game Day 4-255
Table 4.21-3	Webster and Posey Tubes Congestion Travel Time between 7th Street and Alameda during the P.M. Peak Period 4-255
Table 4.23-1	Neighborhood and Site Enhancement Strategies— CAPCOA 2010 4-263
Table 4.23-2	Parking Strategies—CAPCOA 2010 4-264
Table 4.23-3	Commute Trip Reduction Strategies—CAPCOA 2010 4-265
Table 4.23-4	Transit System Improvement Strategies—CAPCOA 2010 4-267
Table 4.23-5	Transportation and Parking Demand Management Strategy—Average Weekday Effectiveness..... 4-280